

## BOOK REVIEWS

Abel, Kerry: *Drum Songs: Glimpses of Dene History*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1993, xxviii + 339 pp., black and white photographs, tables, maps, bibliography, index. [McGill-Queen's Studies in Ethnic History series.] ISBN: 0-7735-0992-5, Cloth CDN \$44.95; 0-7735-1150-4, Paper CDN \$19.95.

Kerry Abel grew up in northern Canadian resource towns but, not surprisingly, learned little from her schooling about the north and its Aboriginal residents. This personal experience inspired her research focus as an historian. With this book, she hopes "... to readjust the balance of historical writing" (p.x) and "... to answer the question of how these northern people have been able to maintain a sense of cultural distinctiveness in the face of overwhelming economic, political, and cultural pressures from the European newcomers to their homelands" (p.xi). While she does not claim to be writing an ethnohistory or history from Dene perspectives, she does incorporate a wide range of social, economic, and political topics.

Dene or Athapaskan peoples are widely distributed across the western Subarctic, from Hudson Bay to interior Alaska. They live in northern California and in the southwestern United States. The Dene of this history are those occupying the Mackenzie River drainage, especially that part of it that later became the Northwest Territories, with some discussion of contiguous regions. A map showing the general population divisions used in this book would have been helpful.

The narrative begins by outlining the history of human occupation of the Mackenzie Drainage to the point of contact with Europeans, drawing upon archaeological evidence and Dene oral traditions (Chapter 1) followed by a very broad-brushed picture of Dene life in the 18th century on the eve of contact with European traders (Chapter 2). The discussion suggests a lack of familiarity with anthropological approaches. There is some confusion in the text among archaeological cultures, divisions related to subsistence pursuits, and the cultures of socio-cultural groups (those with distinct identities). Oral traditions are introduced as the sources of "... the clearest detail of ancient history" (p.8), which may be true if one knows how to "read" cross-cultural texts. However, the narrative does not address the difficulties in eliciting historical information from cross-cultural oral traditions, but rather draws selectively upon stories relating to particular historic problems.

The remainder of the book is divided into a series of chapters concerning the impacts of the fur trade (Chapters 3 to 7), the post-1870 expansion

of the Canadian state into the Dene region (Chapters 8 and 9), and post-world War II Dene political activism (Chapter 10). Her premises that the Dene have not been passive recipients of European actions, but actively involved in determining their own futures, even when Euro-Canadians made that difficult to do, is argued convincingly.

Although their traditional territories were situated mostly beyond the Mackenzie Drainage, the Chipewyan were the first Dene to become involved with European traders, at a time when the Hudson's Bay company (HBC) was confined to its posts on Hudson's Bay. Abel presents early Chipewyan behavior as strategic, taking advantage of their proximity to the Bay to become shrewd fur trade middlemen (Chapter 3). European traders moved into the northwestern interior after 1763, establishing contacts with many other Dene peoples (Chapter 4). The consolidation of competing fur trade companies in 1821 set the stage for a new period in the fur trade (Chapter 5), usually considered to have been one of relative stability. Abel points out that the Dene were often unwilling to trade with Europeans, and that trade relations continued among different Dene groups, sometimes leading to hostilities.

This situation was complicated by a new social group of increasing importance. The freemen, former fur trade employees who stayed in the Dene region following the merger, became part of the region's social formation. They married Dene women and contributed to a Dene-Métis population. Abel contends that the Métis continued to trade independently and were a source of ongoing connection with the Red River settlement. This allowed Dene trappers to by-pass HBC posts (a point also noted in Chapter 7), although the supporting evidence presented here is limited. She does not explore persisting Métis patterns of employment with the HBC or other aspects of Métis relations with Dene, important topics that warrant more elaboration.

Chapter 6 focuses on the Christian missions to the Dene. The Dene welcomed the missionaries when they arrived in the mid-19th century but later rejected their demands when the missionaries were unable to reciprocate in culturally-appropriate ways. By the end of the 19th century, most Dene were nominally Christian but interpreted Christianity from their own cultural viewpoints. In short, in religion, as in trade, the Dene were active recipients in the new value systems promoted by the missionaries. Abel does not examine the impacts of missionaries and the residential schools in the 20th century; a different situation due to government support for missionary initiatives.

A turning point in Dene history occurred in 1870, when Canada acquired the Dene lands from the Hudson's Bay Company. The end of the

HBC's monopoly resulted in renewed competition by traders, a topic that is introduced (Chapter 7) but not pursued in later chapters. The remainder of the book deals with Dene societies in their dealings with the Canadian state after 1870, mediated by the signing of treaties (Chapter 8) and regulated by the *Indian Act* and other legislation, especially acts governing access to wildlife resources (Chapters 8 and 9). In the 20th century, the Dene had to contend with new and competing industries which, for the most part, did not provide them with benefits. Chapter 10 is a useful summary of the political activism of recent decades, especially Dene challenges to government policies and their involvement with political and constitutional development in the Northwest Territories.

Abel's book synthesizes a wide body of scholarly work as well as drawing upon unpublished sources. It provides an overview of Dene history that will be enlightening for the general public and useful for undergraduate students, who will find the bibliography a particular benefit.

It is not without problems, however, especially the omission of a discussion of Dene historiography. One must read between the lines of the text and bibliography to learn about the historical work done by other scholars, with a few notable exceptions. For example, Abel's discussion of the oral traditions of the White River ash fall does not clearly credit even her own co-authors in an earlier paper and publication about this subject, where this topic was explored in considerable detail (see Moodie, Catchpole, and Abel, 1992). Work by anthropologists was summarily dismissed (pp.x-xi), despite their extensive contributions to the Dene historical literature and the fact that Abel has obviously read and utilized these sources. Less seriously, the broad sweep of the narrative means that it must miss many of the shadings and nuances of Dene history. The focus on the Dene of the Mackenzie Drainage occasionally wanders, digressing for example, to the Yukon.

The text contains some errors and difficulties that could have been eliminated by a good edit, preferably by someone familiar with Dene cultures and history. The information about the Dogrib hand game photo is incorrect (p.xxviii), as are some of the names of Treaty 8 signatories at Fort Chipewyan 8 (p.170). There are discrepancies between information in the text (p.175) about Treaties signed prior to 1910 and the information on Map 3 (p.166). Other areas are more gray: in some instances, motives are assigned to people that are in fact the author's speculation. Did Dene women adopt cooking pots simply for "the convenience of a ready-made utensil (p.75), or because they were impressed by specific properties about the pots? Abel suggests that orphans may have been killed following an epidemic (p.150), a viewpoint which is quite different from the usual

interpretations of infanticide and which thus requires supporting evidence.

Reconstructing past lifeways and events is a highly complex business. With *Drum Songs*, Abel has made a commendable effort, giving us an easily read historical narrative that is particularly important in its efforts to identify the active roles that Dene played as they interacted with traders, missionaries, and government officials over time.

Patricia A. McCormack  
 Provincial Museum of Alberta  
 12845 - 102 Avenue  
 Edmonton, Alberta  
 Canada, T5N 0M6

### Reference

- Moodie, D. Wayne, A.J.W. Catchpole and Kerry Abel  
 1992 Northern Athapaskan Oral Traditions and the White River Volcano. *Ethnohistory* 39(2):148-171.

Alia, Valerie: *Names, Numbers, and Northern Policy*. Halifax, Nova Scotia: Fernwood Publishing, 1994, ix + 118 pp., map, photos, appendices, references. ISBN: 1-895686-31-8, Paper CDN \$11.95.

This book is a fascinating study of attempts by successive Canadian governments to influence and/or manipulate the traditional naming practices of the Inuit. As Alia remarks in the preface, names are an important facet of cultural identity. Not only do they identify individuals, but they also often express and embody power (p.1).

The powerful impose their own patterns of naming on the less powerful. Geographical names in the Arctic have, until recently, been those of the non-Inuit (Qallunaat). Names of places are derived from the names of important explorers, e.g., Frobisher Bay; or other important personages, e.g., Victoria Island; or places, e.g., Devon Island, significant to non-Inuit society. Only in recent times have the Inuit been able to put traditional names such as Kuujuaq, formerly Fort Chimo, and Iqaluit, formerly Frobisher Bay, on maps. To some Qallunaat, whose ancestors "discovered" and "developed" Inuit territory, this is threatening. In a letter to the *Globe and Mail* a retired naval captain laments:

The threat to change thousands of northern place names is disturbing... I am dismayed at the sanctioning of this assault on the history of the Arctic, our collective Northern Heritage (p.11).

Names in Inuit culture are much more than lifeless identifiers. They are a means of reincarnating the dead. Their role, some commentators say, compares with the role of souls or guardian angels in Christianity, though the Inuit concept of names is more complex (p.14). A child becomes a person only when it receives an *atiq* or name, usually that of a recently deceased relative or other person of significance to the family. The child takes on the identity of its namesake. The many persons who share the same name have well-defined obligations to each other, arising from their being namesharers.

Inuit naming practices made little sense to the Qallunaat or colonizers. The identity of the child with his or her namesake creates conceptual puzzles for non-Inuit. A daughter can turn out to be her mother's grandfather:

If I give my grandfather's *atiq* to my baby daughter, she *is* my grandfather. I will call her *ataatassiaq*, grandfather. She is entitled to call me grandson (p.14).

The Inuit gave many children the same name and did not use surnames, nor did they distinguish between sexes in naming. To Arctic bureaucrat and missionary alike it seemed clear that all was not rational in the world of Inuit names. This book concentrates upon two main policies by which the government tried to set things right: the disc number system, and Project Surname.

Government bureaucrats found it difficult to identify Inuit, not only because many had the same name, but also because Inuit names were often spelled in several different ways in English. In 1932, Major McKeand of the Department of the Interior suggested that a file be created for each Inuit consisting of the person's name in English and syllabics, together with fingerprints. No one in government objected and fingerprinting was actually started. According to McKeand, it was an unqualified success (p.28). However, protests were made by several people. Dr. J. Bildfell, a medical officer who accompanied the Eastern Arctic Expedition, complained that the process crowded his examination quarters, frightened the Inuit, and was administratively useless to boot. Bildfell also pointed out that the nearest fingerprint identification experts were in Ottawa, so the prints could hardly serve the function of routine identification! Obviously some better system of identification was required. Disc numbers were adopted to serve this purpose.

