

BOOK REVIEW

Ames, Michael M.: *Cannibal Tours and Glass Boxes: The Anthropology of Museums*. 2nd Edition, Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1992, xvi + 212 pp. ISBN 0-7748-0391-6, Cloth, \$39.95.

Michael Ames's collection of informative and highly readable essays first appeared in 1986 as *Museums, The Public and Anthropology: A Study in the Anthropology of Anthropology*. Unlike another "second edition" I recently reviewed in these pages, though, this one truly warrants that status. In doubling the number of chapters to fourteen, the author presents a wealth of new material that not only amplifies his original observations about the current state of anthropology museums and anthropology generally, but goes well beyond them in examining issues as diverse as the role of museums in purveying popular culture and the contentious matter of cultural appropriation. In effect, Ames has given us another book, not just stale, re-packaged goods sporting a catchy new title.

Whatever else they are about, and they touch on many things, the essays in *Cannibal Tours* are tied together by a common motif: the post-modern dilemma of anthropology in an increasingly democratized society. At the heart of the dilemma, the author tells us, is a profession attempting to re-define its relationships to the Third and Fourth World peoples who traditionally have been the cannibal-tour objects of study, and whose cultures, even today, remain the glass-box subjects of interpretation in ethnographic writing and museum display. On the surface there is nothing much new in this theme, countless printed pages having already been devoted to the political and Intellectual ins and outs of doing anthropology in an age (or is it a moment?) of deconstruction. Yet Ames comes at the matter from a different perspective, suggesting that museum anthropology, for decades regarded by those in the academic world as a lesser calling because interpreting humankind for the masses, not scholarship, made up its primary work, now serves important diagnostic and reconstructive functions for the profession as a whole. This comes about, he reminds his readers in several places, because unlike universities, modern museums are more deeply embedded in the social, economic, and political affairs of their diverse constituencies, and of the wider community. Put simply, they feel the "pressures of democratization" more (p.37), pressures made evident, for instance, in the desire of Canadian Aboriginal peoples to repatriate their own cultural heritage, or to disseminate to non-Natives their

distinct perspectives on the history and anthropology of their respective nations. And since “vastly more people learn about anthropology from museums than from universities, what museums do [especially what they do to accommodate the democratizing impulses in society] will drastically affect the rest of anthropology” now, and likely in the future (p.139).

Ames writes about these subjects with some authority, being a long-serving member of U.B.C.'s anthropology faculty and director of the university's Museum of Anthropology for nearly twenty years. Understandably, many of his essays are laced with details about the positive and negative experiences of museums, mainly in Canada, in coming to terms with the process of accommodation. For example, he makes special reference to several innovative programmes initiated at his own museum, including new forms of display that make cultural materials more accessible to Aboriginal artists and ordinary members of the Native community. No less valuable is Ames's treatment of the paradoxical realities of the contemporary museum anthropologist, being at once a part of a powerful and enduring institutional medium for the production of dominant cultural ideas, and, at least in recent times, open to the possibility of defeating many of those same ideas by adopting alternative approaches to exhibition, actively including viewpoints from “originating cultures,” and engaging in critical self-examination of the objectives and responsibilities of the museum enterprise itself.

Cannibal Tours has quite a bit to recommend it, and to recommend it to professional and lay readers alike. For the former, it offers some new and eminently practical insights not just about the present and future of museums, but about the relevance of anthropology to late 20th century society. In this sense the book is less true to its current subtitle than to the original “Anthropology of Anthropology,” and so is deserving of being read as a critical commentary on where the discipline has been, and where it may be heading. And for the latter, Ames's well-written essays explain a good deal of what actually constitutes the work of museums, most importantly the production of those “cultural consumables” meant to inform and entertain the museum-going public.

Barnett Richling
Department of Sociology
and Anthropology
Mount Saint Vincent University
Halifax, Nova Scotia
Canada, B3M 2J6

Angus, Murray: *"...and the last shall be first": Native Policy in an Era of Cutbacks*. Toronto: NC Press Ltd, Revised Edition, 1991, 87 pp. ISBN: 1-55021-064-5.

This book originated as a project for Project North, an ecumenical coalition of national churches and other non-government organizations who work with First Nations. The book provides the reader with an overview of how the federal government has dealt with Native people over the past two decades. The author was asked to prepare a background paper to address three sets of concerns regarding the federal government and First Nations. Specifically, the author was asked to determine whether or not the social welfare system was being dismantled, what the federal government shifts in policies and programs related to Aboriginal people are, and outline some of the implications of these trends. He describes events and decisions on a variety of policy decisions, e.g., land claims and self-government, which have both short and long term impacts on Native people.

The author begins this short book by outlining the assumptions of the current federal Conservative party. He concludes that they are looking for a way to get out of the Native business. The author goes on to note that many people might even agree with this position and thus it is his task to show how this decision will adversely affect both Native Canadians as well as other ordinary non-Native Canadians. He also points out that Native people have had little power to decide what they want to do; government has the most power to decide what place Native people have in our society. Furthermore, the government has consistently used that power to determine the fate of Natives. The author also notes that he wants to analyze what lies behind the rationale for this ideological position as well as how and when this policy began.

The text is divided into three parts. Part One places the decision to get out of Native business in its historical and political context. The author begins by analyzing the transformation of the government's role in Canadian society after the second world war. He continues his analysis by reviewing the government's policies during the 1960s and 1970s; showing how they remained relatively constant over time. However, when the Conservatives came into power in 1984, the role of government began to change radically. This political party has challenged the ideals of universality, reduced social spending and become determined to find ways to target its programs. By 1988, a new political realignment occurred in Canada, a realignment based upon competing economic interests and competing visions of Canadian society. As such, the Conservatives began to implement their corporate agenda, e.g., withdrawal of federal contribu-

tions to the Unemployment Insurance fund, implementation of the Free Trade Agreement, introduction of a Goods and Services Tax, introduction of the "clawback" on universal social programs and cuts to regional development programs. In short, the federal government has been trying to implement fiscal restraint which would only focus on non-corporate enterprises while allowing for continued subsidization of corporate interests. The author points out that in 1984, the estimated annual cost of assisting and supporting the private sector was \$16.4 billion. Such policies have been endorsed and supported by the economic elite of Canada. At the same time this policy has resulted in the marginalization (demographically, economically, politically) of Natives in Canada.

Part Two attempts to provide specific examples of the various policies and programs put into place by the Conservatives in order to get out of supporting First Nations people. Briefly covering a number of actions, the author outlines the impact of the *Nielsen Report*, how government has dealt with specific and comprehensive claims as well as their response to Native self-government. In each case, the author points out how the government has taken steps to reduce its long term obligation to Native people. The author notes that the failure of the constitutional talks, the restrictions imposed in the new land claims policy, the restrictive scope of the government's self-government policy, the cynical indifference toward land claims, and the determination to avoid legal directives from various courts, all point to the concerted effort of the Conservatives to reduce or reject their responsibility for supporting Native people.

The author concludes in Part Three that the major reason Native people have never received support is because other Canadians did not know about or understand the issues and they saw Native issues as separate. The author tries to show that the government has consciously tried to inform middle class Canadians that continued support of Native people means they will have to pay the bill. Thus, at first glance, it would seem that Native people and middle class non-Natives have opposing interests. The author argues that if the government's corporate agenda continues to be implemented, many of the current middle class will, like Native people, lose control over their workplace and working conditions. They too, will become marginalized as Native people have been for the past century. On the other hand, if the middle class recognizes that the process of economic restructuring will affect them (as it did the Native population), they can take preventative action. In the end, the author enjoins middle class Canadians to form a coalition and develop a greater solidarity so that the Conservative corporate agenda can be defeated. He concludes that ordinary middle class Canadians are not as far removed from the policies affecting Natives as

they might assume.

The book is easy reading and deals with a number of complex issues regarding First Nations. The author also reviews several current issues facing Native people and Canadians and presents an overview. It is also useful for students who generally are unable to see linkages among overtly dissimilar policies or groups within our society. The author makes an important case for demonstrating how fiscal policies and ideological stances are intimately related to other issues such as self-government and land claims.

James S. Frideres
Department of Sociology
The University of Calgary
Calgary, Alberta
Canada, T2N 1N4

Campbell, Maria: *Half-Breed*. Halifax: Goodread Biographies (Formac Publishing Company Ltd.), 1983, ISBN 0-88780-116-1.

(*Half Breed* was first published in Toronto in 1973 by McClelland and Stewart. It was republished in a Seals Book edition in 1979 and was last republished by Goodread Biographies in 1983.)

There are many reasons to write an autobiography. Celebrities write "assisted" autobiographies to satisfy public curiosity and thicken profits. Politicians write autobiographies to publically establish the myth by which they wish to be known. The writer's autobiography serves literary ends; to tell a story in which the writer plays a part. Maria Campbell's *Half-Breed* is such an autobiography. It has been read with amazement and gratitude for 20 years now. Maria Campbell is a Métis person. She is a writer of gifts. The writing is economical, the structure linear, and the whole, brutally poetic. *Half-Breed* is not a book to which one refers for information and documentation. What has happened, what continues to happen in Native communities, has been well studied and documented, if not sufficiently well appreciated. Campbell's work doesn't study or petition. It is self-documentation and testimonial for a 1973 White readership at peak indulgence levels. It is also for a Native readership that already possessed both the writer's insight that courage was sustained within tragedy, and the Métis

knowledge that life as “a people” was slipping away. Campbell's story reveals such a people, perilously close to cultural extinction as they might have been, as her primary source of strength and renewal.

There could not have been a more timely message in 1973. Denial of Métis suffering is as Canadian as back bacon and as old as the nation itself. Campbell's reflexivity and self-knowledge, her courage and directness helped remove any lingering shadow of political expediency still associated with positions of ignorance, passivity and fear in respect of the suffering of the Métis and of all Native people. Now, in its 20th year, one reads *Half-Breed* to revisit its power as a touching and authentic chronicle of Native life, and to rediscover its unique place in Native literature as a work memorable for tenderness of expression and the awful plainness of its tragedy.

