

BOOK REVIEWS

Bright, William (Editor): *The Collected Works of Edward Sapir, Volume V, American Indian Languages I*. Berlin and New York: Mouton deGruyter, 1990, 584 pp., Cloth, \$99.00 (U.S.).

This is a distinguished looking book, with gold letters on dark blue and red; it is securely bound and clearly printed. The first section of the volume is Typology and Classification (pp.21-148), the second, Phonetic Orthography (pp.149-176), the third, Hokan Languages (pp.177-344), the fourth, Uto-Aztecan Languages (pp.345-446), and the fifth Algonkian and Ritwan (pp.447-562). There is also a Preface (pp. 13-14), an Introduction to volumes V and VI by William Bright and Victor Golla (pp.15-17), a most welcome Phonetic Key to Publications of Edward Sapir by William Bright (pp.563-571), and a list of References (pp.573-584).

The recently published Proceedings of the Edward Sapir Centenary Conference (Cowan *et al.*, 1986) is in some sense a massive review of Sapir's writing, including the present volume. In that work Golla (pp.17-40) treats Classification, Langdon (pp.111-146) Hokan-Siouan, Goddard (pp.191-214) Algonquian and Ritwan. This last topic is the only one I know enough about to make a useful contribution to, and hence I will devote the remainder of this review to it.

What is particularly striking to me is how the state of our knowledge about all three branches of Algonquian-Ritwan (hereafter, Algic) has dramatically improved since Sapir wrote *Wiyot and Yurok, Algonkin Languages of California*. This has come in two stages. First, improved data from the field and from Bloomfield's comparative work had greatly changed the situation

1958, when Haas wrote *Algonquian-Ritwan: The End of a Controversy*. Whereas Sapir had to work with very rough phonetic materials, and had no reconstruction of Proto-Algonquian to help him, Haas had the work by Robins (1958) on Yurok, Teeter on Wiyot (later published in 1964), and by Bloomfield (1946) and many others on Algonquian, which simply made most of his data obsolete. The work of this second period is brought to a close by Goddard's paper (mentioned above) which was evidently written before my reconstruction of Proto-Algic phonology (Proulx, 1984), although the publication date is slightly later.

Second, the reconstruction of the phonological system of Proto-Algic at last made it possible to tell with fair confidence what could be cognate

phonologically speaking and what could not. Though some real problems remained chiefly with consonant clusters, contracting sequences, and boundary vowels, one could not in principle state precise phonological correspondences for most cognate sets, segment by segment. Subsequent work has further clarified the situation.

Sapir's work must be seen in the context of the information available to him, scanty and of poor quality. He was aware when he wrote in 1913 that his was only a first step toward the reconstruction of Proto-Algic, that others would follow to correct and improve upon his work. Hence, it seems likely that he felt it his duty to pass along all his insights, every bit of information that might prove useful, even if in so doing he compared many items that ultimately would prove unrelated. Following Goddard's advice-to "settle for a brief, striking demonstration and leave well enough alone" (Goddard, 1986:202)-might indeed have convinced more people, but Sapir knew (or so I infer) that the purpose of linguistic science is not propaganda (convincing people) but the gradual advancement of knowledge.

Goddard's main point about Sapir, if I understand him correctly, is that Sapir placed too great an emphasis on lexical comparisons and not enough on comparisons of structure (semantic or morphological). He divides Sapir's lexical matchings into five classes, graded from "convincing" to "impossible" and concludes that only a small minority are not in the last category.

Time has proved Sapir right. It is of little import that he failed to convince Michelson and many others, who were in any case incapable of advancing research in this area. His material became a gold mine as a "find list" to later scholars, notably Mary Haas, when better materials were brought in from the field. Moreover, had Sapir retained and discarded from his comparisons along the lines that Goddard later suggested, he would have retained some superficially plausible noncognates and discarded some valid cognate sets. Each subsequent scholar is free to make his own choices as he works toward the reconstruction of a protolanguage, but it is very helpful indeed if the original work is all inclusive.

For example, Goddard (1986:199) classifies as "impossible" seven of Sapir's matchings, including the one for 'brush' (Y *ka:p?eʔ*, PA **kepiwi*; Goddard's reconstruction, with no source or supporting data). He states that whereas the former can be segmented the latter cannot, and suggests a possible etymology for the PA form. I fail to understand the reasoning here. Since when does a segmentation or etymology make a word noncognate to another? A Proto-Algic reconstruction of ***kep?*- 'block an opening' and with the respective nominalizers ***-Vʔ* and ***-Vw* (Proulx, nd:298; 304), and the infixing of Y -V? and contraction to Ya: seems quite possible to me. The root would be ***kep?*- 'closed opening': PA **kep-* A728-742, 744-745,

747-757; Y *kepT-* (in *kep?eʔ* 'be deaf', *kep?oʔ* 'there's a barrier', *kep?oʔ nɪp?i?n* 'my nose is blocked', *kep?oksine?m* 'you plug it up [e.g., a rat hole]'). Thus, brush would be 'what one makes a barrier or plugs an opening with'. One might argue that the nominalizations and hence the meanings postdate the protolanguage, but this is surely not material one wishes Sapir had discarded in 1913.