Identification discs were first suggested in 1935 by Dr. A. MacKinnon, who envisaged something like armed forces dog tags that would be worn at all times. No action was taken at the time, but in 1941 a system of identification discs was approved by the Northwest Territories Council. The identification discs were of pressed fibre, and the numbers were to be used on all birth, marriage, and death certificates. A deputy commissioner suggested that the discs ought to be made of white metal and have a dignified design. Major McKeand vehemently objected to this proposal on the ground that it would be replacing an identification number or dog tags with a medal (p.36). Many objected to the identification discs on the grounds that it is an offense against the dignity of persons to identify them by numbers. Others claimed that the practice singled out Inuit for identification in this way while other Canadians were identified by their names. All Canadians should be treated the same. Gradually, a general consensus developed within government circles that the identification discs must go. However, the identification problem would still remain since Inuit insisted on giving children the same names. The solution adopted by the government was to give all Inuit surnames so they could be like all other Canadian citizens. It never seemed to dawn on bureaucrats that, rather than interfering with traditional naming practices, identification tags could have been replaced by SIN numbers and in that way make Inuit the same as all other Canadians. Although some Inuit did object to identification numbers, it is arguable that Project Surname disrupted traditional Inuit naming practices more than disc numbers ever did. Some Inuit even found novel uses for their numbers such as numbering their houses or as the combinations for locks (p.31). Project Surname was to provide a non-numerical dignified way of assuring that every Inuit had a given or Christian name and a surname, the same as every other Canadian. It was to be finished by the end of the Centennial year of the Territories, 1970.

Project Surname began in 1969 and was headed up by an Inuit, Abe Okpit, as a centennial project blessed by the Territorial Council. Although the programme was supposedly voluntary, Okpit's mission was in fact to get a list of all the Inuit in the communities he visited together with proper surnames. Even though some complained, Okpit claimed that only one person refused to adopt a surname and insisted on retaining his number instead. Surnames had no place in Inuit naming. The practice of giving married women the name of the husband's family was regarded as particularly offensive. Although some Inuit who had converted to Christianity chose gendered Christian names found in the Bible, such as Ruth, John, and Abe, the concept of gendered names was foreign to traditional naming practices. Among those most annoyed by these name changes were

children who returned from boarding school to find that their identity had been changed - in their absence. Administrators claimed that the new naming system would solve the problem of more than one person having the same name. The properly formed names "Peter Jones," "John Smith," and numerous others show this is incorrect. Inuit names together with a SIN number would have solved all the administrative problems without interfering with the traditional naming practices. Some groups, such as the Inuit Women's Association, have suggested that the government should pay the legal costs of those Inuit who wish to re-assume their traditional names (p.91).

Alia's book contains a number of useful illustrations, including a map of Arctic communities. The map contains an unfortunate glitch. "Frobisher Bay" has been whited out, but the Inuit name "Iqaluit" is not written in. An important Arctic community is thus lost to the map. One appendix contains a short glossary of terms and another a chronology of events in the Arctic dating from the visits of the Norse. An eight page bibliography testifies to the depth of the author's research. Unfortunately, there is no index. *Names, Numbers, and Northern Policy* is a welcome addition to the growing corpus of works studying the relationships between the Inuit and the Qallunaat.

Ken Hanly  
Department of Philosophy  
Brandon University  
Brandon, Manitoba  
Canada, R7A 6A9

Bloomfield, Leonard: *Sacred Stories of the Sweet Grass Cree*. Saskatoon: Fifth House Publishers, 1993, 352 pp. ISBN: 1-895618-27-4, Paper CDN \$16.95. [Photo reprint of same title as published 1930, Canada Department of Mines, Anthropological Series 11, National Museum of Canada Bulletin 60.]

This re-issue of Bloomfield's collection of thirty-six tales is addressed more to the non-specialist than the specialist as is advertised on the back cover: "Sacred Stories... is reprinted here in its original format so readers everywhere can once again enjoy these wonderful Native stories that have been passed down from generation to generation." The format of the book, however, which is faithfully reprinted from the original without editorial changes or interventions, makes it useful only to the Algonquian specialist.

The tales were collected during a five-week stay in 1925, the Introduc-

tion tells us, and are presented in Cree followed by an English translation. The translations are literary, not inter-linear, and rather free if one is to judge by the several questioning notes that frankly declare Bloomfield's puzzlement regarding the Cree text. For example, note 1 on page 28 states, "This sentence and the following speech are unintelligible to me," yet the English text reads rather coherently, "They had already found the place to stop and rest. Wait and eat at the place where we were planning to eat, before we move on.' 'Oh, little brother [*Wisahkatsak*], when my sister-in-law kindles the fire, I shall get up all right,' he told his younger brother." There is no mention who helped Bloomfield translate from Cree, although it was probably Father Lacombe and a native Cree speaker, Baptiste Pooyak. And it is clear that Bloomfield - but not his Cree collaborators, who were monolingual - followed a literary agenda when putting together the English texts, though nearly every story has blanks with no translation provided and no corresponding querying note in the Cree. The many notes that sometimes query whether the Cree original is in error, also leave me wondering about Bloomfield's assumptions when recording the stories, as in the vast majority of these instances. The reason for Bloomfield's puzzlement is rarely recorded. The notes are also of limited usefulness when, for example, Bloomfield notes "unknown word" in the Cree but fails to suggest possible alternatives, and does not describe the reasons for his choice of words or expression in the English translation. And one can only wonder what Bloomfield had in mind when he noted (p.83, for example), "This feature certainly does not belong here; it spoils the climactic point of the next stroke" (p.83), or "These two words have no place here" (p.239). It seems obvious that Bloomfield had a clear idea of the mold that would give English form to his Native texts, and that this mold was not entirely derived from linguistic considerations. In brief, the English texts are entertaining, coherent, and well written, which is exactly what makes me suspicious about their link to the Cree. It might be important to remember Bloomfield's article on various degrees of competence among Native speakers (1927), in which he argued that non-written languages such as Menomini sometimes, and surprisingly, distinguish good and bad speech forms more than written languages do. Perhaps Bloomfield was using a literate Plains Cree model to construct his English texts, though this is nowhere stated in the Introduction.

Bloomfield, of course, was a linguist, and a superb one. Even more than his brilliant contemporary Sapir, Bloomfield was responsible for wrenching linguistics away from speculative psychology and placing it on to a scientific basis that still informs modern linguistics. An Indo-Europeanist, who was at home in many other languages, Bloomfield is best remembered for his solid contributions to Algonquian studies, the "Algonquian"



sketch in *Linguistic Structures of Native America* (Hojjer *et al.*, 1946). One can hardly fault Bloomfield for not undertaking an analysis of the myths, as they were collected (or at least, published) to illustrate linguistic features of Plains Cree. What seems odd is that Fifth House Publishers did not ask someone to edit them, to add a few notes, to explain the context of the stories in a new Introduction. If they had wanted to salvage the tales from the relatively hard-to-obtain original format in order to present them to a predominantly Native audience, then why print the English? If they had wanted to increase sales to include non-Cree-speaking Algonquian scholars, then why the Cree? Economics is probably the answer, since a straight reprint is probably a lot cheaper than a new edition.

We are told that the stories are *atayohkanin*, sacred texts, concerned with the creation of the world or when the creator-trickster Whiskey-jack (*Wisahkatsak*) was still active in the world of men, as were the Windigo and various "animal-doctors." Most of them are in fact legends with some references to the White world (poison obtained from the White man in "*Wisahkatsak* Preaches to the Wolves," soldiers and houses in "*Wisahkatsak* as a Captain"), though on the whole the tales contain enough traditional themes and motifs to fulfil the promise on the book cover, that these are "A valuable treasury of traditional stories from the Sweet Grass Cree..." The republication of any hard-to-find book is always welcome, though one wonders if a new introduction and notes could have made the book more accessible to a wider public, scholarly and otherwise.

Guy Lanoue  
Departement d'anthropologie  
Universite de Montreal  
C.P. 6128, succursale centre-ville  
Montreal, Quebec  
Canada, H3C 3J7

### References

- Bloomfield, Leonard  
1927 Literate and Illiterate Speech. *American Speech* 2(10):432-439.
- Hojjer, Harry *et al.*  
1946 *Linguistic Structures of Native America*. New York: Viking Fund Publications in Anthropology 6.

Fortier, Normand: *Guide to Oral History Collections in Canada/Guide des fonds d'histoire orale au Canada*. Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Oral History Association/Société canadienne d'histoire orale Journal 13 (1993), Special Issue, xxi + 402 pp., preface, introduction, indices.

Normand Fortier's *Guide to Oral History Collections in Canada* is a welcome addition to the current bibliographic aids available to researchers interested in Native Studies. The *Guide* has been developed in a way that allows for quick, efficient reference to the material. The various collections are listed alphabetically by province and then by repository. Those collections held by federal institutions have a section of their own. The index allows "access to the collections according to subjects: themes, places, proper names of organizations, [A]boriginal peoples and ethnocultural groups" (Fortier:xvii).

The purpose of the *Guide* is to "provide the public and the research community with a summary description of all significant collections of oral history material held in Canada, in audio and video" (Fortier:xiii). The material was collected through questionnaires that were sent to the various repositories. Herein lies one of the weaknesses of the *Guide*. The onus was on the repositories for the description of their collections. This led to a difference in the length and quality of the annotations. For example, the Saskatchewan Provincial Archives description of the "Ethnocultural Groups of Saskatchewan: The First People" (Fortier:316), consisting of 129 audio tapes, takes up fully half a page. The "Dene National Library/Archives Audio/Visual Collection" (Fortier:158), consisting of 60 audio tape reels and films, 400 audio tape cassettes and 50 video cassettes is, in contrast, described in less than a quarter of a page.

It is important to note that Fortier has made a distinction between oral history and oral tradition. Fortier defines oral history as "recorded recollections relating to any aspect of an interviewee's life. It does not include other recordings such as speeches, conference proceedings or radio programs" (Fortier:xii). There are no references to collections that are made up exclusively of oral traditions (i.e. songs, legends, etc.). Fortier also omits any collections that are less than one hour in length.

A final weakness of the *Guide*, which is common to any guide of this nature, is the fact that it is outdated as soon as it is published (Fortier admits this weakness:xvii). The *Guide* does, however, provide forms in an appendix that can be sent to the publisher, the Canadian Oral History Association, so that revisions, additions, and/or corrections can be made to the present guide.

