

BOOK REVIEWS

Churchill, Ward: *Indians Are Us: Culture and Genocide in Native North America*. Toronto: Between the Lines, 1994, 350 pp. ISBN: 0-921284-82-9, Cloth CDN \$34.95; 0-921284-83-7, Paper CDN \$17.95.

This volume is a composite of fifteen essays and documents. Only three of the essays have not appeared before. The specific meaning of the title (and cover illustration) is not clear until page 207. At that point Ward Churchill, Associate Director of the Center for Studies of Ethnicity and Race in America and Associate Professor of American Indian Studies and Communications at the University of Colorado/Boulder, begins his "reflections on the `Men's Movement.'" Initiated in about 1990 by White poet Robert Bly, the "movement" is a misguided reaction to the "Dagwood" stereotype and the rise of feminism. Bly and his companions, partly through the imitation of Native American ritual, are "trying to get in touch with something primal," and "redeeming their warrior souls." Despite their laughable approach, including nude romps in the mountains of Colorado, Churchill is convinced that the group constitutes a real threat to Indian culture. Margo Thunderbird adds, "They want our pride, our history, our spiritual traditions." Russell Means warns of the "ultimate degradation of our people." It is quite true that it has taken more than mockery to defuse the Ku Klux Klan. Pointed legal action has proven more effective.

In this title essay Churchill discusses similar antics by "Indian hobbyists" in Germany who "absolutely *hate* the idea of being European, especially Germans." These intense groups have been aided by what Churchill considers fake "Indian spiritual teachers." His advice, offered to these groups in person last year, is that they reclaim their "own indigenous past" rather than indulging in escapist activity that has no continuity with their own culture and form a "resistance" based on their own "native traditions."

The two reprinted documents that follow are formal responses to the exploitation. One, issued in the Spring of 1993, is an "Alert Concerning the Abuse and Exploitation of American Indian Sacred Traditions," issued by SPIRIT (Support and Protection of Indian Religion and Indigenous Traditions), a nonprofit organization of American Indian people, with headquarters in San Francisco. The other is a Declaration of War Against Exploiters of Lakota Spirituality ("ratified by the Dakota, Lakota, and Nakota Nations, June 1993") in which "decisive and bold" action is urged. Among the presumed targets is Ed McGaa—an "Oglala Lakota attorney"—whose

1990 volume *Mother Earth Spirituality: Native Paths to Healing Ourselves* is described as a “culturally genocidal travesty.”

Other targets chosen by Churchill in this collection are names of sports teams and mascots, selected films, and recent books based on concepts in Native American culture. On the matter of sports activity the delusionary arguments about “honoring” Native Americans and boosting “morale” are attacked. He also suggests that there would be great outrage if the nomenclature of prejudice (“Niggers,” “Gooks,” “Honkies,” etc.) “honoring” other groups were attached to sports teams.

The author also presents a *prima facie* case for “plagiarism” in his analysis of Weatherford's 1988 book *Indian Givers*. Although the book has become the “ideal tool for debunking Eurocentrist mythologies in the classroom” the concept and basic information were actually presented in 1986 by the late Warren Lowes in *Indian Giver: A Legacy of North American Native Peoples* produced by the Canadian Alliance in Solidarity with Native Peoples. Weatherford does not even refer to the Lowes book until the less directly related volume that he wrote three years later, *Native Roots: How the Indians Enriched America* (1991).

Churchill's review (“an American Indian analysis”) of the film “Black Robe” (1991) is more detailed. It praises the beauty and technical strengths of the film while demonstrating the questionable aspects of representation of language and culture. The film displays a less than subtle pro-Christian conversion bias. The Mohawks are vilified for their rejection of the new faith while the Hurons are canonized for their acceptance.

An equally pungent analysis of Mander's popular 1991 volume, *In the Absence of the Sacred: The Failure of Technology and the Survival of Indian Nations*, is offered. Mander's original concept was to continue the historical record and update Dee Brown's *Bury My Heart At Wounded Knee* (1970) in one volume and to do an evaluation of technological change and Indian culture in another. (Recent television documentary projects have perpetuated the view that the Native American's quest for identity and independence ended in 1890 with Wounded Knee.) Churchill sees the book as an example of “cultural appropriation” (without acknowledging or sufficiently utilizing Indian sources), if “a journalistic litany” that in “many respects...embodies the worst of what it intends to oppose.” The final product is a “`covert' extension of Western intellectual dominance.”

Legal issues relating to “culture and genocide” are confronted in the introductory essay—“Bringing the Law Home.” The context was the arrest of Churchill and others in Denver on October 12, 1991 for stopping a Columbus Day parade. This “brief” is a justification of that disruption based on principles of international law. The fundamental argument is from the United Nations 1948 Convention on Punishment and Prevention of the

Crime of Genocide. Churchill shares the 1944 concept of “genocide” which is “a process considerably more multifaceted and sophisticated than simple mass murder.” By 1947 it was defined by the United Nations Economic and Social Council as the “systematic moral debasement of a group, people, or nation. The United States did not ratify the Genocide Convention *until 1986*, apparently because it might be held in violation itself for “Jim Crow” laws, the promotion of sterilization of Indians, the “massive forced transfer of children” to boarding schools etc.

Churchill argues that the arrival of Columbus was the beginning of the “process of genocide” that was to take many forms—outright slaughter, biological warfare, political mythology, and the expropriation of land and resources. By 1903 the Supreme Court had given sanction to further threats with the “plenary power.” Frank Pommersheim of the University of South Dakota School of Law has recently (4/22/94) referred to this power as “the most dangerous, pernicious element in Indian law,” with a “potential for destroying tribal authority.”

The jury was persuaded by the argument of the defendants, that the parade was “an illegal assembly” under directives of international law, and an acquittal was granted on June 26, 1992. Less than four months later the Quincentenary parade was actually cancelled at the last minute to prevent another such confrontation (see *The Denver Post*, 10/11/92).

In a separate article on the Nuremberg punishment of antisemitic publisher and editor Julius Streicher the applicability of international law is again expressed. An addition is the moral voice of U.S. Secretary of War Henry L. Stimson in *Foreign Affairs* (January, 1947): “A standard has been raised to which Americans, at least, must repair; for it is only as this standard is accepted, supported, and enforced that we can move onward to a world of law and peace.” Churchill demands change because the “dime novel legacy” (including movies, advertising, and sports promotion) has provided a rationale for continuing “eradication” of Native Americans.

Two essays in the volume deal specifically with the interpretation of events surrounding the Wounded Knee occupation of 1973. As “Co-director of the American Indian Movement of Colorado” the author presents a view of “the government propaganda war against the AIM” and particularly denounces the late Stan D. Lyman's *Wounded Knee, 1973: A Personal Account* (1991). Lyman was Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) Superintendent of the Pine Ridge Reservation at the time of the confrontation. Churchill contrasts his own (sometimes undocumented) restatement of the 1973 events by categorically dismissing Lyman's views: “The memoirs of government functionaries are notoriously fraught with half-truths and distortion, outright fabrication and self-/serving rationalization.” Certainly part of the violent circumstances have yet to be unravelled. With the assistance of Jim

Vander Wall, Churchill lists the names of over sixty AIM supporters who were killed between 1973 and 1976.

The concluding essay, "Naming Our Destiny," is perhaps the most important contribution. He discusses the legal and linguistic distinctions between viewing Native Americans as "peoples" or "nations" versus "tribes." The "nation" concept was clearly attached to early treaties and in 1828 Attorney General William Wirt stated that, "Like all other independent nations, they are governed solely by their own laws." But before the end of the 19th century "expansion" was "sanctioned by international law" and there was a "shift from physical to cultural genocide." Gradually the "tribe" terminology became more prevalent, implying a *temporary* status and providing the potential for the "wholesale and systematic expropriation of American Indian assets," and even "termination." Churchill calls for a revitalization and an insistence on the right of self-determination. "In effect, by naming ourselves, we name our destiny."