Conversely, the matching Y *?ikiʔ* and PA **-ketekwa* 'knee', which Goddard classifies as "attractive" is as close to impossible as a matching can get. Yet, Sapir could not have known that in 1913, and he did well to publish it. The point is really that until the phonology of the protolanguage is known one does not know what is a possible cognate set and what is not; there is simply no point in speculating about it.

Another way in which Sapir's method is superior to that recommended by Goddard is Sapir's "diffidence" (to use Goddard's word, 1986:202) with regard to structural comparisons. Evidently, Sapir was much more aware than Goddard of the possibility of typological similarity, though (inconsistently) he doesn't hesitate to mention such similarities in *The Algonkin Affinity of Yurok and Wiyot Kinship Terms* in an evident attempt to bolster his thesis of genetic relationship between Algonquian and Wiyot and Yurok. However, Sapir (1990:527) specifically points out that "the distribution of these latter terms is not, to be sure, entirely analogous in Yurok and Algonkin". Goddard (1986:206) avoids this by comparing Yurok directly to Munsee Delaware, dismissing the rest of the Algonquian data which doesn't fit so well.

It is more than a little curious that Goddard should do this, so soon after stating (*Ibid.*:196) that "Proto-Algonquian functions as a filter that strains out of the mass of Algonquian material items and features of individual Algonquian languages that cannot be assigned to the protolanguage and hence are not legitimately available for comparison further afield". This filter principle is another point at which he differs from Sapir (who uses individual Algonquian languages), and again it is Sapir who is right: given a cognate in say, Fox and Yurok, one must reconstruct just as surely as one must reconstruct when faced with cognates in Wiyot and Yurok.

To assert otherwise is to claim that a single attestation of an item in Algonquian is not enough to justify comparison with another branch; if this is true of Algonquian it must be true of the other branches of the family. However, as the other two branches consist of language isolates, this would preclude the possibility of any reconstruction of Proto-Algic whatsoever. This illustrates what Blust (1980:207) calls the principle of necessary consequents: 'the appearance of cognate morphemes in two or more primary subgroups unambiguously implies that the morpheme in question was

present in the common ancestor of the entire group, even if it is not reported in the vast majority of attested languages'. (His example involves reconstructing a Proto-Western Malayo-Polynesian term which has a single descendant, using cognates from more distantly-related languages.)

Returning to structural comparisons, Sapir's "diffidence" is well justified. He compares the set of four Algonquian person prefixes (three of them having two by-forms each), nearly all of which match in the three branches of the family. But all ten of the forms in question involve cognates, and are reconstructible by the regular Comparative Method. A total of 20 phonemes are involved, each an arbitrary link.

It isn't because structures are being compared that reconstruction of this prefix set is convincing; it's convincing because any reconstruction involving 20 phonemes with regular correspondences is overwhelmingly convincing.

Goddard says that Sapir compared Y *micos* 'older brother' to the Algonquian word for 'older sister', and implies he should not have done so since both Yurok and Proto-Algonquian have 'older brother' and 'older sister' terms, which to his mind evidently means the Proto-Algonquian must have too, despite the lack of cognation. However, this doesn't follow at all. There are, after all, thousands of years between the two protolanguages, and more between Yurok and Proto-Algonquian. The Yurok term for 'older brother' is indeed cognate to the Algonquian one for 'older sister', reflecting an 'older sibling' term (**-*mi:hca*) in Proto-Algonquian. It is totally irrelevant that the sex of an older sibling is distinguished in both Yurok and Algonquian: that is simply a typologically common parallel innovation. Goddard's contempt for "comparing syllables across three thousand miles" (1986:207) is actually contempt for the bedrock foundation of the Comparative Method in linguistics, a method Sapir understood and appreciated.

This is seen again when Goddard (1986:206) dismisses Sapir's perfect cognate set of Wiyot and Algonquian terms for 'father, son, daughter' (from **-*ta:na*). Even if reciprocal cross-generation terms are "entirely foreign to Algonquian" as he claims, this does not mean they were absent from Proto-Algonquian (some others are also reconstructible).

If we are to judge by the foregoing, Sapir's work remains relevant to today's methodological issues, at least as regards diachrony. Whether this is entirely a tribute to his genius, or in part a sad commentary on the state of historical linguistics in recent years, is a moot point. It is sad that now that there is high quality data to work with there are few scholars left who still fully understand even the most basic principles of historical method. Any of the old fallacies discarded in the nineteenth century can now be resurrected

as a brilliant new insight, and used to belittle the work of the better scholars who are not around to defend themselves. O tempora! O mores.

This volume, at this price, is not for every scholar's shelf. However, those specializing in the languages dealt with may yet find a good deal in it which later scholarship has missed or wrongly dismissed.

