BOOK REVIEWS

Alfred, Gerald R.: *Heeding the Voices of our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and the Rise of Native Nationalism.* Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1995, ISBN 19-5411382, Paper CDN $24.95.

Gerald R. Alfred is a professor of political science at Concordia University. He is also a Kahnawake Mohawk who has made significant behind-the-scenes contributions to the political life of his home territory in a relatively short amount of time. He has assisted the Mohawk council of Kahnawake--the community's Band Council--in such areas as land claims research, membership policy, and moves toward the restoration of traditional government. He was part of the Band Council negotiating team during the "Oka Crisis" of 1990. In this book, based on his dissertation, he presents one Kahnawake Mohawk perspective on nationalism, built on a solid history of the community's political institutions. There is something distinctive here: political theory that critically engages the mainstream from a Native perspective, written by an active participant in the processes he describes.

Kahnawake is a name familiar to most readers who follow Native politics in Canada. Journalists have focused on its leaders' defiant insistence on Native Sovereignty and their belligerent refusal to give control over their future to outside entities, particularly during and since the events of 1990. Yet this is the first published full-length academic study of the community. [1] In fact, the historical sketch in chapters two and three of *Heeding the Voices of Our Ancestors* reveals a small community adjacent to Montreal that has stood at the vortex of a long series of critical movements in Native and Euroamerican culture, politics, economics, and religion. Amidst this complex history, Alfred's interest is in the dynamism and adaptability of traditional identity, expressed in collective decisions that draw upon traditional roots to build, maintain, modify, and transform political institutions in response to changing external environments. Today he finds this dynamism best represented in the political objectives and strategies of the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake (MCK).

The essence of the book's findings is that the distinctive, uncompromising stance of the MCK vis-à-vis Canada--and even more strongly,

Quebec--is grounded in two opposite qualities of Kahnawake political history. Internally, the community maintains a strongly felt but complicated connection to a long Indigenous tradition of political independence, namely, the Iroquois "Great Law," or *Kaianerenkowa.* To his credit Alfred does not ignore the mitigating, filtering effect of the Jesuit presence and three centuries of Roman Catholicism at Kahnawake; I would go a little further and suggest that Catholicism simultaneously weakened and strengthened traditional identity at Kahnawake.

At the same time, in terms of external influence Kahnawake's leaders could scarcely have afforded the luxury of a purist approach to tradition anyway, since they were kept busy from the very beginning fending off threats to its small landbase and its distinct identity. There was no shield of geographical isolation for Kahnawake. Thus in Alfred's adaptation of the standard historical institutional model, the *Kaianerenkowa,* found under the category "formal rules," is only one of three basic components (19-20). The other two are the Band council and the *Indian Act,* both undeniable facts of life, both originally imposed with the threat of force, and now more than a century later, both still reflecting alien values and aspirations more often than not.

Out of the interplay of these internal and external factors, Alfred believes that MCK politics constitutes an important vanguard in Native North America, based on the community's refusal to abandon traditional identity and objectives, but equally, its refusal to be bound by overly literalistic, impractical interpretations of tradition. Between imitating the European nation-state and being swallowed up by it, this ideology works toward a self-defined objective: what Alfred describes as cultural or community sovereignty, or "group autonomy reflected in formal self--government arrangements in co-operation with existing state institutions" (p.14).

This defiantly co-operative politic will doubtless appear mature, far-sighted, and justified--perhaps even promising--to liberal-minded observers on the outside. They will feel relieved, for instance, when Alfred asks on page 90 whether the desired structure of government for Kahnawake would require "a complete redesign of the mechanism used by Canada to relate with the community," and quickly replies, "Most Mohawks think not." Yet there is a problem here. It takes very little exposure to political rhetoric within the community to realize that such an ethno-nationalist consensus may exist only among the Band Council Chiefs. In the course of my own research I could scarcely avoid expressions of deep-seated resistance to Band Council leadership, particularly among those who explicitly identify themselves as traditionalist or "Longhouse." As evidence for a non-traditionalist consensus, Alfred presents results of an undated

survey which he conducted for the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples; yet a close reading reveals that the questionnaire was returned by only 80 Mohawks out of a total population of around 6,000. Full statistical data is not provided but the sample would appear too small and self-selective to draw general conclusions.

In fact there may be substantive as well as statistical grounds for suggesting alternatives to Alfred's critique of traditionalism. In my own dissertation I came to some of the same conclusions he does regarding the three Longhouses at Kahnawake: specifically, how each seems to embody a different element of the traditional formula, *"Ské:nen, ka'shatsténhsera, karihwí:io,"* (peace, strength, the good message). But I strongly disagree with Alfred's blanket characterization of Longhouse traditionalists as "purist," and his claim that:

> Mohawks clearly distinguish between form and content, and in their evaluation of the Longhouse alternative to the Indian Act system, they recognize a familiar format vacant of any truly traditional values (93).

Or that:

> Mohawks have moved far beyond the Longhouse people in modernising traditional Mohawk values and principles. Where the Longhouse maintains an interpretation and strategy based on re-implementing an old order, most Mohawks have taken the next step toward integrating them in the new political reality (106).

Simply put, in my conversations with Longhouse participants I have encountered a wide range of attitudes, hopes, and strategies, including some that are extraordinarily profound, perceptive, and present-tense. Purists and oversimplifiers there are, but their sometimes strident voices do not speak for all Longhouse people any more than a Pat Buchanan speaks for all Christians. In any case it would seem ill-advised to plot a course into traditional government that simply ignores Longhouse people, at least some of whom must be considered the present keepers of the tradition! To do so would be to relegate the Longhouse to being a church, and so to institutionalise a radically anti-traditional separation of spirituality and decision-making.

Perhaps because of Alfred's own involvement and stake in Kahnawake politics, his is not a completely objective account. Yet despite his perhaps overeager dismissal of traditionalism there is a great deal that is compelling and worthwhile in this book. Kahnawake may not be as close to consensus on these issues as Alfred indicates, but in general terms the project he

describes seems essential: the reformulation of traditional values and structures in ways that engage present realities. Especially instructive here is chapter five, in which Alfred attempts to uncover the political objectives and conceptual frameworks of individual participants in Kahnawake political decision-making through interviews with two past Band Council Grand Chiefs and the present holder of that title. Despite the idiosyncratic nature of these interviews they do portray something of the historical and ideological depth behind modern Kahnawake politics, beginning with the abrupt end of trust in Canadian paternalism following the expropriation of fully one fifth of Kahnawake territory for the construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway in 1956, against the protests of the Band Council. Alfred's summary is succinct and convincing:

> Kahnawake Mohawks have shaped a consistent message out of the various elements previously identified.., as the characteristics of a nascent "nativism" during the 1950s. These have been modernised and consolidated into three core principles: the achievement of sovereignty through the re-implementation of a traditional form of government; the strengthening of an identity of distinct peoplehood through a focus on ancestry; and the redress of historical injustices surrounding the dispossession of Mohawks from their traditional lands (76).

Models of nationalism that focus on the nation-state must either hide Indigenous histories and aspirations entirely, or else oversimplify them to the point of absurdity. Both embodying and extending European historical contexts, they insist that North American First Peoples have only two choices: to become pitifully inadequate imitation nation-states imbued with traditional pride and tilting at colonialist windmills; or else to become mere municipalities with but token vestiges of Aboriginal tradition--the kind easily sold to tourists. Alfred cites a small group of political theorists who have developed alternative models of "Ethno-Nationalism" in which local autonomy is the underlying objective rather than the creation of new ethnic states, but then he goes on to show how even this general concept must be translated into specific local histories and conceptual frames. "Cultural sovereignty" has a far different ring in the midst of a Native North American history such as that of Kahnawake, than in a place such as Chechnya or Northern Ireland.

Alfred has drawn up an intriguing, highly textured, historically grounded study of one instance in these processes, an instance that may indeed be instructive not only for the members of other Indigenous territories but for all communities of people who maintain some sense of traditional identity

yet find themselves surrounded by hostile and alien economic and cultural forces.

Christopher R. Jocks
Native American Studies Program
and Department of Religion
Dartmouth College
Hanover, New Hampshire
03755-3530

Note

One unpublished study of Kahnawake based on fieldwork in the late 1970s is David Blanchard's 1982 dissertation, *Patterns of Tradition* and Change: *The Re-Creation of Iroquois Culture at Kahnawake* (University of Chicago). A number of journalistic treatments of the so-called "Oka Crisis" have also appeared, such as Geoffrey York and Loreen Pindera's *People of the Pines: The Warriors and the Legacy of Oka* (1991), and Paul Hornung's *One Nation underthe Gun* (1991).

Boyd, Robert: *People ofthe Dalles: The Indians of Wascopam Mission: An Historical Ethnography Basedon the Papers ofthe Methodist Missionaries.* (Studies in the Anthropology ofNorth American Indians). Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1996, ISBN 0-8032-1236-4, Cloth US $50.00.

This excellent ethnohistory is largely based on the writings of Henry Perkins, Methodist missionary at the Oregon missions of the Columbia River from 1838 to 1844. This volume creates a classic ethnography using these and other writings (extending the time frame back to 1805, in fact), essentially comparing all sources, published and otherwise, that deal with the various peoples who lived at and around The Dalles during the crucial decades between first contact and the arrival of settlers in the 1840s and 1850s. The ethnography covers the first 220 pages; the journals and other documents are included in the final 120 pages.

Fortunately Perkins and others seem to have had few preconceived notions about Native social and political organization--there seems to be little of the Enlightenment claptrap of the Noble Savage. As Boyd states (p.8), Perkins was "an educated man, though not overly so... ". Boyd (and we) are fortunate that Perkins and his wife Elvira seem to have been tolerant, sensitive persons and careful observers. The journals are all

Perkins', however, so we only glimpse his wife's observations first-hand through a few letters and second-hand through Perkins' notes. It is relatively easy to see Perkins' personality through his writings and so we can more easily judge his biases. In a sense, the documents at the base of this study are easier to decipher than the Jesuit Relations dealing with eastern peoples, a somewhat ironic situation given the popular stereotype of the hellfire-and-brimstone Methodists compared to the more intellectual Jesuits. And despite Boyd's tendency sometimes to refer to the Whites as one culture, the documents are relatively few so that we are essentially getting one man's--Perkins'--bird's-eye view of the complex interrelationships among Plateau cultures thai existed at the start of the massive epidemics of the end of the 18th century and the colonial expansion which fundamentally changed the situation. Not all readers will read the original documents in the final third of the book, but Boyd wisely cites extensive passages when comparing differences of opinion in the ethnographic literature in the first part.

In the Dalles region two linguistic families (Kiksht/"Chinookan" and Columbia River Sahaptin/"Walla Walla") met but, typical to the Plateau area, there seems to have been no clear tribal or geographic boundaries sincetribes as such (with centralising tendencies in the institutions of power, and clan and phratric organization) seem to have been absent throughout the Plateau before the development of later pan-Indian millenarian movements and political confederacies.

The first chapter deals ably with the history of contact and sets the stage for later work by not reducing the missionary setting to a minimum. Some historical details of Mission life sometimes seem tedious but in the end set the stage for later developments, and hence we never forget that as "pre-contact" and "pristine" as some of the later accounts may seem, there was and had been considerable merchant activity in the area.

