

BOOK REVIEWS

Coates, Ken S. and P.G. McHugh: *Living Relationships: The Treaty of Waitangi in the New Millennium*. Wellington, New Zealand: Victoria University Press, 1998, ISBN 0-86473-330-5.

This book is a result of two essays commissioned by the New Zealand Ministry of Justice. The Ministry of Justice was attempting through these essays to "understand the international setting within which Crown and Maori relationships were developing" (p.9). The Ministry of Justice contracted the work to two disparate sources. Paul McHugh is a legal scholar originally from New Zealand and now teaching at Cambridge. His books are well quoted by the New Zealand Court of Appeal and he has testified in Aboriginal law cases in Canada. Ken Coates is a Canadian historian with a long list of scholarly publications. He has advised both governments and Indigenous groups in Canada regarding claims. The book is made up of the essays provided by McHugh and Coates as well as nine commentaries provided by various authors.

In his essay titled, "International Perspectives on Relations with Indigenous Peoples," Coates argues that "Indigenous groups and governments the world over have different goals and are thus talking past each other" (p.10). Coates then goes on to argue that Indigenous people through claims and legal means are in essence attempting to keep their cultures alive. He suggests that Indigenous people have a number of basic targets, including but not limited to cultural survival, self-determination within an established nation state, and partnerships with non-Indigenous populations. On the other hand, governments want "to acknowledge the injustices of the past, to conclude a settlement consistent with national resources and political conditions, and to settle outstanding grievances once and for all" (p.29). Coates concludes that the last fifty years on paper have promised considerable advancement. However, during these same fifty years he also notes that Indigenous people have continued to face considerable struggle.

In his essay titled "Aboriginal Identity and Relations in North America and Australasia," McHugh argues "state relations with aboriginal peoples have consistently taken a disputatious form in the modern period. This central characteristic is a consequence of an underlying structuralist approach that has cast those relations into oppositional form" (p.111). He goes

on to argue that in order for there to be a shift from opposition to cooperation there has to be a move away from the country versus country dichotomy that has dominated the claims process.

Nine commentaries written by lawyers, politicians and academics conclude the book. These commentaries are specific analysis of Coates and McHugh's work within a New Zealand context. They are a fitting conclusion for the book because they provide an important dialogue between the international issues the essays raise and the current state of affairs in New Zealand. This is an excellent book for individuals who have a good understanding of the claims process as it has developed internationally. It is not for beginners, as both the essays and the commentaries assume in their writing prior knowledge of the claims process.

Rob Nestor
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College
Library Room 218 College West
University of Regina
Regina, Saskatchewan
Canada, S4S 0A2

Cook, Curtis and Juan D. Lindau (Editors): *Aboriginal Rights and Self-Government: The Canadian and Mexican Experience in North American Perspective*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000.

Aboriginal Rights and Self-Government: The Canadian and Mexican Experience in North American Perspective is a result of a colloquium held at the Colorado College. The purpose of the essays in the book is twofold. First, they seek to find answers concerning the mobilization and emergence of Indigenous people in both countries after a long period of marginalization. Second, they seek to understand rights and self-government in North America. As the editors state, "Even in Mexico, where the violent confrontation of the Zapatistas compelled attention, the government has been forced to confront Indigenous demands. And Canada's persistent search for accommodative solutions set a standard for the world" (p.36).

An introduction written by the editors provides both contemporary and historical context for the following eight essays. The title is somewhat misleading because only two of the essays concentrate on Mexico, five deal with Canada, and the final essay (rather than comparing the Mexican and Canadian experience, compares the experience of the United States and Canada).

The essays that center on the Canadian experience provide both an excellent historical analysis and an analysis for the future of self-government in Canada. They also outline models of self-government that the authors believe may work in practice.

One of the most useful essays is the concluding essay authored by C.E.S. Franks, which suggests that one way to understand Indian policy in these two countries is to examine the core values that make up each of these nations. Franks suggests that Canada places more emphasis on the community while the United States emphasizes the individual. Although one might expect that Canada would be more respectful of Indian communities and culture and that the United States would be more assimilationist, Franks demonstrates that until the 1970s such was not the case. In the United States, John Collier, the Commissioner of the Bureau of Indian Affairs, implemented accommodating reforms in Indian policy and kept Indian policy on the agenda in Washington. His counterpart in Ottawa, Duncan Campbell Scott, who was with Indians Affairs from 1879 to 1932, was a dedicated proponent of assimilation and attempted to keep Indian policy off the agenda. Pacification by the Canadian Government further removed Indian issues from the forefront of Ottawa's concern.

I would recommend this book to both those who are just beginning to study the concept of self-government and those who have some background in the area. The essays provide sufficient historical and contemporary information for a wide variety of readers.

Rob Nestor
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College
Library Room 218 College West
University of Regina
Regina, Saskatchewan
Canada, S4S 0A2

Dempsey, Hugh A.: *Tribal Honors: A History of the Kainai Chieftainship*.
Calgary: Kainai Chieftainship, 1997, ISBN 0-919555-10-1 CDN\$ 15.00.

Hugh A. Dempsey's *Tribal Honors* recounts the history of the Kainai Chieftainship of southern Alberta's Blood Tribe. As a scholar and life member of the Chieftaincy, Dempsey argues that the "history of the Chieftainship has been a significant one that reflects both the changing conditions on the Blood reserve and the activities of those persons honored by the tribe" (p.5). The sources for the monograph include reminiscences

by the author, newspaper articles, records held by the Glenbow Archives and ethnographical works.

Launched in 1919 and formally established in 1950, the Kainai Chieftainship is currently limited to 40 life members. The aim of the organization is to honor those individuals important to the tribe locally and internationally. Dempsey emphasizes that the honors were never cash purchases, as in many other instances in North America, but based on merit.

Dempsey discusses Blood history, the personalities of founding Chieftaincy members, and current political developments. The final chapter and three appendices present an ethnological and historical examination of the induction ceremony, origins of names, brief biographies of inductees, and the organization's constitution and by-laws. Dempsey carefully explores the acceptance of strangers into the tribe through naming to situate the Chieftainship within Blood traditions. As he argues, historically important names maintain a link with the past while creating a symbolic bond between the inductee and the tribe.

Two key personalities affecting the evolution of the Kainai Chieftaincy were Anglican minister Rev. Samuel H. Middleton and Lethbridge businessman Ernie McFarland. During Rev. Middleton's presidency (1919-1950), the selection of individuals tended to exclude Catholics. McFarland's presidency (1950-1974), however, sought to use the organization to honor individuals while promoting the interests of Lethbridge, southern Alberta, and the Blood Tribe. McFarland's emphasis on inducting individuals not necessarily important to the Bloods led to disputes with the Band council. When McFarland turned over the presidency in 1974, the tradition of honoring people significant to the Bloods became dominant.