Critics have accused Ward Churchill of going a little too far in self-definition. This volume reveals little (see pages 283-285) about his biographical record. He dismisses the blood-quantum formula, initiated in 1887, as conspiracy of "statistical extermination" and denounces those who demand proof of specific ethnic background as "self-appointed identity police." The issue of his background was the focus of one of a series of articles in *Indian Country Today* late last year. "He has never claimed to be enrolled...His self-identification as a Creek/Cherokee and Métis is meant to acknowledge mixed lineage (the term Métis signifies a Canadian Indian with French blood)." (10/6/93) The series, "Indian Writers: Real or Imagined," started on September 8. Churchill replied to the 10/6 article on 12/1. Other related articles and letters continued until 12/22.

A related skirmish is occurring within the ranks of AIM. In November of 1993 Churchill was expelled "by unanimous vote of AIM's National Board of Directors" from the organization and all of its sixteen chapters (*Indian Country Today*, 4/13/94). Churchill also serves as a spokesman for the Leonard Peltier Defense Committee. On January 30, 1994 Peltier issued a statement supporting Churchill and indicating that Peltier was "seriously considering a resignation" from AIM. According to *Indian Country Today* Churchill, Russell Means and others held a special "tribunal" in March which resulted in a 26-page indictment against prominent AIM activists Clyde and Vernon Bellecourt, for undermining the organization and "complicity in genocide and high treason." A national meeting of AIM is scheduled for September in Minneapolis.

The 10/6/93 *Indian Country Today* article also reveals that Churchill refuses to distribute his resumé as a matter of principle. Therefore, readers must seek his identity by exclusion, eliminating the parade of spleeny

caricatures that he reserves for others: "hang-around-the-forts, sell-outs, and `nickel' Indians," "white boys," "formula radicals and sell-outs," "non-Indian `wannabes,' hucksters, cultists, commercial profiteers, self styled `New Age' Shamans and their followers," "pseudo-Indian charlatans," "plastic Indians," "European/Euroamerican scholars," "non-Indian academics" and "newly-enlightened hippies." He is one of the creatures that remain unspecified. He also dismisses the "fantasies of gay rights activists." (The acknowledgments on page 7 list eleven individuals he has determined should be excluded from his camp. Only two of these outcasts are mentioned elsewhere in the volume.)

Whatever the specifics of Churchill's background, he does show a certain contamination by the "Euroamerican" educational system. He has an obsessive affection for lengthy end notes (109 pages for the 200 pages of corresponding text). Most frequently entire volumes or documents are cited and there is a great deal of commentary which suggests a "downloading" of the brain process. If the print used for the end note was significantly smaller one could make an argument for saving a few trees, but that is not the case. In fact, the notes include information, such as the evidence that Dick Wilson was negotiating to transfer part of the Pine Ridge Reservation back to the Federal Government, which would be more appropriate in the text. The series of articles also repeat some content and documentation. (Nagle points to similar redundancy in her 1993 review of Churchill's *Fantasies of the Master Race*.)

Although Churchill adds some substance to the shallow anti-Columbus slogans, it should be noted that a broader study of the quincentenary experience can have merit as well. A simplistic anti-intellectual dismissal does not promote real understanding. Among sources worth reviewing in this context are: Bushman (1992); Lunenfeld (1991) and Viola and Margolis (1991). Even the protestation of misguided celebratory activity is not a new "discovery." Several clear statements of reaction were issued by Native Americans at the scene of the 1893 World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago. In an era when theatrics and ideology are indistinguishable, loudness should not be confused with profundity. It is hoped that in the future Mr. Churchill will put a halt to the juvenile name-calling that only serves to alienate, and elect to use his considerable talents to promote policies of cooperation and write the serious analysis that can be the basis for significant legal change. The strategy and wisdom of international intervention in domestic issues is one that requires careful consideration and planning (see Torres, 1991). Churchill admits there are potential areas of agreement rather than dispute: "Clearly, opposition to the misuse and appropriation of spiritual traditions is a transcendently unifying factor in Indian Country" (p.255).

There are many forms of “activism.” Sometimes old “radicals” just get tired. Others become Wall Street brokers, are “born again,” or end up selling barbecue sauce. Mr. Churchill’s advice to others might be the basis for introspection: “Everything is multidimensional, possessed of positive as well as negative polarities.” Sociologist Stephen Cornell concludes his 1988 analysis of American Indian political resurgence with this reflection: “People act within the limits of particular situations, but in so doing they may transform both themselves and the conditions under which they act. The next stage of Indian-White relations remains unknown, but it seems certain that, in some substantial measure, once again it will be Indian-made.”

Keith A. Winsell
 Sinte Gleska University
 Rosebud Sioux Reservation
 Box 107
 Mission, South Dakota
 U.S.A. 57555

References

Brown, Dee

1970 *Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee: An Indian History of the American West*. New York: Henry Holt.

Bushman, Claudia L.

1992 *America Discovers Columbus: How an Italian Explorer Became an American Hero*. Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England.

Cornell, Stephen E.

1988 *The Return of the Native: American Indian Political Resurgence*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Lowes, Warren

1986 *Indian Giver: A Legacy of North American Native Peoples*. Pentiction, British Columbia: Theytus Books.

Lunenfeld, Martin

1991 *1492: Discovery, Invasion, Encounter: Sources and Interpretations*. Lexington, Massachusetts: D.C. Health.

Mander, Jerry

1991 *In the Absence of the Sacred: The Failure of Technology and the Survival of the Indian Nations*. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books.

McGaa, Ed

1990 *Mother Earth Spirituality*. San Francisco: Harper and Row.

Nagle, Joane

1993 Review of *Fantasies of the Master Race*. *American Indian Quarterly* 17 (Spring).

Torres, Raidza

1991 The Rights of Indigenous Populations: The Emerging International Norm. *Yale Law Journal of International Law* 16.

Viola, Herman J. and Carol Margolis (Editors)

1991 *Seeds of Change: A Quincentennial Commemoration*. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Weatherford, J. Mclver

1988 *Indian Givers: How the Indians of the Americas Transformed the World*. New York: Crown Publishers.

Emberley, Julia: *Thresholds of Difference: Feminist Critique, Native Women's Writings, Postcolonial Theory*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993, xx + 202 pp. ISBN 0-8020-7729-3, Paper \$18.95. ISBN 0-8020-2850-0, Cloth \$50.00.

In her dissertation now published by the University of Toronto Press, Emberley discusses and combines three areas of cultural studies that are related because of their fundamentally critical attitude toward basically male-dominated, inherently colonial and discriminatory academic theories: Anglo-American feminist theory, postcolonial theory, and Canadian Native women's literature. The author critically reviews the work of various theorists, such as de Lauretis, el Saadawi, Said, Mohanty, and Spivak, all engaged in feminist and/or postcolonial academic critique.

In Parts 2 and 3 Emberley discusses both literature written by First Nations, Métis and Inuit women and literature about them. Here her leading argument comes clear: postcolonial critique should incorporate issues of gender since women are still invisible and "othered," and feminist critique should become decolonized for non-Western women to be taken seriously. Her message is that of the "feminism of decolonization and decolonization of feminism, elaborated through a deconstructive materialist feminist critique of gender relations in the discourses of decolonization" (pp.xvii).

No matter how valid her argument I have several critical comments.

Considering the instrumental significance of Native women's writings for Emberley's main argument, it is striking that literature written by Native women constitutes a relatively small portion of her book. Furthermore, although Emberley suggests she has taken an approach novel to the world of academia, I would argue that anthropologists in particular have paved the way for her. Her plea for a decolonization of feminism and a feminism of decolonization is tightly embedded within the discourse of deconstructionism and self-reflection. Last, but certainly not least, Emberley's book is not an easy read. Although she takes a multi-disciplinary approach, her style of writing is clearly deconstructionist which makes it sometimes difficult to fully comprehend. Nevertheless, even if I do not consider Emberley's book to be very delightful, much credit should be given to her thesis which is well worth following.

Lilianne E. Krosenbrink-Gelissen
 Centre for Women's Studies
 Nijmegen University
 P.O. Box 9108
 6500 HK Nijmegen
 The Netherlands

Engelstad, Diane and John Bird (Editors): *Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada*. Concord, Ontario: Anansi Press, 1992.