Trade was not new to The Dalles, of course, being a major point of intersection for various linguistic groupings and also the confluence of several ecosystems, a point substantiated in the second chapter, "Human Geography." It is in the third chapter, "Subsistence and Economics," that we begin to get a clearer picture of what made The Dalles a special region and the Plateau as a whole a relatively difficult culture area to analyze if anthropologists are bent on applying classic anthropological concepts such as "tribe" and "economic base." Major food bases were salmon and plant foods, and hunting was of secondary importance. This may not seem unusual for salmon-rich areas like the West Coast, but unlike the Pacific Coast peoples, the peoples of the Plateau had an abundance of nearby game which they underexploited. Given the conflicting pulls of winter

aggregation and summer dispersal to gather wild foods, people obviously preferred to invest the village with meaning as a node of some sort from which flexible social relationships were extended--semi-sedentary Bands, in short.[1] Classic ethnographies of the area always mentioned the slave trade, but Boyd's research shows there was considerable trade activity with the Cayuse and Nez Percé in salmon and hides as well (p.63), even though this trade could have been a kind of tribute offered by the western Plateau peoples to the more organised central and eastern tribes, who were obviously influenced by their regular contacts with war-like peoples of the Plains.

This is not unimportant evidence, since the influence of the Plateau upon the religious forms of outside groups has long been a focus of debate. The idea of tribute skews the relationship and therefore the direction of influence from the outside to the Plateau, although Cayuse and Nez Percé participation in Dalles winter dances (p.67) and intermarriage suggest that the relationship was not all one-sided This question is taken up again in detail in Chapter 6. Boyd also shows that White goods quickly entered Aboriginal trading networks though they did not displace trade in slaves and dentalgia shells.

The mobility and social flexibility of the people of The Dalles are examined in Chapter 4. Beyond linking such mobility to the need for maintaining ties in order to ensure access to widely dispersed resources (including firewood in many parts of the Plateau), no adequate theoretical understanding of the region's social organization has emerged, and Boyd's work is no exception. He does, however, detail the rules that governed reciprocity, an important linchpin of the system, as well as conflict resolution and political hierarchy--dimensions of social life that are never strongly expressed (revenge was largely individual and involved semi-ritualised feuding; Chiefs had limited powers) and somewhat ritualised or located in the abstract realm of the spirits in order to maintain a sometimes uneasy but workable balance and ensure flexibility. The same conclusions emerge from the following chapter, "Ritual Behavior: Life-Cycle Ceremonies." In the following chapter on spirit beliefs and related ceremonies, Boyd provides the same balanced and detailed survey of the published and archival literature. One can see, in the details provided here and in Chapter 9 ("Religious Change Before the Missions"), the basis for later Reserve-Era revivalist movements such as the Feather Cult and the Shaker Church, movements that Boyd implicitly suggests were as much the result of the void created by the missionaries leaving the area as they were the result of direct cultural domination by the missions.

The next two chapters deal with cultural change associated with White contact. There is nothing essentially new that emerges from Boyd's examination of changes in material culture, but he clearly shows changes in slavery and inter-group conflict linked to the introduction of the gun. He provides new evidence that clearly shows the so-called "Plateau Whipping Complex" (flagellation as punishment for breaking rules) to have been the result of the Law Code introduced by an Indian agent named Elijah White in 1842. Ostensibly fair and democratic, the code did not fit Aboriginal theories of social control, as Boyd shows. He also details that no matter how well-intentioned and relatively non-racist for its time it may have been, its application was sometimes less than fair. Here, as in previous chapters, Boyd is content with describing several case histories rather than drawing any explicit conclusions himself. The evidence he presents on the Methodist derivation of the famous Catholic Ladder (Chapter 10) is interesting and new, as far as I know.

Boyd presents no concluding chapter. His method is to always let the evidence speak for itself. Of course, evidence is always selected and filtered through ideological biases and rhetorical strategies and devices, but in this case Boyd has made a genuine effort to let all parties and events speak for themselves as much as it is possible to do so given 150 years of cultural change and obvious limits on the documents. All in all, Boyd's *People of The Dalles* is a commendable, thought-provoking and extremely well-written book that balances the tendency of professional ethnohistorians to overwhelm and dazzle with never-ending minutiae the semi-biographical but obviously more interesting life and case histories. Not only is this excellent volume of interest to specialist scholars, it should also fascinate all who are interested in using archival documents, and who nowadays claim to be exclusively field anthropologists (or for that matter, "pure" ethnohistorians). Apart from the caution with which Boyd teases facts from the documents and the skill with which he presents them, we should be glad that he has also rescued from relative obscurity the writings of a man who, after internal wrangling caused him and his wife to abandon their life's work and return East, was never to be heard of again except for a few letters to old friends in the West--an ordinary man, perhaps whom circumstances transformed into an extraordinary observer.

Guy Lanoue
Département d'anthropologie
Université de Montréal
C.P. 6128, succursale centre-ville
Montreal, Quebec
Canada, H3C 3J7

Note

See C. Miller, *Prophetic Worlds,* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1985, pp. 11-13; V. Ray, *The Sanpoil and the Nespelem: Salishan Peoples of Northeastern Washington,* Seattle: University of Washington Publications in Anthropology, vol. 5, p. 27; H.J. Spinden, *The Nez-Percé Indians,* Memoirs of the American Anthropological Association, vol. 2 pt. 3, Menasha: American Anthropological Association, 1908, pp. 203-204; J. Jorgensen, *Western Indians,* San Fransisco, W.H Freeman and Co. 1980, Map CU 63/V-199, p. 392.

Cole, Douglas: Captured Heritage: *The Scramble for Northwest Coast Artifacts.* Vancouver: UBC Press, 1995, (Reprint of 1985 Edition), ISBN 0-7748-0537-4, Paper CDN $24.95.

This reprint edition of Douglas Cole's important 1985 work detailing the last major period of fevered collecting of artifacts from the supposedly "dying race" of Amerindians living on the northwest Pacific coast between the 1870s and 1930s comes at a significant time in the evolving relationships between modem First Nations and museums. Canadian museums and First Nations have jointly agreed to some basic principles to guide the sometimes troubled relations between the two (Hill and Nicks, 1992). The Preface to the new edition places the original work in the context of recent cases of First Nations material culture being "repatriated" from the museums which had originally collected it by fair means or foul during the above period.

Cole uses unpublished documents from many museum sources to tell the story of museum collection processes and relations with the contemporary First Nations groups on the coast. Some nefarious collection practices, such as grave robbing and theft from abandoned villages, which have long been condemned by First Nations are detailed.

Included is the history of the development of some of the great museums in Canada, the United States, and Europe based on the artifacts removed from the Amerindian cultures living in British Columbia. Also told is the story of the competition among the museums and their staffs for the highly valued materials originating from the northwest Pacific coast. For students of the history of anthropology, there is also a wealth of information on the development of this field and the controversy between those such as Franz Boas and Otis T. Mason regarding the validity of the evolutionary versus the culture area concept of exhibition techniques.

This newly reprinted work is certainly a welcome means of accessing Cole's earlier work and it is a worthwhile addition to the libraries of those

interested in the history of anthropology, museums, and sociocultural aspects of the northwest Pacific coast. It provides background to the more recent publications (Karp and Lavine, 1991; Stocking, Jr., 1985) dealing with the relations between First Nations peoples and museums as well as the problems inherent in museum representations of the "other".

Paul C. Thistle
Apt. 3, 275A Parliament Street
Toronto, Ontario
Canada, M5A 2Z6

References

Hill, Tom and Trudy Nicks
1992 *Turning the Page: Forging New Partnerships. Task Force Report on Museums and First Peoples.* Ottawa: Assembly of First Nations and the Canadian Museums Association.

Karp, Ivan and Stephen D. Lavine
1991 *Exhibiting Cultures: The Poetics and Politics of Museum Display.* Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Stocking, George W. Jr.
1985 *Objects and Others: Essays on Museums and Material Culture.* Madison, Wisc.: University Wisconsin Press.

Csonka, Yvon. *Les Ahiarmiut: A l'écart des Inuit Caribous.* Editions Victor Attinger. Neuchâtel, Switzerland, 1995, ISBN 2-88380-007-3, Paper SF 66.

Les Ahiarmiut: A l'écart des Inuit Caribous is Yvon Csonka's doctoral thesis about a group of Inuit that lived inland in the Canadian Barren Lands, "away from others (hence their name) and that are thought to represent the last of the Caribou Inuit. As Csonka explains in his introduction, the latter entity is an artificial construct devised by Kaj Birket-Smith and Knud Rasmussen, two members of the Fifth Thule Expedition who were interested in the Inuit whom they thought originated in the Canadian interior near Great Slave Lake. To them, the inland Inuit living west of Hudson Bay and exploiting caribou almost exclusively, were drastically different from the other Inuit they met who were more marine adapted. Birket-Smith in

particular saw them as the last representative of a very ancient ice hunting culture which came from Europe.

According to Csonka, the two ethnographers were so absorbed by their theory that they ignored the fact that the population of the people they encountered during the 1920s had been reduced in size by half due to numerous famines and seemed on the verge of extinction (see also Burch, 1988). It would take more than 30 years for archaeologists to dismiss Birket-Smith's ideas but the stereotype of the Caribou Inuit as more "primitive" than other Inuit societies would stick. Even when their association with an archaic culture was attacked, the "primitiveness" of the Caribou Inuit was seen as a degeneration due to acculturation which happened much earlier than previously anticipated.

Csonka's interest in the Ahiarmiut came from the fact that although they form a small society which went through a major population reduction, they preserved their distinct identity. In effect, after numerous famines that reduced their number to less than 50 people, the Ahiarmiut still lived inland very isolated from other Inuit and Dene groups previous to their deportation in 1958 to Arviat (Eskimo Point).

In the first part of the book we learn that there are two prevailing hypotheses about the origins of the Caribou Inuit: they may have developed in situ from Thule ancestors, first as a coastal people, and then migrating inland, or they may be part of the Copper Inuit with whom they split and migrated inland to the Barren Lands. Probably because his Ahiarmiut informants told him that they came from the Paallirmiut whose territory encompasses the western Hudson coast, and because historical documents attest their presence there in the 17th century, Csonka identifies the origins of the Caribou Inuit as being along the Hudson coast. Their peopling of the tundra took place between 1790 and 1860, and might have been linked to the retreat of the Chipewyan from that area and the lack of caribou along the coast. From 1860 to 1917 the Caribou Inuit population expanded and this is when Csonka thinks that the Ahiarmiut started to form a distinct society. At their highest density, between 1880 and 1915, the Ahiarmiut numbered around 300 to 400 people. This quick human expansion in what appears to have been an unknown territory, is certainly interesting from an archaeological perspective for insights into how long it takes for human populations to settle in a new territory. It also suggests, as pointed out by Csonka, the limitations of the hypothesis that views hunter-gatherer populations as practicing population and resource control to preserve a state of equilibrium. Alternatively, the Ahiarmiut were possibly increasing to reach a number necessary to be stable in the long term in the environment they occupied.

At the time of this population increase, contacts with Euro-Canadians were minimal, although some Ahiarmiut acted as middlemen between the Copper Inuit and the traders until trading posts were established near the Copper Inuit. Csonka, as other authors, wonders if the trade with the Copper Inuit might have contributed to the prosperity of the Ahiarmiut during the period. Unfortunately, the question remains unanswered. Periods of famine took place between 1917 and 1926 and the overall population of all the Caribou Inuit was reduced by more than half. While all other Caribou Inuit societies were being dissolved, the Ahiarmiut continued to participate minimally in the fur trade and had a very traditional way of life.