Of great interest is Dempsey's discussion of the political developments that affected the organization in the 1960s and 1990s. For example, when Peter Lougheed, then Premier of Alberta, rejected the proposed clause recognizing Aboriginal and treaty rights in the repatriated Canadian Constitution, his Chieftaincy was revoked. The furor over this political act forced the organization to re-examine its role, and with support from the Blood tribal council, the Chiefs decided to continue. The Chieftaincy's re-organization in 1983 resulted in the tribal council assuming full control of the induction process.

Tribal Honors ably traces the history of the Kainai Chieftainship from its inception to the current day. While the book assumes the tone of reminiscence and laboriously lists inductees, it is useful in its exploration of how an honorary organization became a reaffirmation of self-determination.

Scholars and general readers alike will find this book an interesting and effective examination of the evolution of Native-White relations.

Karl Hele
RR #4, Bell's Point Beach
Highway 17 East
Sault Ste. Marie, Ontario
Canada, P6A 5K7

Dickason, Olive Patricia: *The Myth of the Savage, and the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1984, ISBN 0-88864-285-7 CDN\$ 24.95.

The 1997 reprint of this book, originally Dickason's doctoral thesis for the University of Ottawa in 1977, attests to its popularity and historical value for readers seeking both scholarly research and entertainment. This volume, together with *Canada's First Nations* published in 1992, reflect her depth of scholarship in the realm of Amerindian history.

The vast number of reprints of 16th and 17th century maps, drawings and woodcuts, and a bibliography, which presents multiple European original sources compiled from the same time period, convinces the reader that this is indeed an impressively researched work. Dickason not only exposes the myth of 16th century Amerindians as being crude savages totally lacking any form of sophisticated society, she also makes it clear that European society was far from refined. Both societies practiced torture and public execution, for example, and so it is problematic for either to claim superiority with any legitimacy over the other. Similarly, concepts of power, social cohesion and the interaction between individual and communal rights were evolving on both sides of the Atlantic, but in such a way that the one culture would have difficulty in understanding the ideologies of the other. Nakedness and the sharing involved in a subsistence economy were as unfathomable to the European as were the surfeit of clothing and the greed for gold of the Amerindian. The advantage of numbers and advancements in technology, however, enable Europeans to ignore the realities of Amerindian culture.

By classifying Amerindians as savages, Europeans were able to create the ideology that helped to make it possible to launch one of the greatest movements in the history of western civilization: the colonization of overseas empire (p.xiii).

The theme of this book is not new; it partakes of ethnohistory's legacy of combining the cultural insights of anthropology with the factual statements of history. Nancy Kupperman's *Settling with the Indians* (1980) studied the awe and admiration with which the first Puritan settlers viewed the Amerindians of the New England coastal area in the 16th and 17th centuries. James Axtell's *The European and the Indian* (1984) compared these two cultural viewpoints with regard to scalping and education. What sets Dickason's book apart is its volume of research, its scope which stretches from New France to Florida, Mexico and Brazil, its emphasis upon the French culture rather than the European in general, and its excellent use of visual examples to support written materials. My only regret is that the print is sufficiently small as to make reading difficult and viewing of drawings and maps unnecessarily blurred.

David J. Norton
Diocesan Coordinator of
Native Ministries
P. O. Box 52
Belmont, Ontario
Canada, N0L 1B0

Dorsey, George: *The Pawnee Mythology*, with introduction by Douglas Parks, ISBN 0-8032-6603-0 USA\$ 22.00.

Enriched with a new introduction by Douglas Parks, the revised version of a classic of North American Indian oral tradition *The Pawnee Mythology* offers a concise insight into the production of knowledge and the scholarly context of turn-of-the-century anthropology. The introduction is a welcome addition to the 1906 edition's short preface by George Dorsey, especially after the debates about text and context stressed the importance of the multiplicity of voices woven into the production of ethnographic writings. This introduction indeed highlights the fact that several people have contributed to the book during the various stages of collection, translation, interpretation, and publication. A total of 39 informants from the Pawnees' four tribal subdivisions told the stories to Murie and Dorsey for future preservation. Despite the diversity of provenance, the texts appear to be part of a formally homogenous body of oral literature, and it is unfortunate that the characteristic styles of storytelling such as emphases, repetitions, pauses, and refrains that may have distinguished the four main typologies of Pawnee mythology have disappeared in the printed version.

Particularly valuable is the fact that Parks notes that despite Dorsey's efforts to minimize modification of the original versions, his Pawnee collaborator and translator James Murie may have retold at a later date some narratives in a personal style, thus altering the formal rendition of some stories. Parks also points out some incongruities in the classification scheme, and adds new interpretative nuances to the written presentation of the 148 oral narratives included in this expanded version of *The Pawnee Mythology*.

Like the past edition, the book follows the original narrative typologies. They are myths, legends with heroes (Tales-Ready-to-Give), tales of visions (The Origins of Medicine Ceremonies or Power), and the more mundane Coyote tales. The first narratives are regarded as history by the Pawnees, and all of them are set in a time before the European arrival.

This original collection of myths was the result of Dorsey's two years fieldwork in 1904 among the 500 Pawnees who had survived the ravages of 19th century epidemics, and the difficulties of Reservation life. This amazing collection is thus an amalgam of the memories of a selected portion of the Pawnees original four tribes' remnants. However partial, the collection is nonetheless valuable for the size and scope of the material presented.

As part of a major study of Caddoan mythology and legends collected by Dorsey among the Wichita, Caddo, and Arikara, the book also lends itself to a comparative perspective. The value of this book does not only rest on its historical relevance and the potential for cross-cultural comparison, but in the immense body of information contained in the few remaining sources of the Pawnee's 19th century knowledge.

Massimiliano Carocci
Department of Anthropology
Goldsmiths College, University of London
New Cross, London, SE14 6NW
United Kingdom

Gibson, John Arthur: *Concerning the League: The Iroquois League Tradition as Dictated in Onondaga*. Newly elicited and translated by Hanni Woodbury in collaboration with Reg Henry and Harry Webster on the basis of A.A. Goldenweiser's Manuscript. Memoir 9, Algonquian and Iroquoian Linguistics. Winnipeg, Manitoba, 1992.

This document is a most welcome publication. It has been long awaited, especially by scholars of Iroquois society who had heard about the Gibson-Goldenweiser version of the League tradition, but lacked access to the

original elicited version or a readily available translation. They now have both!

I first heard about the existence of the Gibson-Goldenweiser text as a graduate student but it seemed lost somewhere in the past of early North American anthropology. I knew only that its arguments and refinements derived from, among others, Lewis Henry Morgan's monumental work *League of the Iroquois or Haudenosaunee* (1859).

Alexander A. Goldenweiser (Ph.D., Columbia, 1910) was a member of the first generation of American anthropologists trained by Franz Boas at Columbia University. Edward Sapir, Director of the Division of Anthropology in Canada, recruited Goldenweiser as a contract researcher for the newly slated Iroquois Programme. The team of researchers, who worked mainly at Grand River along the Six Nations, included Goldenweiser on the study of social organization, F.W. Waugh on material culture, and Francis Knowles on physical anthropology. Marius Barbeau, another member of the Iroquois Programme, worked mainly in Oklahoma.