A recent flood of newspaper articles, editorials, media reports, political statements and observations by self-acknowledged authorities have set nagging doubts in the minds of many Canadians as to the merits of Native self-government. If those publishing the articles had read this book prior to writing they might have saved themselves some embarrassment; if those who encountered the articles had read it prior to reading them they would have been much better informed.

In their introductory comments, the editors explain their personal interest and involvement in the issues at hand. Engelstad was a member of Citizens for Public Justice, a group supported by Dutch Protestant Christians, at a time when the Berger Report on the Mackenzie Pipeline (1977) presented an issue with which the group became heavily involved. Bird's many years of journalistic support for Native issues reached a high point in the summer of 1990 when Canada changed forever after Elijah Harper's rejection of the Meech Lake Accord and the Oka blockades.

As a result we have available to us a collection of 30 essays written by

14 Native authors (trappers, writers, politicians, clergy, elders, artists, elected Chiefs, traditional leaders) and 14 non-Native authors (educators, professors, journalists, lawyers, clergy, activists) who have been involved directly as Native leaders or indirectly as non-Native individuals who share a common vision for a better Canada.

The varied nature of topics involved will only be touched on in this report. In his essay on Aboriginal rights, Georges Erasmus indicates that "Canadian people must continue to push their governments to sit down with the First Nations and negotiate a just solution" as the Native people by themselves have been able to make this happen (p.11). Stan McKay, now moderator of the United Church of Canada, writes that Aboriginal Christians, since the church has been part of the oppression of Native people, face a special challenge in the issue of Native sovereignty, to "redefine what it is to be the church...and to be reunited with the spiritual strength of the aboriginal culture" (p.34). Dene elder Joanne Barnaby explains how the traditional view of her people with regard to government and resources is markedly different from that of the dominant non-Native society. The Assembly of First Nations is seen as the sole voice of First Nations people when negotiations are conducted with the federal government in areas of self-government; but a Cree Métis elder, Bernice Hammersmith, explains that the present AFN's failure to "represent the perspective of women, or youth, or elders or disabled people," could be corrected if traditional women's organizations were developed within each First Nation, thereby "holding aboriginal governments true to their purpose" (p.58). Articles written about the process of specific land claims, comprehensive land claims, and court procedures show that the convoluted system put in place by Canadian parliamentary and legal bodies frequently complicates rather than clarifies the issues being addressed. One article about residential schools provides the reader with an interesting analogy; how would an "English" Canadian feel if suddenly removed to Japan at a young age, where the customs, religion, clothing, and food were different, where the English language was unknown and not allowed, and where contact with home and family was minimal (p.104)? In a speech by Innu leader Peter Penashue to a federal government official concerning the NATO low-level flights in his area, he talks passionately of the need for honesty and justice; that while Ottawa has all the money to solve Innu land and housing problems, "money does not produce justice," and justice will only occur when Ottawa talks with Nitassinan as "adult to adult, nation to nation" (p.132). Money created more problems than solutions in the Swampy Cree community of Cedar Lake, Manitoba, when it was moved 25 years earlier as a result of Manitoba Hydro's electric project. An elder writes that the twenty-fifth anniversary of the move of the community for her is "a time of

mourning for what (her) people lost; their spirit, their dignity, their serene land, the birthright and future of (their) children”—all for \$104 per person (p.164). Articles are also included that indicate what some Native communities are doing when allowed to develop their own renewable resource management and economic independence.

With such a kaleidoscope of information the editors faced a formidable task in arranging these articles. They placed them in three somewhat arbitrary groupings; in Part 1 authors describe what has happened to date to promote sovereignty, including spiritual, economic, cultural and political aspects. Part 2 gives examples of how Aboriginal people have been working out sovereignty and self-determination in their own communities. Part 3 focuses on non-Native support for Aboriginal rights. In all three parts articles are written by Native and non-Native persons.

In the summer of 1990 I attended a meeting in southern Ontario at which 2 Grand-Chiefs, 3 elected Chiefs and a traditional spokesman addressed a number of Anglican bishops and clergy ministering on Reserves. The meeting was requested by the Anglicans to seek Native input and advice as to how the church might best respond to the issues at Oka in particular and Native sovereignty in general. During two hours of meetings the Native leaders spoke of their regional concerns, of political mistrust, of the need to act in solidarity, and of the fact that each Native community is a separate and unique entity. The Anglicans had received no clear answers as to “what they could do.” But more importantly they were thanked for requesting the meeting and for listening.

Those who read this book will finish it feeling much the same as did those Anglican clerics. The issues are many and varied; the solutions are not yet clear. The closing chapter of the book is perhaps my favourite because it is an opening chapter to a new era and provides signposts that in a delightfully vague manner direct us along a new route in Native non-Native relations in Canada. To summarize, we as the dominant non-Native society must: first, recognize and appreciate Aboriginal people's suffering over the past centuries, resulting in their sense of alienation from their own past culture, values, and independence; second, accept the reality and integrity of the Native people's vision for life as a distinct and modern version of what they once were; third, be willing to ask questions and accept the answers so that Native and non-Native will relate to each other with respect and sensitivity; fourth, recognize Native people have something to teach us, especially concerning land stewardship, renewable resources and creating an environmentally-sustainable Canada; finally, listen to and follow the suggestions of Native people as they begin to assume greater responsibility for their own life and in so doing challenge us to question some of our own assumptions.

Father David J. Norton
Box 52
Belmont, Ontario
Canada, N0L 1B0

References

Berger, Thomas R.

1977 *Northern Frontier, Northern Homeland: Report of the Mackenzie Valley Pipeline Inquiry, Volume I*. Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada.

Ipellie, Alooook: *Arctic Dreams and Nightmares*. Penticton, British Columbia: Theytus Books Limited, 1993, xx + 184 pp. Paper, ISBN:0-919441-47-5.

Arctic Dreams and Nightmares is comprised of twenty stories with accompanying ink drawings which collectively reflect the dichotomy of being a Canadian Inuit in the last decade of the 20th century. In his introduction to the collection, Alooook Ipellie states that he writes “essentially about the arctic and its people, the Inuit—the semi-nomads who were made to settle down, for better or for worse” (p.xiii). The Inuit his work reflects are a people “caught in an unpredictable cultural transition (p.xiii).

For Ipellie, it is important to retain “the old myths, stories, and legends so that [the] present generation can absorb them and pass them to future generations” (p.xiv). Yet mere retention of the old stories does not reflect the contemporary Inuit experience. Indeed, contemporary Inuit writer-artists must “adapt their imagination and their story-telling tradition to suit today's artistic demands” (p.xv). Herein lies the duality of the contemporary Inuit creative experience.

Ipellie's fictional world reflects well both his knowledge of tradition and his sensitivity to how that tradition has been affected by southern culture and values. The world depicted in the art and words of Ipellie is one in which an Inuit shaman faces very human problems of hunger, anger, jealousy, and sexual frustration. Yet the shaman of Ipellie is not a wise and staid liaison between the other world of the spirits and the physical world of arctic survival. Indeed, he is one who practices the shamanic trade” (p.23) in an often irreverent and “street-smart” manner.

The context through which the stories are related is often the non-Inuit world of gorgons and Shakespeare (“The Five Shy Wives of the Shaman”),

Cupid, Wimbledon, with reference to superman (“Super Stud”) and a world peopled by Rudolf Nureyev, Dame Margot Fonteyn (“Walrus Ballet Stories”) and Brigitte Bardot on her mission of protecting harp seals (“After Brigitte Bardot”). Just as the dichotomy of contemporary Inuit life includes contrasting old and new, positive dreams and negative nightmares, so, too, does the fictional world of Ipellie contain these contrasting elements in a variety of forms.