Csonka links the famines to a lack of caribou and to the extinction of muskox in the area, which the Caribou Inuit would have relied on when caribou were scarce. Interestingly, the Ahiarmiut interviewed about the famines did not blame the lack of caribou but the lack of ammunition and the failure of spearing caribou from kayaks, a method that was usually the most efficient to get large supplies of caribou. Incidentally, interviews with the Ahiarmiut convinced Csonka that their use of fire arms was minimal until the 1950s. However, it is clear from historical documents that since the end of the last century, fire arms were bought by some Ahiarmiut. The introduction of such new technology, even if used sparingly, and the drastic disappearance of knowledgeable Elders during the famines, must have somewhat diminished the importance of traditional hunting tools.

Although Csonka doubts that caribou were depleted by the Inuit, he is convinced, as was Burch (1977), that muskox disappeared due to an excessive exploitation by humans. We learn that from 1820 to 1917, 10,000 muskox were killed by the Inuit and the Chipewyan but this number means little if we do not know the viable population of that species. If, as we are told, the Caribou Inuit were minimally involved in the trapping economy during that period, why would they bother to trade excessive number of muskox hides? The present rapid increase of muskox on Banks Island (Struzik, 1995) and the parallel disappearance of caribou on this island where the muskox were also thought to have been exterminated by humans, raise more questions than answers about muskox population dynamics and about possible resources competition between the caribou and muskox. Furthermore, Csonka does not tell us if he asked the Ahiarmiut about the presumed extinction of muskox. However, he suggests that the Caribou Inuit might not have had the time to acquire sufficient traditional knowledge regarding the location of caribou and the ecology of muskox in the new region they inhabited, and were thus more susceptible to famines.

The second part of the book deals specifically with the Ahiarmiut from 1920 to 1950. During these years the economy of the Ahiarmiut was affected by the fluctuations of caribou herds and the instability of fox prices.

In effect, following the famines that reduced their population, the Ahiarmiut entered the trapping economy in the 1920s, although on a small scale. However, more periods of famine were to come and the Ahiarmiut were finally deported by the Canadian government to Arviat in 1958. In Chapter 9, which deals with the relation of the Ahiarmiut with their Inuit and Chipewyan neighbors, we learn that they had friendly contact with the latter and that in some cases, they spoke each other's language. To acquire such knowledge would mean that Ahiarmiut and Chipewyan families must have cohabited during certain times of the year, as was indeed reported in the literature and to Csonka.

My major disappointment with the second part of the book is that very little of Csonka's interviews with the Ahiarmiut is presented, especially after the stimulating discussion about the methods of doing oral history in the introduction. At the end of the book, it almost comes as a surprise to read the names of 37 "main informants." Although the author chose to incorporate the results of his interviews throughout the text, I would have preferred the information directly from the Ahiarmiut, even through translations and thus somewhat distorted versions of their narration.

Csonka's writing style and choice of words are not always easy to read, even for a francophone. He often presents at length evidence that could have been summarized and occasionally uses convoluted sentences that are hard to follow. His extensive use of footnotes breaks the flow of the text and although they are all interesting, they do not always add much to the information presented in each chapter. There are a few statements that are somewhat misleading, like the one about steatite and sandstone being the only lithic raw materials used by the Inuit. Chert and quartzite were also available and used in the past by people inhabiting the Keewatin region (e.g., Stewart, 1994).

This said, the book is essential for anyone interested in the ethnohistory of Caribou Inuit or on how small hunter-gatherer societies faced with demographic crisis can survive. Furthermore, the study is extremely well documented. Indeed, its overall quality was recognized before the book was published when Csonka was awarded the 1991-1992 prize for the best thesis in social sciences at the Université Laval in Quebec. I hope that it will soon be translated into English to be accessible not only to English scholars but mostly to younger generations of Ahiarmiut.

Murielle Nagy
GÉTIC
Université Laval
Pavilion Jean-Durand
Québec, Quebec
Canada, G1K 7P4

References

Burch, Ernest S., Jr.

1988 Knuk Rasmussen and the "Original" Inland Eskimos of Southern Keewatin. Etudes Inuit Studies 12(1-2):81-100.

1977 Muskox and Man in the Central Canadian Subarctic 1689-1974. *Arctic* 30(3):135-154.

Stewart, Andrew

1994 Report of a Preliminary Investigation through Archaeology and Oral History of the site of Piqqiq (150X), a Caribou Water-Crossing on the Kazan River, District of Keewatin, Northwest Territories. Unpublished manuscript.

Struzik, Ed

1995 Muskox Heaven: The Fall and Rise of the Banks Island Muskox. *Canadian Wildlife* 1 (1):18-25.

Grumet, Robert S.: *Historical Contact: Indian People and Colonists in Today's Northeastern United States in the Sixteenth Through Eighteenth Centuries.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. ISBN 0-8061-2700-7, $47.50.

Historical Contact is a revised version of a 1993 report written by archaeologist Robert Grumet for the United States Historic Landmarks Survey. Grumet located, surveyed, and mapped historic Aboriginal sites as well as colonial trading posts and forts, and synthesized an incredible variety of secondary sources to supplement his work in the field. The resulting book is a monumental achievement that provides the most informative and authoritative statement on our current understanding of the archaeology of contact between Europeans and Native Americans in the Northeastern United States. However, as a synthesis Historic Contact reformulates what we do know but has little to offer in terms of what we do not know. The book's lack of historiographical punch notwithstanding, it will be an invaluable reference tool for years to come.

Grumet organized the study according to discrete physiographic regions within the Northeast--the North Atlantic, the Middle Atlantic, the Trans-Appalachian region, and the Upper Ohio Country. Within each regional grouping, the author discusses the historical and archaeological legacies of Native "countries," lands associated with particular Aboriginal

groups. Because the tribes of the Northeast were frequently on the move, Grumet's geographical approach enables him to portray the dynamic histories of different peoples as they migrated across fixed spaces.

Of particular use to students of Native American history is the author's ability to synthesize current archaeological scholarship without losing sight of the artifactual evidence of contact and culture change. Each "country" study is accompanied by a map locating the various sites as well as copious illustrations of artifacts, site details, and artists' drawings. Moreover, by placing individual archaeological studies in a regional context, Grumet explains intraregional differences in the chronology of contact and colonization while emphasizing common themes. Contact, Grumet argues, expanded and intensified the Indigenous order; trade, warfare, and migration transformed from important parts of Native life to its defining qualities. Such themes have characterized the monographic literature on the tribes of the Northeast, and it is useful to see that they are valid at the regional level as well.

Neither Grumet's arguments nor his conclusions are particularly earth-shattering, and the book affirms moreso than it revises current scholarship. But *Historic Contact* is valuable because it presents decades of archaeological scholarship in a coherent and organized fashion, and it uses geography rather than culture to organize an interpretation of the Native American past. The book will be a valuable addition to library collections and should find its way onto the bookshelves of specialists. Yet, for all of the book's worth, it is frstrating in some respects. Grumet had to exclude the Native peoples of Canada because the mission of the project was to examine sites in the United States. Imposing present boundaries on earlier landscapes skews the material and creates a false sense of region. Some scholars will also quibble over the use of geographical rather than cultural boundaries. Most troublesome is the lack of a conclusion. Having presented a dizzying array of microhistories, Grumet does not tie them all together at the end, nor does he synthesize the microhistories into a regional metahistory. Historic Contact is an impressive volume that marks where we are--where we go remains to be seen.

James Taylor Carson
Department of History
Queen's University
Kingston, Ontario
Canada, K7L 3N6

Isaac, Thomas: *Aboriginal Law: Cases, Materials, and Commentary.* Saskatoon: Purich Publishing, 1995. ISBN 1-895830-05-2, Paper CDN $33.00.

The material covered in this book deals with nine major topics covering most of the important and salient issues facing Aboriginal peoples today. The author begins each chapter with a brief overview of the court decision, the rationale for that decision, and the implications of the decision. This is followed by excerpts from each of the cases presented along with a brief summary of the decision. This preliminary information is important because many readers, like the present one, are not legal experts and at times have difficulty understanding the jargonistic, obtuse, and highly specific language used by the legal community and courts.

Chapter One focuses on Aboriginal title and explores the courts' thinking on this issue by looking at three sub-dimensions: source and nature of Aboriginal title, proof of Aboriginal title and extinguishment of Aboriginal title. The editor then presents cases and materials which bear on the subject at hand. For example, material from the *Worcester v. Georgia, St. Catherine's Milling and Lumber Co. v. R. and R. v. Sparrow* are presented. Should anyone wish to go back to the original case or look at additional materials on the subject matter, the editor presents a select bibliography on the topics covered at the end of the chapter.

Chapter Two deals with Treaty Rights and its linkage to Aboriginal rights. Chapter Three covers the federal-provincial-territorial legislative authority and set the stage for Chapter Four which focuses on hunting, fishing, and trapping rights. Chapter Five addresses Aboriginal issues unique to the Métis and Inuit and discusses how historical Acts such as the *Manitoba Act, 1870* bear on today's issues. Taxation is the centre of discussion in Chapter Six and provides a current look at how Aboriginals must deal with both provincial and federal tax law. Chapter Seven narrowly focuses on Aboriginal rights and the *Constitution Act,* 1982. Specifically the editor looks at Section 35 of the Act and Section 25 of the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.*

The last two chapters focus on contentious issues both within and outside the Aboriginal community. Chapter Eight addresses the issue of self-government and the courts' perspective. In addition, the author provides several examples of self-government as they now exist in Canada, e.g., Sechelt Indians, Cree-Naskapi, and Teslin Tlingit. The final chapter deals with Aboriginal women. The author introduces relevant legislative and constitutional provisions as well as presenting court cases and decisions made by the Human Rights Commission.

The author is both a lawyer and political scientist. As he notes at the outstart of the book, the material is not meant to be a comprehensive treatise on Aboriginal law. Rather it is to serve as an introduction and overview for the lay-person to some of the issues now facing Canadians and Canadian Aboriginal people. The editor uses the term "Aboriginal" or "Indian" throughout the text, although on occasion he lapses into using the concept First Nations; explaining that these are legal terms and reflect the words and decisions of the court. Moreover, he notes that most Aboriginal law has emerged out of Indian litigation.

The criteria for which case law or what set of materials was to be included are, from the perspective of the reader, those cases which set new directions in Aboriginal law or which supported or clarified existing law. Other materials have been included so that the reader can understand either the historical context from which the dispute emerged or the issues before the courts. There will be some who feel that the author left out some "essential" cases and I suspect the editor would probably agree, but with limited space I think his choices are well reasoned.

The cases included in the text deal with Canadian Abodginal law as the courts have interpreted it over the past two centuries. However, the cases included are not all Canadian and the inclusion of cases from both the United States, e.g., *Worcester v. Georgia, and Australia, e.g., Mabo v. Queensland,* are important additions. When the entire collection is read, the reader is able to understand the historical context which spawned the court cases and the changes taking place in Aboriginal law as we head into the 21st century. Moreover, having the original text allows the reader to see the reasoning by the courts for the decision they rendered. If there is any downside to the text, it might be that the editor needs to include (or at least provide a bibliography for) those legal cases at the lower court level, which have not been appealed but nevertheless have had an impact on the daily lives of Aboriginal people.

Both the editor and the publisher are to be congratulated for coming together and producing an excellent piece of work that will be of great benefit to nonlegal scholars as well as the general public.