Goldenweiser questioned arbitrary intellectual boundaries. His stance caused no end of difficulties for Sapir in his capacity as administrator and director of the programme, yet illustrates how the boundaries, not only between disciplines, but also between sub-divisions of anthropology, had to be worked out through a process of negotiation and conciliation. Moreover, the young discipline of American anthropology had to deal with the political developments among the Mohawks where traditionalists and modernists, traditional Chiefs versus elected Chiefs, each struggled with their place in contemporary society. The two struggled with each other's version of the League's constitution as well as the League's future.

Goldenweiser worked with Chief John A. Gibson, a Seneca Chief, who dictated a longer version of the constitution in Onondaga to Goldenweiser than the one he had dictated in 1900 to J.N.B. Hewitt, a Tuscarora scholar. That version had left Gibson dissatisfied. The long version, a collaborative work, is an account of the Iroquois Tradition which recounts the founding of the League of the Iroquois, or the Confederacy as it is known among the Iroquois of today, and the laws and rituals connected with its operation and continuance. As Woodbury (1994:xi) points out:

Though the League's beginnings are not precisely known, it undoubtedly came into existence before white contact in the seventeenth century. There is a great deal of documentary evidence of its activities and influence from contact times onward..., and it still survives, though in attenuated form, in both the United States and Canada.

Many of the laws and rituals described in the League Tradition are very old and are known to us from the earliest historical sources...

Accounts of the League Tradition tend to be fragmentary, in languages other than Iroquois, written in an unsystematic orthography, or unavailable in published form. Hence the value of this work. As Woodbury points out of the Gibson-Goldenweiser version "it is the only complete version of the tradition published in an Iroquoian language" (*Ibid.*) Ethnohistorians and linguists in particular, will welcome this work, although its orthography remains somewhat inconsistent.

Seymour Dubrow
Policy Analyst, Specific Claims Branch
Indian and Northern Affairs Canada
Ottawa, Ontario
Canada, K1A 0H4

Goulet, Jean-Guy A.: *Ways of Knowing: Experience, Knowledge and Power among the Dene Tha*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998, 334 pp. including bibliography and index, ISBN 0-7748-0680-X Cloth CDN\$ 75.00, ISBN 0-7748-068108 Paper CDN\$ 29.95.

This is a challenging book, which combines a thorough ethnography of the Dene Tha community of Chateh, Alberta, with an exploration into the ways in which anthropological investigations may be carried out and written about. Combining theories about the construction of knowledge and culture with the innovative methodology of "radical participation", Goulet explains the ways in which Dene Tha live their lives today, combining older beliefs and practices with influences from the wider Canadian society, often in the face of profound social change. This book is thus based on an attempt to explain the reality of the Dene Tha world, with its unique constructs and values, as it is created by community members, through an intertwining of theory and methodology, which is realized in the presentation of episodes and narratives from Goulet's fieldwork.

The introductory chapter lays the foundation for the rest of the book by beginning with such an episode, thus suggesting that the presentation of the narratives of fieldwork experience may be an effective means of making such events comprehensible to others. Indeed, as the fundamental principle of Dene Tha epistemology is that knowledge may only be derived from personal experience, this presentation of Goulet's experience is a key

means by which those outside the community may, in the words of an Elder, "know a little bit" (p.259) on the Dene Tha terms. Subsequent chapters continue this emphasis on experience as a way of gaining ethnographic knowledge, demonstrating the ways in which social realities are created and negotiated by those working within shared constructs, and understandable as such. The gradual introduction of other ideas, such as the Dene Tha ethical stance, in which individuals are seen to be responsible for their own lives and where noninterference by others is paramount, allows the reader to grasp something of the ways in which Dene Tha think and gain an insight into their lives. Other fundamental notions, such as the relationship between humans, animals and plants, and ideas about reincarnation, are explored, demonstrating the entanglement between knowledge, power and experience that is one of the key themes of the book; whilst chapters on healing and medicine, prophecy and dreaming demonstrate the ways in which Dene Tha have drawn upon and incorporated other knowledge systems, such as Western medicine and Christian symbolism. Contemporary issues affecting Dene Tha communities, such as alcoholism and violence, are also covered.

Ultimately, this is a dense book, rich in detail and provocative in methodology, which challenges the reader to understand Dene Tha thought and which deserves several close readings. It will be of interest to those interested in the methods behind the production of ethnographies, in issues of epistemology, as well, of course, to any student interested in Native North America.

Claire Warrior
35 Merlewood Avenue
Churchtown
Southport, PR9 7N2
United Kingdom

Griffiths, Nicholas and Fernando Cervantes: *Spiritual Encounters: Interactions between Christianity and Native Religions in Colonial America*. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1999, ISBN 0-80327-081-X USA\$ 25.00.

All too often spiritual encounters have been downplayed in favor of socio-economic and political studies of cultural contact in the Americas, and until fairly recently, many of these works that have appeared have been marred by a Christian triumphalism that concentrates on the deeds of

Christian missionaries and the conversion of Aboriginal peoples. Recent scholarship has begun to question the traditional concept of conversion as a one-way process that transformed or destroyed Native religions. However, since these new studies have tended to focus closely on individual groups, few attempts have been made to bring together the recent work done on conversion in the colonial period.

Spiritual Encounters is thus a timely text. The authors demonstrate that the spiritual encounters between colonists and Natives were reciprocal interactions in which both parties were affected and changed in various ways. Unlike other narrowly focused texts, the editors draw upon research in both South and North America. The contributors to the book include religious historians, ethnohistorians, social historians and anthropologists and they utilize a variety of approaches to reinterpreting these encounters. This book provides an excellent introduction to research in South or North America, and to the possibility of comparative approaches.

The increasing emphasis on Native agency in the encounters between Christianity (of whatever kind) and the various Native religions is particularly heartening. The research adds to the evidence that changes in Native religions were made within the context of pre-existing belief systems, not as fundamental breaks with them. As several authors in the book demonstrate, one of the major areas of discussion and negotiation centred on diseases and healing. Throughout the hemisphere missionaries implicitly acknowledged the supernatural power of Native healers, and sometimes explicitly assumed the role of shamans themselves as a means of demonstrating their own spiritual power to members of Native societies. In so doing, they recognized the need to make Christianity adapt itself to the beliefs and expectations of Native religions, and they gave legitimacy to a fundamental element of the Aboriginal worldview.

The role played by coercion in the process of evangelization is one important area of difference between Hispanic America and North America. As the editors point out, this is partly due to the different timelines of expansion, and to different relationships between church and state in the two hemispheres. In Hispanic America, evangelization was an integral part of conquest and settlement. In contrast, there were fewer systematic campaigns of terror in North America, but coercion certainly did occur. However, it mainly took an explicitly repressive form in post-colonial North America—which is outside the temporal boundaries of this book.