Like a shaman, Ipellie's fiction connects two worlds. In this collection he brings together what in fact has occurred in Canada's north, a merging of the spiritual world of Inuit tradition with the banal world of contemporary Western society. Allusions to a world that smells like underarm deodorant (“When God Sings the Blues”), has exotic dancers (“Hunting for Skins and Fur”), and is home to Big Ben and the Leningrad Ballet School (“Walrus Ballet Stories”) are imaginatively integrated with the traditional Inuit journey “travelling through time and space” (p.155) made by the shaman seeking to communicate with the spirit world. Although there is a tradition of physical challenge among Inuit men, the Arctic Wrestling Federation in “Love Triangle” appears more like the ersatz world of WWF television wrestling than any Indigenous sport of the arctic. The dream which appears in the title story has the narrator shrink until he is like an insect in a world of the giants. Here, as in so many stories in the collection, Ipellie alludes to something from the world of modern southern culture and entertainment by referring to the narrator as “the incredible shrinking man” (p.129)—identical to the title of and situation depicted in a 1950s motion picture.

Yet this collection embodies more than the grafting of “pop” cultural allusions onto traditional Inuit stories. The stories provoke thought about the two worlds inhabited by the contemporary Inuit of Canada's north. Ipellie accomplishes this without being didactic in tone.

Perhaps the best example of the duality of Inuit life is “Summit With Sedna.” The legend of the Woman Below or Goddess of the Sea is one which exists in various versions throughout the arctic from the Aleutians in the west to Greenland in the east. In the most popular version, Sedna is a sea goddess who has control of the creatures of the sea. When displeased, she withholds the sea creatures causing Inuit on the land to starve. It is often the duty of the shaman to go beneath the sea and meet with Sedna, perhaps combing her hair, perhaps pleading with her, but always using his skills to placate her so that she will then be predisposed to release the sea creatures. The Inuit can then have a bountiful hunt.

Ipellie adapts this traditional story by having his shaman depicted as a fast-talking, slick salesperson. Sedna is presented as a sexually frustrated woman who was the victim of child abuse. The author skilfully keeps alive the structure of the story and the principal characters of tradition yet adapts

them to include psycho-sexual language and the issue of child abuse. Thus Ipellie the late 20th century author keeps alive his Inuit tradition by re-shaping it to communicate effectively with a contemporary audience.

The drawings, like the text, are at times disturbing. Yet they are always effective in relating the imaginative ideas of Ipellie. Theytus Books has done an excellent job of reproducing the ink drawings of Ipellie. Each story has a full page drawing adjacent to the first page of text. Smaller versions of the title page drawings appear on alternate subsequent pages of text in the margin with the remaining pages having the title printed in the margin. Lettering is clear and paper quality excellent making this a worthy medium for Ipellie's stories and drawings. Ipellie has had poetry, fiction, and art work published in a variety of publications including anthologies such as Moses and Goldie's *An Anthology of Canadian Native Literature in English* and Robin Gedlof's *Paper Stays Put*. Yet this collection allows him to showcase his work. *Arctic Dreams and Nightmares* has words and images which will delight, disturb, and edify. It is a collection which reflects well a part of the reality of Inuit artistic experience in the 1990s. It is an intriguing volume for those who desire to take an imaginative journey through the dichotomy which is the contemporary world of Alootook Ipellie.

Michael P.J. Kennedy
Department of English
University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
Canada, S7N 0W0

Maud, Ralph: *The Porcupine Hunter and Other Stories: The Original Tsimshian Texts of Henry Tate*. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 1993, ISBN 0-88922-333-5.

Students of the Northwest Coast and those interested in Native tradition will find Ralph Maud's latest offering very appealing. This volume contains a selection of the written compositions of one of Franz Boas's primary Tsimshian informants—Henry W. Tate—who drafted these texts first in English and later offered interlinear translations. Maud selects a total of twenty-five texts including twelve from the Raven cycle, detailing the deeds of the culture hero in his interactions with people and animals. Tate supplied over two thousand pages to Boas, who utilized this corpus in producing his *Tsimshian Texts* (1912) and epochal *Tsimshian Mythology*

(1916). As expressions of individual creativity—by a person versed in both traditional and modern society—these works possess definite aesthetic merit. Maud performs limited copy-editing, corrects grammar and provides punctuation, concluding that “fidelity to mere scribal errors would be misplaced” (although this limited intervention suggests we are not dealing with “original” texts as glossed in the title). One need look no further than the first text—“The Porcupine Hunter”—to see the contrast between Boas’s intervention and Maud’s restraint.

The editor notes the existence of analogous texts by other author-informants which would seem to call for some cross-textual analysis, as for example in the case of “The story of the hunter’s wife change in Beaver.” According to Tate, the husband ignored his importunate wife while at camp and in her “shame” (?) she went to live by herself, becoming the first beaver mother. Maud suggests this is an account of a “modern” sexually-liberated woman who, when “rebuffed by her busy husband, `goes for it’ elsewhere.” However, the story may be about more than sexual desire or the origin of the beavers. One variation on the beaver-mother tradition (MacDonald and Cove, 1987:56) suggests that the wife’s transformation was occasioned by physical abuse by her husband, and had nothing to do with sexual behavior. Another account (*Ibid.*:58-60) establishes that a Kitamaat couple were hunting rabbit, fox and marten in Stikine Tlingit country, and were happy and sexually active. During the husband’s absence on his trapline, his wife began building a lodge and dam and became the first beaver. Upon returning to camp her husband abandoned his successful hunting to remain with her.

The editor might have discussed such analogues as more than idiosyncratic variations: tradition has socio-political contexts and uses, and these congruences and differences *may* have signified something more than artistic license. As Maud noted in his earlier work, readers need help with the “ethnographic and mythographic context” to understand the “social and thematic significance of the stories” (1982:198). The non-Tsimshian antecedents or parallels he posits for some of the texts and mythemes are intriguing from a literary point of view, but do not fully elucidate the appeal these stories had for *Tsimshian* audiences. On the other hand, sometimes a story can be appreciated on its own merits.

Maud has done well to present one slice of a rich traditional corpus to non-Native readers. This book is a welcome addition to the volumes of published Tsimshian texts, and will be read with profit by laypersons, students and specialists all. These undigested texts serve as a useful check on Boas’s leaden rewriting, and portray a candid and delightful view of Tate’s interpretation of his cultural heritage. Anyone who has examined manuscript traditions knows the pleasure working with such materials can

bring. This volume enables persons without access to the original manuscripts to share in this enjoyment.

Jonathan R. Dean
307 W. Main Street
Crawfordsville, Indiana
U.S.A., 47933

References

Boas, Franz

- 1916 *Tsimshian Mythology*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office.
1912 *Tsimshian Texts (New Series)*. Leyden: E.J. Brill for the American Ethnological Society.

MacDonald, George F. and John J. Cove (Editors)

- 1987 *Tricksters, Shamans and Heroes. Tsimshian Narratives 1*. Ottawa: Canadian Museum of Civilization.

Maud, Ralph

- 1982 *A Guide to B.C. Indian Myth and Legend*. Vancouver: Talonbooks.

Pomedli, Michael: *Ethnophilosophical and Ethnolinguistic Perspectives on the Huron Indian Soul*. Queenston, Ontario: Edwin Mellen Press, 1991, xiii + 179 pp., bibliography and index.

In this important work that enlarges our view of the world of the Huron people, Michael Pomedli makes reference to a fascinating Huron term for what we might call the soul, *Khiondhec8i*. To use it, he argues, “as roughly equivalent to the 17th century work *l’âme*, meaning principle of life, *principe de vie*, however, is to overextend its meaning” (p.44). In this short passage, Pomedli has revealed three things. He has drawn our attention to an important term that the Huron people once used to describe one aspect of one of their soul(s). Secondly, in the spelling of the word *khiondhec8i*, Pomedli has discovered some important inadequacies in the structure of the European/Western alphabet and its inability to render foreign sounds into readable text. Most importantly, however, Pomedli has reminded the academic world of its predilection to represent non-Western ideas through equivalences that have a tendency to over-determine or, in his words, “overextend” their meaning. This problem permeates the discussion of a variety of aspects of the academic pursuit of what might be called Indigenous knowledge or Native knowledge.