Paul Proulx
 Post Office Box 111
 Heatherton Post Office
 Antigonish Co., Nova Scotia
 Canada, B0H 1R0

References

- Bloomfield, Leonard
 1946 Algonquian, pp. 85-129 in Harry Hoijer (*Editor*): *Linguistic Structures of Native America*. New York: Viking Fund.
- Blust, Robert
 1980 Early Austronesian Social Organization: The Evidence of Language. *Current Anthropology* 21:205-226.
- Cowan, William; Michael K. Foster and Konrad Koerner (Editors)
 1986 Proceedings of the Edward Sapir Centenary Conference. *Studies in the History of the Language Sciences* 41. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Goddard, Ives
 1986 Sapir's Comparative Method. New Perspectives in Language, Culture, and Personality, pp. 191-215 in William Cowan, Michael K. Foster, Konrad Koerner (*Editors*): *Studies in the History of the Language Sciences* 41. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Haas, Mary R.
 1958 Algonkian-Ritwan: The End of a Controversy. *International Journal of American Linguistics* 24:159-173.
- Proulx, Paul
 1984 Proto-Algic I: Phonological Sketch. *International Journal of American Linguistics* 50:165-207.
- ms. Proto-Algic IV: Nouns. Submitted to Kansas Working Papers in Linguistics for 1992.

Robins, R.H.

1958 **The Yurok Language.** *University of California Publications in Linguistics* 15. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Teeter, Karl V.

1964 **The Wiyot Language.** *University of California Publications in Linguistics* 37. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Cruikshank, Julie (in collaboration with Angela Sidney, Kitty Smith & Annie Ned): *Life Lived Like a Story: Life Stories of Three Yukon Native Elders.* Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1990, 404 pp., photos, glossary, bibliography, index, maps, charts. ISBN 0-7748-0357-6.

Life Lived Like a Story is comprised of accounts by three Yukon Elders of Athapaskan and Tlingit ancestry, Angela Sidney, Kitty Smith and Annie Ned. They tell their stories and provide a narrative history of their lives and those of their contemporaries. They were born at the close of an intensive period of Tlingit-Athapaskan trade within a few years of the Klondike Gold Rush. In part because of their story-telling abilities, they are well-poised to reflect on the changes in the lives of Yukon Natives brought about by the first and second entrance of immigrants to the Yukon. The first was the Gold Rush (there is a marvellous account of how gold was discovered by Dawson Charlie and Skookum Jim) and the second was the building of the Alaska Highway during the Second World War. Sadly, the influx of immigrants was accompanied by epidemics which, because they lacked a natural immunity, caused the death of many Yukon Native people. The Elders remember the loss of siblings and relatives to disease only too well! Cruikshank allows the Elders to tell their own stories, some of which are transformations of well-known North American themes (for example, "Star Husband" of which we are treated to two accounts), against a narrative backdrop which she provides to flesh out the context in which the events took place.

The female Elders talk to us and tell us how they felt about the most important events in their lives; what it meant to be given a Tlingit name during a potlatch; passage to womanhood; how they were married and how it felt to lose parents and siblings through imported diseases. But the focus is not exclusively on society from a female point of view. Kitty Smith's account, for example, focuses on her observations, her success as a trapper, her economic independence and her friendship with other women. Thus, the

narratives are something more than Yukon Native society from a female point of view. Age, rather than gender, sometimes informs their perspectives and colours the narratives which are told to us (there is an excellent discussion of gender as an element of narrative beginning on page 344). The Elders draw a rich and varied picture of events and people who were alive at the time that these narrators were growing up. *Life Lived Like a Story* is innovative in the way it chooses to portray culture from the inside as a rich tapestry in which the narrators continue to weave meaning in their lives; we learn about these three Elders as real life characters. This is the strength of Cruikshank's research project in which the Elders speak for themselves, and shape the final product with minimal intrusion by the researcher. In other words, the characters are not overwhelmed or overly determined by a given theoretical perspective. The recording of life histories as a research method is thus greatly enhanced while a major contribution is made in translating the experience of Yukon Natives to us.

The Elders narrate their life histories and those of their immediate families and spouses and finally their own people in many cases as they learned them from their parents. These narrations provide different levels of analysis and reflection for the Elders as they trace their incorporation into local and wider kin groups. This the Elders do by narrating their *Shagoon* or family history. Some of the Elders learned Tlingit and Athapaskan names for places and people; these are dutifully recorded. As part of her research methodology, Cruikshank and Annie Ned drove by car to various places and sites familiar to Annie Ned; this evoked meaning and stimulated her to associate places and people that still inhabit her memories.

The stories are arranged in the book in three parts, each with an introduction by Julie Cruikshank which discusses how the narrations were elicited and how the narrators collaborated with her (very much on the narrators terms), along with a family tree and an analysis of narrative as explanation. The stories flow chronologically from family history (which sets the stage), through to childhood, womanhood, marriage and old age. The narrators throw new light on life in the Yukon at the turn of the century and beyond by relating their unique accounts from different perspectives of their life histories.

What they have to say about their lives becomes all important to Cruikshank's life history research project, because their words stand by themselves rather than as adjuncts to anthropological accounts of social organization. The narratives provide the material for analysis in the context of life histories as a legitimate way in which people talk about their lives. We are treated here to more than anthropological models of subsistence strategies; the narrators constantly weave back and forth different levels between

narrations, stories and song. Thus we are told of songs sung at potlatches by the hosting moiety at a funeral or marriage. The overwhelming message that comes through is that "spoken words are infused with power that increases in value with repetition" (this is clearly Annie Ned's view). Words- and of course stories- can reveal a person's power and therefore must be uttered with caution. Some of the stories themselves are particularly powerful and gripping; Angela Sidney's account of "The Stolen Woman" (pp.108-110; 119-125) immediately comes to mind.