Despite the few weaknesses mentioned above, clearly the *Guide* is an

important and valuable addition to the collection of bibliographic aids now available to those interested in Native Studies. Although meant to be an Oral History Guide, the addresses and phone numbers provided can also help researchers in locating other items. The *Guide* provides researchers with a current list of many institutions that may otherwise take some time in tracking down. The *Guide* is also useful in that it can assist researchers in locating oral history materials that may otherwise be overlooked. For example, there are materials available in such obscure places as the "Icelandic Canadian Fond" in the collection of the Provincial Archives of Manitoba that refer to Native peoples.

The real strength of the *Guide*, in relation to those interested in Native Studies, is the detailed index. Indian groups are listed by name, i.e. Cree Indians, Dogrib Indians, Kwakiutl Indians etc. There are also headings for Native Canadians, as well as related subjects such as the *Indian Act*, Residential schools, Treaties, Missionaries and so on.

The value of the *Guide* will be determined by the anticipated updates of the work. If repositories continue to cooperate and the editors can locate new collections, the *Guide* can be an important contribution to the available bibliographic aids and will have a place on the shelves of academic, public and private libraries.

Ron Nestor  
Library  
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College  
Room 218, College West  
University of Regina  
Regina, Saskatchewan  
Canada, S4S 0A2

Frazier, Patrick: *The Mohicans of Stockbridge*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992, xviii + 307 pp., maps, photos, preface, notes, references, index. ISBN: 0-8032-6882-3, Paper US \$12.95; 0-8032-1986-5, Cloth US \$35.00.

Drawing upon the numerous resources available to him as reference specialist on North American Indians at the Library of Congress, Patrick Frazier chose July 1734 as the pivotal date about which to develop his history of the Mohican nation. At that time, a tribal council was attempting to decide the future course of its people when faced with the seemingly inevitable increase of European influence. Elders at the council related their verbal history dating back to earliest times, of their intertribal affiliations and conflicts, and of the first encounters with the French and English traders,

settlers and missionaries. The issue at hand was whether or not to accept a missionary into their midst; the decision was to "leave (their) former courses and become Christians" (p.17).

Frazier's book traces the story of the Mohicans with intricate detail and determined sympathy. Copious footnotes and an extensive index of published and unpublished primary sources provide full opportunity for readers to undertake their own research and analysis. Details of the ministry of their first missionary, John Sergeant, are interwoven with anecdotes of his travels to Mohican villages, attempts at conversion and encounters with traditional Native practices. Similarly, situations that the Mohicans faced in their daily lives are recounted with equal clarity: land-hungry settlers, alcohol, unfamiliar diseases, unsympathetic colonial authorities, new economic realities, a foreign language and education.

It was against this backdrop that the colonial legislature incorporated Stockbridge in 1736 as an Indian town. From its inception the town had problems: friction between Christian and non-Christian Mohicans, system of land ownership, sale of lands to European settlers, rivalry between Christian groups vying for souls, warfare involving the French and British that encouraged Native loyalties on either side. By Sergeant's death in 1749, Stockbridge was far from being the Mohican haven that was first envisioned. During Jonathan Edwards' tenure as minister (1751-1757), the Mohicans were under pressure both as a result of Edwards' style of Christianity which stressed more stringent moral demands upon Native adherents, as well as the colonial legislature's unpopular overtures that Mohican youth join in a military expedition against the Six Nations people living near Upper Canada. Many Stockbridge men were drawn into this conflict against their wishes. Upon their return home in 1759 they not only met a new minister, Stephen West, who was "long on Christian exactitude and discipline and short on Christian compassion" (p.138), they also felt betrayed by the New York legislature. While away fighting in a war that they considered none of their business, the legislatures of New York and Massachusetts were in a boundary dispute that greatly concerned Mohican interests. Such was their concern over continued lack of legislature support that they organized a trip to England in 1766 to enlist that of the king, but with little success.

Mohican residents of Stockbridge in the early 1770s continued to decline in morale. They were outnumbered by non-Native settlers, they had little voice in the affairs of the town, disease and alcohol abuse were rampant, many of their men had died in the wars, and the school and church were not operating to the benefit of the Mohicans. They frequently asked for separation from Stockbridge and the chance to re-establish a Native

settlement, but these ideas met with no sympathy at the level of either town council or colonial legislature. In 1771 the new minister, John Sergeant Jr., was in favour of this development, but the War of Independence put a stop to this plan and again involved the Mohicans in a war that they felt was not of their concern. In 1782 the Mohicans again asked the New York legislature for their own piece of land separate from Stockbridge, but to no avail. Some Mohicans had settled among the Mohegans of Connecticut and were invited to join them in their new town of Brothertown in Oneida territory in upper New York. Other Mohicans were finally granted land in Tuscarora territory in the same area of New York in 1784 by the legislature. By this time the Mohicans of Stockbridge were scattered and the town was a totally non-Native community.

In his preface, Frazier states that his hope for the book is that

it will bring public awareness to the existence of these people and their contribution to a significant segment of American history... It is a story of genuine nobility of spirit, quiet strength and loyalty almost beyond belief, demonstrated by a people who were physically, emotionally and economically close to tragedy much of their lives (p.xi).

The reader would have to admit that this hope has been fulfilled.

A major strength of Frazier's writing is that his position as a collector of primary sources has given him access to the copious extant diaries, correspondence, and legislative entries. This enables him to avoid the misleading romanticism of Cooper's *Last of the Mohicans*. At the same time, he acknowledges the fact that the lack of primary materials from the Mohicans themselves has created "agonizing gaps." So thorough is his coverage of the life of the community, that one is caught short at the end of the book when reminded that the entire drama has taken place within only fifty years.

Topics of general interest to those who study the interaction of North American Native and non-Native people are well documented and analyzed by Frazier. Reasons as to why the Mohicans accepted Christianity and conflicts which arose as a result of this decision are discussed both prior to (pp.13-15) and following (pp.240-241) the main Stockbridge story. Similarly Frazier demonstrates that the terminology used by colonial officials and Mohican leaders reveals how the people of each culture misunderstood the other's concepts of authority when discussing Mohican loyalty to the King as Stockbridge was approaching incorporation as a town (pp.34-35). Although the Mohicans are the central figures in the story of Stockbridge, Frazier's use of resources and style of writing would shatter any reader's illusion that all Native people are the same. The interaction of the

Mohicans with neighbouring Native nations in New England is given as much attention as is that of the Mohicans and Europeans. A constant theme interwoven through the book is that concerning the ownership and use of the land. Throughout the history of Stockbridge there was tension over the Mohican concept of land being held communally and kept in its natural state, and the European belief in land owned privately to be developed by the owner. This tension is still being felt today among many Native nations in their relations with dominant non-Native governments.

An additional strength of the book lies in Frazier's integrity when discussing these issues. Although the Mohicans largely accepted Christianity, they were not blind to the shortcomings of the Europeans who introduced that faith; alcoholism, violence, disease, and increased criminal activity affected the Mohicans as much as the European colonists who claimed moral superiority because of Christianity (p.173ff). When Mohican orators felt it in their interest to remove themselves from Stockbridge, they did not hesitate to play on the emotions of the colonial legislature in pleading a loyalty which at other times ran rather thin (pp. 234-235). When they did gain permission to resettle, the Mohican leaders divided the land in a system of individual ownership which they had earlier rejected; now it was Natives granting plots of land to Natives (p.242)!

The debate will long continue as to the degree to which the Mohicans in particular and Native North Americans in general accepted Christianity and the European way of life, and how much their continued existence depended upon their adapting to the realities of life as the numbers of Europeans increased. Although a major strength of Frazier's writing is his openness to this debate and his refusal to make a judgement on the issues raised, I was disappointed that the reader could think that Stockbridge Mohicans and their concerns were an isolated phenomenon. The debate as to whether the Mohicans accepted Christianity due to the "inadequacy of the religion of their forefathers" (pp.16, 240) was not unique to them. In his book *Moon of Wintertime*, Grant wrote a survey of the spread of Christianity across Canada basing his thesis on the fact that the ineffectiveness of Native religions was responsible for the acceptance of the new religion. Grant's book also indicated the extent to which the boarding school system was used as a means of "civilizing" the Native people. It was not a feature unique to Stockbridge (p.46). The establishment of the town government of Stockbridge was similar to a practice followed in a number of Native villages in New England. A single reference by Frazier to a "praying town" (p.41) needs to be balanced by reading books by historians such as Vaughan, who describes this system of adapting Native life to European models. The few references to Mohican religious ceremonies (pp.22, 55)

are made with a slight disdain, although it is not clear whether this emanates from Frazier or from the original Puritan sources. No mention is made of the central importance of ceremonies to the identities of each Native nation, both in the 18th century and today.

The story of the Stockbridge Mohicans and North American Native people continues. The last five pages of Frazier's book provide an excellent conclusion to the issues raised in his writing and a good starting-point for future discussion.

Father David J. Norton  
Box 52  
Belmont, Ontario  
Canada, N0L 1B0

### References

Grant, John Webster

1984 *Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter Since 1534*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Vaughan, Alden T.

1965 *New England Frontier: Puritans and Indians, 1620-1675*. Boston: Little, Brown.

Gerber, Peter R. (Editor): *500 Jahre danach: Zur heutigen Lage der indigenen Völker beider Amerika*. Zurich: Verlag Ruegger A.G., 1993, 380pp. ISBN: 3-7253-0465-3, Paper SFr. 54.00.

In his preface to *500 Jahre danach: Zur heutigen Lage der indigenen Völker beider Amerika (500 Years Thereafter: The Present Day Situation of the Indigenous Peoples of Both Americas)*, Peter R. Gerber points out how differently the year 1992 was celebrated by the White, European-descended population and the Indigenous peoples of North and South America. Even today the Native peoples of the Americas still struggle for survival, if not for bare existence then for their social and cultural survival, for their identity. Gerber feels that the Indigenous peoples of the Americas have a far greater right to be recognized as distinct societies than a group of White immigrants, i.e., the francophones of Quebec. Although there has been some effort to acknowledge "the right to be different," in regard to compliance with international law, not much progress can be registered. To this day cultural and value system conflicts exist between Western and Indigenous people, in spite of centuries long pressure for assimilation.