1973 was a banner year for autobiographies. Both Jane Willis's *Genesh: An Indian Girlhood* and Wilfred Pelletier's *No Foreign Land: The Biography of a North American Indian* were published in that year. Distinctions between these and Campbell's work, evident then, are more evident now. Reviews often cited the absence of bitterness in Campbell's work, a dimension by no means in short supply in Willis or Pelletier. With a vast international literature of bitterness developed over the past 20 years, Campbell's exceptionality in this regard has become even more outstanding. Twenty years ago, one could still find critics committed to mythologizing biography and of literature in general as an agency of social change. Now, in the raging pits of postmodern subjectivity, there are no such balms. Bitterness as expression prevails. Bitterness as a condition of life in Native communities remains. *Half-Breed* has stepped out of the exceptionality of its youth to become a book of wisdom in its maturity.

It is a story, like so many others, of poverty, injustice, exploitation, violence, desperation, degradation. It is also a tale of resistance, of grit and determination. It is the classic tale in which the victim emerges victorious. But it is none of this powerful stuff that leads into the source of its “rightness” and grip. Campbell's work centres on the context of her life...a rich context encompassing a human community that she is able to describe with minimalist precision and evocative depth. The Métis community in the area of Spring River, Saskatchewan remained a largely integral social unit through the years of her childhood, the 1940s and early 1950s. What is memorable for Campbell and for the reader is not merely the characters that gave such color to the community's human landscape, but the readiness and ease with which that community was prepared to value character in the full range of its expression from conformity to individuality to eccentricity. Campbell's description of shared poverty, pain and pride, of unob-

scured and undefeated linkage to the vision of Riel and Dumont, never plays with the mawkish or heroic. Her sense of the presence of experience is remarkably keen and the reader is drawn into the unresistant texture of the writing.

The complex, multi-dimensioned relation of Métis, treaty Indians, White communities, priests, nuns, residential and local schools, are all briefly but tellingly uncovered and explored. Domestic life, weddings and funerals, dances and feasts, the work of physical and community survival, doing without, personal loss, living with grief, adjusting to dashed hopes...all map into a cluster of personalities and events which, accumulating and driven to climax over the course of Campbell's story, become progressively more familiar in the context of current bitterness.

This beautiful book, the product of a child's memory and of this same child's wisdom as a woman writing memoirs at age 33, must have been sobering for the still-innocent Canadian nation in the post-Expo flush of the early seventies. Since then, the critics have released their grip on liberal ideologies. So have the politicians. *Half-Breed* retains its grip. It has been read and republished too many times to harbour what critics then might have identified as "still unrealized expectations."

It has, perhaps, taken this time to realize what it has always been: a work of eloquent directness and unforgettable courage.

Alfred Fisher
Queen's University
Kingston, Ontario
Canada, K7L 3N6

Coltelli, Laura: *Winged Words: American Indian Writers Speak*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992, ISBN 0-8032-1445-6.

In the book *Winged Words: American Indian Writers Speak*, Laura Coltelli and eleven Native American writers create a dialogue, expressing various Native American perspectives. This book, through the interviews, gives the reader a sense of who are the writers, where they are from, and how "Native American literature is useful to everybody who's trying to move from one world to another."

Coltelli asks a series of questions of each writer about acculturation, cultural preservation, Pan-Indianness, the multi-ethnic family and how the writers view their creative work. The different writers voice their views of the changes within the Native American person in contemporary society. As Paula Gunn Allen states, Native Americans are "trying to decide how to be an Indian person and how to be a modern person."

The book is divided into ten chapters. Coltelli interviews the writers in various settings with unique questions about the contemporary Native American, giving the reader a strong sense of who the writers are as well as what their creative work is about. Throughout the interviews Coltelli asks the writers questions about storytelling, tradition, tribal history, and their writing process. Her interviews give the reader information about the writers, their world views and their personal perspectives, for as Gerald Vizenor explains "You can't understand the world without telling a story."

As Coltelli explains in her introduction, her "first concern in the interviews gathered here was to provide an adequate cultural perspective, a resource for criticism that would be directly connected to creative activity. The aim of most of the questions I put to the writers was, following the challenge of self-definition so common to writers in postcolonial times, to elicit from them their sense of displacement as well as their sense of belonging, their interpretation of Native Americans in their modern homeland."

The writers each discuss how, in contemporary society, Native Americans are modern. The way it's conveyed is by the portrayal of the contemporary Native American in the literature and the Native American quest for modern identity.

The book is interesting, humorous and stimulating. The interviews give the reader a sense of who the writers are, by reading the dialogue shared between the interviewer and the different writers. The interviews are personal and humorous, making the reading interesting. When Vizenor talks about American Indian Studies as "the Department of Undecided Studies" he jokes about how Indian students "hang on undeclared as long as they can," which is funny in the sense that as a student, declaring a major can change from one year to the next.

The book gives the reader a sense of cultural respect. The writers talk about the modern Native American in their literature, and as Coltelli says "Central to most contemporary Native American works, as the writers state in the interviews, are the mixed blood Indians, characters not previously portrayed by Native American writers in American Literature." Coltelli chose writers who are mixed blood and explores their individual perspective in a personal and respectful way, bringing different cultural perspectives together.

Lisa Belcourt
611-12th Avenue South
Suite 200
Seattle, Washington
USA, 98144

Flanagan, Thomas: *Métis Lands in Manitoba*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1991, x + 245 pp.

Reading Thomas Flanagan's *Métis Lands in Manitoba* brings to mind the saying, "the operation was a success, but the patient died." The book is lucidly written and duly footnoted, but still manages to miss the point. Because Flanagan ignores collective rights and because he believes the workings of the competitive market are invariably just, he fails to see that the Manitoba Métis were unfairly deprived of their land.

Section 31 of the *Manitoba Act of 1870* provided for the distribution of 1.4 million acres among the children of Métis heads of families, and Section 32 guaranteed title for those already living on lots in the Red River settlement. In 1981 the Manitoba Métis Federation and the Native Council of Canada launched a court action, claiming that Sections 31 and 32 had not been properly implemented. Flanagan signed a contract to work for the federal Department of Justice as a historical consultant in the case against the Métis, and this book represents his findings. Though admitting that "doing research for one side in a conflict may colour one's thinking in ways that are difficult or impossible to perceive," (p.viii) he insists that "the purpose of this book is to tell the factual story," (p.10) a declaration to be taken with a grain of salt since all historians bring their own views and values to the "objective" story.

Of 7,027 Métis children who claimed a land grant, 6,034 received 240 acres each for a total of 1,448,160 acres, and 993 received scrip for \$240 apiece after all the land had been given out. On January 22, 1877 the surveyor general, J.S. Dennis, wrote Archbishop Tache: "[O]wing to the designs of speculators the majority of claims of Half Breed children, as the same mature, will pass from the owners for comparatively a mere nominal consideration" (p.91). This is exactly what happened, except that the speculators did not have to wait until the "Half Breed children" "matured." A provincial Act of 1878 allowed the Court of Queen's Bench to sell the real estate of a child under 18 upon the application of the parent or guardian. A commission of inquiry set up in October, 1881 found that the applications, although made in the name of the child and parent, were often prepared on nearly identical printed forms by the purchaser or by his solicitor. There were no detailed affidavits from the parent or guardian explaining how the sale would benefit the child, no personal examination of witnesses, nothing, in fact, to protect the interests of the child. To add to the scandal, Chief Justice Wood, who passed most of the orders for sales, approved requests submitted by his own land-speculating sons.

To ascertain what happened to the Métis land, Flanagan drew a one

percent sample, consisting of fifty-nine allotments, from the registers kept by the Department of the Interior. Only five of the subjects in the sample held on to their land for long-term use and investment. Three of this group could be identified as part of the educated and well-to-do Métis upper class. The great majority of land recipients were poor and vulnerable to speculators. The land was quickly sold and then passed through a chain of two, three, or more sales (with a profit collected at each stage) before reaching a buyer prepared to settle and farm.

Flanagan concludes “that the Métis were not victims of exploitation in the market” (p.129). He argues that since the market for land and scrip was competitive, not monopolistic, the prices received were fair. “The much-maligned speculators were in fact benefactors of the community” (p. 145) because they acted as middlemen, conveying the land from those who wanted to sell to those who wanted to buy. Flanagan repeatedly suggests that the Métis were capable of making rational decisions in their own interest and did not need “paternalistic” protection from government, but he also hedges, allowing that the degree of appropriate paternalistic government intervention is a matter for debate.

What Flanagan labels “paternalism” can be seen instead as the acknowledgement of collective rights. The Métis leaders wanted their land in one large block and they wanted it entailed for at least a generation to prevent resale. As Lieutenant-Governor Archibald noted in 1870, “they [the Métis leaders] treat the question, not as one of business, but rather as one of race, and breed, and language and because they are unwilling that their people should form part of a mixed community” (p.66). The Canadian government, rejecting collective rights, granted the land in severalty with few restrictions on the rights of individuals to sell. In the negotiations leading to the *Manitoba Act*, Sir Georges Cartier had promised the Métis the distribution of their lands in such a way as “to meet the wishes of the half-breed residents” (p.75). This promise was not kept.

Flanagan's defence of land speculators is based on the premise that a free, competitive market is inherently non-exploitive. However, ethical behaviour and liberal economics may, but need not, coincide. Speculation in Métis lands may have conformed to the principles of the free market, but many people found the practice morally offensive. This is not simply a matter of historical hindsight, of today's generation passing judgment on an earlier age. In 1912 George W. Brown, a lawyer, financier, and member of the Regina College Board of Governors, approached the college president, the Reverend Robert Milliken, with an offer: “I have just had word of a section of government land that is being vacated at Milestone. I will sell you scrip to cover it for one thousand dollars... You can sell it next spring

for over five dollars an acre. You can make three or four thousand dollars without turning your hand." Milliken refused: "If I made that much so easily I would likely want to make as much more in the same way, I would be bothering the life out of you until you would say, "I wish he would attend to his own work and not be so keen after the dollar" (Pistula, 1987:33). Both then and now people recognized an ill-gotten gain when they saw one.

In the end, therefore, Flanagan's book, though clearly written and thought-provoking, is unpersuasive. The Manitoba Métis were dispossessed of their lands because the Canadian government did not acknowledge collective rights and because of the depredations of speculators.

James M. Pistula
Department of History
University of Regina
Regina, Saskatchewan
Canada, S4S 8A2

Reference

Pistula, James M.

1987 *An Act of Faith: The Early Years of Regina College*. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center.

Fleras, Augie and Jean Leonard Elliott: *The Nations Within: Aboriginal-State Relations in Canada, the United States and New Zealand*. Oxford University Press, 1992, 287 pp. \$16.95 (Canadian).