James S. Frideres
Department of Sociology
The University of Calgary
Calgary, Alberta
Canada, T2N 1N4

Lithman, Y. Georg, Rick R. Riewe, Raymond E. Wiest, and Robert E Wrigley (Editors): *People and Land in Northern Manitoba. 1990 Conference at the University of Manitoba* (Anthropology Papers No. 32). Winnipeg: University of Manitoba 1992. ISSN 9227-0072, Paper CDN $23.06.

This book is a compilation of 25 papers presented at the *Conference on People and Land in Northern Manitoba,* held at the University of Manitoba in May, 1990. The purpose of the conference was to provide a forum for informed public discussion of the forces behind, and implications of, development and land issues in northern Manitoba. A key feature of the conference was that "Aboriginal People were not only an item for discussion at an academic conference, which is so often the case, but were integrally involved in the organization and participation in the majority of the sessions."

The papers in this volume are presented under eight different "Parts" to give them a logical sequence. In Part I: The North Imagined, Doris Young discusses the impact on her Cree culture of the northern Manitoba Hydro Electric Projects. The focus of her paper is on traditional values and the relationship between the Cree and the land. She describes how flooding from hydroelectric dams affected not only economic aspects of their life such as gathering berries and mosses, hunting, fishing, and trapping, but also their physical health through dietary changes and their spiritual health through the loss of their connectedness to the earth and dependence upon welfare instead of traditional self-sufficiency Then Ruth McCleary, an English teacher who lived in Labrador, discusses the different perspectives presented by Canadian authors who traveled in the North and wrote about their experiences.

In Part I1: How the North Became the North, Jean Friesen's paper examines the perceptions of the North as presented in the writings of succeeding generations of Manitoba historians, from the fur-trade period to the present. Gerald Friesen provides an outline of northern Manitoba political, economic, and European-Canadian cultural history, from 1870-1970. John Loxley completes Part II with a discussion of the dynamics of North-South relationships primarily from an economic point of view.

William Pruitt Jr. leads off Part III: Northern Realities--The Northern Environment, with a discussion of one component of the northern environment, i.e. the boreal forest. He covers the vegetation, wildlife, soils, and weather, the significance of forest fires as both a destructive and renewing force, and concludes with a discussion of issues surrounding the impact of the Greenhouse Effect on northern Manitoba. Robert Newbury follows with

a review of the discovery and development of the rivers of northern Manitoba.

Part IV: Northern Realities--Northern People, consists of five contributions. Paul Richards discusses the plans for and concern about development of the pulp and paper industry in northern Manitoba by Repap Manitoba. Philip Fontaine provides a counter-point with a discussion of what the "corporate presence" in northern Manitoba means to Aboriginal people. A logical sequel to this is Paul Chartrand's discussion of Aboriginal land rights and how land claims may affect northern development. In Rick Riewe's paper he focuses on Inuit land use in the soon-to-be-established territory of Nunavut, which will border on northern Manitoba, and draws parallels with how Manitoba Aboriginal bands are beginning to document their land use. The final paper in this part is Jill Oakes' description of traditional clothing and how it symbolized relationships between the people and the land.

The theme of Part V: Northern Resource Extraction, is the large-scale development of renewable and non-renewable natural resources. Alastair Walker writes about mining and smelting. George Chuchman discusses development of an economic framework for large-scale resource development. Michael Anderson describes the human impact, particularly with regard to First Nations people, of large-scale projects. Michael Dutton questions whether "sustainable development" refers to economic or environmental sustainability and uses smelters as a case in point. Dave Young concludes this part with an overview of the Northern Flood Agreement.

Community Economic Development Strategies are the topic for Part VI. Included are papers on the strategy for the City of Thompson (presented by David Shefford), regional as well as local economic development strategies (by Adrian DeGroot), and human as well as economic resource development strategies (by Oscar Lathlin).

Part VII: Northern People and Northern Resources, comprises papers by Georg Lithman on the land as a cultural resource, emphasizing that development must focus on people rather than products; by Cam Mackie on new occupational strategies for the North, also emphasizing the human aspects of education, business planning through trend analysis, and creativity in occupational goals; and by Harvey Nepinak and Harvey Payne on natural resource co-management between First Nations communities, government and industry.

The final section of this book, Part VIII: People and Land in Northern Manitoba--Reassessment, provides two summary reports. Diane Malley, Peggy Smith, and Paul Watts report on a workshop on "Life Styles and Sustainable Development." Dr. Malley introduces the theme, focusing on

changes in societal attitudes and beliefs and what lifestyle changes individuals might consider to reflect new belief systems. A synopsis follows of the participants' discussion of the need for, and nature of, lifestyle changes, and the author's interpretive conclusions drawn from it. John Stager, and Mary Turpel conclude the book with an edited description of their impressions of the conference proceedings as non-residents of Manitoba and the results of an interactive session on future directions for development in the North.

The breadth of topics covered in these conference proceedings make it difficult to summarize. I found that the quality of the contributed papers was uniformly high. This volume will make an excellent starting point for anyone wanting to become familiar with the issues surrounding socioeconomic and natural resource development in remote communities with unique cultures, not just of northern Manitoba, but of any region not already part of a concrete jungle.

Robin J. Marles
Department of Botany
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Lowry, Laurence: *Marius Barbeau: Man of Mana.* Toronto: NC Press, 1995. ISBN 1-55021-100-5, Paper CDN $27.95.

Through most of the 19th century, anthropology was a popular avocation organized under the auspices of learned societies, but after 1880 a rising generation urged the field's elevation to professional standing. This first led to ties with natural history museums, then with universities, where the discipline remains at home today. Yet before achieving academic status, many anthropologists courted the state's patronage to secure its future, arguing that systematic research into racial and cultural variation promised to yield knowledge of inestimable value to governments in managing human resources both at home, abroad, and in the case of Canada and the United States, within their internal colonies. Washington's Bureau of American Ethnology, founded in 1879, pioneered this connection, and when the Anthropological Division of the Geological Survey of Canada was organized thirty years later--the first agency of its kind anywhere on British soil and the forerunner of what was to become the Canadian Museum of

Civilization--those who had politicked on its behalf advocated emulation of the Bureau's wedding of scientific and public ambitions.

In practice, the arrangement was never more than a marriage of convenience in Canada, professionally-minded anthropologists managing to gain a toe-hold in the occupational structure, but doing so at the cost of subordinating their scientific and intellectual interests to the politically-determined objectives and bureaucracy of a publicly-funded institution. Compounding the situation was the fact that until mid century, the federal government not only employed nearly all of the country's few specialists--the move into academia being painfully slow to develop--but was ill-disposed to utilize their expertise in the management of Native affairs. As a result, it held effective control over both the means and ends of Canadian anthropology for quite some time. These circumstances figure prominently in Laurence Nowry's new biography of Marius Barbeau (1883-1969), the first, full-length treatment of the life and career of one of the leading ethnologists and folklorists of the period. Like others in his small circle, Barbeau pursued a highly successful career despite Ottawa's indifference to anthropology and its relevance to the public interest throughout the inter-war years.

Born in rural Québec and trained in the law at Laval, Barbeau's original interest in anthropology dates to the three years he spent at Oxford on a Rhodes Scholarship, studying under R.R. Marett in the university's newly-minted diploma course. Summers in Paris brought him into the orbit of Durkheim's influential *L'Année Sociologique* group as well, a connection that led to friendship with one of its brightest lights, Marcel Mauss. He returned to Canada in 1911 to take up a post as assistant ethnologist with the Geological Survey, joining Edward Sapir in carrying out the initial stages of the fledgling Anthropological Division's mandate: collecting and preserving a comprehensive record of Canada's Aboriginal peoples and cultures. To that end, Barbeau's earliest research was with Wyandot (Huron) speakers in Quebec and Oklahoma, concentrating on "memory culture" through the collection of texts obtained from Elders. Three years later he embarked on a new project, making the first of a decades-long succession of trips to study social organization and oral traditions among the peoples of the Nass and Skeena rivers in British Columbia. This research was done in close collaboration with William Beynon, a Nisga'a-speaking assistant whose contributions to the body of Barbeau's Northwest coast work rivals George Hunt's to that of Franz Boas. Finally, in what became the most fortuitous step in his long career, in "1914 he began investigating and then promoting for popular consumption the folklore of French Canada, a calling to which he remained passionately committed over the ensuing fifty years. The

Canadian Centre for Folk Culture Studies, a division of the Museum of Civilization, owes its origins to Barbeau's seemingly tireless efforts on this front, its collections including thousands of songs, narratives, and other materials which he gathered during numerous field trips to his home province.

As Nowry explains, Barbeau's specialization in the traditions of French Canada, however ultimately productive, appears not to have been without costs to him both personally and professionally. This mainly stemmed from the prevailing view among Anthropological Division personnel and some ranking Survey bureaucrats that their proper work was about Canada's Aboriginal people, not its European settlers. While an accommodation of these differences slowly evolved, its effect was to marginalize Barbeau and, by some accounts, to sour his relations with colleagues such as Sapir and Diamond Jenness. Indeed, Nowry intimates that the issue may have also played a role in Barbeau's failed ambition to take over as Chief on Sapir's resignation in 1925, a job that fell to Jenness instead. On the bright side, however, trips to the Québec countryside tended to be less expensive than trips to the Pacific northwest, the western subarctic, and other regions then drawing considerable attention. As funding for research steadily dried up during the twenties and thirties. Barbeau was able to manage a fairly regular diet of fieldwork while his associates grew weary of office duties in Ottawa.

The general reader will find much of interest in this book, particularly in its portrayal of Barbeau's central role in uncovering and preserving so vast a wealth of folkloric material, and in securing a place for it in the contemporary cultural life of the country. Nowry does less well in situating Barbeau's work in relation to the state of anthropological thought and practice in Canada and elsewhere in the period, though to his credit he does draw out some of the more distinctive institutional features of doing anthropology on the federal payroll. The book's main weaknesses, however, lie in matters of style and method. For one thing, the author repeatedly indulges in the minutest of details at the expense of the overall narrative, an approach that may well have something to do with his assertion in the biography's opening pages that "what has been written about Barbeau tends more to error than the meticulous." "Depressingly," he goes on, "the victory of imagination over facts has been celebrated not only by scribblers but also by persons with academic qualifications" (p.9). Such defensiveness begs explanation: a good possibility is Nowry's failure to maintain a respectable distance from his subject, preferring instead to portray the man as we might well imagine Barbeau himself would have chosen to be portrayed, free of the dissenting

opinions of others. So much for the critical eye biographers are ordinarily enjoined to cast over the personalities and events that engage them.

Barnett Richling
Department of Sociology
and Anthropology
Mount Saint Vincent University
Halifax, Nova Scotia
Canada, B3M 2J6

Madill, Shirley (Editor): *Jackson Beardy - A Life's Work.* Winnipeg: Winnipeg Art Gallery, 1995. ISBN 0-88915-172-5, CDN $18.95.

Over sixty percent of the text of this book has been written by the respected Lakota artist Colleen Cutschall, whose moving reflections on the substance of Jackson Beardy's art work provide the reader with much insight into the sixteen colour plates and fifty-five black and white reproductions derived from a Winnipeg Art Gallery exhibition (Oct. 1993-Jan.1994).

This book is a rare window into the traditional world view of the Anishnabe people, displayed and evoked throughout the reproductions of Jackson Beardy's paintings. As the primary focus of the book, Beardy's paintings are somewhat oddly framed within a "revolving door" of the book's multilingual text: English, French, Ojibway.