This book is the result of a lecture series organized to accompany the exhibition *Ka'apor - Menschen des Waldes und ihre Federkunst: eine bedrohte Kultur in Brasilien* (*Ka'apor - People of Forest and their Feather Art Work: an Endangered Culture of Brazil*) which ran from May 1991 to October 1992 in Zürich. Eighteen articles in total deal with various topics concerning the relationship between the dominant Whites and the Indigenous people. This book review will provide a short precis of each article to familiarize English-language readers with the contents of the book.

The least satisfying article is by Sonja Schierle. It lacks precision and clarity, while dealing with the two common stereotypical views held by Europeans or Germans (here precision is lacking) about Indians. At the same time she finds that Indians' views about Germans are shaped by the American mass media, which happen to concentrate on the Third Reich and hate for foreigners. Such stereotypical views obviously hinder real understanding and communication for both parties.

In his article *Geographic Names and Sovereignty: Cultural Assertion of the Inuit in Nunavik, Canada*, Ludger Müller-Wille shows how the Inuit, by reviving all Indigenous names, redefined their cultural and political territory. What was once traditional has now become official, a factor which aids them in their efforts at self-determination.

Peter R. Gerber also deals with a Canadian issue. He describes the long and frustrating struggle of the Lubicon Cree for recognition, and tied in with this, their struggle for land. In spite of the favourable Penner and Fulton reports, the greed for oil and other natural resources prevailed. Between 1979 and 1991, the intruders reduced a self-supporting Cree community to a welfare community. This article points out the shameful way the Canadian government prolongs the process of land settlement, and underscores the government's unwillingness to pay compensation owed for so long to the Lubicon Cree. The author, who had expected more from a civilized country such as Canada, appears rather pessimistic in his prognosis. He fears it will be a long time before land claims, compensation, self-government and control over natural resources on Indian land will be granted to the Indigenous people.

Peter Bolz reports on the horse-back ride to Wounded Knee in 1990, the centennial year of the massacre. For a better understanding he supplies the reader with a short history of the events of 1890, and the reason why these annual rides have been instituted. On the one hundredth anniversary the Lakota Indians were to "wipe the tears" and close the broken circle, i.e., work toward unity among the dispersed groups. The author believes that this common experience was spiritually significant and could provide the strength to fight for the common good of their people.



In her article *Traditional Crafts of the Purhepechas of Mexico: a Threefold Chance*, Beate Engelbrecht gives a short history of the region and analyzes the life and crafts of three different villages. She shows how traditional pre-colonial crafts can secure family existence, how they strengthen the cultural identity of the villages and region, and stabilize the region by preventing out-migration. The author, however, fears that NAFTA, the latest western hemisphere free trade agreement, will have a negative effect on the traditional crafts of the Purhepecha and their entire region.

As with Engelbrecht's contribution, Susanne Hammacher deals with the every day life of women, this time in Mixteca Alta, Mexico. Here, as elsewhere, women must engage in crafts to secure the family's existence. The other alternative would be either partial or full time out-migration. In this region, weaving, silk production and crafting sombreros are the women's major occupations besides keeping house, caring for the family and the land. Many men are either temporary or full-time migrants which leaves the women to carry an even greater burden at home.

*Ethnic Radicalism as Counter-Nationalism* is Andreas Wimmer's topic. He describes the development of the Indian movement fighting for political autonomy and self-determination. The author expresses amazement at the nationalistic form of this Indian movement, and he looks at three levels for explanations for this phenomenon: in the area of social structure; that of social psychology; and that of ethno-culturalism. Wimmer argues rather convincingly that the Indian middle class, which was supposed to acculturate the Indigenous people, actually developed into the leadership of this nationalistic movement. Indians of Mexico, relegated to the lowest social level in society, hope to gain greater respect and self-determination by promoting their ethnic identity, their long traditions, culture and history.

Life in the multicultural village at Turtle Mountain near the Orinoco, Venezuela is the topic of Annemarie Seiler-Baldinger's work. After providing a short history of the village she discusses appearances and changes as well as the reason for the changes in the composition of the village, its people and the villagers' attitude toward each other and outsiders. *Les Parcs et les Reserves: Pour ou Contre les Autochtones?* illustrates the fate of the Yanomami in Brazil and Venezuela. These Indigenous people are threatened with extinction by disease from contact with Whites searching for gold and other valuable resources. The latter, in their greed, do not shrink away from crime; indeed they frequently rape the Indigenous women. Pierette Birraux-Ziegler reports that land has been set aside by both the Venezuelan and Brazilian governments, but whether the territories allocated to the Yanomami will indeed guarantee them a self-determined

life is questionable. The legislation for these parcels of land is ambiguous enough to allow various interpretations in regard to the mining of natural resources and their use for military defence. It is also possible they will now be exploited for increased tourism.

Mona B. Suhrbier tells the reader that change is essential for any viable community, and Indigenous communities are no exception. They will, like others, adopt external ideas, but will measure them by their traditional values before accepting or rejecting those ideas that initiate change. The life of the Tikuna who once were forest dwellers, but who now live by the river, serves as her example. The author points out that many changes will arise out of necessity from within the community rather than being forced upon them by outsiders. Those internal changes which she found, were even incorporated in the Tikuna myth that captured their changed lifestyle from hunting to fishing.

In *Menschen des Waldes - Wald der Menschen (Man of the Woods - Woods of Man)* Christian Erni discusses in some detail the fragile soil conditions of the Amazon basin. Especially sensitive is the *terra firma* which makes up the largest percentage, because it is a very poor soil. Plantations and monocultures do not succeed: firstly, because the poor soil is robbed quickly of certain nutrients, and secondly, because of the plague of insects that can easily spread in monocultures, which are nevertheless favoured by Western settlers. In contrast, he describes how Indigenous people managed to adapt to the ecosystem and thus survived for many centuries. However, he points out that large regions are necessary for each group to survive. Similarly, the *cabolos* and the *seringueros* have managed to live in these regions because they learned from the Natives of the Amazon. Erni recommends that developers and politicians rethink their plans and policies regarding the Amazon Indians and their region.

A truly last hour act saved the Guarani groups of eastern Paraguay from extinction: part of their Indigenous land was returned to them. Hans Rudolf Wicker also tells us that these groups have recovered economically and culturally, but that they now face the problem of finding effective political leadership among themselves.

The relationship between the Mestizos and Indians in the Highlands of Peru is illuminated in Gerhard Baer's contribution, *Wandel und Verharren im Hochland von Peru (Change and Stagnation in the Peruvian Highlands)*. The Indians, who are at the bottom of the social hierarchy, are being assisted by private agencies to better their living standards through development in agriculture and education; these agencies, however, frequently act in a paternalistic manner and thus the danger exists of the *comuneros*> again becoming dependent.

Alice Spinnler-Durr's contribution concentrates on the life of Indian women of the Andes from before the time of the Incas up to the present. These Native women, by withdrawing into the *punas*, carried on their ancient traditions. As changes introduced by outsiders had only negative effects on *indio* women, they are understandably not open to change. Even today they consider withdrawal as a form of resistance.

The Spanish conquerors of Peru created colonial governments "against" the Indigenous population, while the Creole founders of the Republic set up governments without the Indians. As Beat Dietschy reports, during the third phase of development - that is, after the revolution - the government symbolically used Inca history and tradition without really including the Indians. Disappointment has led to further discourse about the identity of the Natives and increased pressures and fights for recognition and equal rights on behalf of the Indians. Most past discourse about Indian identity took place in circles which did not belong to the Indigenous people, but this discourse now forces the Indigenous people to define themselves in their search for identity.

In the year 1992 Helmut Schindler visited various Native communities in Chile, to observe Indigenous reactions to the five hundred year anniversary of the discovery of America. Throughout the five centuries, the Mapuche have undergone many and diverse changes depending upon their locality. The "time of horror" under Pinochet did not break the Native will for survival; but the various groups will have a difficult task to accommodate the many diverse interests in order to find their identity and merge. Merger is necessary so that they can speak with one voice in their fight for recognition of their culture and language.

Lars T. Softestad's article *Indigene Völker und die Vereinten Nationen (Indigenous People and the United Nations)*, originally written in English, reports on the work of the Subcommission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities. Due to the growing efforts to resolve the problems Indigenous people face all around the globe, since 1982 a yearly Working Group of Indigenous People is called to deal with setting standards for all groups, and to review developments of Indigenous people. Softestad reports that every year more Indigenous representatives from all regions attend this conference: these gatherings have, over time, gained greater importance and the relationships among the Indigenous participants have intensified. It also appears that the impact of Western non-governmental organisations has diminished in favour of Indigenous representation; finally, the author observed that countries belonging to the United Nations show greater interest in this working team. Softestad feels that this special team can claim to have led to a better understanding of Indigenous people and

to have provided a yearly forum where the Indigenous people of the world can meet. This forum in turn may add to the development of a supra-national Indigenous identity.

Isabelle Schulte-Tenckhoff's article *Herrschaft nach Gesetz (Rule According to Law)* is the last of the series. Learning about the history of the Treaties, and their ruthless violations by the Western intruders, leaves this reviewer ashamed and depressed. As the dominant group, Europeans elevated themselves over the Indigenous people by the Guardianship Doctrine; these believers in their own superiority are not even today willing to listen to the ideas and philosophy of the Indigenous people. Laws were passed at the federal as well as at the provincial level to undermine existing Treaties. Different interpretations of the Treaties clash. For Indigenous people treaties are valid as "long as the grass grows," while Whites do everything in their power to satisfy their own greed and desires. Schulte-Tenckhoff feels that Indigenous people "will still have to wait a long time before governments (nation-states) are prepared to grant them justice."

This collection of articles, written mostly by German scholars, reflects the interest and positive attitude toward Indians prevalent in many Germans whose first image of the Indian was frequently shaped by Karl May's books about the Noble Savage. This aside, by studying the history of the Indigenous people, any person with even a slight sense of decency and justice cannot but be very critical of how so-called civilized nations or people have treated - and still treat - the Indigenous people in both Americas and other parts of the world. One can only wonder about the real purpose of law. It does not appear to serve justice.

Margot Finke  
Department of Languages  
Brandon University  
Brandon, Manitoba  
Canada, R7A 6A9

Hayden, Brian (Editor): *A Complex Culture of the British Columbia Plateau: Traditional Stl'átł'imx Resource Use*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1992, xvi + 568 pp., 21 black and white photographs, maps, figures, tables, bibliographies, index. ISBN: 0-7748-0405-X, Cloth CDN \$75.00.