A good illustration of the difficulty that Aboriginal people have within a liberal democracy to secure their rights is the Canadian failure to ratify the Charlottetown accord in the October 26, 1992 referendum. In that accord an Aboriginal package had been negotiated that would have entrenched the inherent right to self-government for Aboriginal peoples in the Constitution. Canadians rejected the accord far less for the Aboriginal package it contained, than for other reasons associated perhaps, with its overly compromising nature. Interestingly, even Aboriginal Chiefs and some communities rejected the Aboriginal package (62 per cent voted "No") because they were uncomfortable with its timing—they felt rushed; there was insufficient time to consult with community members.

What now? The focus will probably shift to the avenues that the Federal Government currently has available for negotiating self-government for

Aboriginal people, and the suspicion that another Federal Initiative, soon to be announced, will point to a new direction to self-government. One of the avenues that could open up a new path to self-government negotiations may come from the findings and recommendations of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples now holding hearings across Canada. Or, perhaps other processes, such as legislative options (powers beyond the *Indian Act*), *Indian Act Alternatives* comes to mind, will be resurrected after suffering a brief demise during the Constitutional talks. The government can still point to several existing avenues for retaining the essence of the package negotiated in the accord. The field of self-government for Aboriginal peoples in Canada bears watching.

This brings me to the book under review, *The Nations Within: Aboriginal-State Relations in Canada, the United States and New Zealand*, which selects the three liberal democracies mentioned in the title, to compare the relations of Aboriginals with the state, and to show the transformation of these relations from first contact to the present, mainly from a sociological perspective. The Aboriginal peoples selected for discussion are the Indian, Inuit and Métis peoples of Canada. The book clearly demonstrates the difficulties that the "nations within" (read sovereign nations) have in redefining their relationship with the Nation State and in turn, gaining recognition from the state of their collective rights. The present position of Aboriginal peoples in each of the liberal democracies is quite different and the book, therefore, opts for a thorough review of the history and development of government policies for dealing with Aboriginal peoples (and those they must suffer under). The general historical treatment of Aboriginal-State relations in the book follows the trajectory from attempts at outright assimilation of Aboriginal peoples by the state to government efforts to resolve their grievances within the context of the nation state, in short, from colony to nation within.

In between are all the failed and forlorn attempts by successive government administrations to deal with Aboriginal people as equals: it is clear that the incremental approaches favoured by governments of liberal democracies don't get to the heart of the matter. The impression is that governments are busy learning about and controlling Aboriginal people as they develop their policies. Lurking in the background of the struggle by Aboriginal peoples to secure their collective rights, is the unresolved issue of just what constitutes sovereignty for Aboriginal nations. The authors trace how the liberal democracies try to accommodate their strivings by means of policy measures, administration by bureaucracy and legislative fiat.

In Canada, according to the authors, the federal authorities and the

Aboriginal people hold different views of self-government.

Political discourse, in Canada, is slanted toward recognition of the First Nations as a "distinct society" with special rights and claims against the state over and above those of citizenship. The authors acknowledge that:

Government officials appear willing in theory to acknowledge the validity of aboriginal national demands, if only to avert a crisis of legitimacy of the state or avoid international censure. Thus the principle of aboriginality is not dismissed outright; rather debate focuses on the limits of aboriginal rights, the extent of jurisdictional boundaries, and how best to deal with aboriginal claims without destroying the social fabric of the larger society in the process (1992: 221).

The present day mechanisms for dismantling the paternalistic institutions developed by the state for dealing with Aboriginal peoples, centres around such notions as "delegation," "devolution," and "self-government." What do these terms mean and do they hold the same meaning for all parties? Not necessarily so, according to the authors, wherein lies the source of disagreement, frustration and failed policies for Aboriginal people to secure a new place in the nation state. The new negotiated reality of self-government will require agreement and compromise by the parties to the negotiations, if a lasting model is to remain workable.

One such model currently being touted is the public government of Nunavut, where the Inuit ratification of the land claim (sixty-nine per cent voted "Yes") opened the way for self-government talks and the eventual creation of the Territory of Nunavut (ratification and legislation are needed on the federal side.) The Inuit will be able to give their aspirations concrete form by developing and operating the institutions of their government. The discussion on Nunavut is quite thorough, warranting inclusion with Métis nationalism which receives a brief treatment.

There is a particularly thorough discussion of New Zealand's Maori, the *Treaty of Waitangi* and Maori-State relations, centred around the restructuring of relations in New Zealand. By restructuring the New Zealand state along market lines, Aboriginal-State relations are reorganized through the principles of devolution, decentralization and delegation. As the authors are quick to point out, more than terminological quibbles are at stake here:

Competing visions of devolution are a source of Maori-government conflict. Regarding devolution as a means of increasing *iwi* autonomy and power, the *tangata whenua* perceive tribal use of resources as community-driven, with a strong commitment to collective accountability and operational freedom. In contrast, the government position emphasizes

market-friendly resource use, ministerial accountability, integration into the overall political structure, and, ...control" (1992:206).

There is a further discussion of the conflicts over how the use of the term "devolution" flows from two different realities and embodies competing meanings (pp.203-208). Devolution may, in New Zealand government parlance, come to mean a delegation of authority rather than a transfer of jurisdiction. The word "paradigm" appears here, as it does in the chapter on Canada, as a shorthand way of capturing the different visions or assumptions of Maori autonomy versus government policy. Nothing less than the full sharing of power will satisfy Maori aspirations, as befits their status as a nation within.

For the position of Aboriginal groups in the United States, the authors paint a picture coloured by outright assimilation followed by co-optation. As the authors note:

Aboriginal people are still under the thumb of Washington; their treaty rights are still denied; their land base grows smaller each year; their resources flow out of their communities to the benefit of non-Indians; and the government that rules them does so without their consent. Even when they technically own their land, they frequently lose the profits to outsiders (1992:164).

The government strategy of "co-optation" allows the power-holder (read the federal government) to extend some form of political participation to actors who pose a threat to the legitimate order. The intention is to have it appear to outsiders as though Aboriginal people are part of the decision-making process and thereby confer legitimacy on government policies and programs. There is a very good discussion of federal policies in the United States under successive administrations as they seek to either promote outright assimilation or blatantly chip away at its converse, self-determination, by limiting the powers of the "domestic dependent nations." The context of self-determination in the United States is defined not by the Aboriginal nations, but by the government.

Following the authors' discussion of Aboriginal-State relations, two points need to be raised. First, though they do talk about fiscal politics, their analysis does not pay much attention to the implementation costs and problems associated with self-government. This may be because their analysis is really concerned with the underlying relations between Aboriginal people and the liberal democracies, and their view that real changes will not occur. The costs of self-government are, however, a very important factor in the government's policy. In other words the solutions to implement self-government are left for bureaucrats and administrators. Another point

which needs to be clarified concerns the use of the term “paradigm” and the concept of a “paradigm shift.” The notion that a “paradigm shift” (pp.229-230) flows from the Penner Report (1983) and the 1985 Coolican Report on Comprehensive Claims, is questionable. It seems to me that for a true shift to have occurred, all parties would have to share the basic assumptions about the nature of Aboriginal self-government. This is not the case in Canada; from the federal side many of the government departments and agencies don't necessarily endorse these basic assumptions. The authors appear to talk more about an evolving approach to the fulfilment of Aboriginal aspirations, based on selected key themes, and not really a true paradigm shift.

In conclusion, this book is a thorough treatment of Aboriginal-State relations in the three liberal democracies and will undoubtedly repay close attention. As Aboriginal-State relations are constantly changing, the predictive value of the discussion will be interesting to keep an eye on. The authors feel hopeful that Aboriginal aspirations will likely be realised in Canada rather than in any of the other two countries under discussion.

Seymour Dubrow
International Relations Directorate
45 Bainbridge Avenue
Nepean, Ontario
Canada, K2G 3T1

Goddard, John: *Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre Ltd., 1991, xi + 228pp. ISBN 0-88894-716-X.

State-sponsored subjugation of native peoples is generally thought of in Canada as a barbarity that happens elsewhere (p.86)

Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree is a skilfully researched and documented, well written, and very timely book which can serve as an eye opener for all Canadians. This book is an intricate, poignant, and unclouded account of a northern Alberta Cree community's century long decisive struggle to assert its existence.

John Goddard is an experienced journalist, an investigative reporter, and a photographer. While working for the Canadian Press news agency in the early 1980s, he spent “two years as a kind of roving correspondent in the Far North” (p.ix). In 1984, Goddard encountered the Lubicon Cree at a time when they were engaged in a battle to prevent their traditional

hunting and trapping grounds from being ravaged by oil development ventures in their region. Because of the growing public preoccupation and concern with the Lubicon case and also partly because of his high regard for Chief Ominayak, Goddard takes a personal interest in the Lubicon people's land-rights campaign. *Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree* is in this respect not only a behind-the-scenes history of the Lubicon people's struggle for land and recognition as a First Nations community, but it is also the tale of a personal journey of growth and edification which takes Goddard "from thinking of aboriginal rights as historical baggage—a trick native people were using to get more than they deserve—to appreciating how essential the recognition of such rights is to the well-being of Canadian native peoples, and to the general prosperity of the country" (p.xi).

The Lubicon story starts about a century ago when federal commissioners travelled through northern Alberta to sign treaties with Aboriginal groups. Government officials first had difficulties in reaching the Lubicon region. As a result, the Lubicon Cree did not officially exist until 1939 when they were "discovered," recognized as a Band, and promised a Reserve. However, first came a spiteful federal accountant who roamed through the region in the early 1940s and, displaying blatant ignorance and disrespect for the local culture, nullified centuries old Band affiliations, destroyed local family networks, and divided families. This marked, according to Goddard, the end of "benign neglect" and the beginning of "the modern period of officially sanctioned sabotage" (p.24). Next followed a series of federal and provincial government obstructions and stalling tactics which basically scorned and disdained Lubicon demands for recognition as a Band. Finally, the oil boom arrived and the traditional Lubicon land was turned, practically overnight, into a sea of opportunity for multinational companies and for federal and provincial governments. *Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree* documents all of these developments in stark detail. While doing so, the book discloses the racism, cultural ignorance, and hatred and apprehension towards the Canadian Aboriginal peoples permeating all levels of government institutions. However, all is not gloomy and bleak in this book. Goddard has another, equally powerful, honorable, and heartening narrative to share: this is the story of the uncompromising resistance and the determined struggle of the Lubicon Cree.