Julie Cruikshank, in collaboration with Angela Sidney, the late Kitty Smith and Annie Ned, has produced a truly remarkable account of life experiences in the Yukon. The book also makes a major contribution to life history as an effective research method for interpreting and explaining the process of culture.

Seymour Dubrow
45 Bainbridge Avenue
Nepean, Ontario
Canada, K2G 3T1

de Gaspé, Philippe-Joseph Aubert: *Yellow-Wolf & Other Tales of the Saint Lawrence*. Montreal: Véhicule Press, 1990. Translated and annotated by Jane Briery, 160 pp., index, illustrations. ISBN 1-55065-002-5, Paper, \$12.95.

Thirty years ago, and certainly in the author's lifetime (1786-1871), this collection of four stories, three of them dealing with the Indians whom de Gaspé knew from around his seigneurie on the Saint Lawrence just southwest of Quebec City, would have been considered charming and picturesque. Now one wonders what appeal and significance, apart from historiographic interest, republishing such a book could have (especially with the imprimatur of the Canada Council).

Originally published in French in 1893 (Montreal: C.O. Beauchemin et fils) under the title *Divers*, one supposes as a kind of posthumous tribute by his family to a grand old man, in "... these fireside tales ...", the cover text announces, "... we find the same wit and wisdom which delighted readers [of de Gaspé's memoirs] "The tales "... provide fascinating insight into the life and times of one of the fathers of Canadian Literature ...", a man who in the course of his life met and knew many Indians, "... the remnants of proud and noble lines who lived along the Saint Lawrence River ...". The stage is set: the meta-lexical instructions to the reader are clear before

cracking the cover, the print is large (the tales are only about 5,000 words each) and readable (as if set in type for Grand Old de Gaspé himself), the text is well-translated and well-annotated by Brierly, but the effect on the reader is rather sour.

The stories are loosely based on the facts of de Gaspé's life. What we have here, in the near-immortal words of the Boss Man in Paul Newman's *Cool Hand Luke*, is a failure to communicate. Or rather, perhaps too much success in exposing the many paradoxes of the 19th century's admiration for these Nobel Remnants [an obstinate metaphor: for example, one Abenaki is described as "... the image of the Roman god Terminus..." (p.56), a particular metaphor which may have had some reference for de Gaspé but little for his public-but the idea of Roman and therefore ancient remains]. For example, in "Woman of the Foxes" we learn that a friend of de Gaspé bought a female Iroquois slave-for laudable motives, to save her from a life of torment and torture at the hands of her Abenaki captors-to which he became quite attached. But the friend named her "La Grosse"; de Gaspé obviously felt the paradox because in the short narrator's preface he apologetically declaims that "he never knew her by any other name" (p.49): a lie, as it turns out, or an example of how easily we can delude ourselves if we already have a clear definition of social categories: de Gaspé's friend and La Grosse's owner Couillard as protagonist may have called her "La Grosse", but it is de Gaspé as author who continues using the name even when he has reproduced, in his preface on page 48, an extract from the death certificate that lists her baptismal name as Marie Genevieve.

De Gaspé ostensibly wrote this particular story to contrast two lives-one rich, favoured by money, birth, social position and culture, a "*parfait gentilhomme*" (p.78), the other marked by ugliness sub-normal intelligence and a life of servitude-and to inform us that these things do not matter, as both master and slave died within a few hours of each other "... to meet in heaven, there to receive in equal measure the rewards God grants to virtue" (p.78). The story is not really about Marie Geneviève, the Iroquois slave woman, but about her acquisition, which involved intense negotiations between Couillard and an Abenaki "warrior" (most of the Indian men are so named, and "squaws" are also common; by placing these [White] designations in the mouths of the Indians de Gaspé's Noble Savages become even more distant, in the reader's mind, from their modern descendants). The negotiations are complex because the Indians' 'savage pride' and "vengeful nature" (p.67) must be assuaged: the first is my term but both sum up the tone of the negotiating instructions Couillard receives from an Abenaki, who paints his own son (Marie Genevieve's owner) as a vainglorious and cruel man. And the few elements that involve Marie Genevieve herself (when the

narrative focus switches from Couillard to de Gaspé at the end of the story) depict Marie Genevieve's innocent stupidity in swimming with the master's young son in the "warm waters" (p.75) of the Saint Lawrence; yet after the groundless scare, we learn that the young boy's delicate constitution was strengthened by the "... cold baths La Grosse gave him ..." (p.76) in the river. The significance seems to be an attempt to glorify the slave with such faint praise that the paternalistic distance between Indian and master is maintained, even by reversing the temperature of the waters to let us know that the praise is fictive and so can be withdrawn at any time. With both master and servant near death de Gaspé makes Marie Genevieve call Couillard Jr. "my son", yet young Couillard was merely "... very fond of the gentle Indian" (p.78-my italics); even in death she is not given the dignity of the name that while obviously not her own, would at least have been socio-linguistically equal to her master's.