In surveying the ethnographic record, archaeologist Brian Hayden finds groups such as the Aranda of Australia, the Bushman and Hadza of Africa, and the Shoshoni of the American Great Basin as typical representatives

of "generalized hunter/gatherers." Such groups lack social stratification and complexity and depend on resources with low yields. He feels that among non-agricultural peoples one can also find "much higher resources (and populations) associated with prestige display items, socioeconomic inequality, ownership, and the first indications of corporate groups." These Hayden classifies as "complex hunter/gatherers" (p.ii). This work explores at length the resource base available to hunter/gatherers in the Middle Fraser Canyon (near Lillooet, British Columbia), as well as the technologies available for harvesting and storing resources, to deal with issues relative to the quantity, quality, and reliability of these to support complex hunter/gatherers of the area in prehistoric and early historic times.

This book's sub-title more accurately reflects its content than does its title, for a well-rounded description of *St'átll'imx* (Upper Lillooet or Fraser River Lillooet) culture is not to be found here. A listing of chapter contents reveals the degree to which the book emphasizes the relationship between this Fraser River population and the environment they utilized. After a theoretically oriented introduction on ecology and culture by Brian Hayden, Diana Alexander in Chapter 2 describes the seven major environmental units in the study area: Alpine, Montane Parkland, Montane Forests, Intermediate Grasslands, Intermediate Lakes, River Terraces, and River Valleys. In Chapter 3 she combines information obtained through interviews with the record in the ethnographic literature to provide detailed descriptions of the sort of use made of resources in each of the environmental units (hence space rather than time provides the organization of this chapter). She pays particular attention to the evidence each of these activities may have left behind to be uncovered by contemporary archaeologists. The next three chapters focus on the salmon fishery. Michael Kew looks at the entire Fraser drainage emphasizing differential availability of salmon by species, geographic location, season, and population cycle. A chapter by Steven Romanoff (modified from his 1985 paper in *Northwest Anthropological Research Notes*) and another by Dorothy Kennedy and Randy Bouchard deal with the details of the technology of the salmon harvest, the sites amenable to taking salmon, and the process of preserving the catch. Fishing sites upriver from the more than 50 locations named by Kennedy and Bouchard are catalogued by Robert Tyhurst in Chapter 7. He also deals with sites for hunting land mammals and harvesting plants. Nancy Turner deals with the importance of plants to the Upper Lillooet in Chapter 8. A useful appendix to this chapter (pp.437-463) places the eleven most important species in their natural and cultural context. A second chapter by Romanoff (again, modified from an earlier publication) argues that venison (and hence the deer hunter) was vital to the Upper Lillooet

despite the enormous quantity of fish harvested (in ordinary years) and the few deer available. Aubrey Cannon in Chapter 10 points to trade (with near neighbours) and warfare (with more distant neighbours) as mechanisms for obtaining salmon by interior groups from areas beyond large salmon runs. Finally, Brian Hayden discusses variables possibly important in the transition from "generalized hunter/gatherers" to "complex hunter/gatherers" in light of the detailed data on resource use by the people in the Middle Fraser Canyon presented in earlier chapters.

As several authors point out (there is some overlap found among the chapters listed above), the study area was particularly productive for several reasons. Farther up river the spawning salmon are less desirable because of weight loss. River conditions are also optimal for taking salmon in the study area. Perhaps most important, climatic conditions are much more favourable than they were on the coast for air-drying the catch, thus allowing preservation. Indeed, salmon were so abundant and so easily harvested (in normal times) that the limiting factor to the salmon harvest was the number that could be processed for preservation. Preserved salmon were even traded downstream, where, even though salmon were more abundant, conditions for preservation were less ideal. Sam Mitchell, a now-deceased Elder from Fountain, put it this way (pp. 257-258): "This is the only country that can dry fish like that... You go further south and it's too wet - they get moldy... But you go further north and country levels out and there is no more rocks [from which you can fish]."

Much of the information found in the book derives from interviews, particularly with Elders, and from observations of contemporary practices. Contemporary salmon harvesting differs from that of the previous century on at least two counts. First, Spring (or Chinook) salmon have not been available in the Middle Fraser Canyon since the Hell's Gate slide of 1913. Spring salmon previously were a major resource and were fished from rocks "owned" by individuals. Sockeye salmon, also important in the past, are taken now as then from locales with communal access. Gill nets are now used to harvest salmon in addition to dip nets and set nets which were used in the past. With respect to fishing technology, the text is accompanied by some photographs of salmon fishing. Drawings would have been useful to the non-specialist to convey the intricacies of the set net or the process of butchering a salmon for air drying.

The importance of the salmon fishery and the location of winter villages on the river terraces should not be taken to mean other environmental units were left unused. Both Alexander (in Chapter 3) and Turner (in Chapter 8) document the importance of resources from all environmental units, including the Alpine.

I found Romanoff's discussion of the deer hunter a bit unconvincing given data in other chapters on salmon fishing and the few deer available for harvest. Deer would not seem to this reader to be available in sufficient quantity to alleviate famine in the unusual year of minimal salmon harvest. The low deer harvest meant deer hides for clothing were very scarce, a factor alluded to but not discussed at length by Romanoff and others.

All of the contributors to this volume benefitted from information provided by knowledgeable local people. In particular, Hayden acknowledges Sam Mitchell as "the major Native contributor to this volume" (p.37). In addition, this reviewer, not a specialist in the Plateau Culture Area, was struck by the frequency of citation of the pioneering ethnographic work of James Teit. The utility of Teit's work to the authors of this excellent volume indicates that Teit, like many other ethnographers of his generation, still deserves to be read.

Thomas S. Abler  
Department of Anthropology  
University of Waterloo  
Waterloo, Ontario  
Canada, N2L 3G1

McFarlane, Peter: *Brotherhood to Nationhood: George Manuel and the Making of the Modern Indian Movement*. Toronto: Between the Lines, 1993.

This is a useful account of the life's work of George Manuel (1921-1989), a "hard luck Shuswap kid" who, in the early 1970s, served as founding President of the National Indian Brotherhood (NIB), the immediate precursor of the Assembly of First Nations. McFarlane, a Montreal-based translator/journalist, achieves an effective beginning by describing Manuel's tour-de-force presentation before a session of a Joint Committee of Parliament on Indian Affairs convened in Ottawa on the morning of May 26, 1960. Judging him on the basis of his inelegant new blue suit, scarred briefcase, heavy limp, crooked smile, slow deliberate speech, and strong "Indian" accent, Committee members likely foresaw no difficulty in dealing with Manuel in the two hours allotted to him as spokesman for the British Columbia Aboriginal Native Rights Committee. Instead, holding forth for six hours, presenting a lengthy brief on the miserable conditions of B.C. Native peoples and castigating Indian Affairs for a century of colonial injustices, Manuel extracted grudging respect from the Members of Parliament assembled. Muffled in "the foggy complacency of the Eisenhower era," they

must have been taken aback when Manuel asked "Is that what you people are afraid of - that the Indians will be a self-supporting nation?"

Born into the Secwepemc (Shuswap) nation's Neskonlith Band, George Manuel was raised by his maternal grandparents. At age nine he was cattle-trucked off to the Kamloops Indian Residential School (on which see Haig-Brown, 1988) run by the Oblates of Mary Immaculate. Three things stood out in his memory about his years there: "hunger; speaking English; and being called a heathen because of my grandfather" a man whom he later described as "an Indian doctor, or a psychologist" (Manuel and Posluns, 1974:63; 35). Later Manuel would suggest that a class-action suit ought to be launched against the Vatican for the abuse suffered by generations of Native children subjected to residential schooling. When he was twelve, George contracted tuberculosis of the hip; this would force him to spend most of his adolescence at the Protestant missionary-run Coqualeetza Indian Hospital in Sardis, to which the region's Indian TB sufferers were sent because Indian Affairs refused to cover the cost of their treatment in real sanatoria. At Coqualeetza he met his first wife, Marceline Paul, a Kootenay Indian from Cranbrook. As young parents they migrated around the lower mainland of British Columbia and the U.S. Pacific Northwest as seasonal fruit-pickers. Later, despite the condition of his hip, Manuel worked as a Thompson River boom-man (highly skilled at dislodging log-jams), as a farmer, and as a lumberman. He was thirty-four when Indian Affairs' refusal to cover the cost of his son's tonsillectomy propelled him into politics. Seeing that community feeling, like other aspects of Indian life, had deteriorated since he was a child, Manuel organized local sports teams, served as booking-agent for his Tsleilwatuth friend Dan George's touring band, learned about national Native struggles from his Squamish mentor, Andy Paull (whom he succeeded as head of the North American Indian Brotherhood in 1959), worked in Cowichan as a Community Development Officer employed by the Department of Indian Affairs, then moved to Edmonton to work with Harold Cardinal's Indian Association of Alberta. Manuel and Cardinal travelled in the United States, meeting with, it was rumoured, Black Panthers and other radicals whose ideological influence would later be made explicit in Howard Adams' 1975 volume *Prison of Grass*.

Although the National Indian Brotherhood came into being in 1968, for a time it remained a paper organization. But the elected leaders of the dominant society were moving on: in June 1969, Trudeau's Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, Jean Chrétien, presented his now famous *Indian Policy, Statement of the Government of Canada*, better known as *The White Paper*. This, like the termination policy of the Bureau



of Indian Affairs in the United States from 1952 to 1970, sought to eliminate Indian status. George Manuel, who had always opposed assimilationism as the overt or covert view that "the only good Indian is a non-Indian," was pushed forward as the Aboriginal leader most likely, in McFarlane's words, to be able to block "the Trudeau-Chrétien assault on their historic rights." Saying that to accept the *White Paper* would be to serve as "willing partners in cultural genocide," the National Indian Brotherhood declared "this we cannot do."

On becoming national Chief, Manuel lost no time in moving office from Winnipeg to Ottawa. In building the National Indian Brotherhood, his administrative style, as described by his assistant Marie Smallface Marule, was that "People got the impression... they were working for themselves and their people, not for him" (Ponting and Gibbins, 1980:201). In 1972 the National Indian Brotherhood produced its historic paper *Indian Control of Indian Education* which, opposing *White Paper* relegation of Indian education to provincial control, proposed the establishment of a National Indian Education Authority which would give Indian people the right to negotiate their children's entry into public schools or even establish schools of their own. McFarlane describes how, on being presented with this paper, Chrétien "accepted it in principle, but refused to discuss the mechanics of its implementation. This was a tactic [he] would use again and again" during his three remaining years at Indian Affairs.