In this book, Pomedli has enlightened our understanding of a pivotal dimension of Native knowledge. However, he too, falls short of the mark even by referring to the entity owned by the Huron as “soul.” Throughout the book, he describes in part the Huron understanding of different souls and different parts of souls, in an attempt to understand how to move beyond the sometimes unidimensional meanings provided by European vocabulary and life experience. Aside from a few glaring errors (a missing page between pages 76 and 77 and a missing reference in the bibliography to Maben Poirier’s excellent summary of the ideas of Michael Polanyi) Pomedli’s text is readable and provocative.

Pomedli entices the reader to discover a new and interesting aspect of life among the Huron people. “In this project,” he writes, “the intent is to let the muted and sometimes silent Huron world speak out.” By engaging in a sort of “conceptual archaeology,” he will “unearth the Huron conception of the soul,” which has been silenced by the simple fact that the Huron people have left no written record of their intellectual achievements. The primary sources for this study are thus European. Accordingly, Pomedli argues that, “to begin to understand the Huron mind, and the Huron conception of the soul, then, it is important to understand the form and content in which their thoughts were formulated, that is, to understand primarily the French and European patterns of thinking and reference points” (p.xi). This statement

poses an extremely important methodological question about the appropriateness of using 16th and 17th century documents made within a complex political, social and economic framework to understand the Huron conception of the soul.

The book is written in two main parts. The first is a very brief account of the European discourse on the conception of the soul at the time of contact. It is a summary of Plato to Aquinas on the soul, a subject that requires more space and interpretation. This is done to acquaint the reader with the disposition of the trained missionary who encountered and recorded the Huron conception of the soul. The position of 16th and 17th century missionaries is understood in the following passage which describes their state of mind on the soul: "In summary, the human soul is one vital principle (form) in humans, has a higher (more noble) nature than the body, and is immortal and incorruptible. Humans as a whole consist of body and soul (and spirit). In death, the soul, separated from the body, is in an unnatural state and seeks its union with the body in resurrection" (pp.24-25).

The second part of the book is an account of the dialogue between the missionaries and the Huron and an elaboration of the myriad dimensions of Huron soul(s). It is in this section that Pomedli displays his ability to synthesize the wildly speculative, racist and demeaning accounts of Huron ideas of the soul preferred by Jesuits and Recollet missionaries.

As Pomedli explains, the Huron language is not spoken by any living people in the traditional sense, so the only appeal to authority is a non-Huron one. Nevertheless, the dialogue between the missionaries and the Huron proves to be a valuable resource for reconstructing the Huron soul(s). Pomedli displays remarkable familiarity with complex Huron meanings and words. For example, the chapter on *aata*: Self as Body reveals that the Huron regarded the body as an elemental, not separate, part of the soul. Moreover, as Pomedli argues, missionaries believed that the Hurons had more than one term for the soul because they were unsophisticated philosophically, "they were mired in the material." Pomedli argues that the missionaries (and perhaps ourselves in other ways) were mistaken in believing that a unidimensional understanding of the human soul was progressive. What it reveals instead is another way of being, one that is in some ways strikingly similar to early Greek and Roman perspectives. The existential relationship between spirit and body through the care, preparation and consumption of food is another example of the complexity of the Huron conception of soul that is reminiscent of another world view which predates the 17th century modern preoccupation with the control of nature.

The spirit of nature is transferred to the human through the feast, whereby a reversal of causality is revealed. Instead of the mind or spirit informing the body through reason, the consumption of corn and other

elements of nature informs the spirit of the individual. Thus, the feast is important as a moment of interconnectedness among the Huron people. Pomedli argues that this reversal should also remind us of the importance of the body to our own predecessors in Greece and Rome. However, his argument reveals Pomedli's own inability to step out of the dualism of the mind and the body, a dualism that continues to inform our cultural pursuits. Perhaps a complete understanding of the Huron soul is too elusive because there are no Hurons left to speak it. It is somehow equivalent to the "subsidiary awareness" of thinking described by Michael Polanyi and the "occasioning" *poesis* understood by Heidegger through Aristotle. Most important, however, is the power of dreams to unite the soul and the souls of the Huron into one. The Huron saw dreams of *oki*; soul as spirit power, soul as medicine. The missionaries saw dreams as madness, illusion, or denizens of the demonic. Dreams to the Hurons, of course, were the exact opposite of what they were for Europeans. Instead of being signals of anxiety and dysfunction, they were messages of great significance, and were linked to causality—a causality that Pomedli likens to Heidegger's understanding of Aristotle.

In his discussion of the multi-variant aspects of Huron soul(s), Pomedli would do well to remind himself of his own admonition of the missionary. "As missionaries came in contact with native cultures," he writes, "they did the most natural thing, that is, measure their new experiences against their own culture and experiences" (p.60). By measuring the new found experience of the Huron soul(s) against the wisdom of Plato, Aristotle, Heidegger and Polanyi, Professor Pomedli has opened the door to greater understanding of Indigenous knowledge that is still dependent on the eyes and ears of others for its articulation. Nevertheless, one wonders if the achievement in this book is to suggest alternative ways of understanding every aspect of Indigenous knowledge and learning, from culture to self-government, from experience and world-view to knowledge itself.

In closing, one wonders whether the following text could ever be rendered in Huron. "It does not seem appropriate to label the Huron epistemic approach as merely metaphorical and naively topographical. In their less introspective cultural context, the focus is minimally on the self and one's immanent epistemic processes; in a culture based on Greek philosophy, the immanent psychological approach predominates" (p.67).

D.A. West
 Department of Political Studies
 Lakehead University
 955 Oliver Road
 Thunder Bay, Ontario
 Canada, P7B 5E1

Sandoz, M.: *Cheyenne Autumn*. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1992.

In a forceful, unapologetic manner, *Cheyenne Autumn* offers a realistic appreciation of agony and ecstasy experienced by a small band of Northern Cheyennes during their 1,500 mile flight from incarceration in Indian Territory back to freedom in Yellowstone Country. The story reflects a period in American history when Indians stood in the way of westward migration, land development and resource exploitation. Those who protested broken Treaty promises were harshly dealt with through forced resettlement in Indian Territory, never to return to their homeland. For the Northern Cheyennes, resettlement could not be tolerated and in the autumn of 1878 the major decision was made to escape this Hell and flee back to their Yellowstone homeland, an unusual feat considering that women, children, warriors, old and sick alike must outmanoeuvre a relentless army and inhospitable White presence along the perilous route.

Through gripping narrative, the reader accompanies these Cheyennes as they escape their imprisonment under cover of darkness. We experience the numerous skirmishes with soldiers, some successful, others causing injury and loss of life for Cheyenne and White alike. Yet, government would never hear about the consistent orders from the Cheyenne leaders to not shoot first or kill anyone, but shoot only in self-defence!

Predictably, in a group besieged from without one expects discord brought on by the agony of a miserable situation. Mercifully, these outbursts are short lived because of the overriding danger of pursuing soldiers. Inevitably, ongoing disagreement between two old enemies—Little Wolf and Dull Knife—splits the Cheyennes into two small groups. While providing greater likelihood of escape and eventual return of some Cheyennes to Yellowstone, there is the harsh reality of reducing their “strength/safety in numbers”—a factor which would prove to have disastrous consequences later on.

Winter arrives, adding to the agony of outrunning the soldiers. Fleeing toward the safety of their old friend Red Cloud, the Cheyennes are devastated on learning that no help will be forthcoming because Red Cloud is also surrounded by soldiers. In the ensuing confusion, those Cheyennes following Dull Knife are captured and imprisoned. Little Wolf and his followers fare somewhat better, outwitting the soldiers and pressing on toward the Yellowstone only to have their worst fears realized when they learn of the capture of Dull Knife's group.

Vivid details of life in confinement for the Dull Knife Cheyennes are woven into this narrative, paling by comparison to the news that these people are going to be sent back south and their leaders tried for murder.

Refusal to comply with this order creates the setting for what will become their greatest ordeal. Forced to endure deprivation of food, water and heat, the Cheyennes make one last desperate try for freedom. While many die, some make good their escape only to be captured later on.