In Latin America, non-physical forms of coercion also were used. As Klor de Alva argues in his essay on the reconstruction of the Nahua self, the penitential discipline used by Christian friars in Central Mexico was far more effective than physical discipline, since it exerted control over the soul

rather than the body. Indeed, the focus for many of the essays in this book is the extent to which so-called Native converts were able to adopt outward manifestations of Christianity, while maintaining their traditional sense of self-identify.

An excellent essay by Nicholas Griffiths introduces the compilation, and the main conclusions are summarized admirably by Fernando Cervantes. All and all, this collection brings together exciting new work by scholars from the two Americas and Europe. I would only hope that it be followed up by a companion volume that deals with post-colonial America, since this is the period in which the most significant spiritual encounters took place in North America. The present volume provides some excellent examples of how the encounters between Christianity and Native religions in the Americas can be analyzed from new perspectives.

Michael R. Angel
11841 Lambert Drive
Coldstream, British Columbia
Canada, V1B 2P4

Hauptman, Laurence and L.G. McLester: *The Oneida Indian Journey, from New York to Wisconsin 1784-1860*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1999, ISBN 0-29916-144-7 USA \$ 16.95.

In marked contrast to the abundance of sources on the Mohawk, Onondaga and Seneca Nations, very little material is available about the Oneida Nation. Even the Cayugas, who with the Oneidas share the designation of being "younger brothers" of the original five Iroquoian tribal groupings, seem to have the greater amount of historical materials collected.

Hauptman's work adds to the research on the Oneidas. Hauptman together with Jack Campisi, has become associated with new discoveries and writings about the "People of the Standing Stone".¹ Indeed both men contributed essays to this volume. Only four articles out of a total of 17 are written by historians of note (Francis Jennings, Laurence Hauptman, Jack Campisi and Reginald Horsman); three are by non-Native archivists, and the remaining 10 contributors are Native. Of the 10 Native writers, nine are members of the Oneida Nation. In addition to individual efforts, the contribution of the Language and Folklore Project is included. Their work is based upon the oral traditions that are increasingly recognized as necessary elements of a people's self-identify.

Hauptman and McLester's book successfully links the past with the present. The first section traces the history of the Oneida people from their ancestral lands near Lake Oneida in north central New York State through their dealings with Europeans in the American 1770s Revolution and their dispersal at the hands of the new American government in the early 1800s, to their eventual arrival in Wisconsin in the 1840s.² The whole pattern of the Native-European encounter is summarized in the preface by Oneida lawyer Gerald Hill:

The cultural devastation brought on by the thefts of land, broken government promises, family breakups, removals and relocations, coerced attendance and cruel regimented life at boarding schools, the belittling and undermining of tribal religion, law, leadership and authority, and the loss of language has been terrible.³

In response to these adverse conditions the Oneidas of Wisconsin developed a determination to take ownership of their future. The second section of the book features "present perspectives" and includes aspects of current language projects and historical research involving Oneida community leaders and Elders. In the third section the Oneida people suggest how they might develop future methods of understanding and utilizing "needs, approaches and resources" that might be beneficial to themselves and others. Of special interest to those who wish to delve deeper into Oneida history is the appendix entitled "Oneida Indian Records Prior to 1887 Owned by, or Deposited at, the State Historical Society of Wisconsin or at its Area Research Centres". This appendix includes items as diverse as church records, papers of colonial leaders who dealt with the Oneida people, government treaties and documents, surveys, Indian Affairs census rolls, and correspondence referring to contemporary weather conditions, agricultural produce and school attendance.

This book, though small in size, is a major contribution to the history of the Oneida and a valuable recognition of that community's program for the future. This might best be expressed in words taken from the book's conclusion:

The history of the Oneidas is the story of their unrelenting determination to survive as a people... Today more than 14,000 Oneidas are enrolled in Wisconsin. We hope to continue our efforts at preserving our own history and conveying it to both Oneidas and others in the future with more history conferences and publications, focusing on the period from 1850 to the present, namely the years in which the Oneida "took root" in Wisconsin.⁴

We, like the editors of the book, wish them well in their endeavour.

David J. Norton
 Diocesan Co-ordinator of
 Native Ministries
 P. O. Box 52
 Belmont, Ontario
 Canada, N0I 1B0

Notes

1. Some of their publications are:

Laurence Hauptman and Jack Campisi: *The Oneida Indian Experience: Two Perspectives*, 1988.

Laurence Hauptman and Jack Campisi (Editors): *Neighbours and Intruders: An Ethnological Exploration of the Indians of the Hudson River (1978)*.

Jack Campisi, "Oneida", in Bruce Trigger (Editor): *Handbook of North American Indians* 15 (1978).

Jack Campisi, "Fur Trade and Factionalism of the 18th C Oneidas", in *Occasional Publications in Northeastern Anthropology* 6 (1980).

2. Some Oneidas moved to eastern Ontario, others to the Thames River area of southwestern Ontario. The largest group, however, moved to Wisconsin.
3. Page xiv.
4. Page 198.

Innis, Harold A.: *The Fur Trade in Canada: with a New Introductory Essay* by Arthur J. Ray. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999, xxxvi + 463 pp., bibliography, index, ISBN0-8020-8196-7 CDN\$ 24.95.

Following its publication in 1930, *The Fur Trade in Canada* was an immediate and critical academic success. During the next three decades it would transcend disciplines, becoming equally as popular among historians as it had among geographers and political economists as well as a favorite source for serious students researching the fur trade. Considered an innovative study upon publication, its influence would peak in the 1970s

when a new generation of writers began to critically reevaluate the author's conclusions and to initiate a literary renaissance that is largely responsible for how we comprehend Aboriginal history in Canada today.

The question of why a reprint is appropriate. A wealth of Native historical material has been produced in the last three decades, so why the reprint? Throughout his study, Innis chose to view Aboriginal populations as part of the physical landscape and a hindrance. He minimized their role as business partners, middlemen, and military allies, and argued that obtaining technologically superior goods from traders was the primary reason for their continued involvement in the fur trade, views that have long been abandoned by most writers of Native history. Although it could be argued that these are contextual issues based on prevailing attitudes that existed when the study was produced, Native studies as a discipline is mandated to move beyond these original interpretations and redefine the role Europeans played in the development of Native history in North America, an approach absent in *The Fur Trade in Canada*.

While we must recognize Innis' influence and contribution to Native history in its preliminary stages, the catalog of Native histories produced since 1970 is much more in-depth and reliable as an initial resource. Innis had no access to the Hudson's Bay Company Archives, which would have afforded him the opportunity to reevaluate a number of his conclusions; nor did he have the luxury of being able to discuss his ideas with colleagues devoted strictly to the study of Native history. Minus the addition of a new introductory essay by Arthur J. Ray and the inclusion of Innis' own indications of his future research interests found in original manuscripts, this reprint is much the same as the 1930 edition. Is this an important book? For those interested in studying Canada's development from an economic and geographic perspective, yes. I do not believe, however, a reprint of a seventy year old study that is limited in its presentation of the role Aboriginal people played during the fur trade, a work that has been improved upon by later writers of Native history, is at this time called for. Innis initiated a trend that led to the production of a canon of literature about Canada's Native history. This is his real legacy.