If the villains in this book are the insensitive, uninformed, and crude government officials, the unsung heroes are the members of the Lubicon Nation and their leaders, most prominent among them Chief Ominayak, and their Native and non-Native supporters from all over the world. Goddard provides us with portraits of these individuals who display remarkable courage and fortitude against all odds. The reader of this book is likely to

develop a sense of camaraderie with and a high respect for a community which remains defiant and refuses to give in to government threats.

Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree also provides a case study which sheds light on three significant issues. First, the conflict between the assertion of land rights and the exploitation of land rich in natural resources is disclosed in the case of the Lubicon Cree. Goddard shows us how a profit motive outweighs and practically invalidates the public's cultural values, and how "talented" government officials are in securing the confidence of business even if this means disregarding the law and causing deaths and suffering in Aboriginal communities. Second, Goddard provides a priceless commentary on the question of how to challenge and oppose the powers that be. The Lubicon struggle is exemplary in that it is well organized, it reaches grassroots, and it is based on a slow, calm, planned, and determined move to build coalitions across Canada and the world. The potential for solidarity among Canadian and American Native peoples is clearly demonstrated in this book, as is the invaluable support that can be provided by dedicated and skilful non-Natives. Third, Goddard tackles the idea of pluralism and shows that even though Canada claims to be a democratic, multicultural, and pluralistic society, it has no tolerance for alternative ways of life based on alternative economies. The book shows that the corporate-capitalist economy is omnipresent and hegemonic in Canada, a condition which refuses to tolerate the existence and survival of viable, self-sustaining, and environmentally prudent traditional Native economies. As such, Goddard's story radically challenges Canadians to reconsider the "barbarity" of their own ideologies.

Goddard introduces his book with a quote from William Faulkner: "The past is never dead. It's not even past." *Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree* is about our past, in the sense that it captures a significant portion of the history of our present. It forces us not to forget; it reveals the origins of boundaries which divide us all, the current boundaries of our thought and imagination, and the historicity of the present. It shows us that the present is our making, and hence we must shoulder the due responsibility. But it also shows us that ultimately people have the power to undo the wrong and to reshape the present.

Umit Kiziltan
College of New Caledonia
Tl'azt'en Nation Community
Learning Center
Tache, British Columbia
Canada, VOJ 1P0

Haig-Brown, Celia: *Resistance and Renewal: Surviving the Indian Residential School*. Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp Press Ltd., 1988, ISBN 0-88978-189-3.

Based upon interviews with members of the Shuswap, Thompson, Lillooet and Chilcotin Nations, *Resistance and Renewal* affords the reader a revealing account of life in the Kamloops Indian Residential School over a sixty year period from 1907 to 1967. Vivid recall of negative school experiences by former students directs attention to two powerful and often competing forces representing non-Native domination and intrusion into Native life: Church and Government. Nowhere could this attempted control have been more pronounced than in the education of young, impressionable children often forcibly removed from their family security and placed in the confines of a residential school.

The author skilfully portrays a struggle for power and control in the residential school as a microcosm of an ongoing struggle of Native people with the Euro-Canadian presence in their lives. White European intrusion into the relatively stable and thriving Secwepemc society is attempted by both Church and Government adopting cultural oppression as written policy. The residential school serves well in this regard since it makes cultural destruction and ethnocentric indoctrination easier through the minimizing of parental influence.

Residential schooling traumatizes young Native children whose experiences of being uprooted from their familial settings are akin to child abuse. Deprived of family and friends, not understanding the English language and forbidden to speak their own, can, together with the shock of regimentation in the residential school, be coped with only by developing a counter-culture resulting in a delicate balance between adaptation to a new order and the indelible aspects of their original culture. While recalling their stay at the Kamloops Indian Residential School, the interviewees share with the reader traumatic and often painful memories dramatizing the systematic destruction of a thriving Native culture: indoctrination accomplished through school routines; extreme discipline; over emphasis on daily church exercises; abuse; poor quality of student food; forced trade skills (sewing and cooking for females and agriculture for males); and extreme loneliness. Interestingly, extracurricular activities provide a cultural outlet for students trapped in this environment, an opportunity to become visible through excellence.

Defiance frequently serves as a means for dealing with the injustices of this school system. In fact, language constitutes a major form of defiance since the use of the Native language always carries system reprisal. In

general, pockets of resistance are significant at the Kamloops Indian Residential School, caused in the main by efforts to control through oppression. The actions of students involved in these resistance activities must be viewed as the actions of strong people against a system which degraded and dehumanized.

Inevitably time arrives for students to leave the residential school: sent home due to illness; completion of formal educational requirements, and even death. For many the return home is not easy, sometimes resulting in clashes with parents and siblings, or outright rejection of home or by the home. In later years, differences between traditional Shuswap and Catholic emphases will contribute to confusion over matters such as sexual relationships, language, religious faith and parental responsibility.

In retrospect, the most poignant theme emerging from these personal experiences of former Native students is the extent and complexity of their resistance to the injustices of an educational system designed to control and transform them into a stereotyped Euro-Canadian image of an obedient Native. *Resistance and Renewal* presents a story of clashes within a residential school between invaders and a staunch resistance. We are also given a first hand look at cultural invasion as a means of imposing power over Native peoples. That the Kamloops Indian Residential School and schools like it have now disappeared bears testimony to the ability of Native students to have survived this ordeal through their resistance, to have grown up and to have played a leadership role in changing the system. *Resistance and Renewal*, a powerful and gripping disclosure of failure in Native education, is a reading necessity for educators and public alike.

D. L. Treslan
Faculty of Education
Memorial University of Newfoundland
St. John's, Newfoundland
Canada, A1B 3X8

King, Edna and Jordan Wheeler: *Adventure on Thunder Island*. Toronto: James Lorimer and Co., 1991.

Adventure on Thunder Island is a collection of four short stories for children. All four stories present refreshingly positive and sensitive portrayals of Native children by Native authors. The stories stand on their own merits as good stories yet also present a non-stereotyped view of Native children. Each story deals in some way with personal struggles that both

Native and non-Native children should relate to. Both authors take an optimistic view of children's problems without denying the reality of their hardships and fears.

"Adventure on Thunder Island," by Edna King, is the title story in the collection. The three other stories, "The Troll," "The Ebony Forest" and "Pigeon Bridge" are by Jordan Wheeler. All are written in a direct and accessible, indeed perhaps overly simple style. The stories, while about modern children in modern locales, have a strong sense of tradition, incorporating characters from both Native and European cultural heritage (trolls and thunderbirds) as well as details of rural and urban daily life today.

"Adventure on Thunder Island" tells of a young girl, Jessica, who inadvertently goes on a spiritual quest. The raft she is riding on is lost in a storm and washed ashore on the traditionally sacred burial ground of Thunder Island. Cold and frightened, she is cared for by a mysterious young man who says he is "Thunderchild, son of Thunder and son of Moon." In the morning he disappears but leaves her with gifts, both material and spiritual.

"The Troll" and "Pigeon Bridge" are both stories about urban children and deal overtly with racism. In "The Troll," two boys, Jack Waboose and Billy Kwan, allow schoolmates who have excluded and mocked them in the past to play with Jack's frisbee, his most prized possession. Trouble ensues but Jack and Billy ultimately receive a magical reward for their trust and kindness. In "Pigeon Bridge," Troy has also been excluded by other boys because he is Cree. By the end of the story, however, he has proven himself in their eyes and become one of the gang. While the treatment of racism is perhaps overly simplistic, both stories do offer a positive message to young readers.

The fourth story in the collection, "The Ebony Forest," is a ghost story with a happy ending. It is set on a Reserve and, like "Adventure on Thunder Island," has a strong sense of ancestors, traditions and life cycles. Ten-year-old Milton Whitehawk meets a spirit girl in the forest and is able to help her fulfil her quest.

Writing stories which are easy to read yet engaging and exciting is an art. Both King and Wheeler tell down-to-earth stories about ordinary children young readers should relate easily to, yet offer plots rich in fantastical, magical and supernatural events. The main strength of these stories is the successful blending of the everyday and the supernatural, the spiritual and the mundane.

The only weakness of the collection is the very simple writing style of both King and Wheeler. While this does make for easy reading, the rich story content deserves stronger and more poetic prose. The actual stories

are good enough in their plots and themes to motivate children to read them anyway.

Elizabeth Yeoman
Faculty of Education
Memorial University of Newfoundland
St. John's, Newfoundland
Canada, A1B 3X8

Meili, Diane: *Those Who Know: Profiles of Alberta's Native Elders*. Edmonton: NeWest Publishers Limited, 1992, ISBN 0-920897-03-7

This text is a collection of thirty-one profiles of elders representing the Cree, Dene Tha', Stoney, Chipewyan, Siksika (Blackfoot), Kainai (Blood-Blackfoot), Beaver, Sarcee, and Pekuni (North Peigan). The author, herself of Cree ancestry, presents the reader with sensitive insights into the lives and traditions of those most deserving respect and honor within the indigenous communities of Alberta. Although she travelled throughout Asia in her search for spiritual guidance, the author eventually discovered that the most valuable spiritual teachers were life's blessings and trials, important books and wise teachers. The wise teachers could be found within her own homeland among the elders of the various Native communities. This book is a tribute to those elders who model the characteristics worth emulating. The conversational style of the writing is suited to the author's purpose, which is to inspire young people to read it and seek out guidance from elders and to feel proud of their cultural heritage.

There is no apparent order in the sequencing of the chapters, but the reader gets the impression that this is intentional. The author could have presented the profiles in sections representing each Native group in order to develop more depth of knowledge about each group. However, she chose to intermingle the profiles of the elders from the various Native groups. This organizational style is useful because one gets the impression that no one Native group is more important than another. This is interesting considering that there are more profiles of Cree elders than any other group. The presentation style contributes to an overall impression of the relatedness of people to each other and of the finest qualities of elders: spiritual and prayerful, generous, gentle, kind, hardworking, compassionate, humble, and respectful towards other living things which also have spirit. From the organizational style employed, the reader is left with a greater understanding of elders rather than of each Native group and after all, that was the author's purpose.

The profiles present such diverse topics as: current and former economic conditions in Native communities, traditional education and tribal

stories, Native wisdom, language, respectful behaviour, material culture, wholistic thinking, community spirit, memories of hardship punctuated by happy times, life in the bush, resourcefulness in feeding families, healing, life and death.