In February 1973, although the Supreme Court of Canada failed to overturn a negative judgement of the British Columbia Supreme Court in the Nisga'a case (*Calder v. B.C. Attorney General*), Mr. Justice Emmett Hall nevertheless stated that, "possession being nine points of the law," the Nisga'a people had rights to their historic territory which only the federal government had the power to "extinguish." Forced to climb down from his 1969 contention that "We can't recognize [A]boriginal rights because no society can be built on historical 'might have been'" (Berger, 1992:151), Trudeau admitted to Indian representatives, "Perhaps you have more rights than I thought." From the government's point of view, however, this meant little more than that the process of negotiating extinguishment would be more protracted than had been anticipated.

In 1974, despite opposition from the United States, England, and France (Ponting, 1980:204), the National Indian Brotherhood received recognition as a United Nations Non-Governmental Organization. While Manuel felt this constituted his life's "most historic event," the NIB had no intention of keeping this NGO status to itself. Having visited New Zealand, Australia, and Scandinavia in 1971-1972, Manuel continued to work tirelessly for the establishment of a World Council of Indigenous Peoples

(WCIP), peoples whose ancestors were the earliest inhabitants of the territories in which these peoples live today, but who do not control the governments of their countries. In late 1975 the first formal meeting of the WCIP, attended by delegates from nineteen countries, was held in Nuuchah'nulth territory on Vancouver Island. The following year, despite his having been diagnosed with cardiac disease (probably hereditary, his father having died young of an apparent heart attack), Manuel, as President of the WCIP, nevertheless made strenuous trips to Scandinavia, Mexico, Guatemala, Nicaragua, Panama, and Ecuador.

Although he resigned in 1976 as NIB President and was succeeded by Noel Starblanket, Manuel did not retire from politics. Instead he proceeded to rebuild the Union of B.C. Indian Chiefs, continue the ever-acrimonious fight for Aboriginal fishing-rights, and sponsor a 24-point "Aboriginal Rights Position Paper" which would later be adopted as the basic self-government policy of the National Indian Brotherhood against Constitutional proposals which said little or nothing about Canada's Aboriginal founders. In 1980 Manuel went to London in an effort to have the patriation of the Constitution cut off at the source. This pressure-laden political activity took its toll. By the end of the year, when the Native "Constitutional Express" arrived in Ottawa, occasioning much security-mad over-reaction to feared "Native unrest," Manuel was confined to hospital facing coronary by-pass surgery. In 1981 he made one more trip, this time to bring attention to the fate of Guatemalan Mayans surviving in refugee camps in southern Mexico. Further impeded, first by a minor stroke, then by a major one, George Manuel died in late 1989, at the age of sixty-eight, having barely finished his second term as Chief of the Neskonlith Band.

While McFarlane has made a very useful contribution with this account of the life and work of George Manuel, there are at least two points at which he could have adopted a somewhat more critical stance. First, readers with an appreciation of how hard Native people are struggling with the devastating effects of alcohol abuse may be dissatisfied with the assurance that "no matter how much partying [Manuel] did, he was always back in shape in time to take on his responsibilities." Second, more detail would have been welcome in regard to Manuel's and the NIB's role *vis-à-vis* the closely related cases of Jeannette Lavell (Ojibwa) and Yvonne Bedard (Six Nations). What was at issue was whether or not the rights of individual Native women and their children, as outlined in the Bill of Rights, should take precedence over collective Native rights, as set out in the *Indian Act* Manuel argued that while Section 12(1)(b) of the *Indian Act* was obviously unjust, "yet we cannot accept a position where the only safeguards we have had can be struck down by a court that has no authority to put something better

in its place. The tragedy of this situation... is that it never needed to arise (Jamieson, 1978:84). Manuel was therefore among those Indian leaders who urged Trudeau to have the government appeal an October 1971 Federal Court ruling which had found in favour of Lavell. In the landmark case *Attorney General v. Lavell* (1974), the Supreme Court decided five to four against Lavell, with the results that while the sexist provisions of the *Indian Act* remained in place for a further decade Native women and their children continued to be expelled from their homes on Reserves. In addition, Native women's organizations were denied a voice in the early negotiations between the National Indian Brotherhood and government leading to the eventual yet less than entirely successful amendment of the *Indian Act* by Bill C-31 of 1985 (Jamieson, 1978:92).

On the other hand, Manuel led a generation of Indians whose task it was to force "Canadians to look at the historical injustices on which their society is founded." During the critical years between the late 1960s and the early 1980s, Manuel insisted that justice was incompatible with any attempts to extinguish either the cultures of Native peoples or their rights to ancestral lands.

Susan Campbell  
Department of History  
Queen's University  
Kingston, Ontario  
Canada, K7L 3N6

### References

- Adams, Howard  
1975 *Prison of Grass: Canada From a Native Point-of-View*. Toronto: New Press.
- Berger, Thomas R.  
1992 *A Dark and Terrible Shadow: White Values, Native Rights in the Americas, 1492-1992*. Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre.
- Haig-Brown, Celia  
1988 *Resistance and Renewal: Surviving the Indian Residential School*. Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp Press Ltd.
- Jamieson, Kathleen  
1978 *Indian Women and the Law in Canada: Citizens Minus*. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services for the Advisory Council on the Status of Women and the National Association of Indian Rights for Indian Women.

Manuel, George, and Michael Posluns

1974 *The Fourth World: An Indian Reality*. Toronto: Collier-Macmillan Canada.

National Indian Brotherhood

1972 *Indian Control of Indian Education: Policy Paper*. Ottawa: National Indian Brotherhood.

Ponting, J. Rick and Roger Gibbins

1980 *Out of Irrelevance: A Socio-political Introduction to Indian Affairs in Canada*. Toronto: Butterworths.

Meyer, Roy W.: *History of the Santee Sioux: United States Indian Policy on Trial*. Revised edition. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1993, xvi + 471 pp., maps, photos, preface, (1993) epilogue, appendix, notes, references, index. ISBN: 0-8032-8203-6, Paper US \$17.95.

This is a reprint of Meyer's history of the Santee Sioux in the United States, first published in 1967. It consists of 406 pages of text, in addition to two prefaces, an appendix containing text and selected correspondence related to the United States Treaties with the Dakota, an updated bibliography, and a reasonably detailed index. It also has clear maps and a number of interesting illustrations. Although described on the cover as a "revised edition" of the 1967 publication, changes consist only of a "Preface to the Revised Edition" and a twenty-five page "Epilogue" which gives a brief account of Santee history from the 1960s to the present. There has been no change to the original text.

On the whole, this is a sympathetic treatment of the history of the Santee, especially from 1862 to the 1960s, which points out in detail the shortcomings of United States Indian policy. Nevertheless, Meyer's heavy reliance on Bureau of Indian Affairs documentation does cause him to lapse occasionally into its biases. For instance, on page 63 he seems to accept laziness as a factor for some, when he says that it was "not merely laziness" which prompted the Mdewakantons to avoid ploughing their fields. As "indolence" was often used by Indian agents to explain "failures" of the Santee, Meyer's acceptance of it as a factor suggests some of the agents' assumptions had crept into his own thinking. His statement on page 152 that "Stone persuaded fifteen of the *most industrious* to build log houses" [emphasis mine] also suggests indolence, rather than, say, resistance to American authority, as a motivating force. Also, he is sometimes unclear as to whose viewpoint is being expressed. In the phrase "genteel eastern ladies caught their first glimpse of the savage in his poverty and degradation," on page 44, one is not sure whether Meyer entertains the conclusion

or is merely expressing the 19th-century view, especially since he refers on page 358 to the Santee as "stone-age savages when [W]hite men first broke in on them..." However, if readers can get past these textual problems, they will find much to praise in this history, not only for the information it conveys about American policy toward Aboriginal people in general, but also for its emphasis on the Santee will to survive in the face of it.

The Epilogue deserves special mention because it reflects the changes which have occurred in the past thirty years in the way historians write about Aboriginal people. As proven by his addendum to the bibliography, Meyer has kept abreast of current literature on the Dakota, including Gary Clayton Anderson, and for the Canadian scene, Doug Elias and Father Gontran Laviolette. He speaks approvingly of the revival of the Santee, the affirmation of what remains of their culture, and the positive impact of gaming on their economic situation. He ends on a positive note, asserting that they have a better chance now than at any time in their recent past of realizing their potential.

Raymond Beaumont  
Frontier School Division # 48  
1402 Notre Dame Avenue  
Winnipeg, Manitoba  
Canada, R3E 3G5

Nuttall, Mark: *Arctic Homeland: Kinship, Community and Development in Northwest Greenland*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992, 194 pp., maps, black and white photos, bibliography, index. ISBN: 0-8020-7391-3, Paper CDN \$19.95; 0-8020-2886-1, Cloth CDN \$50.00.

This book is an ethnography of the Greenlandic Inuit community of Kangersuatsiaq, a village of about 200 inhabitants located in Upernavik district (population 2,300) in Greenland's northwestern periphery. Nuttall, a British social anthropologist, obtained his ethnographic data mainly through the traditional ethnographic method of participant observation during a twenty-month sojourn in Kangersuatsiaq in 1987-88. The author admits (p.6) being "wary of attempts at definitive analysis" on the basis "of only a transitory journey through other people's lives," but the work does amount to an impressively perceptive and equally analytical piece of social anthropological scholarship.

The author employs narrative description, including much anecdotal information given in the first person, but the emphasis throughout is analytical. The book consists of eleven thematic chapters, which take the

reader from the community's geographic layout and economic base (mainly seal-hunting and fishing), through its social anthropology, and back to the global context of that relatively isolated community. Much of the book, as one might expect from a work written by a social anthropologist, deals with kinship and social interaction in Kangersuatsiaq. Nuttall focuses particularly on the persistence today, generations after the community's adoption of Lutheran Christianity, of the traditional belief in affinity through name-sharing and the custom of naming a newborn baby after a recently deceased member of the community so that the deceased's name-soul will live on. He shows, however, that it has become largely a matter of choice, to what extent, and in what context, individuals carry out their customary obligations to those relatives acquired through naming. By highlighting such dissonance here, as well as by noting several other examples of individual variation and lack of consensus in the community, Nuttall seems to subscribe to a phenomenological approach to society and culture.