Yale Belanger
Department of Native Studies
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, Manitoba
Canada, R3T 2N2

Kunin, Roslyn (Editor): *Prospering Together: The Impact of the Aboriginal Title Settlements in B.C.* Vancouver: The Laurier Institute, 1998, xxxvi + 314 pp. bibliography, biographies. ISBN 0-9682343-0-5, CDN \$29.95.

The nine articles in this volume were written by leading analysts of Aboriginal issues who bring together first class scholarship in their respective fields. The volume seeks to answer such intricate questions as: How will First Nations self-government fit in the existing legal framework of Canada? Why should we negotiate and settle Aboriginal claims outside of the court system? How will land claims settlements affect access to resources, investment, and availability of skilled labour? Whose responsibility is it to protect the environment in a post-treaty world? How are Aboriginal settlements to be paid for? Some of the highlights of the volume include Ken Coates' work on how Aboriginal self-government might be implemented; Lee Morrison and David Fish's paper on the implications of transferring health care responsibilities to First Nations; and Brian Scarfe's piece on how best to finance treaty settlements. All the essays are within the comprehension of any literate person. Indeed Roslyn Kunin consciously edited the papers into plain language.

While the volume does not purport to offer definitive answers, it presents logical and provocative insights into the treaty process in British Columbia, using a variety of witty examples, pithy descriptions, and fascinating scenarios. All the contributors demonstrate analytical competence and familiarity with the literature on Aboriginal treaties. Their eagerness to examine both the negative and positive implications of treaty settlements adds to the charm of this volume. The recurrent theme is that the cost of treaty negotiations and settlements will be hefty, yet tolerable; the costs of not negotiating will even be heftier. As many contributors assert, treaties will help reduce the uncertainties surrounding land use in British Columbia, curtail the paternalistic tendencies of the government, and instill a sense of pride among Aboriginals. Because the bulk of cash payments in treaty settlements comes from federal coffers, British Columbia's economy stands to gain considerably, although this point escaped nearly all the contributors.

The volume highlights some of the internal dynamics that may undermine the treaty aspirations of Aboriginals, including the diversity and tensions among First Nation groups and the dearth of well-educated professionals among Aboriginals. Here too, some important issues were overlooked. These include the problems posed by overlapping land claims in the treaty process; the acute gender disparities in power among Aboriginals; and the difficulties in reconciling the interests of *reserve* and *off-reserve* Aboriginals in treaty negotiations. The book is not perfect. A product

of many scholars, the book inevitably has some repetition. Also, it has no index, no maps showing land claim area, and no concluding chapter that brings it all together. These minor concerns aside, the book represents a valuable contribution to the literature on Aboriginal land claims in British Columbia and merits serious attention by scholars and students.

Joseph Mensah
Department of Geography
Kwantlen University College
Surrey, British Columbia
Canada, V3W 2M8

McNab, David T.: *Circles of Time: Aboriginal Land Rights and Resistance in Ontario*. Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfred Laurier University Press, 1999, ISBN 0-88920-338-5 CDN\$ 29.95.

Thanks to David McNab, there is finally a book that explains clearly yet succinctly the issues involved in what society mistakenly calls "land claims". In fact the introductory chapter should be required reading for anyone who genuinely wishes to understand the whole concept of Aboriginal spiritual and political ties to the land. As he says in his preface,

It is hoped that this work will assist in understanding Aboriginal land rights and resistance in Ontario as well as providing some insights into the history and historiography of the treaty-making process in Canada, especially in the last quarter century (p. vii).

As a public historian working as an advisor to the Walpole Island Heritage Centre and as an external associate of Trent University, McNab brings to his writing an extensive legacy of involvement with Ontario's First Nations and their struggle to maintain their land and treaty rights.

The body of the book deals with eight recent problematic scenarios: the Ontario Métis who, though recognized as Aboriginal people in the 1982 Constitution, have no status under the federal Indian Act; the Tem-Augama Anishnabai whose rights to the land are constantly denied by the Ontario Government; the Assabaska First Nation whose land has technically disappeared; the people of Lac la Croix who have lost their land and those of Sturgeon Lake who are declared to be extinct; the unethical dealings of a power company with the Michipicoten Reserve; the failed attempt to complete the Manitoulin Island Treaty of 1862; the appearance of institutional racism encountered by the author at Queen's Park in Toronto concerning the Batchewana First Nation; and the degree of success

achieved by Walpole Island First Nation following a lengthy history of negotiation with the federal and provincial governments. In all these case-studies McNab never minces words; rather he writes with a forthrightness that comes from a knowledge of the facts and familiarity with the situations.

Even if the eight episodes seem removed from the daily lives of many people, the introduction will benefit all readers. McNab clarifies the meaning of many concepts which become distorted by the press; title, claim (specific and comprehensive), caution, treaty rights, claims process. The extensive endnotes and bibliographical material are a gold-mine for those who wish to read further. McNab expresses his own hopes for the impact of his book as:

Resistance, policy inadequacies, racial attitudes, racism and propaganda are identified.... This work is also a warning. There must be an alternative to a flawed and failed treaty-making process. After the events of Oka and Ipperwash, we cannot afford to fail again (p.19).

Having myself stood within the razor wire surrounding the peace camp at Oka and having walked in the procession to the burial site of Dudley George within the grounds of the military camp at Ipperwash, I have felt the shame of being perceived as on the side of those who promote "racism and propaganda". I hope McNab's book achieves that for which it was written. I also hope he writes more. We need it.

David J. Norton
Diocesan Co-ordinator of
Native Ministries
P. O. Box 52
Belmont, Ontario
Canada, N0I 1B0

McNab, David T. (Editor): *Earth, Water, Air and Fire: Studies in Canadian Ethnohistory*. Waterloo: Wilfred Laurier University Press 199, ISBN 0-88020-297-4 CDN\$ 29.95.

In this collection of essays first presented at the conference held in 1994, "*Earth, Water, Air and Fire: World in Contact and Conflict*", editor David T. McNab seeks to include articles that present an Aboriginal perspective on the four elements comprising the Aboriginal world.

Reginald Good examines White settlement in southern Ontario. Dean Jacobs looks at land and water issues, concluding that many Canadian

Reserves' outer boundaries require reevaluation. Canada's Reserve system is assessed by Joan Fairweather in light of South African apartheid. She concludes that the two are more dissimilar than comparable. The highlight of the first section is Olive Dickason's essay on writing from a Native viewpoint in 'Art and Amerindian Worldviews'. The second section, however, fails in its conveyance of a wide Aboriginal perspective. Ontario Aboriginal historical concerns and Mi'kmaq historical issues become the editor's narrow focus rather than the variety of culture groups implied by the title "*Studies in Canadian Ethnohistory*."