Colleen Cutschall's perspectives are thus multilingually rendered, as is the politically revisionist text of Carol Podedwomy A moving epitaph by Darlene Daniels and Leslie Spillett completes the text. Their plain language explanation of Beardy's community, personal and cultural life experiences would have just as finely served to be an introduction to the book as a conclusion. As a caveat, Shirley Madill's introduction to the book, although appreciatively respectful in tone, appears pedantic and flat, and also unfortunately contains a number of reitied explanations of First Nations' cultural realities that may deflect the casual reader from delving much further into the text.

Highlights of Cutschall's understanding of Jackson Beardy's lifework are framed in five major themes: psychic crises, creation, world view, relationships within the orders of the universe, and spiritual transformation. Her chronologically-organized perceptions are both playful and challenging to the reader, as she capably transmits ways Jackson Beardy's life and his changing grasp of his cultural roots infuse his art work.

Carol Podedworny's pragmatically descriptive piece outlines recent shifts in Canadian gallery and museum definitions and attitudes towards First Nation and Métis art. This is a well-referenced essay that complements Cutschall's in its political/chronological conceptualization.

This book will be a thrilling find for many artists, and a memorable text for cultural critics or interested art historians. It will likely serve as an accessible repository of cultural meaning for First Nation people, as a visual complement to written cultural records such as Basil Johnston's Ojibway Heritage.

These vibrant reproductions of Jackson Beardy's paintings dynamically represent manifold "... psychic categories or possibilities expressed by the spirit as it passes through human form" (Argüelles, 1975). They may inspire some of us one step further: to look for Jackson Beardy's last work, titled *Peace and Harmony,* a series of murals to be found on the exterior walls of the Indian Family Centre in the north end of Winnipeg, Manitoba.

Roger Nell
Faculty of Education
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

References

Argüelles, Jose
1975 *The Transformative Vision.* Boulder, Colorado: Shambala Publications.

Johnston, Basil
1976 *Ojibway Heritage.* Toronto: McLelland and Stewart.

McIlwraith, Thomas F. *The Bella Coola Indians* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992. ISBN 0-8020-2820-9, Cloth CDN $125.00; 0-8020-7692-0, Paper CDN $60.00.

Based on field work with the Nuxalk (Bella Coola) people of British Columbia conducted from 1922-1924, T.F. McIlwraith wrote a definitive ethnography which is also a classic for ethnographic methodology. What makes this work so important from a methodological point of view, especially given the period when it was written, is that it is actually coauthored

by Nuxalk people, although this is not acknowledged on the title page. A Foreword by members of the Nuxalk nation written for the 1992 reissue expresses their gratitude for McIlwraith's patience to listen, learn, and finally understand parts of their oral history. They also express appreciation for McIlwraith's documentation of their heritage and the efforts of John Barker and others to republish the work and thus assist in the preservation of their stories, names, songs, and history, encouraging the spiritual renewal of the Nuxalk Nation and the education of Nuxalk youth in their own cultural heritage.

In his new introduction, Barker provides a biographical sketch of McIlwraith (1899-1964), a description of his field methodology, a brief overview of Nuxalk traditions today, and the trials and tribulations of dealing with narrow-minded editors, reviewers, and censors that McIlwraith had to go through before his manuscript was finally published more than 20 years after it was first written. This contextual information is an important contribution in many ways. It helps us to understand the close rapport that developed between McIlwraith and the Nuxalk Elders, despite their different perspectives on the work and its final objectives. McIlwraith's perspective in writing the report was that of "salvage ethnography." He was hoping to be able to describe precontact Nuxalk culture from analysis of the memories of living informants. Given Alexander Mackenzie's description of Nuxalk use of European tradegoods in 1793 and a further 130 years of trade, missionary contact, and smallpox epidemics, McIlwraith was working with a culture that had, in his words, often been "contaminated" by Western influences. The Nuxalk Elders, whose contributions to his study appear as stories or extended quotations throughout the two volumes (mainly translated into English with occasional Nuxalk terms), were living tributes to the strength, persistence, and adaptability of their culture. Their objective in participating was not to enshrine an idealized view of precontact culture but to ensure the survival of their traditions among their children and grandchildren who would be participants in a constantly changing modern culture. Thus they were looking forward rather than backward.

McIlwraith prefaces his book with his own account of the experiences he had researching and writing the report, and the field methods and theoretical orientation employed. His two volumes are an encyclopedic reference primarily focusing on the social organization and religion of the Nuxalk, since their material culture, subsistence and medicine were the focus of Harlan I. Smith's work during the same time period (1920-24). There are chapters on location and environment, religion, social organization, rank, the potlatch, origin myths, the life cycle, the supernatural world including spirits, magic, medicine and taboo, winter ceremonial dances (267

pages describe what he learned by means of extensive participant-observation), songs (only the lyrics in Nuxalk and English are given here but he also recorded more than 120 songs by means of wax cylinders on a gramophone), warfare, games, stories, physical anthropology, "mechanical processes" such as preparation of food and construction of canoes, string figures (cat's cradle) created for recreation, a list of local plants and animals, and a Bella Coola/English dictionary.

McIlwraith's work is a major contribution to Pacific west coast ethnography and a model of thoroughness for researchers to emulate. The direct participation by the Nuxalk Nation in the original writing and its republication to improve availability is a critical determinant of the value of this work. It is a pity that not all First Nations have such extensive documentation of their traditions, but hopefully this book can provide a stimulus to Native and non-Native researchers and funding agencies to work together to achieve similar collaborative successes elsewhere.

Robin J. Marles
Department of Botany
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Newell, Dianne: *Tangled Webs of History: Indians and the Law in Canada's Pacific Coast Fisheries.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993. ISBN: 0-8020-0547-0, Cloth CDN $50.00; 0-8020-7746-3, Paper CDN $18.95.

Newells account of the exploitation of the British Columbia fishery over the past 120 years is almost haunting in light of the recently publicised problems facing the industry on both the Atlanticand Pacific coasts. Indeed, as Newell aptly points out, over-exploitation by the non-Aboriginal fishery is not a new phenomenon on the west coast but rather appears to be a long standing feature of the industry.

This book provides a thorough historical review of the British Columbia fishery using Indians and the law as the basis for analysis. The result is a captivating and interesting piece of work that touches upon an issue that has not received much scholarly attention, particularly from a legal perspective.

Throughout the book, I was struck by the underlying critique of capitalism and its effects on Indian peoples in particular and Aboriginal peoples

in general. The issue at the heart of this critique is that Indian peoples were manipulated, either explicitly or implicitly, by the fishery to become involved in the industry. In this way they were co-opted to participate in a system that was, for all intents and purposes, not conducive to their general well-being. Newell writes:

> By getting government to issue the bulk of fishing licences to canneries, by making it easier for Indians than for other fishers to fish for them, cannery operators assured Indians' participation in the industry for decades to come .... Licensing and regulation had thus served to capture Indian labour for the white-owned industry when labour was scarce... Corralling Indian labour for the white-owned industry, along with other measures.., eventually undermined Indians' ability to continue their ancient entrepreneurial traditions on their own terms (p.77).

Also striking about the book are some of the conclusions Newell reaches about the nature of the traditional Indian fishery as opposed to the non-Indian industrialized fishery, and how state-regulation maintained and promoted the non-Indian fishery to the detriment of traditional Indian subsistence and economic harvesting. Newell concludes her chapter on the "Aboriginal Salmon Fishery" with the following:

> What is striking is the net effect of this system [Aboriginal salmon fishery]. It assured everyone adequate stocks of fish over the long tenn. The same cannot be said for the state-regulated industrial fishery that replaced it in the late nineteenth century (p.45).

This type of study opens the door to similar treatments of the law and Aboriginal peoples in a number of other crucial sectors such as environmental protection, forestry and mining. What is missing from this book is a comprehensive and thorough examination and application of the case-law, such as the Supreme Court of Canada's 1990 decision of R. v. Sparrow,[1] and the string of recent British Columbia Court of Appeal cases dealing with Aboriginal fishing rights, including *R. v. Nikal,*[2] *R. v. Gladstone,*[3] *R. v. N.T.C. Smokehouse,*[4] *R. v. Lewis*[5] *and R. v. Vanderpeet.*[6] However, this is not so much a critique of this book, considering the task at hand is immense, but rather a suggestion for future work to be done in this area.

Newell is to be commended on this fine piece of work. This is a well-written and focused book. I highly recommend it for anyone who is interested in natural resources and conservation, Aboriginal peoples or

social critiques of the law, in addition to those interestcd in the British Columbia fishery.

Tomas Isaac
304 - 4920 54th Avenue
Yellowknife, Northwest Territories
Canada, X1A 2P5

Notes

1. *R.v. Sparrow,* [1990] 3 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 160, Supreme Court of Canada.
2. *R. v. Nikal,* [1993] 4 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 117, (B.C.C.A).
3. *R. v. Gladstone,* [1993] 4 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 75, (B.C.C.A.).
4. *R. v. N.T.C. Smokehouse,* [1993] 4 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 158, (B.C.C.A.).
5. *R. v. Lewis,* [1993] 4 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 98, (B.C.C.A.).
6. *R.v. Vanderpeet,* [1993] 4 *Canadian Native Law Reporter* 221, (B.C.C.A.).

Ruppert, James: *Mediation in Contemporary Native American Fiction* (American Indian Literature and Critical Studies Series 15). Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. ISBN 0-8061-2749-X Cloth US $29.95.

Scholars of Native American literature will find little to surprise them in James Ruppert's *Mediation in Contemporary Native American Fiction.* Ruppert attempts to apply reader-response analysis to six Native American novels--N. Scott Momaday's *House Made of Dawn,* James Welch's *Winter* in the Blood, Leslie Marmon Silko's *Ceremony,* Gerald Vizenor's *Bearheart: The Heirship Chronicles,* D'arcy McNickle's *Wind from an Enemy Sky,* and Louise Erdrich's *Love Medicine.* The thesis--that Native American novels mediate between Native and non-Native ways of being--and the assessments of the novels are accurate, but what limits Ruppert's effectiveness is his unfamiliarity with contemporary critical theory, and, more particularly, his relative unfamiliarity with Reception Theory beyond Wolfgang Iser. Ruppert quotes from interviews and summarizes previous critical studies

rather than adding much himself. The book, as a result, is appropriate mainly for newcomers to Native literature and for undergraduates. Newcomers will find, for example, a discussion of the "apsychological" elements (wherein the act rather than the motivation defines the character) in the Native use of myth; students of literature, on the other hand, will recognize this as a well-known distinction since at least Erich Auerbach's 1946 study, *Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature.*

Summaries aside, unfamiliarity with literary theory lets Ruppert quote unreflectively from a critic who refers to "the thought that is speech" (24) and from another who claims that "interpretation becomes not so much an imposition of meaning by readers onto a text as it is exposing their selves to the meaning assigned to them by myth" (27). These are intelligible, if naive, attempts to validate myth and orality; but what are we to make of Ruppert's bizarre introduction of Native literature as in "the forefront of postmodern literature" (xi), before he emphasizes the obvious and thoroughgoing differences between the two movements? The initial stance, like the repeated use of "self-reflexive," shows a profound misunderstanding of postmodern texts, and seems motivated primarily by a desire to give Native literature a specious theoretical currency What Ruppert's attempt does, instead, is to betray an unconscious anxiety about Native texts: if their affinities are with the "sacred" pre-modern and with modernist reinventions of myth, how can Native authors speak into the seamless digital surfaces of the late 20th century? Ruppert's own affiliations are clearly not with postmodernism, but with scholars like Mircea Eliade whose broad distinclions between "sacred" and "profane" seem useful for the analysis of mythic texts.