The reader can rejoice with the tiny group of Little Wolf Cheyennes who finally arrive in Yellowstone exhausted and confused from their arduous journey. Around them the battle rages on with White soldiers killed by Indians and Indians hanged in retaliation. For this particular group of Cheyennes the long journey has ended with the quietness of their homeland providing a haven for reflection and thanksgiving.

A portrait of conviction, strength and perseverance, *Cheyenne Autumn* presents a unique perspective on an embarrassing chapter in American history. We witness in a personal way the triumph of a group of fellow human beings who refuse to accept the bigotry, injustices and inhumane treatment inflicted by a White government. This book is definitely a necessary reading for those bold enough to explore the Indian struggle against the military might of a major nation.

Dr. D.L. Treslan
 Faculty of Education
 Memorial University of Newfoundland
 St. John's Newfoundland
 Canada, A1B 3X8

Sharp, Nonie: *Stars of Tagai: The Torres Strait Islanders*. Canberra: Aboriginal Studies Press, 1993.

Stars of Tagai is a fascinating account of the Indigenous peoples who inhabit the tropical islands within the azure-blue waters of the Torres Strait in Northern Australia. These islands, the traditional homeland to as many as 30,000 people, are located midway between the Australian province of Queensland and Papua New Guinea, and have become the basis for a historical court case challenging the state's authority to control the region and its original inhabitants.

Stars of Tagai gives the reader a comprehensive insight into the culture and history of the Meriam people of the Murray Islands, a subgroup of the Torres Strait Islands. By integrating conversational narratives with Islanders (a type of "historical narrative") with her own social analysis, Nonie Sharp is able to convey the Meriam culture as living and breathing within the pages of her book. It would have been useful, however, if Sharp had

given a brief one or two paragraph biography of each of the Islanders she interviewed, thus giving the reader a sense of who is speaking.

Organized around the main theme of cultural renewal and “self-awareness as a unique sea culture,” Sharp has divided *Stars of Tagai* into four separate yet interrelated parts. Part I deals with themes of contact with *Kole*, the Meriam word for both “master” and “whiteman.” As Sharp explains about Part I, “special emphasis is placed upon gift exchange or reciprocity as the key principle in the creation and re-creation of identities as diversities-in-unity” (p.xi). This element of exchange, or reciprocity, was essential to the Meriam way of living; it allowed for an exchange known as *wauri* by which friendships were made and essential goods were obtained that were not available on local islands. Sharp explains that:

Wauri exchanges created complementary unity through the shared social code of reciprocal exchange between those who possessed what the other lacked: canoes, potential marriage partners, fishing and gardening tools, ceremonial valuables, weapons and different food produce. *Wauri* was a form of exchange of the equivalences of dissimilarity: it enhanced, enriched, and gave variety to their lives... (p.28).

For example, although all Torres Strait Islanders were part of a sea-faring culture very dependent upon the seas and winds, they were vastly different in cultural terms in large part due to variations in ecosystems. Therefore, some Islanders needed to garden in order to survive and others did not; some Islanders had coconut available to them and others did not. In either case, these cultural variations created an imperative for exchange. As well, being a sea culture, the Islanders had to travel long distances to *Op Deudai* (Papau New Guinea) to obtain canoes sometimes fifty feet in length. These exchanges allowed for a network of reciprocity which tied Islanders together.

In all cases, these reciprocal exchanges occurred under a relationship of equivalency; neither party was superior to the other. This sense of equivalency was to change dramatically through contact with the newcomers; *Kole* began to establish themselves as the rulers and “destroy the foundations of Islanders’ beliefs and customs along with their visible symbols” (p.9). Indeed, as Sharp testifies, “the coming of *Kole* was a contradiction of a new kind: an enforced asymmetrical relationship” (p.34). Unfortunately—and despite the heading “Themes of Encounter”—the majority of this section is spent explaining the *wauri* exchanges which occurred among the Torres Strait Islanders and their neighbours; encounters with *Kole* receive much less discussion. Either “Themes of Encounter” was meant to imply more generally to encounters with other peoples (neigh-

bours in *Op Deudai* and mainland Australia, as well as the Whiteman), or Sharp believed that issues of contact with *Kole* would be dealt with more fully in subsequent chapters of the book and therefore required less emphasis in the first section. In either case, Sharp's intention is unclear.

Part II describes how the Meriam people order their world within the movement of cosmic cycles. Much of the ordering of the Meriam worldview is done through myth, and in particular the myth of *Malo-Bomai*. From this myth comes the sacred code of Malo's law, *Malo ra Gelar*. As Sharp explains:

In Malo ra Gelar lies the imperative of Meriam life. It provides the rule by which people conserve the land, make it bountiful and protect the rights of those who belong to each part of it... (pp.49-50).

Meriam life is highly attuned to the rhythms of nature. In fact, these rhythms of nature “—the seas, the winds, the celestial world, the land—produces the ‘seasonal calendar,’ the rhythm of Meriam life” (p.53). This, in turn, becomes the essence of the Meriam ‘timetable’ of life. In describing how the Meriam order both space and time, Sharp gives the reader a strong understanding of the way in which they pattern, or organize, their universe. What Sharp fails to do is draw the links to demonstrate how Meriam cosmology “fits in” with the political developments which she details near the end of the book.

Part III of *Stars of Tagai* deals with the forces of colonialism brought about by the *Storm Winds* (the *Storm Winds* is a metaphor used by the Meriam people to describe the invasion and the powers of destruction brought about by *Kole*). Sharp begins by discussing the effects of missionaries, in particular the London Missionary Society (LMS). While the author documents the negative effects of missionary contact with the Meriam (which occurred throughout so many other parts of the world as well), what is particularly interesting is the way in which the Meriam people were able to accommodate Christianity within their own traditional beliefs and world-views. As one Islander's narrative explained:

I do not see me infusing Malo into Christianity. I see Christianity as the fulfilment of Malo...

You see Malo and Christianity go together. See the idea of reverence I was talking about. It is there. The reverence must remain there. This is the first important thing that God demands from man: reverence. You must show it; you can't escape it. I don't see fusion, I see comparison (p.108).

In the early 1900s, Torres Strait Islanders and Australian Aborigines came under a system of “protection” and segregation which Sharp de-

scribes as “the supervision of exclusion” (p.130). She describes three distinct phases of *Kole* rule which overlap to some extent. The first phase (roughly 1879-1901) was a process of British supervision known as indirect rule, in which a *mamus* (head man) was given magisterial powers over Islanders. *Mamus* in this instance was a remarkably similar position to that of Indian Agent in Canada. The second phase (roughly 1901-mid 1980s) involved a racist policy of segregation along with a policy of paternalist rule. This phase was referred to as *paternalist exclusion*. The third phase, *controlled* integration, “combined the labour needs of post-Second World War capitalist expansion with a continuing paternalist segregation” (p.130). What is particularly interesting, at least for the reader of Native history in Canada, is the degree to which these phases of control coincide with similar phases in Canada.

The fourth and final section of *Stars of Tagai* focuses on some of the contemporary political developments of the Torres Strait Islanders in their quest for increased autonomy. While Sharp discusses five key events which formed the basis for increased demands for political autonomy, two events were of particular significance. The first of these events occurred in 1936 when the Torres Strait Islanders organized an inter-Island general strike within their pearling fleet, pearl-shells being a very lucrative commodity at this time. While the Aboriginal Department felt that the reasons for this strike centred around maladministration and Islander dissatisfaction with their wages and other financial matters, the central aim of the strike was “to be free of the strictures of Protection” (p.197). This freedom entailed a number of factors including “free choice of work, freedom to travel, freedom to spend their money as they pleased, and the right to run Island affairs and control their own Island funds” (p.204). Each of these areas was controlled and circumscribed by the Aboriginal Department under their policy of Protection.

The second key event which formed the basis for increased demands for autonomy was the Murray Island Land/Mabo case (1982-1992). This court case occurred as a result of threats to Islander lands from the Queensland Government. To counteract these threats, five Murray Islanders went to court “claiming distinct rights to traditional lands which form part of lands continuously occupied by the Meriam people from time immemorial until today” (p.231). After recounting their history and myths to successive levels of the court system over a period of ten years, on June 3, 1992, the Meriam people experienced victory: the Supreme Court of Queensland declared that “...the Meriam people are entitled as against the whole world to possession, occupation, use and enjoyment of the lands of the Murray Islands” (p.235).