The elders represented here are able to comment on many changes which they have observed in the world around them throughout their lives, which span many decades. Living close to nature they have seen unprecedented environmental destruction. Many have seen the dramatic changes in fish populations in the northern lakes and streams caused by the dumping of toxic chemicals by pulp and paper mills. Elders have observed the thinning and dying of trees and depletion of berries which have been valuable sources of food to their communities over the centuries as well as the decline in the world fur market which had made Fort Chipewyan the "emporium of the north." Clearly an environmental message is within this text: insensitivity to Earth and the indigenous people as well as unsafe development will destroy us all. In addition the elders have seen the terrible destructive force of a variety of social illnesses such as alcoholism, smoking, and drug use which have plagued their communities since contact with the Europeans. Their response to these problems is "return to traditional values."

The reader also can develop an understanding of changes in transportation technology since the early 1900s and the effects on Native communities. One is able to feel the fright at seeing an airplane for the first time while out in the bush as described by Victoria MacDonald (Chipewyan) and can begin to understand what it must have been like for the elders to see paddle wheeler steamboats and Ford motor cars for the first time.

A picture of each elder accompanies each profile, an elder with a drum here, one with a hide being skinned there, another sitting at a kitchen table or one in front of a traditional tipi, etc. A map of Alberta is given at the beginning of the text with the various Reserves marked on it for easy reference.

Clearly this is a valuable contribution to the literature in Native Studies. The effort in researching and preparing these profiles is admirable and young people should be encouraged to read the text since it may encourage them to appreciate the wisdom which elders have gained over a lifetime of living.

Susan K. Ahearn
Faculty of Education
Memorial University of Newfoundland
St. John's, Newfoundland
Canada, A1B 3X8

Minor, Kit: *Issumatuq: Learning from the Traditional Healing Wisdom of the Canadian Inuit*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1992, 110 pp., ISBN 1-895686-05-9.

Dr. Minor is an Associate Professor in the School of Social Work at Lakehead University in Thunder Bay, Ontario, and her book is primarily directed to persons interested in social work. It is based on the author's doctoral dissertation, which in turn came out of her 10 year's experience in the Canadian Arctic as a social worker with the Inuit. She helped the Inuit develop social service training and programmes based on the traditional strengths of their own culture.

The basic idea of the book, as outlined in the Introduction, is that culture-specific helping systems are the most effective. In particular, she argues that the Inuit were very successful for millennia in surviving physically, spiritually, and emotionally, and that any social work programmes for them should build upon these strengths and should be developed primarily by the people themselves. This is a very sensible premise and one that I have seen work well in educational projects involving Native people in Canada and also in Africa and Asia.

Her particular "culture-specific design" is presented in the Introduction and Appendix One and provides the structure for the rest of the book. It involves three levels: (I) physical survival of the group, (IIA) psychological and social survival of the group, (IIB) external influences upon the culture, and (III) the individual. Each level includes from one to sixteen specific cultural categories. I find this model very unconvincing. Why any specific thing is in any specific level is not fully explained or argued; often no reasons at all are given. The author offers her design as being drawn from Inuit concepts and world view, but fails to offer sufficient linguistic or ethnographic evidence for its "culture-specific" nature.

There seem to be severe structural problems with the tiered levels of the culture specific design. It is not clear what these are levels of, or that they are levels at all. For example, it is said of the items in Level II that they "are defined in a consequential relationship to Level III (p.16), yet in Level I we find spiritual beliefs, the concept of souls, and philosophy, while Level II includes language and thought patterns. How beliefs, concepts, and philosophy could be prior to language and thought patterns is beyond me, and Minor does not attempt to explain. Similarly, that philosophy is classed a physical survival factor (Level I) while storytelling falls under psychological and social survival factors in the consequent Level II is very strange on the face of it.

Fortunately, the rest of the book is much clearer and better than the Introduction. Chapter One is an eleven page appreciation of the traditional

survival skills of the Inuit; Chapter Two details some of their important social and psychological assets in fifteen pages; Chapter Three takes eighteen pages to review four hundred years of contact between Inuit and Europeans with especial attention given to missionaries; and Chapter Four devotes twelve pages to discussing the problems of contemporary Inuit youth within their group. The summary section is very clear and makes clear how the culture-specific model shaped the structure of the book but fails to resolve the theoretical problems.

The first three chapters are drawn primarily from secondary sources, supplemented with material from the author's arctic experience. While they are well written and often insightful, they are generally too short to do justice to their topics. The fourth chapter is considerably more original and more interesting as it is based on her field experience in social work. In particular there is an illuminating discussion of the phenomenon of suicide amongst contemporary Inuit youth contrasted with traditional Inuit theories and practices.

In Chapter Two, there is an interesting discussion of traditional Inuit healing, based on three Inuit concepts. First is *ajurnarmat*: "things are the way they are and it makes no practical sense to despair over something that has already occurred or cannot be changed" (p.53). Second is the "art of silence," the silent supportive acceptance by the group of difficult circumstances (pp.54-55), and third is *issumatuq*: the person who has the ability to reason, mastery of the physical and social environment, and thus the ability to help and heal other members of the community (pp.56-59). These three, she argues, "have been tested by time and reality" and should be the basis for any helping programmes for the Inuit. She skilfully uses these concepts in her discussions of practical problems confronting the contemporary Inuit.

This is quite a short book, and I wish there had been considerably more in it about the specific social service projects that were developed using the author's culture specific method. The bibliography does not lead the reader to more information on these important practical manifestations of her work. Although too much of the book consists of flawed theorizing and simplified background material, her good-hearted and intelligent culture-specific approach is well worth consideration. The parts of the book which come directly out of Minor's professional and personal experiences in the North stand far above the rest.

Robert E. Florida
Department of Religion
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

Monet, Don and Skanu'u (Ardythe Wilson): *Colonialism on Trial: Indigenous Land Rights and the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en Sovereignty Case*. Philadelphia, PA and Gabriola Island, British Columbia: New Society Publishers, 1992, xii + 212 pp. Paper.

This volume can best be characterized as a scrapbook of photographs, sketches, court transcripts and newspaper reports on the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en sovereignty case, collated by political cartoonist Don Monet, with chapter introductions and explanations by Gitksan researcher and speaker Skanu'u (Ardythe Wilson).

The introduction to the book is by way of prefaces by both Monet and Skanu'u, a couple of pages by Michael Jackson termed "A Legal overview: The Case in Context," and the 1884 statement of claim to their lands by the Gitwangak Chiefs. This material provides a framework for what follows. In his preface, Don Monet identifies an important objective of his work: "I freely admit that I am not an unbiased, dispassionate reporter...I am an engaged, political cartoonist, supporting the cause of justice for the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en people" (1992:v). While Jackson's "overview" does not provide a context of emerging legal opinions about Aboriginal rights in Canada, it does emphasize the uniqueness of the trail in the nature and scope of Indian evidencia. The 1884 statement by the Chiefs emphasizes the longstanding nature of the claim.

The book then walks the reader through the trial. Each chapter is introduced by Skanu'u, who summarizes events and their significance for the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en people. In all the chapters, the text is interspersed with sketches of participants, cartoons, explanations of courtroom procedures and the significance of testimony, newspaper clippings and photographs.

The first chapter presents milestones in the colonization of North America with some of the major events in Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en history. Chapter 2 describes the first two months of the trial in Smithers, B.C., with the claim against the Crown, the address of the Chiefs, the opening statements by the lawyers for the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en, and excerpts from the Chiefs' testimonies. Chapter 3 continues with this witness after Chief Justice McEachern moved the trial 1,200 km. south to Vancouver, deeming "the inconvenience to the court to be greater than that of the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en" (1992:52).

These chapters, comprising 86 pages, are the strongest portion of the volume. The Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en people were convinced that, for the court to comprehend the full dimension of their legal rights, it must understand and respect their world view. Much of the evidence consisted of the

Chief's oral record of their histories, their laws and institutions, their relationship to their territory, and their social and economic fabric underlain by a kinship system based on reciprocity. The excerpts from the legal transcripts portray a rich and vibrant Aboriginal society and culture, and strongly demonstrate that this culture continues to affect all aspects of everyday life for the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en. The text also reveals the costs of opening up sacred histories for dissection, belittlement and disbelief in the court.

As Skanu'u explains, "expert" witnesses were needed because the courts do not allow oral history to stand on its own. Chapter 4 (36 pages) describes scientific data and opinion covering the time period referred to by the Chiefs and supporting their evidence.

Chapter 5, titled "Pioneers, Perfiders and Cultural Ghouls: Expert Witnesses for British Columbia," is comparatively short (18 pp.). This section provides excerpts from the province's statement of defense interpreted through cartoons, and presents gaffes, inconsistencies and outrageous claims by provincial lawyers, experts and witnesses. In Chapter 6, "Expert Witnesses for Canada" (8 pp.), the reader learns that the evidence introduced by federal lawyers included 200 Wills and estate files from parents and grandparents of Chiefs and Elders who had taken the stand—not only a massive invasion of privacy but an abuse of confidentiality and the fiduciary relationship between the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en people and the federal government. Chapter 7 contains excerpts from the arguments and closing statements of Chiefs, the Province and the Court.

In Chapter 8, Chief Justice McEachern's decision and excerpts from the reasons for the judgment are presented. In the context of the material in the rest of the book, the judgment comes as a shock. It contains statements like: "The most striking thing that one notices in the territory... is its emptiness" (p.187); "aboriginal life in the territory was, at best, "nasty, brutish and short" (p.187-8); "Aboriginal life, in my view, was far from stable and it stretches credulity to believe that remote ancestors considered themselves bound to specific lands" (p.188); and "I am quite unable to say that there was much in the way of precontact social organization among the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en simply because there is so little reliable evidence" (p.191). The book does not end here, however, and there is a Postscript which demonstrates other forms of resistance and the commitment of the Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en peoples to continue to assert sovereignty over their lands.

The strengths of this volume are its vivid presentation of Aboriginal culture, and the way it makes court proceedings accessible—even entertaining and humorous at times. It also forcefully demonstrates the biases

against Aboriginal worldviews and histories in western courts of law. However, the presentation of excerpts from legal transcripts often makes the testimony seem like a collection of fragments, and there is a clear bias against the province and the federal government—a bias which Monet freely admits to. What this work does not do is present the case in the context of recent Canadian legal decisions. The McEachern judgment was shocking, not only in light of Gitksan and Wet'suwet'en testimony, but also in light of recent Supreme Court decisions which have interpreted Aboriginal rights and the use of evidence in ways which are much more favorable to Aboriginal peoples.