Of course, we can hardly fault de Gaspé for being no more nor less than the product of his time; at least he seems to have been merely paternalistic rather than a rabid racist, although one story ("Big Louis and the Legend of Indian Lorette") revolves around de Gaspé getting a Huron-and a known alcoholic-deliberately drunk to coax a legend out of him. The problem is not de Gaspé; he is what he is. The problem is editor and translator Brierly. For example, in the conflict between de Gaspé (writing in the first person 'I') and the reluctant and proud Big Louis, who initially rejects de Gaspé's company and his liquor [de Gaspé says, "Let there be peace between us, brother. I'm sorry to have given you pain, and I ask your pardon [for having gloated that in thirty years all the Hurons will have "good French blood" in their veins]. Let us think of it no more." "But I do think of it," replies the Huron. "I am on my own ground here. Go away, and trouble my rest no further" (pp.85-86) -italics in original]. Brierly tells us that the legend is

...told [by the Huron Big Louis] with wit, *charm and irony*....
De Gaspé the author projects himself as *the easy-going* narrator, seeker of *tales of old*, in a chance encounter with a *pensive* Huron. Big Louis epitomizes the dilemma of his tribe -the sense of the Hurons' past greatness contrasted with their present plight. He encapsulates the confrontation of two cultures, with brandy and Christianity as symbolic catalysts (p.79-my italics).

Not a word that the brandy comes from de Gaspé, not a comment on the historic limitations of the text [for example, "And since the Indian knew nothing of the white man's sense of fair play when stripping the weak of their possessions, he naturally enough (and wrongly, as the following description of Big Louis's alcoholic antics shows) concluded that they had merely acted

according to the right of might" (pp.82-83)]. Note that this occurs before de Gaspé slips into the familiar 'I', and thus the third person description makes the comment more 'objective'. In Brierly's narrative, Big Louis's 'eloquence' becomes *charm*, 'bitterness' becomes *irony*, Huron culture becomes *tales of old*, exploiting Big Louis's alcoholism makes de Gaspé *easy-going*, and of course, the 'catalysts' brandy and Christianity do not in anyway represent the conflict of two cultures, since they are both products of only one.

To give the devil his due, de Gaspé reports his own embarrassment in the diluted blood episode, and in "Yellow-Wolf, Malecite Chieftain of Old" he plays the part of the curious listener rather than the 'easy-going' moralizer and lets the story end with Yellow-Wolf's own words about the impossibility of changing his faith and values in order to adapt to the modern world (although even this can be interpreted as a meta-textual strategy: presenting the last objectionable version of de Gaspé and the noblest noble savage first seems to make acceptable and tone down the other stories; I think the choice of organization is not accident, as the last tale is about General Wolfe's statue in downtown Quebec—a progression from Noble Savage to Noble Conqueror).

I repeat, therefore, my scruples about Brierly's role, which is limited to annotating the text with helpful and accurate (as far as I can tell) technical notes. Brierly's notes describe the Indians as they were (naturally enough, given the age of the text), but I would have thought it normal to give the non-specialist reader—the market for this book—some information on their current situation: are they still around, or is it *The Last of the Mohicans* all over again? It is as if Brierly had missed out on the hundred years of anthropology since the book was written and certainly missed out on twenty-five years or so of very public political debate about the role of Indians in the Canadian confederation. I could more easily understand if the book had not been published under the aegis of the Canada Council or as part of a series called "Dossier Quebec", with "dossier's" overtones of 'truth' and 'objective fact' and with obvious politico-historic overtones (other titles in the series are indeed about past or current Quebec politics and culture). Surely Brierly's falsely 'objective' distance from the text reflects the ambiguity that has marked Quebecois attitudes towards Indians from the start: pride in their role in Quebec culture, but more than a little sense of unease that the Indians too may have some justifiable right to be considered autonomous cultures and therefore may legitimately quarrel Quebec's claims to special legal status and territorial sovereignty.

The sub-textual message in *Yellow-Wolf* is that Indians have a right to their culture, but only as long as they keep to the culture of a dead past and don't talk back to the *seigneur*, it is one thing for de Gaspé in 1893 to follow

a tactic of relegating Indians to the ancient past and therefore keep them in their place, in the dustbin of history; it is quite another for Brierly to do the same in 1990. This book, therefore, seems more a product of a revisionist historical strategy than an old collection dusted off for mere interests' sake. One wonders what use it could find, what market it could address, what role it could play in modern Canada (or Quebec?). No one will learn anything new from this book. If I were Indian I don't think I would appreciate the recurrent implication that Indian culture is dead in 1990, but of course that is not for me to say. I do worry, however, about the short-sightedness of this historical project and about Canada Council editorial policies.

Guy Lanoue
via Ezio, 19
00192 Roma
Italy

Frantz, Donald G.: *Blackfoot Grammar*. Toronto, Buffalo, London: University of Toronto Press, 1991.