Despite the disjointed nature of the third section, many of its essays are intriguing and informative. In particular, Thomas Abler's well-written essay on the missionary Silas Rand and his collection of Mi'kmaq legends conveys the difficulties one faces in attempting to unravel the intricacies of oral tradition. Rhonda Telford's entry examines the lengths the Canadian government went to in order to obtain the sale oil and gas rights from the people of Walpole Island during World War I. This is a reminder both of the federal government's poor treatment of Aboriginal people in the early 20th century and how researchers too often overlook the subject of Aboriginal petroleum use. When Cameron Croxall and Laird Christie summarized the evolution of the Nunavut Agreement at the conference in 1994, they were contemporary and provocative. Unfortunately, most of their conclusions had by 1998 become media catch phrases and the significance of their article in this collection is greatly diminished.

Overall, this compilation expresses a variety of viewpoints and concerns. It is unfortunate that Ontario Aboriginal and Mi'kmaq concerns often take precedence. The inclusion of essays that displayed a more accurate cross section of Canadian Aboriginal concerns would have been welcome. Even so, many articles (Janet Chute, Sidney Haring, Theresa Redmond) illustrate the quality of research now being conducted in the field of Aboriginal history and most readers will find at least one article to their interest.

Yale Belanger
Department of Native Studies
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, Manitoba
Canada, R3T 2N2

Marles, Robin J., Christina Clavelle, Leslie Monteleone, Natalie Tays and Donna Burns: *Aboriginal Plant Use in Canada's Northwest Boreal Forest*. Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press, 2000. ISBN 0-7748-0737-7 CDN\$ 75.00.

There are literally hundreds of recent books on ethnobotany, traditional medicine, traditional food, and botanical folklore from various parts of the world, but works from northern regions, especially those reflecting active collaboration and authorship with northern Indigenous peoples, are few and far between. This book, representing the rich and complex knowledge of native flora of First Nations and Métis peoples of Canada's Boreal Forest, fills a definite gap in this regard. It is a thorough, well-researched, well written compendium that will serve for decades to come as a "classic" reference for those interested in northern plants and northern peoples.

The project was originally sponsored by the Canadian Forest Service, whose stated objective is the sustainable management of Canada's forests. Students and others, many of them Aboriginal, participated in the study as interviewers, researchers, photographers and compilers. Appendix A documents the dates interviewed and the home communities, language and genders of over 100 contributors to the research, most of them Elders from the Cree, Dene and Métis communities.

There is an informative introductory section, with a carefully compiled and extremely helpful literature review and a description of the forests and cultures of the boreal region. The main body of the book is the section comprising an inventory of the plants themselves and their traditional uses. Included for each of the species listed are the English and other common names (Chipewyan, Cree, English, French and Slave), the scientific name, family name, voucher specimen number (Appendix B lists the voucher specimens collection), brief description of the plant and its habitat, traditional uses for food, medicine, technology and ritual, and properties of the plant relevant to its traditional and potential future uses, as well as a preliminary evaluation of its potential for economic development as a Non-Timber Forest Product. The book contains a Glossary, an excellent References listing, and a complete Index of both plant names and topics covered. There are some wonderful photographs in the book, of both plants and people. The botanical photos are small, but generally of good quality.

The current and potential commercialization of native plants, especially when this involves the knowledge and experience of Aboriginal Elders and others, is fraught with particular ethical concerns. These issues are addressed in the book in a direct and balanced manner. Substantial information was excluded from publication at the expressed wish of the Elders who

participated in the study because the knowledge was considered inappropriate to share in such a venue. Ultimately, the authors contend, it should be the decision of individuals and communities who hold the knowledge as to what extent they participate in any sort of commercialization of their cultural plants. However, the authors also point out that sustainable, respectful harvesting of some of these products might help in local economic development, and coupled with agroforestry production, can be an alternative to the devastating deforestation now occurring through extensive clearcutting of our boreal forests.

Dr. Marles and his co-authors are to be congratulated for such a fine and useful contribution to Canadian ethnobotany.

Nancy J. Turner
Professional School of
Environmental Studies
University of Victoria
Victoria, British Columbia
Canada, V8W 2Y2

Nichols, Roger L.: *Indians in the United States and Canada: A Comparative History*. University of Nebraska Press: Lincoln and London, 1998, ISBN 0-80328-377-6 USA\$ 19.95.

The book under review is a well-written comparison of the treatment of Indians in the United States and Canada, their different definitions of "Indians" notwithstanding. The narrative is fast-paced, discussing many of the important events that shaped the relationship between the newcomers and Indigenous populations, but yet does not sacrifice the complicated story. A comparison of any kind is notoriously difficult, but I believe that Nichols pulls it off admirably, exploring the convergences and divergences in the two countries' treatment and policies for their Indigenous peoples. His account is particularly good at identifying the historical factors that led to changes in the policies of Britain, the United States and Canada (Spain is mentioned, where applicable). He discusses how the pressure from settlers, with government inaction, deprived Indian groups of their traditional territory.

Acculturation is rarely an equal exchange between two cultures; the relationship is unbalanced and unequal in outcome. The greater loss in North American history was suffered by the Indian Nations, to the point that at the turn of the 19th century, it was thought that they would disappear as

nations. Nichols' book is sometimes a reading of how power by the Euro-Americans/Euro-Canadians was consolidated at the expense of Indian cultures. He examines the long-term and short-term factors that led to a change in the relationship between the two groups. He aptly discusses the stages this relationship went through and the ways in which racism toward the Indians were translated into action especially in the policies which were designed to govern their lives. Nichols is good at enunciating the situational elements, an increasingly radical or covetous attitude toward the Indian's possession, namely land, and how that combined with ever-changing political objectives in the face of fairly strong ideological convictions about how the Indians should be treated.

The book really takes the history up to about 1996, and therefore needs to be updated, at least for the Canadian portion, in the light of significant Court decisions, including *Delgamuukw v. British Columbia* and the Nisga's treaty. Certainly one large difference in the policies of Canada and the United States is that in Canada treaty-making has not yet ended whereas in the United States treaty-making ended in the 1870s. What the two countries have had in common is the practice of reducing Indian lands by one means or another. Canada strove for assimilation built on the edifice of numerous practices such as residential schools, enfranchisement, and outlawing the potlatch. In the United States, tribal sovereignty had been upheld since Chief Justice Marshall declared them to be "domestic dependent nations." But the United States also proposed "Termination" (and actually did terminate some Indian tribes). After the realization by both governments that assimilationist policies failed, they turned to new approaches including "self-determination" in the United States and "self-government" in Canada. While there appears to be a firmer legal foundation for self-government in the United States than in Canada, it may be said also that the Supreme Court in Canada has tried to give direction to notions of Aboriginal title and self-government; whereas in the United States the courts have not been as favourably disposed.