While this volume is limited in its usefulness for the specialist and may be too detailed and assume too much knowledge about the case for the general reader, it would make good supplementary material for courses on Native Law and Aboriginal rights in Canada. It may also be appropriate in Anthropology and Sociology courses which entertain ideas about different ways of seeing the world and of using evidence. Finally, the volume would work very well in high schools, possibly for Native students as a reaffirmation of their values, cultures and experiences, and for non-Native students in areas, such as British Columbia, where there are ongoing land claims.

Evelyn Peters
Department of Geography
Queen's University
Kingston, Ontario
Canada, K7L 3N6

Ross, Rupert: *Dancing with a Ghost*, Markham, Ontario: Octopus Publishing Group, 1992, 195 pp.

The participation of Objibwe Elders in the administration of justice in Northwestern Ontario is an imaginative approach to cross-cultural adaptation described in this book. The reader also catches a glimpse of social ills including alcohol abuse, family dysfunctions and Third World conditions in Canada.

The author does not spell out solutions to every ailment, but he does say something about Aboriginal peoples as they are being dragged into the urban civilization of the dominant society.

This is also a book about a vision of man and knowledge of the world as a spiritual as well as a physical place. It is about feeling the spirit within living things. For those who have been removed from nature, or who have

adopted material thinking and shunted the spiritual plane aside, it may be bizarre reading.

In its author's modest view, this book is an attempt at acknowledging and understanding the chasm separating Native and Euro-Canadian cultures. Drawing on his own experience as an Assistant Crown Attorney for the District of Kenora, Rupert Ross observes behaviour and theorizes with guidance from Elders such as Charlie Fisher, Ontario's first Native Justice of the Peace, and Dr. Clare Brant, a Mohawk psychiatrist.

Beyond observing, Ross has learned to listen, thereby "earning his learning," and he has found much to value in traditional Native teaching.

Kitchi-Manitou has given us a different understanding (Red Jacket).

The reader discovers that the Native difference is rooted in the fundamental belief that human beings are creatures of goodness endowed with a sense of self-worth, equality and respectful pride sprung from the vision of Kitchi-Manitou, Creator of the universe. In emulating Him, people strive to enhance their gifts and those of others. Accordingly, one extends a helping hand, and respectfully counsels or redirects behaviour. These principles of honour and respect contrast sharply with adversarial courtroom behaviour where charges, examination, conviction and sentencing procedures attack an individual's sense of worth and truthfulness, and break him away from the community, ostracizing him for his transgression rather than redirecting and readmitting him to his community.

Until you see through the rules, you can only see the rules (R. D. Laing).

The first impression often imparted by Natives is one of a silent people not given to displays of emotion. Beyond the misunderstandings this may cause in everyday encounters, the lawyer author considers the implications in judiciary proceedings where keeping mum is viewed as evasive behaviour at best. Ross reveals that there are social rules and values behind this taciturnity.

Although it is practically impossible to view the world through the eyes of a person belonging to another culture, Dr. Clare Brant's points of analysis are developed in four intertwined ethics.

The first, *the ethic of non-interference*, explains that confronting someone or even commenting on his behaviour is considered rude. It follows that testifying in court is not only unpleasant, it is a further wrong. Not that telling the truth is wrong. On the contrary. In the Native perspective, one must acknowledge his wrongdoing in order to be reinstated into the group. Indeed, there is no judiciary "right to silence" in order to avoid incrimination,

or pleading “not guilty” as a way of forcing the Crown to prove guilt, because this is seen to place undue burden on other people.

On another level, the rule of non-interference requires parents to allow children to decide for themselves, learning on their own by observing and emulating proper behaviour, both moral and practical. However demanding of the learner, this way of acquiring wisdom and skills is not an absence of education, although it harkens to a more simple family-centered social organization. Moreover, one should not conclude that the rule of non-interference precludes discussion of public matters. It does, however, offer an alternative to the usual Western form of debate, face to face, often adversarial argumentation. Instead, Native communal decision-making results from a public process of “joint-thinking” where not arriving at a decision is better than an imposed decision. For instance, in the 1990 debate on the Meech Lake Accord, further to extensive consultation with many other Natives, Elijah Harper stood against that constitutional proposal, thereby reflecting the lack of consensus on the issue, and effectively setting it aside. In this process, there is no absolute truth to be emitted by superior intellects; only a common agreement that the truth as experienced by the speakers has been expressed as accurately as possible given one’s perceptions and communication skills.

Entirely consistent with the rule against criticism, the *ethic that anger not be shown* extends to showing feelings of grief and sorrow, since that too would be burdening others. In the context of Band life predicated on survival in the wilderness, there was no usefulness in self-indulgence of this kind. Nevertheless, the rule is extraneous to court proceedings and rehabilitation programs. Hence Natives often cannot behave according to these foreign rules. Perhaps they could be asked how they see and do things. Ross cites the example of a man whose son had been struck by a gravel truck, and who refused to assist in the prosecution. Forgiveness too is not showing anger.

Rooted in wilderness survival where hard work and sharing are a necessity, *the ethic respecting praise and gratitude* is the acknowledgment that doing one’s best is the only norm; trial and error, a luxury nobody can afford; and proper appreciation, a simple nod. Hence, a child is expected to observe over and over how things are done until he knows all aspects of a given task. When viewed in this perspective, the apparent sullen and passive attitude of people quietly preparing for action is more likely to be deemed prudent mindfulness.

Understanding the need for acting successfully in harsh, pitiless circumstances allows for a better understanding of the notion that *the time must be right*. This is the essential mental skill setting in motion all of the

knowledge acquired through the senses while living on and with the Earth and leading to the conclusion "Now": the berries are as ripe as they will get this year.

When you know things because you have *felt* them, you know them as alive, as having their own life, their own spirit (p.83)

Unfortunately, people who understand the world as a place where a person's survival depends on when he *feels* things to be right rather than on a series of cause and effect things and events of man's making may experience some difficulty in adapting to town and city life.

In order to understand the peculiar juncture in history Natives are grappling with, it should be known that the societies in which they live in Northwestern Ontario are recent fabrications. Traditional life in the bush is still within memory's reach, and being assembled in year-round multi-family communities is a new social context created by a no-doubt well-intentioned government. The fact remains that the Anishnabae have been deprived of the self-sufficiency and self-respect they previously derived from a way of life predicated on life-preserving problem-solving and family-bound social skills.

Paradoxically, the social and economic exigencies of traditional life in the bush which seem so constraining of individual autonomy, provided freedom from interference, advice and orders. Survival in the wilderness demands a multitude of free choices by all members of the Band. In the new northern communities, most choices—jobs, housing, schools—are made by others. Indeed, the demand for self-government may be more a matter of insisting on being given an opportunity for being left alone than for making laws, which is deemed to be interference in an individual's affairs rather than promoting the well-being of a society. This should come as no surprise, since there has not been time to evolve consensus on the things that give an individual a sense of belonging to a wider community.

It is also emphasized that what is at risk is the burgeoning family-centered Native community. As it develops, the people are forced to learn new ways to deal with strangers and foreigners; not only directly, but through the media, especially television as it impacts on children. As yet, Native parents too are seeking an appropriate way to respond to this invasion of family values. There is a need to find a way of preserving the culture, of imparting to children a sense of who they are before they leave the community, lest they be lost to themselves and their brothers. However, the only certain thing in that what guaranteed the observance of traditional ethics, the threat of starvation, has been removed by a paternalistic Big Brother.

Something else has been lost to many, that is the integrated existence

with the land, the family and the spiritual world. Moreover, it is feared that the compartmentalized Western life will prevent the people from becoming whole again. Yet, they manage to cope with the travails of life. Perhaps surprisingly, since many of the instruments for coping with grief, anger, and sorrow have been denigrated or long prohibited. These include the pipe, sweet-grass and sweat-lodge ceremonies which proved useful over the ages, and are now being reintegrated, along with disclosure of private emotions as it gains approval in some circles and is being adapted for use by the Anishnabae. Perhaps these means of coping will replace alcohol as a vent for pent-up emotions. Perhaps also the very size of the small Native communities will be an advantage in promoting the complete health of the individuals who comprise it.

Extending the Native approach to family-centered integration and rehabilitation to the community, even to all communities, will mark the real difference between Native culture and Western civilization. This, of course, is not yet achieved. Survival, however, demands listening to the values and rules within that have always been there, shared by diverse groups. Becoming aware of them is a source of growing self-esteem. Carrying these cultural traits over into the broader sphere of social and political organization, by consensus, may remind everyone of the interdependence of all people.

The holistic approach to social problems is evident in a 1990 report by the Ontario Native Women's Association on physical and sexual abuse of women that recommends that "healing houses" be set up for women, children and men. This dealing with the total social environment where all the parts are valued and the family-oriented attitude is extended to the community stems from the premise that everyone is a person in the making.

Assistance from others is further described in relating the part played by Elders joining the Court at Sandy Lake. Having met with the accused, the victim and the families in advance, the Elders rarely speak about the offense or punishment. They concentrate on "making things right again," on community respect through contributions of work and restitution in order to allow the accused's goodness and strength to reveal itself. The emphasis is on a person's progress toward self-actualization, and on what steps to take in order to root out the inner problems that cause the individual to break social ties that bond him to his community. The effort is to restore harmony and unity, not to aggravate isolation. This helping hand reveals the underlying belief that a person's success is equated with his attainment of an attitude of respect for the last of Kitchi-Manitou's children, men and women.

The problems confronting Natives are enormous: unemployment, substance abuse, an unfair justice system, alienating television, lack of defer-

ence to Elders, decisions imposed from the outside...loss of respect. All of these contribute to deepening the abyss between cultures, and between generations of Anishnabae as they are drawn into the White man's world. Everyone, however, must adapt in this collision between cultures, even in the previously remote, isolated communities of Northwestern Ontario. There is no returning to the primeval forest. Fortunately, the basic belief in the goodness of the Creator's children nourishes the culture and sustains adaptation.

The fact that these same challenges face all people may even someday bring White men and women to adopt certain Native ways. Not that all people will or should be indistinctly similar, but rather that differences will be recognized as the cultural gene pool that will insure survival against the menace of the cultural wilderness threatening North America.