Pedagogical grammars and reference (or descriptive) grammars have traditionally been quite distinct in format as a result of their different aims; a pedagogical grammar is designed to impart to the reader some ability to use the language, while a descriptive or reference grammar is intended as an orderly and logical statement of the rules for making words and sentences in the language. In a pedagogical grammar, the order of presentation of details of the language's structure is dictated by such considerations as more frequent before less so, and simple before complex. In a reference grammar the facts are generally grouped by word class, nouns, pronouns, verbs, etc., under major divisions like syntax and morphology, derivation and inflection.

Frantz's *Blackfoot Grammar* is a blend of these two types. Perhaps it could be called a pedagogical reference grammar. Thus, inflection of nouns for number and obviation is discussed in chapter two, but for possession not until chapter fourteen after verbs in independent clauses have been presented—a pedagogical ordering. Moreover, many of the early chapters are followed by brief exercises to reinforce knowledge of the details presented. On the other hand, no effort to impart basic or frequent vocabulary items is made in this book. And there are no dialogues or texts to familiarize the reader with usage; Blackfoot words and sentences are strictly examples for the grammatical and phonological rules. The latter are features charac-

teristic of reference or descriptive grammars. [Not that this is a unique example of such a mixed pedagogical and reference structure; other examples are Nandris' *Colloquial Rumanian* (1953) and Mitchell's *Colloquial Arabic* (1962).]

The result in this instance is a very readable grammar of Blackfoot, an excellent and essential tool for someone who wants or needs to acquire some knowledge of this language. No grammar is easy reading, certainly no grammar of a highly synthesizing language such as the Algonquian languages are, but this is surely one of the easiest yet written for a North American tongue.

Throughout the work there is an admirable effort either to avoid technical terms, or to explain those that cannot easily be avoided, so as to make the contents of the book available to more than just trained linguists. Formal rewrite rules are used in the phonological descriptions, especially in chapter five, but they are also explained verbally and well exemplified, so this chapter could be used to demonstrate how such rules work, as well as to explain phenomena of the Blackfoot language.

The book may even be a useful introduction to general Algonquian structure through this member of the family, though the reader should heed Bloomfield's advice that Blackfoot is one of the "divergent western languages". Those familiar with a central Algonquian language such as the well-documented and widely-spoken Cree or Ojibwa, will be struck by Blackfoot's structural divergences including animate singular obviative nouns which resemble inanimate singulars, not plurals, animate plural obviative nouns the same as animate proximate plurals (pp.12f), indefinite actor forms (Bloomfield's passives) used for first-person plural inclusive (pp.17, 22), and verbs with personal prefixes, i.e., independent-order verbs, in subordinate clauses (pp.109-111), though the latter occur also in eastern Algonquian (Voorhis 1979, p.57). Likewise, one will not frequently encounter Blackfoot words that closely resemble those of other Algonquian languages.

Paul Voorhis
Departments of Native Studies
and Languages
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

References

- Bloomfield, Leonard
1946 Algonquian, pp.85-129 in Harry Hoijer (Editor): *Linguistic Structures of Native America*. Viking Fund Publications in Anthropology, Number 6. New York: The Viking Fund, Inc.

Mitchell, T.F.

1962 *Colloquial Arabic: The Living Language of Egypt*. London: The English Universities Press.

Nandris, Grigore

1953 *Colloquial Rumanian*, Second Edition. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.

Voorhis, Paul

1975 *Grammatical Notes on the Penobscot Language...* University of Manitoba Anthropology Papers, Number 24. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba.

Frantz, Donald G., and Norma Jean Russell: *Blackfoot Dictionary of Stems, Roots, and Affixes*. Toronto, Buffalo and London: University of Toronto Press, 1989, xxii + 470 pp. ISBN 0-8020-2691-5, Cloth, \$60.00.

Donald Frantz, a linguist who has studied the Blackfoot language for almost thirty years, and Norma Jean Russell, a fluent speaker of the language, have collaborated to produce the first reliable dictionary of Blackfoot. It is not complete-the "more than 4,000" entries are only a fraction of the total Blackfoot lexicon-and it is not particularly easy to use, but it provides a firm foundation for further research on a very interesting but complex language. As a dictionary-maker and sometime student of Blackfoot myself, I can appreciate the difficulties they faced in undertaking this project: my criticisms are intended to assist Frantz and Russell in preparing a revised edition, not to belittle the work they have already done.

The entries reflect Blackfoot concerns, not those of the linguist. Some, such as 'black horse with white facial markings', 'youngest wife', 'give gifts to parents-in-law (of male)', and 'get ochre' refer to traditional culture, while others reflect modern conditions, such as terms for 'Greyhound' (bus and dog), 'pasta', 'oil royalty payment to an individual', 'Absorbine Jr.' and 'television'. But linguists seeking cognates with other Algonquian languages will search in vain for some of their favourite words.