The Murray Island Land/Mabo case was of extreme importance to not

only the Murray Islanders, but to Indigenous peoples of all Australia. For prior to this case, Australia was the only Commonwealth country which had neither recognized the land rights of its Aboriginal peoples, nor signed a treaty with them. As Sharp states, "The court's recognition of 'common law native title' sweeps away forever the force of past judgements which upheld the legal invention known as *terra nullius*—that is that Australia was unoccupied at the time of White settlement" (p.235).

In many ways, the first three sections of *Stars of Tagai* build up to the final section, culminating in the Meriam victory in the Murray Island Land/Mabo case. By being introduced to the history and culture of the Meriam people, the reader is able to gain a full understanding of the importance of this precedent court case. As Sharp concludes:

A radically new assumption underlies the 1992 judgement: equality before the law now means the obligation of Australian law to respect the Meriam law even though it is a form of title radically different ('unknown') to British law. As we have seen, this is known to the Meriam as *Malo ra Gelar*, Malo's Law (p.236).

Stars of Tagai is an extremely interesting book about the Meriam people of the Torres Strait Islands. Far from being a cultural reader, *Stars of Tagai* combines the rich cultural narratives of Islanders with social analysis by the author. The result is a text which reaches into the depths of the social/political/cultural aspects of the Meriam way of life. For the reader interested in comparative aspects of colonialism and its effects on Indigenous peoples, *Stars of Tagai* offers a fascinating account which is easily comparable to the situation in Canada.

Tom Weegar
Native Public Administration Program
Kitsumkalum Band
P.O. Box 544,
Terrace, British Columbia
Canada, V8G 4B5

Spicer, Edward H.: *People of Pascua*. Edited by Kathleen M. Sands and Rosamond B. Spicer, Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1988, xlvi + 331 pp. ISBN 0-8165-1069-5.

Spicer's *People of Pascua* is an almost half-century old ethnographic study of an expatriate Yaqui community inhabiting the village of Pascua,

which at the time of Spicer's research there in 1936-37 and 1940-41 was a kind of urban Yaqui ghetto just outside the city limits of Tucson, Arizona. Since then Pascua has been completely engulfed by the rapid growth of Tucson's built-up area.

Although he published many other works on the Yaqui Indians, including four book-length studies and over thirty essays, Spicer withheld *People of Pascua* from publication because the study divulges information of a rather personal nature about some of Spicer's Yaqui informants, and so it was deemed advisable that publication be postponed until those informants, most of whom were already on in years, might have been expected to have passed on. In 1988 the book was finally published, posthumously, with a foreword by Rosamond B. Spicer, the author's widow and erstwhile research assistant who also co-edited the volume. The book concludes with an epilogue written by Kathleen M. Sands, professor of American Indian literature at Arizona State University.

The Pascuan Yaquis, and by extension all of the approximately 3,000 Yaquis then living in Arizona, were refugees from persecution at the hands of the Mexican military—what Spicer describes as “periodic Yaqui pogroms” and even as a “campaign of Yaqui extermination” (pp.213, 215)—in their home state of Sonora from about 1890 to 1920. In this respect the situation of these Yaqui immigrants in Arizona may be seen as parallel to a number of immigrant Indian groups in Canadian history, notably the several thousand Iroquois who came to Canada with the Loyalist migration of the 1780s and, especially, the Sioux Indians in southern Manitoba. This analogy with immigrant Indians in Canada is strengthened by the fact that in 1978, four decades after Spicer's study, the Yaqui settlement of New Pascua, in southwest Tucson, was given Indian Reservation status and the Yaqui were recognized as an American Indian tribe, under the administration of the U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs (pp.xvi, 310).

Spicer saw the Yaqui in Arizona as an example of the persistence of ethnic identity. In fact, drawing upon his ethnographic study of the Yaquis in Pascua, Spicer “developed a theory of ethnic persistence and began to publish material analyzing how certain people sustain their ethnic identity despite pressures by surrounding cultures to give up the symbols and practises that set them apart” (p.306). Thus, decades before Fredrik Barth's seminal theorizing on the nature of ethnicity, Spicer had already demonstrated that “ethnicity is not a result of isolation, but rather that the maintenance of separate ethnic identity often occurs in spite of, and sometimes because of, increasing contact and interaction between cultures” (p.306). The Yaquis in Arizona thus provided Spicer with an invaluable ethnographic case study, from which he derived much of his later theorizing on ethnicity. His method was therefore, as Sands suggests in her epilogue, more

inductive than deductive:

Unlike some of his contemporaries in culture and personality research, he did not go into the field to validate his theories, but drew his theories from his work in the field, gradually building on his Pascua research to offer a comprehensive theory to the growing theories in the study of ethnicity (p.308).

In his *People of Pascua* Spicer shows, often by direct quotations from his informants, how nearly all of the Yaqui he interviewed insistently set themselves off from the more numerous Mexicans in Arizona, with whom they otherwise appear to have much in common. In fact, it is only on closer scrutiny that Anglo-American outsiders are able to discern Arizona's Yaquis as a separate ethnic group, distinct and different from the mainstream Mexican population in that state. Those Anglo-Americans who have come to know Yaquis through prolonged direct contact, generally in economically unequal relationships (employer/employee, lawyer/client), seem to corroborate the Yaquis' view of themselves as being honest (they pay back their debts) and hard working, in contrast to their stereotyped view of "Mexicans." They thus see the Yaquis as a people motivated by a different value system.

Yaqui distinctiveness, especially as it is perceived by the Yaquis themselves, is what most of *People of Pascua* is about. What, then, are the main traits of Yaquiness? Or, in operational terms, how do Yaquis differ from mainstream Mexicans and other Indians in Arizona? Spicer discusses several differentiating traits. There is, of course, the Yaqui language, which was still the language most frequently used in the home of most Yaqui households in Pascua at the time of Spicer's study. Spicer also specifies skin colour, a distinctive Yaqui kinship system and even modes of dress and social intercourse—for instance, traditional Yaquis expressed opposition to dancing in couples as practised by Mexicans—as traits which distinguish Yaquis from Mexicans. But what emerges in Spicer's study as the most central Yaqui trait is participation in distinctively Yaqui religious ceremonies. Although superficially Catholic for centuries, as a result of early Jesuit missionary activity amongst them the Yaqui religion is a syncretic blend of standard Catholicism and precontact Yaqui religious beliefs and practises. Both Jesus and the Virgin Mary have a central role in the Yaqui religion, but that religion also includes such non-Christian practises as the appeasement of ancestral spirits, healing through witchcraft and especially all-night ceremonial dancing. Lent, climaxing with much ceremonialism during the Holy Week preceding Easter, had become the most important period in the Yaqui religious calendar. Another period of intensified religious activity was in late October (All Souls' Day, All Saints' Day), when the ancestral spirits had to be propitiated with ceremonies.

Probably due to centuries of Hispanic Catholic influence on them in their Sonoran homeland, the Yaquis see themselves (and are seen by others) as being less Indian than the Indigenous Papago Indians in southern Arizona and other American Indians. Spicer relates several cases of Yaquis intermarrying with Papago Indians, as well as with Mexicans in and around Tucson. The failure rate for both of these types of "mixed marriages" seems to be high, and it is evident from Spicer's discussion that Yaquis tend to dismiss both Papago Indians and Mexicans as too lax and permissive in their ways of life. Most Yaquis seem to have a particularly negative view of Mexicans, to the extent that Mexicans figure as bogeymen in stories Yaqui adults tell their children. Spicer devotes considerable discussion to this attitude. This negative stereotype of Mexicans is most common in the older generation of Yaquis, that is in those who can remember the mistreatment of Yaquis in Mexico. It seems more attenuated among younger Yaquis. As far as Yaqui attitudes to Anglos are concerned, we learn from Spicer that most Yaquis hold a generally positive view of the dominant Anglo-American society and culture in Arizona. They are especially grateful that Anglos have aided them financially and did not have them deported to Mexico, but there also seems to be a general feeling among Yaquis that Anglos lack spirituality. It should be noted here that the Tucson Chamber of Commerce has supported with financial aid the holding of Yaqui ceremonies in the Yaqui church in Pascua, but it seems to have done that mainly because it sees such Yaqui ceremonies as potential tourist attractions.