Naturally, there is no consensus on this opinion. Everyone will agree, however, that our justice system, for example, is doing poorly at rehabilitating and at deterring crime. Surely, there must be a better way. We could do worse than allowing respected Elders—laymen, not specialists—to play an active role in the administration of justice. This, however, is no revolutionary measure. It probably saves dollars, too, by cutting down on prison costs, parole and the like. It is even possible that further experimenting in this area will be attempted. After all, maybe everyone does not need to conform to an absolute countrywide rule of conduct for judiciary proceedings. Perhaps the Criminal Code itself should be revised or replaced...But that is the topic of some forthcoming book.

The overall problem of cultural contact is more mundane, and I am reminded that a few years ago, in Northern Manitoba, I was talking with a group of Natives including a young woman recently returned from Montreal. She had left the city, she said, because there were just too damn many people.

Everyone in the room roared with laughter.

Just too damn many people to talk to, let alone listen to, have a relationship or agree with. Indeed, the collision of Native and Western cultures is a loaded numbers game. Native culture has suffered from it, both in the conflicts and wars between Natives and Whites, and in the evolution of the culture of Aboriginal peoples as urbanization extends into the far reaches of the hinterland.

Because the process is inexorable, I am glad to see that there are people like Rupert Ross who respect the profound differences in people. The pragmatic changes he is willing to accept in the rules of legal administration are witness to his vision of human dignity. He is not so naive as to propound the myth of the noble savage, but neither does he lose faith in

what could appear to be a “solitary, poor, nasty and brutish” life. Changing the system from within, even ever so slightly, requires these qualities.

Also, it is only fitting that a man of heart should benefit from a foreword such as the one crafted for this book by Basil Johnston. Not only does it grasp the book's intent, it elevates it, and promotes its understanding by revealing the spiritual plane that gives the book its true scope.

The spirit that haunts this book dances on the borderline of Western urban civilization. Students of the separate realities in Canada will enjoy the gambol.

Ronald Henry
School of Translators and Interpreters
Laurentian University
Sudbury, Ontario
Canada, P3E 2C6

Thornton, Russell: *The Cherokees: A Population History*. Lincoln, University of Nebraska Press, 1990, 237 pp. ISBN 0-8032-9410-7 (paper). Cloth, U.S. \$35.00.

This book is, as stated in its subtitle, a population history of the Cherokee Indians. The numbers of Cherokees at different times is what Thornton primarily seeks to establish, and he does that meticulously. Of course, population numbers cannot be presented in a vacuum, and therefore this book also contains much information on the culture history of the Cherokees beyond their population numbers. We learn, for instance, that by 1760 the Cherokee already “had a prodigious number of excellent horses” (p.36) and that by the first decades of the nineteenth century they kept both cattle and hogs foraging in the woodlands that separated Cherokee villages—and by then also individual farmsteads—from each other (pp.55-56).

By the second and third decades of the 19th century the Cherokees were involved with their own state formation with formal democratic institutions:

At this same time the Cherokees were becoming formally organized more or less as a “state”. In 1817 they created a bicameral legislature...and ten years later...they held a constitutional convention at [their capital of] New Echota...and developed a national constitution (p.56).

As is well known, but only incidentally mentioned by Thornton, the Cherokee had by then also acquired a written language (developed by Sequoyah in 1809-1821). Although such cultural innovations qualified the Cherokees as a "civilized tribe" in the eyes of the encroaching Euro-Americans, and perhaps also helped them to attain legal recognition as a "nation"—albeit a "domestic" and "dependent" one—before the U.S. Supreme Court (in the 1831 decision on the case *Cherokee Nation v. Georgia*), it did not prevent their wholesale removal from their ancestral homeland to make room for White settlement in 1835-38.¹ Thornton also traces, in considerable detail and with the aid of maps, the shrinkage of the Cherokee homeland in the face of advancing White settlement during the century preceding that removal.

Prior to their removal to Oklahoma, a relatively small number of Cherokees (and most of them were Cherokee-White mixed-bloods) had acquired large landholdings (plantations) which they worked with Black slaves. When these Cherokees moved to Oklahoma they generally took their slaves along, and admixture with these Afro-Americans amongst them (who all became "freedmen" in 1863) resulted in what Thornton calls the Red-Black Cherokees. Admixture with Euro-Americans was still much more common and resulted in the Cherokees becoming a largely *Métis* population.

The most incisive event in Cherokee history was their removal to Oklahoma in 1835-38, an early example of the "ethnic cleansing" we hear so much about today, and Thornton discusses that population transfer and its devastating demographic effects in great detail. He concludes that the "mortality from the Trail of Tears...seems even more severe than heretofore realized" (p.76).

Several thousand Cherokees avoided being removed from their Appalachian homeland. These "Eastern Cherokees" were subsequently granted a small reservation in western North Carolina. Ironically, it is the only Cherokee Reservation in existence today, because the much more extensive Cherokee land base in Oklahoma was privatized through "allotment" early in this century and subsequently largely lost to Cherokee ownership. The eastern Cherokees, descendants of those who were not removed to Oklahoma, now number about 9,000 and are organized formally as the Eastern Band of Cherokees. The enrolled descendants of those who were removed to Oklahoma, known as the Western Cherokees, now number close to 100,000 but are split ideologically into two organizations: (1) the Cherokee Nation of Oklahoma, numbering about 90,000, and (2) the United Keetoowah Band of Cherokee Indians in Oklahoma, with about 7,500 members (p.1). Yet, as Thornton informs us, in the 1980 U.S. census the

Cherokee population in the United States was, based on the principle of self-identification, enumerated as 232,344. If we accept all of these "Census Cherokees" as bona fide Cherokees, and Thornton insists that we should (p.175), then the Cherokees rather than the Navajo (as is generally claimed) are now the largest Indian "nation" in North America (Jarvenpa, 1988:32).

Moreover, many people who did not claim a Cherokee Indian identity in the 1980 census still claim some degree of Cherokee antecedence—what Thornton discusses as the "Cherokee grandmother phenomenon" (p.172). On the other hand, over 36,000 (or 15.6%) of those who claimed to be Cherokees in the 1980 census claimed no Indian ancestry, and another 11.4% claimed to be mostly non-Indian in ancestry. Only about half (50.7%) of those who identified as Cherokees in the 1980 census also claimed to have an exclusively Indian ancestry (p.163). Indeed, Cherokee intermarriage with other races, primarily with Euro-Americans (Whites), has been going on for centuries. Thornton traces the first Cherokee-White intermarriage back to 1690 (p.20) and in the Appendix, written by C. Matthew Snipp and Nancy Breen, it is pointed out that a famous 19th century Cherokee chief, John Ross, was mostly of Scottish ancestry and "only about one-eighth Cherokee" (p.196). The Cherokees' unusually high degree of admixture with non-Indians was undoubtedly facilitated by their geographical dispersal as well as their long period of proximity and intensive contact with people of European and, to a lesser extent, African ancestry.

Census Cherokees are now found in every state of the United States, and 32 states had over 1,000 people identifying as Cherokees in the 1980 census. A considerable number of these "census Cherokees" obviously switched to a Cherokee identity during the 1970s. As pointed out in the Appendix, the proportion of U.S. Indians who identified as Cherokees doubled during the 1970s, from 8.7% in 1970 to 17.0% in 1980 (p.199), thus placing the Cherokee ahead of the Navajo in population size. A most amazing growth in the census Cherokee population was registered in California, where the Cherokee population enumerated increased from a mere 258 in 1930 to 51,394 in the 1980 census (p.148). Consequently Thornton now considers California as a third major concentration of Cherokee population, besides North Carolina and Oklahoma, although he also refers to "the low Indianness of the California Cherokee" (p.166)—because in the 1980 census only 40.7% of those identifying as Cherokees in that state claimed an exclusively Indian ancestry. And here too, as in so many other aspects of North American culture, California provides us a glimpse of what is yet to come elsewhere. Thornton therefore concludes that, if

present trends continue, the Cherokee “represent a prototype for the demographic future of American Indians” (p.177). That is, as Thornton puts it in his concluding sentence: “Perhaps ultimately most, if not all, Indian blood, to quote the Cherokee John Ridge, `will win[d] its courses in beings of fair complexions.” However, such increasing racial admixture does not necessarily mean that Indian identity will cease to exist. It may, however, shift away from tribal affiliations to a Pan-Indian identity (Jarvenpa, 1988:42-43).

Thornton does justice to his subject matter. His thorough study is based on an obviously extensive reading of the relevant literature—Thornton lists close to 200 sources in his bibliography—as well as some private family information (both documents and oral history) from his Cherokee antecedents. Although himself a Cherokee, Thornton discusses the travails of the Cherokee with remarkable detachment and great objectivity. Only occasionally does Thornton become explicitly normative, telling us what should be, as when he writes with reference to the “Cherokee grandmother phenomenon”: “They seem proud of it, and so they should be” (p.173).

Five maps, most of them with a linear map scale provided, greatly help the reader follow Thornton's detailed discussion. No less than 53 tables (the fifty-third is in the end-notes) are also included, as one might expect in an essentially demographic study such as this. Thornton generally discusses the main points of these tables in the text, but often not as fully as one might like. In this reviewer's opinion, Thornton has a tendency to stay too close to his sources, both quantitative and qualitative (direct quotes). He rarely ventures to speculate or theorize as to meaning or causation. In this regard Thornton's approach to history seems to follow the now somewhat discredited “historicist” school of L. von Ranke, who insisted that historians should restrict themselves to describing “how it really was” (*wie es eigentlich gewesen*).²

Nevertheless, in this reviewer's opinion, Thornton's monograph is a valuable contribution to the history and sociology of what is today North America's largest Indian nation, one that, although perhaps atypical today in its degree of geographic dispersion and racial admixture, may very well prove to be the prototype for the future of the other Indian nations in North America. This book definitely merits a place on the bookshelf of anyone interested in Native history.

Alvin Kienetz
Box 402
The Pas, Manitoba
Canada, R9A 1K5

Notes

1. I earlier discussed parallel displacements of relatively acculturated indigenous peoples, of Khoi Khoi (formerly known as Hottentot) ancestry, in the face of White settlement in southern Africa. See Kienetz, 1977; 1983.
2. Cited in Carr, 1964:8.

References

Carr, E.H.