Blackfoot is written with ten consonants (/h k m n p s t w y 'l/) and three vowels (/a i o/); the orthography is very briefly explained in an appendix (pp.467-470). The inventory of sounds is perfectly normal from an Algonquian point of view (and none of them, except perhaps the glottal stop, /'/, and /h/, pronounced like the German ch, would seem strange to English speakers), but Blackfoot seems to delight in unusual clusters of consonants and vowels. Entries like *SSPISTTSIKITSIKIN* 'cowboy boots', (*A*)*KSSTSii* 'sea-

shell', *SSKSKSIM* 'send on an errand', *AA,ÁHS* 'grandparent' and *MAAÁÍ* 'robe, shawl' could easily convince those who have never heard Blackfoot spoken that it is even less pronounceable (by outsiders) than some of the Northwest Coast languages. Of course the dictionary entries are in most cases only abstract stems; however, the real words on which the entries are based look no less formidable: *naaáhsa* 'my grandparent', *áakssksksimiwa* 'she will send him on an errand', *nitsspfsttsikitsikiistsi* 'my cowboy boots'. In part the difficulty is merely due to the orthography: East Cree *maschisin* 'shoe' would be spelled *MASTTSSN* in Blackfoot, and English postscript would be something like *POOSTTSSKRIPT*.

Most of the complex consonant clusters are due to some minor sound changes which occurred a few centuries ago: /ti/ becomes /tsi/ and /ki/ often becomes /ksi/; /it/ often becomes /ist/; and /ih/ before or after /s/ becomes /s/. As the /s/ introduced by these changes is predictable (if two kinds of /i/ are distinguished), the earlier (or underlying) forms could be used as dictionary headings - /akltff/ instead of *AKSSTSÍÍ* 'sea-shell' and something like /lhkihkim/ instead of *SSKSKSIM* 'send on an errand'. The existing headings are already abstractions, not Blackfoot words - even more abstract representations would greatly assist in identifying individual morphemes (and, for the comparative linguist, in identifying cognates) without adding to the difficulties Blackfoot speakers will have in using the book. Many of the underlying forms are already available in Taylor (1969) and Frantz (1971), and the rest could be fairly easily worked out from the inflected forms cited in the dictionary.

The Blackfoot-English section is followed by an English index (pp.319-465), which users of the dictionary will find indispensable as neither speakers of Blackfoot nor linguists familiar with other Algonquian languages will be able to find many words in the first section without its help. Unfortunately, the indexing is uneven; moreover, the words in the English index are given without accents: *ÁÁPAIAI* 'ermine' (animate) and *AAPÁÍAI* 'cattail' (inanimate) therefore appear to differ only in gender. The animate noun *KOON* 'frozen water, ice' is listed under 'frozen', but at 'ice' only inanimate *KOKÓTO* is mentioned; *OHKOHTAA* 'gather firewood' (glossed 'gather wood' in the examples) is under neither 'gather' nor 'wood'. The negative of *YOOHTSIMI* 'listen, hear' is *nimáátáyoohsirnihpa* 'I am deaf', but I had to check Uhlenbeck and van Gulik (1930) to find it, as there is no listing for 'deaf'.

Among the kinship terms, *ISSKAN* 'younger brother or sister (of male)' is indexed only under 'sibling', whereas *IHSISS* 'younger brother or sister (of female)' is indexed under both 'younger' and 'sibling'; looking up

'brother' and 'sister' will not locate either word, but I'S 'older brother' and INSST 'older sister' are listed there and nowhere else. Under 'brother-in-law' there are three terms: 'sister's husband (of male)', 'wife's brother' and "brother-in-law (of female)". Taylor (1969:41) provides the additional information that OOTOYOOM is always a woman's sister's husband; the fourth member of the set ('husband's brother') is missing. Similarly, the dictionary gives only a single term for a male's sister-in-law and none for a female's, while most of the terms for 'cousin' are lacking.

On the other hand, the English index sometimes helpfully includes words not actually used to gloss the Blackfoot: ITÁKKAA 'friend, peer' is also listed as 'pal' and 'buddy'; IPISTTSI 'expel intestinal gas, break-wind' (sic) can be found under 'fart' as well as 'gas' and 'break-wind', though not under 'intestinal', which is where WAAWAKSSKAA 'intestinal rumbling' is listed- the latter word also under 'peristalsis' (but not 'rumble' and 'stomach', despite the gloss 'my stomach rumbled' in the Blackfoot section); MÓÓŚ, glossed 'derriere' (sic), is also indexed as 'bottom' and 'bum' (but not 'buttocks', which is where many would look).

The dictionary sometimes omits words upon which others are based: NÁÁPIAAKII 'white woman', NÁÁPIA'PII 'whiteman's culture' and other derivatives are listed, but not NÁÁPI 'whiteman' (Caucasian) and 'Whiteman' (Naapi, the Blackfoot culture hero). Less important omissions are 'clitoris' (in 'clitoris-eagle', a taboo word for 'bat'), 'lay eggs' (in 'when the birds lay their eggs, June'), and others which appear in bird names and the like.

Actual misprints appear to be very rare, an indication of the care which went into the compilation of the data-base. Allan Taylor's name is misspelled "Alan" in the list of sources (p.xv) but is correct in the acknowledgements. The code adt (adjunct, roughly equivalent to root in other Algonquian languages) is misprinted adj after ,4 'durative aspect' (1) and AAPÁT (3); under ISSKSISTSOOHSI (99) an imperative form is missing (but glossed); the Latin name of KAKAHSIIN (130) is misprinted '*Arctos-taphylos uva-uris*' for *Arctostaphylos uva-ursi*; under YOOHSINÍINA (315) the note *mm* should read *3mm* (cf. p.xiv).