Since the introduction of Home Rule in Greenland in 1979, the main political dichotomy has, according to Nuttall, shifted from an ethnic split (Greenlanders vs. Danes), to one which pits local and regionally peripheral interests against the center at Nuuk (formerly Godthaab) in southwestern Greenland. It is not difficult to see where Nuttall's sympathies lie in this conflict, because he consistently defends Kangersuatsiaq's traditional hunting culture, with its "intuitive awareness" and "subsistence ideology," against the rationalizing, profit-oriented development advocates of the Home Rule government in Nuuk. In this regard Nuttall's views seem to correspond closely with those reiterated by Thomas Berger, although he does not list any of Berger's publications in his bibliography at the end of the book.

Nuttall demonstrates that, at least in Greenland's peripheral Upernavik district, hunting culture can survive modernization with the traditional hunting ethos relatively intact. Such persistence is possible because hunting people are able to adopt modern technology and new ways of doing things selectively and adapt such innovations to their needs. And such selectivity has resulted in the following seeming incongruities in Kangersuatsiaq: all hunters now use motorboats during the 5-6 month ice-free season, yet snow mobiles (skidoos) have not yet replaced traditional dog sleds; home telephones are used to communicate news of a successful seal hunt in anticipation of the resultant customary sharing of the seal meat (p.141); children are occupied with the playing of videos on the family VCR, which most households in the village now seem to possess, while in the same room their parents receive a succession of visitors coming to express customary and obligatory condolences following the death of a family

member (p.120).

Nuttall's *Arctic Homeland* is a revision of the author's doctoral dissertation, which helps to explain both its strengths and weaknesses. The book is quite well written and well proofread, with hardly any typographical errors in it. Three clear maps in the introductory chapter, all with map-scales given, focus the reader on the country, district and locality under discussion, although some of the places named in the book are not shown on these maps. Altogether the book is a valuable contribution to ethnographic scholarship. Its greatest strength lies in Nuttall's analysis of social anthropological phenomena, but the author also reveals a surprising blindspot in his knowledge when he strays beyond ethnography and his discussions become rather wide-ranging. Thus Nuttall attributes "global warming" to "damage caused to the Arctic ozone layer by increased emissions of man-made greenhouse gases, such as methane and carbon dioxide" (p.175). As is generally known, the emission of CFCs (chloro-fluoro-carbons) is the main contributor to ozone-layer depletion, not the greenhouse gases mentioned by Nuttall. Moreover, ozone depletion contributes, in only a minor way, to global warming. The causes of ozone layer depletion and global warming are, however, not important to Nuttall's work, and therefore the error cited above does not detract much from the scholarly value of the book. I would recommend Nuttall's *Arctic Homeland* to anyone interested in Native cultures and societies, particularly those of the circumpolar world, or in the persistence of hunting cultures in the modern world.

Alvin Kienetz  
Box 402  
The Pas, MB  
Canada, R9A 1K5

Reeves, Brian O.K. and Margaret A. Kennedy (Editors). *Kunaitupii: Coming Together on Native Sacred Sites, Their Sacredness, Conservation and Interpretation: A Native and Non-Native Forum*. Proceedings of the First Joint Meeting of the Archaeological Society of Alberta and the Montana Archaeological Society, May 2-6, 1990, Waterton Lakes National Park, Alberta, Canada. Calgary: The Archaeological Society of Alberta, vii + 275 pp., ISBN 0-88953-184-6, Paper.

Translated from the Blackfoot language, "Kunaitupii" of the title means "people coming together." Native and non-Native, religious practitioner and bureaucrat, Canadian and American participants met to share understandings on the issues involved in the treatment and interpretation of sacred sites.

This collection of presentations from a 1990 joint conference sponsored by the archaeological societies of Alberta and Montana deals with what has been one of the major points of contention between First Nations peoples and archaeologists: the differing, indeed polarized, conceptions about the sacred nature of archaeological sites.

Several of the papers present the unfortunate history of how archaeologists and government agencies have ignored the religious beliefs and practices of First Nations peoples. They identify a continuing resistance among some professional archaeologists to accept the validity of, or incorporate, the Native spiritual world view in their work. It is pointed out that this has occurred in a context where mainstream values and practices which parallel Native concerns for the non-disturbance of graves and the ongoing significance of grave goods have not been applied when Native graves are in question. Many of the Native presenters also made the point that the sanctity of place is not merely part of an isolated past, but retains on-going significance for First Nations peoples in the here and now.

Although some presenters stressed that Native archaeological sites must not be dehumanised by being referred to as "archaeological resources," two Canadian bureaucrats continued to use this concept, ignored the spiritual concerns of present people by claiming that in this complex situation there are "no automatic rights and wrongs." They maintained that the disinterment of Aboriginal remains is done with "full regard for respect for the deceased." These ideas were broached as if Native perceptions of desecration were meaningless while the concept "full respect" was not, apparently, a culturally relative one.

A number of solutions and successful case studies are presented which centre on consultation, cooperation, and co-management of sacred sites by Native groups and archaeologists. Archaeological surveys and the resulting "sensitivity maps" are being successfully employed to protect sacred sites. Sharing of spiritual world views, archaeological data, and most importantly the commodity of mutual trust are identified as the basis for resolution of past conflicts.

Although in general a very valuable review of many issues involved in the treatment and interpretation of the sacred sites associated with First Nations cultures, some minor flaws are evident in this publication. First among these is the fact that the papers were transcribed and edited from the tapes of the conference but were not reviewed by the presenters, as is the accepted practice in order to ensure accuracy with oral history transcriptions (see, for example, Baum, 1977). This has resulted in editorial errors inevitable with such a practice (e.g. the citations of Edmund Morris as "Edward" [p.75] and Carl Berger as "Burger" [p.272]).



Another disappointment is the assertion by co-editor Brian Reeves (p.1) that this conference was the first to bring together Native and non-Native people from western Canada and the United States to discuss matters relevant to sacred sites and archaeology. This seems to evidence a primary failure to perform a simple literature search, as even this reviewer (who is not an archaeologist) was aware of a much earlier precedent conference called "American Indian Militants (sic) vs Archaeologists" (Plains Anthropological Association, 1971) which was held in Winnipeg. If not to be attributed to a petty and unworthy chauvinism on the part of Reeves who asserts that locales such as South Dakota (and apparently Winnipeg) are not part of the "real west" (p.3), this failure helps to explain why many of the issues addressed by the two conferences have not been resolved in the intervening twenty years.

It also seems unfortunate that this time-limited and published form of academic vehicle is not the most appropriate one for transmitting the wisdom of Native Elders which obviously will best be accomplished in a personal, not time-bounded, cyclical relationship with elders.

Finally, one paper by co-editor Margaret Kennedy dealing with Black-foot trade ceremonialism - interesting in itself though it may be - seems oddly out of place as it has no explicit connection with the theme of Native sacred sites.

In summary, it is encouraging that this conference and the resulting publication have provided a vehicle for the sharing of understandings on the issues of spirituality and archaeological science among First Nations and other religious practitioners, Native and non-Native archaeologists, and bureaucrats. It is to be hoped that the results are put to use and not "lost" in the literature as previous efforts seem to have been.

Paul C. Thistle  
The Sam Waller Museum  
The Pas, Manitoba  
Canada, R9A 1K4

### References

Baum, Willa K.

- 1977 *Transcribing and Editing Oral History*. Nashville: American Association for State and Local History.

Plains Anthropological Association.

- 1971 *American Indian Militants vs Archaeologists. A Symposium Transcription of the 29th Plains Anthropological Conference*. Winnipeg, Manitoba: October 11.

Taite, Theresa (Wee'hal Lite): *Inside Out: First Nations on the Front Line*. Vancouver: Lazara Press, 1993. 14 pp. ISBN: 0-92099924-7, Paper CDN \$3.50. (A chapbook in the "Discussions" series.)

Depicting the personal dilemma associated with the entrenchment of Aboriginal self-government in our Canadian Constitution, *Inside Out: First Nations on the Front Line* describes Taite's experience as an Aboriginal person in a non-Aboriginal work setting. While the media focuses on the struggle for self-determination and self-government generally, the reader is made privy through this document to the daily struggle of Aboriginal people whose work setting necessitates the near impossible task of balancing two extremely different cultures.

With a persuasive writing style the writer exposes the Aboriginal perspective on being isolated in the work place, and treated as if one does not exist. The constant agenda is homogeneity with a concomitant tendency to assimilate Aboriginal people into a White society. As an Aboriginal worker, Taite is heard by co-workers only when her statements express what they want to hear; otherwise she is ignored.

I look deep inside and find myself I find the truth I am not invisible I am not wrong I know what the issues are. It's my colour, it is the way I'm dressed or not dressed, it's my heritage, it's not my fault.

Reflecting on these feelings of being ignored and misunderstood by her co-workers, the writer unapologetically points out that she is not trying to change the world of her colleagues, but only trying to preserve that which is sacred to her Aboriginal ancestry as a means of helping these non-Aboriginal people to appreciate the Aboriginal concept of time and space.

What a price to pay. The water cannot run free it's not allowed, it must be tamed, it must be controlled... I believe the water must run free and that collectively we must pay the cost.

To Taite, co-workers feel threatened by the presence of a Native person. As always there are the suspicious stares, the insinuations, the total lack of understanding. Perhaps the greatest pain derives from observing the charade displayed by non-Natives:

pretending to understand, while in the same breath stabbing my mother, their mother in the back. They wear those plastic smiles ashamed of who they are and where they come from.

To maintain her composure in this trying situation, the writer reflects on the words voiced by her great-grandmother whose view of the White man's presence derived from the fact that "... they were here to stay and

that we must accept them, that we must be kind to them, we must understand them... " This resignation helped her great-grandmother retain a strong Aboriginal identity in the face of overwhelming bigotry, cruelty and misunderstanding. In the process, she gained strength through tenacity, enabling her to rebuke distrust, ignorance and attempted co-optation. For Taite, however, the reality of her world in 1993 is seemingly more difficult. To her "... it is difficult... to remember compassion, when they take you and slam you down to the three count."

For those interested in understanding the everyday difficulties experienced by Aboriginal people in a White work force, *Inside Out: First Nations on the Front Line* offers a candid perspective. A study of the struggle for and survival of Native values in the move toward realization of Native control over Native affairs, this document provides a gripping disclosure of what it means to be labelled "Indian" in contemporary Canadian society. Definitely a critical addition to every Canadian's personal reading library.