Spicer's methodology emphasizes the life history approach to cultural anthropology. In this approach the researcher attempts to elicit the general ethnography of a people by detailed recordings of the life histories of individuals who are considered to typify the group studied. About half of *People of Pascua* consists of the life histories, generally based on extensive interviews with the subjects, of sixteen Yaqui individuals in Pascua. Both genders and various age categories, including minors, are represented in the book's biographical section, but most space is given to an octogenarian named Lucas Chavez. Of course, Spicer does not just present his respondents' accounts of themselves and others, but analyzes and interprets this biographical data along the way. Such analysis and interpretation is always risky, as all who have done similar research in the social sciences well know, because reality often appears in a rather discordant cacophony and it is up to the researcher to impose order upon it. Different interpretations vie for acceptance and the researcher finally has to make a judgment call on which interpretation he will go with. In any case, Spicer's lifehistory approach has since been validated by a number of eminent cultural anthropologists (pp.303-306).

Spicer's *People of Pascua* is well written and well edited. Both the

editorial preface and the updatings in the end notes are clear and succinct. The book also includes 25 black-and-white photographs and 14 pages with diagrams and maps—four genealogical tables and ten maps. Eight of the ten maps show itineraries of respondents interviewed and all ten maps show map scale.

Except for the updates in the editorial preface and endnotes, this book's description of the Yaquis in Arizona is obviously dated. Nevertheless, one can imagine several good uses for Spicer's *People of Pascua* today. For one, it is obviously valuable as an in-depth study of the Yaqui in Arizona at a critical point in their history—when they may still have feared being sent back to Mexico and had not yet been officially recognized as Indians. Secondly, this thorough, detailed study could serve as a bench mark for a comparative ethnographic or sociological study of the Yaqui Indians in Arizona today. Thirdly, Spicer's *People of Pascua* can serve as a model for similar studies on expatriate minorities or for researchers using the life-history approach to ethnographic study. Last, but perhaps not least important, this very readable book is an example for academics in that it shows that scholarly books need not be opaque or boring.

Alvin Kienetz
Box 402
The Pas, Manitoba
R9A 1K5

References

Barth, Fredrik (Editor)

1969 *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries*. Boston: Little, Brown and Company.

York, Annie, Richard Daly and Chris Arnet: *They Write Their Dreams on the Rock Forever: Rock Writings in the Stein River Valley of British Columbia*. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 1993, 320 pp. 16 Colour plates, 80 Black and White Illustrations, ISBN: 0-88922-331-9, Cloth, CDN \$34.95.

A fascinating experience in the world of spirituality, art, history, and communication awaits the curious reader in a grand and unique book published last year in Vancouver. *They Write Their Dreams on the Rock Forever* describes and analyzes the ochre marks, the "writing" which Native

people executed on the rocks along the banks of the Stein river, a tributary of the Fraser near Lytton in southern British Columbia.

As do some anthropological notes, the book could simply have presented a collection of commentaries on drawings of rocks, giving descriptions and perhaps some scientific explanations, but leaving the reader with the impression that a particular form of art had been alive and well at one point in that region. But this ambitious and beautiful book goes much beyond that in its treatment of a unique and underexplored subject.

The three authors, one coming from an Aboriginal oral tradition of knowledge and two coming from the European tradition of scholarship, propose a travel in time, cultures, and indeed, into the spiritual world which the rock writers of the area had experienced. They also explore the linguistic value of the writing, which is both a physical link between the spiritual and the material worlds, and an educational testimony for future generations of dream and vision seekers.

It was not a small challenge; in fact to some extent, it could be seen as being parallel to the challenge which the young dream-seekers of yesteryear had met in the Stein Valley. How does one express, indeed communicate, a vision quest, a shamanic experience, a personal relationship “to the vast network of energies in the universe by psychic explorations into different meditational planes?” What media will one use to describe the fundamental quest of human condition? How does one shift from the spiritual to the material?

Immediately, art and various artistic expressions come to mind as indeed they should. Art, after all, allows mankind to escape the materialistic and limiting weight of its reality. Are rock drawings art forms? Yes, but as Daly explains it in a well-structured and solid chapter, we are out of art and into writing when it comes to the signs on the rocks by the Stein river. The exposé is serious and well-documented, provocative and interesting, even to the non-expert.

This book presents a challenging kind of writing which the authors describe as “restricted literacy.” As opposed to “full literacy” which uses the alphabet and visual signs to stand for the spoken word, this literacy is restricted as it pertains to the “altered states of consciousness of certain young persons of the 'Nlaka'pamux.” It strives however, to communicate visually shared human and cultural experiences, as the reader of the rock will be sharing a similar psychological process, will possess a common tradition of hunting, gathering and fishing, and share a common regional culture and artistic tradition.

What is witnessed for the reader by Annie York, who was educated in the restricted code of those signs, is a systematic written report of spiritual experiences. These experiences are “written” on the very medium from

which the vision seeker was drawing part of his knowledge—the rocks in which many beings have been materialized. Quite an important mission was given to the sign as it had to “facilitate the acquisition of power and make it stronger and more permanent.” Thus the writings on the rocks were at once a link through matter with the spiritual dimension of reality and a link through time to future generations; they exist in effect as twin media.

The writing is done in red, the color of life; on rocks, the embodiments of creatures; and in the Stein valley, the hidden place, where the powers of nature were considered to be most present.

Inhabitants of today's urban Canada who are used to materialistic culture and hard matters should not feel threatened by this esoteric subject: Annie York manages to translate the writing on the rock into very understandable and simple experiences to which everyone can relate. In fact, the oral style of delivery has been reproduced so exactly in the book that it is like listening to the actual conversation.

Two examples provide a sense of the richness of this interview-turned-historical-and-spiritual-exploratory-research.

Here, Annie York describes a complex set of markings of a boy's first dream (p.77):

This is the boy's first dream. You see the little thing above the snowshoe? The dot at the end is the beginning of this life. The little circle below the line that shows it was a full moon near the start of his dream and after a while he gets hungry in his dream. The little animal in his dream tells him “Now you can eat.” He has nothing to eat, so he shoots a squirrel or something—a bird. And he cooked it at an open fire. He sits there and he eats it. But that little animal, when he eats it that time, that becomes part of this power.

In the next selection, she explains a large and complex configuration of symbolic writings, all laid out on the page as they must have been on the rock. The illustration is 30 cm x 16 cm and one imagines Annie's finger following the lines as she explains precisely what is there (p.156):

This is a nine-day dream. See? All those parallel lines on the right? It means he didn't eat for nine days while he had his dreams. That deer in the middle and the figure above it with wings around the animals, those are separated by sort of forked sticks. The one around the deer is just to show it's not part of the dream above. They use that fork a lot. We seen it already (Fig. 99) where it penned the animals into the high mountains. There it was rooted in the ground, keeping them in place. The fork holds it there. But it can be used just like the wings of this hunter creature, to capture the animal in the

dreamer's mind.

While strolling through the core of the book, a 150-page-long chapter of clear, easy-to-follow, nicely reproduced red drawings and sharp commentary, the reader slowly realizes that systematic, precise and well-defined visions are unfolding on the pages. Through Annie's comments, the reader is also exposed to legends, history, hunting and fishing traditions and ways of life. The entire world in which Annie grew up, and the education she received, slowly and fully emerges, as a mark, a spot, a line or a figure on the rock triggers memories and knowledge.

The book itself is 300 pages. Chris Arnett and Richard Daly complement Annie York's testimony with scholarly chapters on the archaeology of dreams and the meaning of writing. I enjoyed them both, but in fact Annie York's testimony stands alone, full and strong, passing on the memory of those who wrote their dreams on the rock forever.

Joël Demay
C.P. 245
Chelsea, Quebec
Canada, J0X 1N0