As Franks has written:

Policies toward Aboriginal peoples in the United States and Canada embody and express fundamental views of society, the individual and how uniformity and diversity are treated... all policies must, as a first step, deal explicitly or implicitly with the problem of cultural, linguistic and legal differences between groups in the general population (Franks, 2000:221).

The past result of the policies in the United States and Canada has been the state's domination of Indigenous or Aboriginal peoples accompanied by prolonged attempts to dismantle their cultures. The question of how

this state of affairs came about is the subject of Nichols' book. His account, however, does end upon a hopeful note for the future.

Seymour Dubrow
Policy Analyst
Specific Claims Branch
Indian and Northern Affairs Canada
Ottawa, Ontario
Canada, K1A 0H4

Reference

Franks, C.E.S.

- 2000 Indian Policy: Canada and the United States Compared, pp. 222-263 in Curtis Cook and Juan D. Landau (Editors): *Aboriginal Rights and Self-Government*. Montreal: McGill University Press.

Ostrowitz, Judith: *Privileging the Past: Reconstructing History in Northwest Coast Art*. Seattle and London: University of Washington Press; Vancouver and Toronto: UBC Press, 1999, 201 pages, including bibliographic references, index and 14 colour plates. ISBN 0-295-97814-7.

Judith Ostrowitz's well-presented and clearly written book examines notions of authenticity in Northwest Coast art, of the tension between innovation and tradition, and of the influence perceptions of the past have on the present. She discusses art in the broadest sense, encompassing architecture, exhibition and dance, demonstrating how the peoples of the Northwest Coast draw upon their cultural heritage in interactions with those outside their community. Furthermore, she suggests that the emphasis on history in Northwest Coast art, often judged negatively by the Western art market, is a conscious decision by contemporary artists, congruent with the role of art in upholding social structures. Although this book is "about" Northwest Coast art, it is thus also about cross-cultural encounters, negotiations and understandings. Copies and replicas that draw on earlier objects amount to more than the Western art world might perceive, and whilst deliberately drawing on the past, meaning is in the present. This meaning may encapsulate notions of authority, identity, politics and value to Northwest Coast peoples, and thus encompass more than simple replication.

Ostrowitz uses four different histories to illuminate these issues. The first is a discussion of the Chief Shakes Community House, in Wrangell, Alaska, often seen as exemplifying "classic" Tlingit architecture. Using archival evidence Ostrowitz demonstrates how the house has been restored over time, and how each restoration should be contextualized in terms of the perceptions of authenticity surrounding it and the relationship between Native and non-Native communities in the vicinity. The meaning of the house has not been a stable one, despite a general continuity in its form. The second history illustrates the ways in which the Grand Hall at the Canadian Museum in Civilization represents "the Northwest Coast", its people and their material culture. Each house and cultural group present is discussed, demonstrating the dynamics behind the displays and the differences overcome to present an apparently unified, authentic vision to museum visitors. The Kwakwaka'wakw dance performance, which accompanied the opening of the Chiefly Feasts exhibition in 1991, is the subject of the third history, placed in the context of other performances and the meaning they were held to encapsulate. Rather than sealing a Chief's reputation, as a potlatch performance would do, this dance and its accompanying orations validated Kwakwaka'wakw identity to a wider audience without compromising the issues of rank, authority and tradition connected to such a performance. Finally, the fourth history examines contemporary artifact production by Northwest Coast artists.

This is a fascinating book, and will be of interest to anthropologists, art historians, museologists, and those interested generally in the Northwest Coast. What Ostrowitz ultimately sees as significant is that Northwest Coast artists have maintained their ability to display the past as they feel is appropriate, foregrounding the meanings they wish to emphasize and choosing who has the authority to do so. They participate in the negotiated construction of such representations rather than blindly following paths of the past, working within a cross-cultural atmosphere rather than one of isolated historicism.

Claire Warrior
35 Merlewood Avenue
Churchtown
Southport, PR9 7N2
United Kingdom

Parks, Douglas: *Myths and Traditions of Traditions of the Arikara Indians*. Nebraska: Nebraska University Press, ISBN 0-80323-712-X, USA \$ 40.00.

Myth and Traditions of Traditions of the Arkara Indians is a result of a 14-year project Parks undertook in 1969 in North Dakota. Some 11 Arikara narrators are mentioned in the introduction and short biographical notes are provided for each of the collaborators. However, not all the stories collected from them are included in this edition because *Myths and Traditions* contains only a selection of the material published in full in *Traditional Narratives of the Arikara Indians* (1991). For this reason, tales which are referred to in the introduction, taken from the 1991 version, do not match the present numeration. A concordance enables the reader to refer back to the original list's numbering.

The introduction is very complete in its sociolinguistic and anthropological background. It fully contextualizes the traditions with sections on Arikara mythology, history, and culture, with synthesis and yet detail. It also addresses the process through which the narratives have been recorded, and offers the reader a comprehensive explanation about translation, style and presentation. The linguistic section is rather extensive, and quite a lot of attention is granted to lexicology, morphology, and syntax of the oral text. Each sentence, and syntactic formation, has undergone a close linguistic scrutiny, understandably so given the fact that the original purpose of the research was to study the Arikara language, one of the Caddoan languages of the plains horticulturists.

Much attention is given to the orators' performative style, the question of perspective, and all the other stylistic features that have been 'assiduously preserved in the translations of the narratives...' (p.64). Parks also highlights the problems concerning a written version of oral narratives that need to be 'seen' as well as heard. This incompleteness, however, does not detract from the appeal that these narrations retain in spite of the mere textual rendering.

The collection includes material of diverse nature. An introduction to Arikara narrative typologies is given for the different *genres*, and a clear table explains the classifications. These are divided into true stories and tales. Some of the true stories are about the world's origins; other narratives are about visions, historical events, and the supernatural. A section is dedicated to trickster tales, and other adventures.

This collection of Arikara myths and legends follows an anthropological tradition that goes back to 1903, when James Murie started collecting oral material for the anthropologist George Dorsey, 18 years after the mission-

aries began to try to eradicate the Arikara's religious practices. Their representativeness is witness to the richness of contemporary Arikara knowledge and the endurance of their tradition that so poignantly emerges from this exquisite collection.

Massimiliano Carocci
 Department of Anthropology
 Goldsmiths College, University of London
 New Cross, London, SE14 6NW
 United Kingdom

Pelly, David G. and Kim Crockatt (Editors): *Uvajuq: The Origin of Death*. Illustrated by Elsie Anaginak Klengenberg. Cambridge Bay: Kitikmeot Heritage Society, 1999, ISBN 0-9690783-8-2, Pape, CDN\$ 24.95.