Dennis L. Treslan  
Faculty of Education  
Memorial University of Newfoundland  
St. John's, Newfoundland  
Canada, A1B 3X8

Tester, Frank James and Peter Kulchyski: *Tammarniit (Mistakes): Inuit Relocation in the Eastern Arctic 1939-63*. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1994. xv + 420 pp., maps, photos, tables, preface, notes, references, index. ISBN: 0-7748-0452-1, Cloth CDN \$45.95; 0-7748-0494-7, Paper CDN \$24.95.

Speaking to the House of Commons in 1953, Prime Minister St. Laurent declared that Canada had sorely neglected its responsibilities in the Arctic during the preceding eighty years, the government languishing in a protracted "absence of mind" in administering the affairs of its far-northern residents. Its neglect was ostensibly intentional, the work of nation-building south of sixty all-absorbing, the expense of a presence north of it seemingly unwarranted. This inattention was a mixed blessing for the Inuit. It did permit their escape from the draconian legal regime that had reduced Indian First Nations to dependent wards. It also left them at some liberty to pursue relations with a quarrelsome triumvirate of missionaries, police, and traders who more or less acted as the state's proxies. But Ottawa's hands-off approach became a recipe for disaster starting in the 1930s as a collapsing fur trade exacted an ever-greater human toll. By the time government

shifted course in the next two decades much of the north was in full-blown crisis, wildlife in many regions depleted, traditional livelihoods undermined, disease rampant. The book under review tells what happened next.

Rather than offering up a comprehensive history of federal northern administration following World War II, *Tammarniit* actually focuses on four cases of relocation in order to examine the motivations and instrumentalities of modernity, change, and control in the eastern Arctic. To this end, Professors Tester and Kulchyski combed through a great wealth of archival material, much of it only recently come to light, and interviewed a *dramatis personae* of career bureaucrats and experienced Arctic hands - the latter a hodgepodge of Hudson's Bay Company veterans, Mounties, and Northern Service and welfare officers - who played leading roles in forming and implementing Canada's new approach to the region. The result is a detailed, vivid portrait of how the government defined the nature and causes of the problems Inuit faced, and more importantly, charted a path to their resolution that managed to ignore Native realities while faithfully serving state priorities: shoring up sovereignty in the high Arctic and universalizing very liberal social welfare programmes and reforms. Through the apparatus of what Robert Paine (1977) once dubbed "welfare colonialism," that path ultimately led the Inuit away from the autonomy inherent in their traditional modes of existence and inexorably toward *Qallunat* (non-Inuit) forms of organization and values, the organization and values of the state. In effect, the book is about what the authors have chosen to call "totalization" but what many readers know more familiarly as assimilation.

Organized into eight chapters, *Tammarniit* begins with a highly instructive background discussion of *Re:Eskimos*, the 1939 Supreme Court decision that finally persuaded a reluctant federal government to assume responsibility for the Inuit once and for all. This is followed by a lengthy examination of key policies and policy objectives of the immediate post-war period, namely health and economic welfare initiatives aimed at stemming the deepening crisis fuelled by a failing fur trade, the move to settled communities, epidemic tuberculosis, and the North's rapid militarization in the Cold War era. The next five chapters take up the specific uses of resettlement as a strategy that administrators believed would encourage Inuit self-sufficiency, but that in fact often yielded opposite results. Of these chapters three and four delve into the highly controversial decision to recruit Inukjuak (Port Harrison) and Pond Inlet Inuit to recolonize the high Arctic at Cornwallis and Ellesmere islands in 1953. The justifications and consequences of this plan have recently been studied by the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1994) with a view to settling the relocatees' claims for compensation. This is followed, in turn, by an examination of famines

among Caribou Inuit relocated to the central Keewatin areas of Henik and Garry Lakes in the winter of 1957-58, the former episode having gained a certain notoriety through Mowat's highly publicized account (1959), and by the subsequent move of these same inlanders to Whale Cove, on the Hudson Bay coast. The book's concluding chapter traces further developments in federal policies into the early 1960s, including early experimentation with involving Inuit themselves in defining problems and constructing solutions, a process long anathema in most quarters of the Native affairs establishment in Ottawa.

*Tammarniit* may well be read as a history of Canada's postwar administration of Inuit affairs. Yet its principal value is in laying bare the inner workings of how state policy was shaped and applied, top down, at the time. Tester and Kulchyski's judicious use of primary documentation puts us face to face with the small group of *Qallunat* officials whose job it was to deal with the crisis then engulfing Inuit society, but to do so without repeating the past mistakes (ie. fostering dependency) of their counterparts in Indian Affairs and, more critically, without compromising the interests of the state. Whatever else it accomplishes, the book offers a clear analysis of the incompatibility of these objectives, and in so doing offers solid justification for current Inuit claims to self-determination.

Barnett Richling  
Department of Sociology and Anthropology  
Mount Saint Vincent University  
Halifax, Nova Scotia  
Canada, B3M2J6

### References

Mowat, Farley

1959 *The Desperate People* Boston: Little, Brown.

Paine, Robert

1977 The Path to Welfare Colonialism, pp. 7-28, in Robert Paine (Editor): *The White Arctic: Anthropological Essays on Tutelage and Ethnicity*. St. John's, Newfoundland: Institute of Social and Economic Research, Memorial University.

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples

1994 *The High Arctic Relocation: A Report on the 1953-55 Relocation*. Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada.

Weekes, Mary: *The Last Buffalo Hunter: As Told by Norbert Welsh*. Saskatoon: Fifth House Publishers, 1994, 192 pp., introduction. ISBN: 1-895618-38-X, Paper CDN \$12.95.

Norbert Welsh was born in 1845 in a log house on the Assiniboine River, three miles from St. Boniface. The son of a Hudson's Bay Company trader and a part-Indian mother, he joined his first trading party and buffalo hunting expedition in 1862. In time, as the buffalo were exterminated, he turned his hand to farming, ranching, and freighting. In 1878 he built a substantial house in Lebret, Saskatchewan (hauling the lumber for the floor by wagon from Fort Garry) where he was still living in August, 1931 when Mary Weekes, a Regina writer, paid him a visit. Now eighty-six years old and blind, Welsh enthralled the visitor with his tales of the old North West, while he, for his part, enjoyed the sound of her voice and opened up to her the story of his life.

The result was *The Last Buffalo Hunter*, first published in 1939 by Thomas Nelson and Sons and now reprinted by Fifth House Publishers with an informative introduction by Bill Waiser. The value of the book lies in the authenticity of the voice of Norbert Welsh. Weekes made a conscious effort to intrude as little as possible her own ideas and sensibility into the text. The narrative is presented in simple, direct language with Welsh speaking in the first person. Only occasionally do the expressions sound not quite right. For example, I doubt that Welsh said upon seeing his future wife for the first time, "By Jove, that's what I'm looking for! You'll be my wife."

The overall structure of the book is chronological, tracing Welsh's career in the context of the developing West, but there are many digressions. At times, Welsh interrupts the flow of his narrative to give technical information: how to set up a tipi, how to prepare pemmican, and the technique for skinning a buffalo and carving up the carcass. He describes his encounters with such prominent figures as Chief Poundmaker, Chief Starblanket, Major James Walsh, Gabdel Dumont, and Louis Riel. The latter two did not impress him. Welsh had received and sold his scrip and was hard at work making a living. For him, the rebellion was a waste of time.

Because the book is based upon an old man's reminiscences, the text is rambling and discursive. A typical chapter begins with a description of a trading trip where buffalo robes and the furs of fox, wolf, beaver, otter, badger and skunk were exchanged for tea, sugar, tobacco, cloth, blankets, powder, bullets, copper kettles, vermilion, and alcohol. Welsh had a remarkable memory for the prices paid for all these goods. The chapter moves on to a discussion of trading in Poundmaker's camp, a description of Poundmaker's tipi and a detailed account of how it was erected. This

leads to the story of a Cree named *Ka-min-akose*, who was credited with single-handedly killing seven Blackfoot Indians. The chapter concludes with another trading expedition, this time to Round Plains, now Dundurn, Saskatchewan. Welsh had trouble on this trip when the Indians demanded alcohol, even though they had no more buffalo robes to sell. A struggle ensued during which Welsh was cut with a knife on his chest and shoulder, but somehow managed to survive.

The picture of Norbert Welsh that emerges is that of a man of considerable physical strength and a strong, positive character, not given to self-pity. He is clearly pleased with his achievements. Many stories have to do with his accomplishing a physical feat that others thought impossible - crossing a river filled with pieces of ice, shooting buffalo despite having one arm disabled - thereby winning the admiration of onlookers. His descriptions of these adventures can be startlingly vivid, for example, a buffalo hunt in a blinding blizzard:

It was about forty below zero, but we kept on. I shot ten buffalo. Then we had to skin the buffalo in the blizzard. We were on the open plain, and had no shelter, but we were not cold. We were no weaklings, we men of the old brigades! I had a man helping me. The first cow we skinned, we cut her open, and to pieces. Then I cut a hole in the tripe. The manure was hot, and whenever our hands got cold, we would run and put them in the manure, and they would get as warm as fire.

The reader is bound to suspect that the positive, optimistic tone of the book does not capture the whole truth of Norbert Welsh's life. There must have been moments of tragedy and deep disappointment. In a letter to her publisher in 1939, Weekes recalled that at times Welsh was so saddened by his memories that he had to stop the interview:

No one, not even his own people, he confided in me, understood all he had gone through. I think the sad days, the days when his children and those of other buffalo hunters died without medical help on the plains, was [*sic*] in his mind when he spoke like this.<sup>1</sup>

The Last Buffalo Hunter makes no reference to these sad events. Welsh's children are not even mentioned, except for a brief account of the birth of his first child. Welsh told Weekes that he wanted to tell his story "so that when I am gone it will be there for my children and grandchildren to read." Perhaps he did not want to burden his descendants with the unhappiness he had experienced.

A final point needs to be made. This book should be The Last Buffalo

Hunter by Norbert Welsh as told to Mary Weekes, instead of by Mary Weekes as told to her by Norbert Welsh. Although Weekes did a great deal of work gathering "the loose threads of the old hunters memory into a cohesive pattern," the words are his and the idea is his. He is the author.

James M. Pitsula  
Department of History  
University of Regina  
Regina, Saskatchewan  
Canada, S4S 0A2

#### **Notes**

1. Saskatchewan Archives Board, Mary Weekes Papers, R-100 V 14, Mary Weekes to Jessie McEwen, 21 August 1939.