1964 *What is History?* Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Kienetz, Alvin

1983 The Rise and Decline of Hybrid (Métis) Societies on the Frontier of Western Canada and Southern Africa. *The Canadian Journal of Native Studies* 3(1):3-21.

1977 The Key Role of the Orlam Migrations in the Early Europeanization of South-West Africa. *International Journal of African Historical Studies* 10:553-572.

Jarvenpa, Robert

1988 The Political Economy and Political Ethnicity of American Indian Adaptations and Identities, pp. 29-48, in Richard D. Alba (Editor): *Ethnicity and Race in the U.S.A.: Toward the Twenty-First Century*. New York: Routledge.

Titley, E. Brian: *A Narrow Vision: Duncan Campbell Scott and the Administration of Indian Affairs in Canada*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1986, paperback reprint, 1992, viii + 245 pp. Paper, ISBN 0-7748-0420-3.

Recent developments in the area of Aboriginal self-determination have permanently redefined the relationship between the federal government and First Nations. 19th century paternalism and overtones of the "White man's burden" have, hopefully, given way to more appropriate forms of interaction. The legacy of enforced dependency, created by the Department of Indian Affairs in the late 1800s as the accepted method for assimilating the "Indians," has given rise to modern ideas of inherent rights, demands for power-sharing and a new vision of the treaties. E. Brian Titley, an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Education at the University of

Lethbridge, has undertaken the analysis of the Victorian mindset of early Canadian Indian policy-makers by examining the ideas and attitudes of Duncan Campbell Scott, one of the main contributors to the Department's plans for the "Indians." Not meant as biography, *A Narrow Vision* describes the development of Indian policy during the early years of the 20th century. Titley's intention is to describe the role played by Scott and, in the process, to show how federal Indian policy impacted on the lives of the people it was meant to regulate.

Duncan Campbell Scott was a poet who earned his living as an advisor to the Minister in charge of Indian Affairs. He was for over twenty years the framer of policies designed to assimilate the Indian. More importantly, he also acted as the interpreter of Indian needs to the politicians of the day. Typically a Victorian, Scott was intrigued by Indians and "they remained objects of curiosity to him throughout his life" (p.23). His real interest, however, remained the arts and for most of his time as the administrator for Indian Affairs his life did not centre around his work but, rather, with his contacts in the literary world. His primary concern with his charges was that they would become "civilized" according to the precepts defined by the Canadian norm and that in the process they should also be ready to accept a proper role in Canadian society. Above all else, they had to adapt successfully to agriculture or wage labour in order to reduce the burden on the public purse. More concerned with regulating expenditures for Indians than with what the Indians felt about or wanted from their relationship with Canada, Scott was the archetypical Canadian Victorian civil servant. In his world, paternal guidance, firmly maintained, would succeed where all else had failed and, in his opinion, government Indian policy should reflect such sound principles. In spite of many opportunities to the contrary, Titley manages to avoid directly condemning Scott for actions that were devastating to the people they were meant to control. His intention is to describe Indian policy development, Scott's role in Indian Affairs, Indian reaction to subjugation and in this he succeeds.

Indian resistance plays a major part in Titley's narrative. The First Nations people who were under Scott's guidance had other views from those held by the civil servant. They understood that the particular model of civilization prescribed by the Department was not the best form to which they could have been subjected. Their resistance to policy defined what came to be known as the "Indian Problem." Racial intolerance and ethnocentric attitudes produced decisions which would, at all costs, "civilize" the Indian as rapidly as possible. Every time the Indians discovered a new way to resist, Scott turned to his political masters with requests to amend the *Indian Act*. Not as authoritarian as he might have been, Duncan Campbell

Scott was prepared to persuade if possible but he was also ready to use coercion if necessary. In his perceptions of what constituted the best in society, Scott was a true Victorian and his actions in the Department reflected his firm belief in the power of the British ideal. His struggle with recalcitrant Indians attempting to throw off “the shackles of subjugation and [to] reassert their autonomy and the importance of their own traditions” (p.202) foreshadowed the political struggles of First Nations and Governments in recent years.

Titley has written a useful and timely book which partially makes up for the lack of serious academic study about the formation and proliferation of the Department of Indian Affairs. His portrayal of Scott as the architect of the policy of enforced assimilation also deals with the “narrow vision” of the Canadian Victorian mind when it came to the subject of Indians. Under Scott's capable administration, the *Indian Act* became the tool by which First Nations' resistance was slowly stifled. The same resistance, however, also allowed for the development within the First Nations of a political movement which is currently redefining “Indian” relations with all levels of Government. Inadvertently, Scott's policy decisions also contributed to the modern rebirth of First Nations' traditions and subsequent political activity.

This edition of *A Narrow Vision* is a softcover reprint of an earlier (1986) release and its appearance in this form should make it more readily accessible. The few minor errors in typography (e.g. missing or extra words on pp. 132, 133, 138) are regrettable but do not spoil the overall presentation.

A Narrow Vision is recommended reading for those who need to know about Indian Affairs and its longstanding policy of assimilation by any means possible. It is also recommended to politicians, the civil service and others who may need to refer to it in the future as they attempt to negotiate terms for self-government. More work is needed on the development of Government Indian policy, especially for the 1940-1969 period, but until it appears, Titley's superb book will remain the major contributor to our understanding of Indian policy and Indian reaction to subjugation. Understanding how Canadian Indian policy developed in the early 1900s should help in understanding the much more difficult process of achieving self-government in the 1990s.

Fred J. Shore
Department of Native Studies
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, Manitoba
Canada, R3T 2N2

Vorst, Jesse *et al.* (Editors): *Race, Class, Gender: Bonds and Barriers*. Toronto: Garamond Press in cooperation with the Society for Socialist Studies. Second Edition, 1991, 268 pp. ISBN 0-920059-92-9.

This book, a revision of the fifth annual volume from the Society for Socialist Studies, is a collection of ten articles exploring how race, class, and gender interact to oppress minorities. Tania Das Gupta writes a useful introduction which gives an overview of the contents. The articles are grouped under three subheadings: theoretical and methodological articles (4 articles), historical articles (3 articles), and contemporary struggles (3 articles). The theme was originally explored in a panel discussion on capitalism, patriarchy, and socialism at the 1988 Learned Societies Conference and also at a forum on "Feminism, Critical Theory and the Canadian Legal System," both held at the University of Windsor. Many of the articles in this collection develop the critique of institutionalized feminist studies which surfaced during these meetings. They are an invaluable resource for understanding some of the debates going on among feminist scholars, socialists, and others about the relationship of class, gender, and race to oppression.

The authors of the first group of articles approach their subjects from varying theoretical standpoints, but all authors are critical of mainstream feminists' attempts to define and analyze gender oppression without considering its relationship to oppression based upon race and class. Several authors argue that mainstream feminism, primarily a product of women who are White and privileged, ignores the specific forms of oppression experienced by minority and working class women.

In "Sexism, Racism, and Canadian Nationalism," Roxana Ng holds that oppression based upon gender, race, and class should be traced to social relationships that arise through people's struggles over the means of production and reproduction (p.256). Ng's project is to show how gender, race, and class oppression are constituted "in different historical conjunctures so that the dominant groups maintain their hegemony over the means of production and reproduction." The history of Chinese immigration illustrates Ng's point. At the turn of the century almost no Chinese labourers immigrated to Canada as they were subject to a head tax, but Chinese merchants and their families were permitted to immigrate (p.22). When there was no need of dominant groups for Chinese labour, labourers were discriminated against in comparison to those Chinese who might support and share the same interests as the dominant groups. A similar phenomenon exists today in the preferential treatment given to Hong Kong Chinese and others. Rich Chinese may bypass immigration queues and virtually buy

citizenship through contracting to make substantial investments in Canada. When dominant groups required Chinese labour to build railroads, the labourers were not allowed to bring their wives or families to Canada. Thus, dominant groups obtained cheap labour and also realized their racist aim of ensuring that the Chinese labourers did not reproduce and spread the "yellow menace" (p.18).

In "Focus on Black Women," Esmeralda Thornhill demands that mainstream White feminists recognize the specific forms of oppression suffered by Black and other minority women. Privileged White women themselves often oppressed minority women, as is shown in Agnes Callister's article on the history of female immigration from the Caribbean. Rich White women were often "masters" and immigrant Black women were their "slaves." The latter performed all the unpleasant tasks necessary for a well-functioning household. Thornhill notes that White feminists often draw an analogy between the oppression of women and of Blacks. The use of such an analogy appears to deny the relevance of the specific oppression of Black women to understanding gender oppression. Black women are oppressed both as women and as Blacks, but this double oppression is ignored by White feminists.

Marlee Kline's critique of mainstream feminism is more extended and scholarly than Thornhill's, but no less biting. Kline argues that mainstream feminists such as Nancy Harstock and Nancy Chodorow posit a universal "women's standpoint" and a common gender oppression. Their actual standpoint, however, is often not universal at all, but that of a relatively small group of women like themselves who are White and educated, and who enjoy upper middle class privileges. Their feminist agenda is not shaped by any common gender oppression or by the race and class oppression of minority women, but by the barriers remaining to advancement of their own kind. With this bias, they should not be surprised when women who suffer from racial oppression or class exploitation feel anger toward them instead of solidarity with them.

The historical articles and those which describe contemporary struggles contain many illustrations of many points brought out in the theoretical articles. Ron Bourgeault traces the development of the domination of Indian women from the beginning of the fur trade until 1800. Nicole St-Onge writes about race and class in a Manitoba Métis settlement from 1850-1950. She shows that although a racist ideology pervaded the Oblate missionary accounts of settlement life, their classification of someone as Métis rather than White depended more on economic factors and what part of the settlement he or she lived in than on any actual "racial" features. The Oblates thought that being Métis implied being poor and living in the part

of the settlement where the poor lived. When successful Métis moved to the area where the better off lived they became "White."

Ronnie Leah discusses problems faced by minority women within organized labor. Minorities have often formed their own groups, such as the Ontario Coalition of Black Trade Unionists, to ensure that their specific needs are met by mainstream unions. Leah tells of a CUPE local which managed to unite Blacks and Whites in a successful job action. The final two articles consider the struggles of Métis women in northern Saskatchewan and of Mexican workers in the Maquiladora strip.

There is a short biography of each contributor and useful abstracts of every article. This collection will be of value to all those interested in feminist theory, Marxism, socialism, or race studies.

Ken Hanly
Department of Philosophy
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9