Narrative knowing has a long history. Storytelling is, in fact, the tradition of Aboriginal people across the world. In the Arctic, these narratives are called "*unikkaartuit*". *Uvajuq: The Origin of Death* is within this tradition. The story is rooted in a time when the people lived essentially in harmony with the land. It is a story told for generations, not simply a story but a "of the truth" narrative knowing the truth. The story begins: "A long time ago, when people lived forever, there was a family of giants who lived on the north side of *Kiilliniq*; the people lived in harmony." Yet, as in the Judeo-Christian story of Adam and Eve, the harmony ends. The story is, in fact, the *unikkaartuit* of death. It tells of a famine, a prevalent event in the past in the Arctic, and how the people became weak and died. Yet, as the Elders have told since the beginning of time, the people became the land. The land and people became one. Life continued, so did death. Homicide and even suicide entered the land. *Uvajuq* reflects a knowing that to survive, Inuit and all people need to work, to share and to be in harmony.

Yet, *Uvajuq* expresses much more than this truth. It weaves together art, science and the land to allow maybe even us in the South to know *Uvajuq*. The artist, Elsie Anaginak Klengenberg illustrates the story with a beautiful array of prints, which connect us to the traditional culture, the way of healing in the Arctic. Old photographs, in the tradition of Pitseolak's *People from Our Side*, add to the tale. And there is more. The people, with photographs of the Elders, share their knowing about the story. Frank Analok, for example, tells of vivid recollections of hearing the *Uvajuq* story. The book then tells of how the White man, *qaplunaat*, came. Moses Koihak reflects: "Those that were set to bring the message of the white man, they

were the first, long ago. Long before we were born, they started to travel, sent by their bosses, and now Inuit today have heard their message." The White man remapped the land. The story of *Uvajuq* was forgotten and the knowing was lost by many, but not forgotten, thanks to the Elders. The book even shows the *qaplunaat*, with their science, the truthfulness of the story; indeed, it uses science to prove the story.

I highly recommend this book to not only thanatologists who want to understand death, but to anyone who wants to understand life. Maybe through it, even the most close-minded of us in the South can understand the harmony of life and death. I marvel once more how narrative knowing goes beyond words.

Antoon A. Leenaars
Department of Clinical and
Health Psychology
University of Leiden
The Netherlands

Perdue, Theda: *Cherokee Women: Gender and Culture Change, 1700-1835*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1999, ISBN 0-80328-760-7 USA\$ 14.95.

This book is an excellent example of the strengths and weaknesses of ethnohistory as both premise and methodology. Perdue's introduction and conclusion are sensitive, insightful, and enlightening. The central historical analysis is detailed and thoroughly documented; it is also fundamentally flawed.

Ethnohistory is history about the people.¹ However, to simply 'do' histories of Aboriginal peoples according to the usual historical method, (that is to say, solely through documents) will inevitably produce partial histories, largely as these peoples were understood by European minds. Even with documents such as letters from First Nations leaders or councils of American (or Canadian) government officials, one is still reading First Nations' attempts to communicate across cultures. Such documents may or may not be representative of a people's understanding of particular situations. Rather, these were often highly strategic missives. Anthropologists also utilize exogenous ideologies and methods, but speak as well to the people they study. Ethnohistorians would be wise to adopt this practice when writing about peoples with an oral tradition. As this tradition certainly exists among the Cherokee, it is difficult to understand how one could

purport to write a history, and one of a fairly recent period at that, and not speak with the Cherokee Elder women about the histories they carry.²

Still I think this book has much to offer to scholars and students. The introduction is an excellent overview of many of the concerns and systemic problems in preparing histories about Indian peoples, and about Indian women in particular. While Perdue may not have carried out her work in the ways an Indigenist historian would, her discussion in the beginning is well worth reading. Similarly the conclusion contains a brilliant analysis of the implications, both political and legal, of the fact that amongst First Nations, agriculture, that standard of European land tenure and rights, was largely practiced by Indian women. Even so, while Perdue has done intensive research amongst the documents available from this time, we are still left waiting to learn what the Cherokee women themselves understood and understand about this period of their history.

Denise S. McConney
Department of English
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
Canada, S7N 5A5

Notes

1. There is a difference between histories of a people and the people's history. It is the latter which *Cherokee Women* lacks.
2. This is particularly odd when the very attractive cover art features contemporary Cherokee women leaders in 18th century dress, yet there is no mention of how these particular women understand this period of the history. Nor is there any reference to the involvement of any other Cherokee people in the preparation or crafting of this history.

Valentine, Lisa and Regna Darnell (Editors): *Theorizing the Americanist Tradition*. Toronto, Ontario: University of Toronto, 1999, ISBN 0-80208-077-4 CDN\$ 29.95.

Theorizing The Americanist Tradition is the first attempt to analytically reflect upon North American scholarship methods and theories, and their place in the global history of anthropology. Moreover, it is an attempt of

explicitly acknowledge the strong historical legacies that have influenced the scholarly work carried out in contemporary North American academia. This praiseworthy effort has brought together, in a volume of nearly 400 pages, some of the most revered names in North American scholarship to give a solid and comprehensive overview of the historical development of Canadian and American anthropological theory and practice. The book is the result of a combination of 25 conference papers and personal reflections, and provides a timely reminder that the Americanist tradition has, so far, been highly undertheorized.

The introduction by the editors Lisa Valentine and Regna Darnell delineates the main features of this tradition, pinpointing in a rather schematic, yet rigorous way, what in their view continues to characterize the Americanist legacy in opposition to other schools of old and new anthropological thought. The book, however, does not stop at the explicit recognition of the *traits d'union* that tie together past and present North American scholarship, but also ask questions about the future of this legacy and the possibilities for change. Indeed, most of this book's verve is given by the open-endedness of the questions it raises.

The book also invites the reader to discover links between the effervescent and often idiosyncratic strands of theory that have appeared in North America, from Boasian historical particularism to Geertzian hermeneutic perspective. Part of the book's strength lies in its capacity to create a dialogue between the contributors across the three vaguely time-bound chapters that organize the narrative structure of the book. This dialogical perspective, as suggested in the introduction, is one of the main characteristics at the core of the Americanist tradition (p.4).

The variety of perspectives presented in the essays points to the extreme eclecticism of the Americanist tradition. The papers collected here address themes such as the early Americanist scholar's engagement with nationalism, the importance of cultural relativism in the history of anthropology, and the concern of Americanist theorists with questions of authenticity. Other essays explore the place of text in anthropological writing and theory, and the relevance progressively gained by linguistics in the holistic perspective of Americanist thinkers. The book also touches upon the relationship between narrative structures and lived experience and the role of cognitive science in cross-cultural research. It does not forget the debt of today's Queer theory to the purely Americanist tradition of language and culture.

This book is a complete and critical complement to graduate and postgraduate reading lists, and is certainly an important contribution to the

development of contemporary anthropological theorizing well beyond the geographical boundaries of North America.

Massimiliano Carocci
Department of Anthropology
Goldsmiths College, University of London
New Cross, London, SE14 6NW
United Kingdom