Seem useful: the difficulty with Eliade is the same difficulty that appears when Ruppert applies Reception Theory, namely that broad categories only help during the initial stages of cultural and literary analysis. Quite intriguing is Ruppert's attempt to move back and forth between an implied non-Native reader and an implied Native reader, since generally the thrust in studies of Native American fiction has been to explain Native myth and ritual to implied White readers. Ruppert's promise, largely unfulfilled, is of the kind of study suggested by James Clifford, a study which would investigate the details of hybridity. Instead, Ruppert will mention, for example, that Silko's story of the Destroyers is a "translation" rather than a traditional Laguna narrative, but he will pursue neither the sources of the story nor its particular mediational significance.

Ruppert's work on Welch is illustrative of both the strengths and weaknesses of his approach, He is able to show *Winter in the Blood's* dual strand of psychological and mythical motivation, counterpointing those

elements which make the novel a realistic, nearly sociological, portrayal of alienation against those elements which suggest the importance of dream, Na'pi (the Blackfoot trickster, also known as Old Man), and a renewed connection between the narrator and his unknown father Yellow Calf. But these are general themes. Welch's cultural specificity demands a much closer investigation than simply paralleling his narrator and Na'pi, because it is Yellow Calf and not the narrator who is an old man; because Na'pi, unlike the tricksters of many other traditions, seems to mature in the course of his travels; because at the penultimate point in Welch's narrative, Yellow Calf scrapes the icons of the Star Boy myth-- a star encircled by the sun--into "the tough skin of the earth" (Welch 154). In short, any study of "mediation" ought to take a much more precise account of Western and Blackfoot skepticism, of Hemingway's stylistic influence, and of the connections between Yellow Calf and Star Boy.

Despite these serious caveats, Ruppert's chapters do give reasonable introductions to the novels, analyzing Vizenor's use of Dog Husband tales, the trickster elements in Momaday's Rev. Tosamah, and McNickle's fictional mediations of Wounded Knee, AIM, and pan-tribalism Ruppert's best writing is done when he becomes very particular, such as when he discusses the political discourse of the early and mid-sixties, a discourse which expected that returned veterans would assume leadership roles on the Reservations. At such moments, the implied non-Native reader is convincingly specified as a form of discourse, rather than simply as the non-Native reader, and as a result *House Made of Dawn* is shown to be as dialogic as Ruppert wants it to be.

Part of Ruppert's difficulty may lie in Reception Theory itself. Who is this reified category known as "The Reader"? Where exactly does one find the "Non-Native Reader"? The "Native Reader"? These constructs seem intuitively correct, since different socio-cultural experiences must create different readers, and, at the same, intellectually suspect, since they fit too neatly into ethnic stereotypes. Reception Theory has been used effectively by critics like Patrocinio Schweickart, who are not afraid of the word "1," and who extrapolate from personal readings to sociological studies on gender. However, the debates about "interpretive communities" and "reader competence" have often circled, unhelpfully, back to an imagined rather than to an implied reader, or, despite Reception theorists' assertions that meanings do not reside in texts, to the ground zero of the text: in other words, if the reader has experienced welfare culture, the reader will recognize the strange impotence of Welch's narrator. If the reader knows Na'pi, the Blackfoot trickster, the reader will recognize the humour in the narrator's predicaments.

In our hybrid culture, however, "The Young and the Restless" may be a much greater influence upon a Native reader than the tradition of the Dawn Runners, while a non-Native reader with a great deal of academic knowledge about Native myth may be entirely oblivious to lived experience on the reservation. Ruppert's sometimes stereotypical readings tend to lead either to rather prickly results--"The implied non-Native reader would most likely first be a little surprised at the continuance of any Native culture" (45)--or to conclusions as unspectacular as the following: "The Native implied reader is led to discover that written discourse can nurture and extend the field of oral discourse" (39). I suspect that Ruppert simply wants to do close rhetorical readings of the novels, to say that in *House Made of Dawn* Abel rediscovers the continuity of the Laguna tradition, and that Momaday's prose form fulfils the oral tradition, but Ruppert fears that without a reference or two to an "implied audience" his reading will not have the required cachet. He may be right. Yet the gaining of that cachet will require something besides a few uncntical references to Wolfgang Iser.

Reinhold Kramer
Department of English
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Sloan, Pamela and Roger Hill: *Corporate Aboriginal Relations: Best Practice Case Studies.* Toronto: Hill Sloan Associates Inc., 1995. Paper CDN $29.95.

Pamela Sloan and Roger Hill are consultants who advise organizations seeking to establish programs and policies relating to Aboriginal peoples in Canada. Their book is a compendium of "best practice" case studies of 38 organizations that consented to share with the authors their experiences in devising programs "...designed to build constructive partnerships with communities and expand employment and business opportunities for Aboriginal people" (p.ix).

In the Introduction, Sloan and Hill explain the purposes of their book, summarize its contents, and identify an intended readership. They contend that changing demographics (a significant increase in the Aboriginal population relative to the total population), the increasing political power of Aboriginal peoples (as reflected in land claims settlements and interventions by Aboriginal communities in environmental hearings), and human

rights and employment equity legislation have combined to make it imperative that corporations and other organizations respond to the concerns of Aboriginal peoples with positive policies and programs. Moreover, the authors indicate that, once such projects are launched, it quickly becomes apparent they are "win-win" situations. They make good business sense from the perspective of corporations and other organizations. They generate benefits for Aboriginal peoples.

The authors do not explain how they constructed their sample of 38 case studies; they simply note that "[t]he 38 organizations profiled...were selected on the basis of their leadership, commitment and expertise in different areas of Aboriginal relations" (p.xii). It would be interesting to know the size of the population they had to choose from (that is, the number of organizations that agreed to participate) and the precise criteria that were used to determine which organizations would be profiled. Nevertheless, the sample is diverse and includes both giant private-sector corporations from the resource, transportation, utilities and financial sectors of the economy, as well as crown corporations, crown agencies and government departments, educational institutions, and industry associations. As well, it includes organizations from all parts of the country.

An overview of the best practices precedes presentation of the case studies. The case studies are grouped into five sections: Part I, Building the Commitment (seven); Part II, Education and Training (twelve); Part III, Employment Opportunities (nine); Part IV, Business Opportunities (five); and Part V, Community and Relations (five). The book concludes with a summary "Checklist of Corporate Best Practices."

The case studies are essentially descriptive, a nuts and bolts summary of the main features of the project followed by a brief discussion of results, and, in some cases, a discussion of problems and plans for change and expansion. Since the format for each of the case studies is the same--a definition of the nature of the project; a statement of goals; a description of concrete actions--what was done; and a summary of results--the style is somewhat ponderous and dull This is accentuated by the fact that the studies are overly one-sided; i.e., they rely almost exclusively on information provided by the organizations involved and the people within the organizations responsible for administering the projects. In some of the case studies there are testimonials from Aboriginal participants on the virtues of the program, but for the most part, the Aboriginal perspective--the other side of the equation--is missing. The book would be strengthened--and much more interesting--with the inclusion of an assessment of the projects by the Aboriginal partners.

The authors suggest that their book should be required reading for everyone interested in how corporations, governments, etc. are working with Aboriginal peoples to expand economic opportunities. I agree that the book is a useful resource for people working on these matters. I also believe that this is the sort of book that can be used by students and researchers as a base to learn more about the particular projects covered by Sloan and Hill and also those projects that were not included. Students in undergraduate courses, for example, could take a particular case study and update it, do a more complete and nuanced evaluation of results, or add the voices that are absent from these studies. Similarly, there is much scope for graduate papers and dissertations which extend and enrich particular case studies.

Errol Black
Department of Economics
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Waldram, James B., D. Ann Herring and T. Kue Young: *Aboriginal Health in Canada: Historical, Cultural, and Epidemiological Perspectives.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995. ISBN: 0-8020-5956-2, Cloth CDN $50.00; 0-8020-6887-1, Paper CDN $18.95.

Any useful introductory analysis of the evolution of the present system of health care services for the Indigenous peoples of this country is a daunting project. The need to explain the complex links between the variables that govern the fate of the entire system (such as the levels of spending) and those factors (etiology of specific medical conditions, etc.) that determine the success of the thousands of person-to-person interactions in the program's delivery is difficult indeed. The stated goal of the authors was to apply a cross-disciplinary perspective to a thorough nationwide historical study of Aboriginal health status and health care. The major focus is the postcontact era, specifically the 20th century. These authors have been successful in producing a valuable resource that is accessible to upper-year undergraduate students in programs from political science to health care administration.

It is proven that for most categories of disease or illness, members of Canada's Aboriginal peoples fare much worse than the national average.

Still, it would be incorrect to argue that there has been no change in the major health issues facing Indigenous Canadians since the time of initial contact with Europeans. Infectious diseases such as smallpox (16th to 18th centuries) and tuberculosis (18th to 20th centuries) were major long-term contributors to mortality (p.61), but no universal trends can be identified that would be applicable to every Aboriginal culture. Many of these populations also experienced shifts in population levels that cannot be explained solely by the appearance of a particular disease organism. Colonization precipitated changes in the trade patterns, the choice of technology, and the geographical distribution of virtually every Indigenous community in Canada. These disruptions contributed at least as much to the spread of disease as the microorganisms themselves (p.56).

During the latter half of the 20th century, many Aboriginal peoples experienced a considerable decline in the death toll caused by infectious diseases and infant mortality. Unfortunately, most of these communities now exhibit rates of "lifestyle diseases" such as diabetes higher than that of other Canadians (p.85). Illness and death as a result of accidents and violence, including suicide, plague Aboriginal people to a much greater degree than they do other segments of Canadian society (p.88-91).

The health status of precontact Indigenous Canadians is addressed by the authors to establish a baseline to which the post-15th century health concerns of these communities could be compared. The construction of accurate population estimates is required as a first step in the measurement of the health effects of European colonization. Introduced epidemics played a key role in the depopulation that began after the year 1500, but their real impact is still a matter of great controversy (p.45). Therefore, many of the opinions drawn about the precontact period include a significant degree of conjecture (p.49). Inhabitants of pre-1497 Canada suffered from many illnesses--fungal, bacterial, and parasitic. The types and incidence of these problems differed between communities and with them over time (p.42). It is impossible at the current time to present a definitive epidemiological history for even a single Aboriginal people in Canada. Still, one must conclude that local conditions amplified the inherent impact of the diseases brought by the Europeans in each successive wave of penetration into the frontier (p.60).

Control over the selection of health care services and their delivery is the central theme of Waldram and his colleagues (p.234). Such power is an essential ingredient in the construction of a truly effective health care system. Many social analysts now acknowledge that terms such as illness and health do not have absolute meanings that can be divorced from the cultural contexts where these ideas are applied (p.216). Forever ignoring

these realities, colonialists attempt to nullify the value of the technological and philosophical approaches of the cultures they try to absorb; but their intrusive and often violent methods also breed mistrust of the institutions that they attempt to install.

The European invasion, at first, did appear to overwhelm many Indigenous medical systems with problems of a magnitude perhaps never before seen in this hemisphere. However, at least as significant a historical discontinuity over the longer term was the political consequence of the arrival of the Europeans. These newcomers enforced a legal and social structure in which many Aboriginal Canadians were denied the right and the ability to practice their own style of medicine. Real intercultural dialogue that would lead to a synthesis of the medical practices of different cultures is an illusion in such an environment.

Social control then becomes the paramount virtue governing public policy. The epidemiological disaster that was the residential school system illustrates this point all too vividly. As early as 1907, one of its own officials informed the Canadian federal government that the death rate of students ranged between 25% and 35%. Tuberculosis was the main culprit. A plan to reverse this horrendous situation was never adopted because of (a) the cost; and (b) the authority of the churches in charge of the schools which would have been lessened. Even back then, many church officials worded about the negative financial impact should they lose control over these institutions (p. 136-137, 156-157).

The authors offer numerous examples of Indigenous peoples who are trying to achieve both self-determination and an ability to bridge the perceptual gaps between Western and traditional healing approaches. For example, in the late 1980s a number of experiments in local control were carded out under the aegis of the Indian Health Transfer Policy, which was adopted by the federal government in 1986. The popularity of these arrangements most likely represents real progress as long as two critical issues are addressed. First, will these existing series of agreements be renewed? Will adequate levels of funding be provided? Do these temporary accords represent one possible first stage of true self-government, or something else entirely? Second, can such structures make positive contributions to the overall health status of the community and its affected individuals? A growing body of evidence shows the clear benefits of self-determination over health care for many Aboriginal peoples (p.237-244).

Medical pluralism, defined loosely as a willingness to follow the advice of medical caregivers offering treatments from different schools of practice (p.209-210), is fast becoming a regular habit for many Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Canadians alike. For example, one researcher had noted

that some Anishinaabe communities in Manitoba have gone as far as to divide illness into two main categories: non-Anishinaabe (where individuals will seek out Western medicine) and Anishinaabe (which require the attention of traditional medicine) (p.211).

The renaissance of the traditional Indigenous healing arts has added yet another contentious element to the already heated political debate around health care. Claiming the validation of a literal reading of many vaguely worded treaties with different First Nations, the federal government continues its decades-long claim that there is no treaty right to health care (p.141). Many Aboriginal Canadians reject this view and claim that Ottawa was, and is now, driven only by financial self-interest. There is more than anecdotal evidence to support this theory (p. 146). However, there are disputes within Indigenous communities themselves regarding what treaty rights to health care are exercised now and what such rights should mean in terms of specific future policies and programs (p.149).

The thorny epistemological and regulatory issues connected with the supervision of healers who work outside of the boundaries of mainstream Western medicine will only complicate further the legal battles outlined above, at least in the short term. One example: how can the often informal, even spiritual, approaches that dominate much of traditional Aboriginal medicine be reconciled with the large complex bureaucracies in control of many Canadian medical institutions? (p.219). Medical regulators still are struggling to find the appropriate methods to evaluate disciplines such as homeopathy within the dominant biomedical model.

The continuing emphasis on training Aboriginal individuals for entry into as many medical professions as possible is one long-term strategy for social development that is starting to show real success A critical element in the local control of medical services is the ability to import foreign treatment regimens without the abandonment of traditional approaches. This requires individuals attuned to the Indigenous culture of that community who are willing to train in these outside schools of thought Community-directed programs also promote economic development through the "inject[ion of] cash and opportunities for personal development" (p.271).

Although written in the dry and neutral language of academics, this book presents a determined attack on the ideology of what might be labelled Indigenous exceptionalism In other words, the authors criticize theories that claim Aboriginal individuals are burdened with unique genetic or biochemical susceptibilities to certain diseases, or that Indigenous cultures display a particular set of pathologies that cannot be found in other societies.

While different cultures do present real variations in patterns of belief/behaviour or genetic characteristics, much et the research on these issues has had little practical impact on public policy or on treatment programs for specific conditions or illnesses (p.268). Aboriginal peoples face the identical long-term challenges of other Canadians with regard to the following premise: health care systems play only a minor role in the determination of health status. While political power and economic prosperity do not guarantee good health for any social group (p.256), the lack of control caused by their absence will almost certainly ensure bad.

Chris J. Pepin
Library Nortep/Norpac
Box 5000
La Ronge, Saskatchewan
Canada, S0J 1L0

Williams, Walter L.: The Spirit and the Flesh: Sexual Diversity in American Indian Culture. Boston: Beacon Press, 1992. ISBN 0-8070-4615-9, Paper CDN $21.00.

The Spirit and the Flesh: Diversity in American Indian Culture by Walter Williams, first published in 1986 and republished in 1992, is a monumental work in the area of the Native American berdache, a third gender of people who are classified as neither men nor women. After its first publication, The *Spirit and the Flesh* received the Gay Book of the Year Award from the *American Library Association,* the Ruth Benedict Award from the *Society of Lesbian and Gay Anthropologists,* and the Award for Outstanding Scholarship from the *World Congress for Sexology.* Walter Williams, a professor of anthropology in the program for the Study of Women and Men in Society at the University of Southern California, has written many essays and five books on the issues of interethnic relations, gender, and sexuality among Native American Indians, Black Americans, and the Javanese.

The English term berdache originates from the Arabic bardag and the Persian bardaj; by the 16th century the word had made its way into Italian, Spanish and French to denote a passive partner in male-male sexual intercourse. Within anthropological literature today, the term berdache means muGh more than a homosexual male. Williams defines a berdache as "a morphological male who does not fill a society's standard man's role, who has a nonmasculine character. This type of person is often stereotyped

as effeminate, but a more accurate characterization is androgyny" (p.2). This androgynous person belongs to an alternative, institutionalized third gender. As a distinct association, sexual relations between berdaches are forbidden; a berdache must find an appropriate partner among members of the male gender.

As Williams states in his introduction, the purpose of the book "is to examine how a culture can accommodate gender variation and sexual variation beyond man/woman opposites, without being threatened by it" (p.5). Part I deals with this question. Within Native American societies, sexual variation is accommodated and respected because the berdache role is viewed in religious terms, as a mediating category between binary opposites. "Somewhere between the status of women and men, berdaches not only mediate between the sexes but also between the psychic and the physical--between the spirit and the flesh. Since they mix the characteristics of both men and women, they possess the vision of both" (pp.41-42). Berdaches are often known as seers who can predict the future. In addition to this role, they may fill a variety of religious functions, depending on the tribe; providing lucky names, offering spiritual protection, giving advice to shamans, curing illnesses, preparing food at thanksgiving ceremonies, and arranging funeral services.

As a sanctified role, the berdache status is not considered to be a free choice, but is dictated by the supernaturals. Such a belief restrains parents from trying to dissuade the boy. His refusal to adhere to the normative male role is understood as a reflection of his nature, which is determined by spiritual forces. Often in dreams or visions a boy receives confirmation from the supernatural world that he was born to fulfil this unique role within the tribe. Not only do these dreams provide community sanction for the assumption of the role, but some tribes believe that if the boy does not take on berdache status after receiving a communication from the spirit world, misfortune will befall him, his family, or the tribe.

The acceptance of a berdache proves valuable to both the family and the tribe. Berdaches are known as highly intelligent and compassionate people who have a special talent for educating children; many berdaches adopt children. Traditionally, berdaches also helped women with their work and were known to be very productive, doing excellent beadwork, pottery, weaving, saddlemaking, and tanning. Williams quotes a Crow traditionalist who says, "We don't waste people, the way white society does. Every person has their gift" (p.57).

When the Christian missionaries arrived in North America, they certainly did not understand nor appreciate the unique gins of the berdaches. While Part I of *The Spirit and the Flesh* discusses how Native culture

accommodates gender and sexual variation without being threatened by it, Part II examines the influence of White Europeans whose fear and intolerance caused a great deal of hardship for the berdaches. As a result of persecution berdaches stopped cross-dressing, and for the sake of outward appearance, they assumed a typical male or female demeanor and social role. Also, when Indians converted to Christianity many absorbed Christian notions about taboos against homosexuality. Today Native views toward the berdache status are mixed; traditionalists who adhere to Native American religion support homosexuals but may criticize them for not taking the religious aspects of their gender seriously, while those with a Christian background find it difficult to condone the sexual choice of homosexuals. Williams states that the self-esteem of homosexual Native men increases to the degree that they are exposed to traditional beliefs concerning the berdache role.

Part III provides a further theoretical understanding of the acceptance of sexual and gender variance by briefly examining the concept of third gender as it relates to Native women and to non-Native cultures. A recognized third gender for females did exist among Native Americans, particularly in California, the Southwest, the Northwest and the Great Basin, but information is sparse since European male explorers gathered their material from Aboriginal men. While Williams relies heavily on the work of Evelyn Blackwood, Paula Gunn Allen and Beverly Chinas, he does assert that the term amazon should be used to indicate the female third gender group, as berdache is used for the male third gender; terms such as *cross-gender* female are linguistically awkward and tend to obfuscate the point that women belong to a separate, unique gender group. The chapter on berdachism as a cross-cultural phenomenon includes references to groups from Siberia, Polynesia and India. Since the first edition of *The Spirit and the Flesh,* Serena Nanda has published a study entitled *Neither Man nor Woman* (Nanda, 1990), in which she examines the *hijras* of India; Nanda's fieldwork supports many of William's findings. Like the Native American berdaches, the *hijras* of India are considered to be an alternative gender and receive social sanction as a result oftheir association with the realm of the sacred.

williams does an excellent job of combining traditional Native perspectives on the berdache role with contemporary Aboriginal views. Through a comprehensive survey of secondary source material from historical and anthropological reports and ethnographic studies, Williams provides an overview of traditional tribal beliefs concerning the institution of the berdache. In addition, Williams maintains that "a major goal of this study is to allow Indian people to speak for themselves. There has been much too

much theorizing without listening to what Native Americans themselves have to say." In accomplishing this task, Williams personally conducts interviews with gay men from a variety of tribes, such as the Omaha, Lakota, Crow, Northern Cheyenne, and Maya, who struggle to understand their identity as homosexual Native men within the context of both White European culture and Native tradition. The personal stories are invaluable in understanding this alternative gender role that is so unfamiliar to most Western readers. While the wide representation of a variety of tribal groups provides much needed information on the topic, it is difficult to differentiate between the practices and beliefs concerning the berdache role of specific tribes. The universalization of the berdache phenomenon confuses the reader as to the diversity of tribal expressions; for example, there are marked differences between the Lakota winkte, the Navajo *nadle,* the Arapaho *haxu'xan* and the Mohave *alyha,* but these dissimilarities are not readily apparent within Williams' discussion. In his 1992 preface Williams does address this criticism, stating that he "unavoidably glossed over some important differences in the berdache traditions of specific tribes" and that "it is now necessary for scholars to focus on more culture-specific local studies, with fieldwork as the research methodology."

While it is now necessary for more culture-specific studies, Williams provides a seminal work on the subject of Native American berdachism His book is also invaluable in informing Western societies of a new perspective concerning gender and sexual identity. Williams successfully demonstrates how a culture can accommodate divergence from the binary system of male/female without being threatened by sexual variety; this study challenges some basic Western presuppositions about the relationship between homosexuality, spirituality, and society.

Susan Medd
Department of Religion
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Reference

Nanda, Serena
1990 *Neither Man Nor Woman: The Hijras of India.* Belmont: Wadsworth.

Young Bear, Severt and R.D. Theisz: *Standing in the Light: A Lakota Way of Seeing.* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1996. ISBN 0-8032-491 l-X, Cloth USA $30.00; ISBN 0-8032-9912-5, Paper USA $12.00.

Standing in the Light: A Lakota Way of Seeing is an unusual and powerful work. A new listing in the excellent *American Indian Lives Series* published by the University of Nebraska Press, its joint authors, Severt Young Bear and R.D. Theisz, have had the patience, understanding, and sensitivity to produce a work of depth and lucidity. Theisz, a teacher and writer originally from New York moved to the Rosebud Reservation in 1972 and, since then, has taught at *Sinte Gleska,* the Indian tribal college at Rosebud. Severt Young Bear, an Lakota Sioux who passed away just as the book was going to press, was a tribal leader, musician, and an individual who possessed a deep experiential and historical understanding of his people, their past, and their trajectory as a people into the future. He was not only the "keeper" of a threatened heritage; he was, in his persona and personal journey, a powerful representative of its strengths and values.

The book developed out of taped conversations of Theisz and Severt over a period of many years. The challenge for Theisz is immediately obvious: how to listen, organize, and convert into book format wide ranging, largely freely flowing, often multiple divergent discussion into a coherent package. But this is the beginning; the greater challenge is to do so while respecting the style, the idiosyncracies, the verbal-rhetorical map, even, somehow, the verbal spacing of Severt Young Bear. Each author "succeeds" in the context of the other's strength and unique contribution. The result is a book that brims with information, insight, and is often very moving. Rich in remembrance, penetrating in analysis, and powerful in exhortation, this work seems far more likely to succeed where so many have failed--to provide both Native and White readers with a vivid and powerful picture of Lakota life, traditions, spiritual heritage, and values.

With all due respect to contemporary anthropological and ethnological research, its theory, methodology, and the intensity with which these are debated, this book creates its own path from the deep recesses of the cultural vault to the reader precisely because it is not research in any conventional sense. It provides information without the proud oppression of positivistic methodology. It provides insight immediate and powerful in its expression without the baggage of unmediated subjectivity. *Standing in the Light: A Lakota Way of Seeing* works because it is "in the light" of uncompromised, lived experience, energized by the trust and dedication of authors from different worlds, but created as the work of "adoptive brothers."

Severt's memory is long, rich in reflection and gentle in judgement. His circle of acquaintances is immense and the range of knowledge broad. He speaks in detail about his own family history. His is the gifted memory that holds other's memories as treasured objects--his maternal grandmother's survival of Wounded Knee I, accounts of Lakota life drawn from three and four generations back; generations that could not but understand themselves as the "keepers" of a tradition that prized above all else, communality, self-sufficiency, independence and generational continuity. The depths of Severt's memory extend enormous distances beyond the territory of personal testimonial to include a host of insight such as a perfectly plausible Lakota account of geographical provenance that is very much at odds with positivistic anthropological explanations.

Traditional Lakota culture does not, of course, survive in memory alone. For Severt and many of the people whose name he invokes, it is palpable and functional. His greatest concern is with those "beyond the light"--those for whom the authentic, unconstructed experiential centre of Lakota life is weak or has been forgotten. He illuminates the subtle, non-evidentiary interior of a People's life that will forever remain inaccessible to even the most sensitive and probing contemporary scholarship. He speaks, as an example, not simply of Lakota music in terms of its social function, performance practice and history, but also of music as a discipline, of its meaning and value, of the creative process, of its spiritual dimension, of the relation of the individual music maker and dancer to musical parameters and to external contextual parameters; how music is possessed and shared; how music encompasses both the specific and the nameless, how music is both expression and order.

He shares his understanding of concepts and issues, and is able to extract from that stratum of comprehension which stands beneath learning and knowing. His observations on Native language, etymology, implied and concrete meanings, is not simply the bounty of "long memory" but of intellectual keenness and criticality of mind strengthened by clarity and uncorrupted by theory. This is regularly corroborated throughout the book in Severt's long-ranging discussions of leadership, family, it politics, relations with the dominant culture, and Lakota customs. Given the strength of his grounding, he is able to view critically, the confusion, depression, and often the corruption that has been the inevitable product of commoditization, secularization, and the cruelty of an unknowing dominant culture.

While acknowledging the inevitabilily of adaptation, Severt is acutely aware of both an "inner environment" not susceptible to change and, of course, to an "outer environment," or, better, a margin, a membrane of experience and exchange interacting with the "outer" but reporting, as it

were, to the "inner." Severt has no fear of this divide, but he does understand cultural survival to be contingent on the depth to which the "inner" is fully intact and wisely cultivated. Constantly under stress, however, it must do no less than protect, discriminate, motivate and defend if it is to be effective. Oppression becomes, for Severt, not only the aggressive ignorance of a dominant culture, but the "organic" failure of Native communities. His book makes plain how this critical cultural physiology can and must be kept in robust health.

R.D. Theisz is no less an author and his role has been considerably more substantial than "staying out of the way." The paths through which we are led are blazed and mapped by Theisz--an accomplishment absolutely unthinkable without a profound grasp not only of the "territory," but a remarkably close bond with Severt Young Bear; a bond that belies associations with the idea of "adoptive brother."

Standing in the Light: A Lakota Way of Seeing is a major work. It will not only shed light, it will create it.

Alfred Fisher
School of Music
Queen's University
Kingston, Ontario
Canada, K7L 3N6

Zolbrod, Paul: *Reading the Voice. Native American Oral Poetry on the Written Page.* Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1995. ISBN 0-87480-457-4, Cloth US $25.00.

> There is, fortunately, enough literature, both oral and written, available for scholarly study, but it has for the most part been neglected. Myths, legends, and songs have not been regenerated and set in modem terms to earn immortalization in poetry, dramatization in plays or romanticization in novels, Johnston, 1992).
>
> In all likelihood, indigenous peoples of the Americas never considered themselves poets as many scholars consider them. Rather, they were effective communicators, and their words had specific purposes. A song was not a poem; likewise, a prayer was not a poem or a bit of prose (Cornell, 1987).

I preface my review of Zolbrod's book with statements by two Annishnawbe scholars, Basil Johnston and George Cornell, in order to show two

different views in a debate which I consider the context for my discussion. While the first quote expresses a Native person's perspective on the need for recognition of oral and written Native literature as literature, the second quote emphasizes, again from a Native point of view, the cultural rather than the literary aspects of orature and in particular of so-called "oral poetry," the topic of Zolbrod's study.

Zolbrod, professor of English at Allegheny College and senior curator at the Museum of Indian Arts and Culture in Santa Fe, wants "to avert the narrow print-oriented Euroamerican assumptions about what poetry is" (p.34) and, consequently, give "oral poetry" the same status as "alphabetical poetry." Designating the category *poetry* as the genus and *literature* as "one species of it" (p.7), he also includes narratives like myths in his study of "oral poetry." In the chapter following his introduction Zolbrod discusses his choice of English versions of four "sacred texts" of the Iroquois--The Story of Creation, The Thank-you Prayer, The Dekanawida Myth and the Condolence Ritual. As the focus of his study is "to recognize the traditional poetic activity of Native American peoples" (p.9), the emphasis of his discussions is not on the cultural but on the literary and artistic aspects of the narratives; although the title of this chapter--"Sacred Texts and Iroquois Culture"--seems to lead into a different direction. He wants to demonstrate through his interpretation of those orally transmitted and eventually recorded texts that "they reside at the center of the universally applied art of poetry-making throughout the human community" (p.24), and thus he highlights their "poetic artistry" (p.25) and the "dramatic intensity" (p.25) of the rituals.

The greater part of the book is devoted to the classification of "poetic texts" like the "sacred poetry" of the Iroquois, the Navajo and the Tewa of San Juan Pueblo. In chapter three Zolbrod distinguishes between the lyric and the colloquial *voice,* in chapter four between the dramatic and the narrative *mode,* and in the last chapter he attempts a taxonomy, "a broadly applicable classification by voice and mode" (p.109). He addresses his analysis of various examples of orature to careful and attentive readers who hear the speaker's or singer's voice while they are reading. His own style of writing is in tune with his subject matter, the orality of the original performances. He uses the rhetorical device of repetition and speaks from a storyteller's first person perspective, as in sometimes saying to his audience "Please bear in mind..." (p.4) or "Look again..." (p.60). In each of the classification chapters he demonstrates not only how literary characteristics like the lyric voice and the dramatic mode are "evident even in translation" (p.40), but also how the performance aspects of the transcribed texts can be conveyed on the printed page, for example through a certain "contrived graphic arrangement" that "would prompt a reader to think of a

text in terms of voice rather than print" (p.42). A Canadian example that came to my mind in this context is the book of stories told by the Okanagan Elder Harry Robinson and put into print by Wendy Wickwire in the format of fragmented lines of poetry so that, indeed, the storytellers voice speaks to the reader through the print medium.

In his discussion of different approaches to "Homerizing" (as Wickwire calls it in the preface to her collection of stories) orally transmitted texts, Zolbrod refers mostly to Euroamerican scholars, Hymes. Swann and Tedlock among others, whom George Cornell criticizes in an essay titled "The Imposition of Western Definitions of Literature on Indian Oral Traditions." He claims that in their academic practices the "complicated cultural complex of indigenous ideas, socio-political thought and action, celebration and spirituality is... subordinated to formalist treatment" (Cornell, 1987:178). Although Zolbrod himself sometimes attempts a cultural interpretation and always stresses a connection between poetry and "the sacred," his main emphasis is the analysis of a text as "an art form" (i.e. poetry), whereas Comell claims that "Native peoples.., never cultivate and develop words for purely artistic ends" (*Ibid.*:179) and that therefore the mere concept of poetry is alien to Indigenous ways of thinking.

Concluding, I want to come back to the debate I mentioned at the beginning of my review. On the one hand, Euroamerican or Eurocanadian scholars are expected to acknowledge '1he literary worth" (p.51) of the texts--or, in Zolbrod's terminology, the poetry--created by the non-literate Indigenous people of this continent before contact, so that the texts can be discussed on the same level of scholarly discourse as the Bible, the Greek classical tradition, and "Shakespeare, Milton, Dickens, or Emily Dickinson" (p.47). On the other hand, it is maintained that the classification, interpretation, and evaluation of Aboriginal orature demands linguistic competence in the original language and an understanding of the "specific cultural context which accurately reflects the mode, purpose and rationale for communication" (Cornell, 1987:180). Hence, a study of orature should include as much as possible the voices of Native Americans living today. Zolbrod, however, dismisses modern Native American writers and poets too quickly for being "not Native enough" ortoo print-oriented. The study of orature also demands a knowledge of the specific conditions under which "Homerized" texts have been produced, as Ralph Maud has done in his study of mythography. Although I too do not want to polarize poetry according to race, class, gender, or cultural origin (p.124), I do not want to universalize either. It is because of my disagreement with Zolbrod's belief In "the universally applied art of poetry-making" (p.24) that I cannot fully appreciate his study, which, in other ways, within the given parameters, makes a valuable contribution to "understanding tribal peoples not merely as hapless victims of a European juggernaut, but as survivors able none-

theless to preserve their cultural wealth verbally as well as materially" (p.116).

Renate Eigenbrod
Department of English
Lakehead University
Thunder Bay, Ontario
Canada, P7B 5E1

References

Cornell, George L.
1987 The Impositions of Western Definitions of Literature on Indian Oral Traditions, pp. 174-187, in Ed. T. King *et al.: The Native in Literature.* Oakville: ECW Press.

Johnston, Basil
1992 Is That All There Is? Tribal Literature, pp. 105-112, in D.D. Moses and T. Goldie (Editors): *An Anthology of Canadian Native Literature in English.* Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Maud, Ralph
1982 *A Guide to B.C. Indian Myth and Legend.* Vancouver: Talonbooks.

Robinson, Harry and Wendy Wickwire
1994 *Write it on Your Heart.* Vancouver: Talonbooks.