A section on Limitations in the introduction shows that the authors recognize most of the problems mentioned in this review. Rather than wait for a "complete" and perfect dictionary-an unattainable goal-they have published what they have available, understanding that "compilation and revision of a dictionary is a never-ending task" (p.xix). I hope they will continue to expand and refine their word-collection for a long time to come,

periodically issuing new editions of the Blackfoot Dictionary for the benefit of the Blackfoot people and the world at large.

David H. Pentland
 Department of Native Studies
 Brandon University
 Brandon, Manitoba
 Canada, R7A 6A9

References

Frantz, Donald G.

- 1971 Toward a Generative Grammar of Blackfoot (with particular attention to selected stem formation processes). *Summer Institute of Linguistics Publications in Linguistics and Related Fields* 34.

Taylor, Allan R.

- 1969 A Grammar of Blackfoot. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley.

Uhlenbeck, C. C., and R. H. van Gulik

- 1930 An English-Blackfoot Vocabulary, Based on Materials from the Southern Peigans. *Verhandelingen der Koninklijke Akademie van Wetenschappen te Amsterdam, Afd. Letterkunde*, n.s., 29(4).

Gifford, Edward W. and Gwendoline Harris Block (Compilers): *Californian Indian Nights*. Lincoln & London: University of Nebraska Press, 1990, x + 23 pp. Paper.

This Bison Book edition reprints a work first published in 1930 (Glendale, California: The Arthur H. Clark Company) and long out of print.

The subtitle describes the contents well: "Stories of the creation of the world, of man, of fire, of the sun, of thunder, etc.; of coyote, the land of the dead, the sky land, monsters, animal people, etc." The original edition was intended for a general audience, and its main title was indeed *California Indian Nights Entertainments*. Presumably someone thought of appealing to readers of *the Arabian Nights Entertainments, or The Thousand and One Nights*, translated several times in the course of the nineteenth century, and known especially from the unexpurgated volumes of Sir Richard Burton, or at least to those who knew of Aladdin, All Baba, Sinbad and the rest.

The volume in fact mirrors the rather sober ethnology on which it is based. The texts are ones collected by anthropologists and published by scholarly series, those of the University of California Publications in American Archaeology and Ethnology, the American Museum of Natural History, and the *Journal of American Folklore*. The original introduction gives an overview of the Native cultures of California, as to way of life (pp.16-42) as well as to story telling and stories (pp.42-75), and there is a full map of the location of peoples (pp.10-11). The usefulness of the book as an introduction to Native California is enhanced by an introduction to this edition by Albert L. Hurtado (pp.1-7). Hurtado tells us something about Gifford and Harris Block, and indicates, as the original authors did not, the terrible experience of Indian peoples under Spanish and then American control.

(Hurtado politely says that "A much more detailed picture of Indian history has emerged since this book was first published" (p.4), but apart from modern estimates of population, the story he sketches was already known. The truth is that the ethnologists generally saw themselves as recording Aboriginal-or at least only Indian-culture. Their reports were usually silent as to the role of Europeans in almost destroying it.)

In sum, the book is a useful introduction to knowledge of Native California and its oral traditions. It would be far more useful if the new edition had supplied sources. For "The beginning of the world", for example, a reader learns only "As told by the northwestern Maidu of Butte county". He is not told that it is from Roland Dixon's *Maidu Myths*, where other Maidu myths can be found: Or that Dixon also published *Maidu Texts*, and that it has another account of the beginning of the world, involving Earthmaker and Coyote at the outset when there was only water to travel on. The book is not, then, an introduction beyond itself.

That fact matters because the texts are rewritten from the original translations. Here is the opening of "The beginnings of the world" in Gifford and Block (p.85):

All the earth was covered with water, and everything was dark in the beginning. There was no sun, no moon, no stars. Then one day a raft appeared, floating on the water, In it was Turtle. Down from the sky a rope of feathers came and dangled near the bow of the raft, and then a being, who shone like the sun, descended. He was Earth Initiate. When he reached the end of the rope, he tied it to the bow of the raft, and stepped in. His face was covered, so that Turtle was not able to see it. In fact, no one has ever seen his face uncovered. Earth Initiate sat down and for a long time said nothing.

Here is the opening as Dixon published it, reprinted in Thompson (1929:24):

In the beginning there was no sun, no moon, no stars. All was dark and everywhere there was only water. A raft came floating on the water. It came from the north, and in it were two persons, -Turtle and Father-of-the-Secret-Society. The stream flowed very rapidly. Then from the sky a rope of feathers, was let down, and down it came Earth-Initiate. When he reached the end of the rope, he tied it to the bow of the raft, and stepped in. His face was covered and was never seen, but his body shone like the sun. He sat down, and for a long time said nothing.

Someone seriously interested in what the teller of this story had to say will not know that the original does not here mention the earth. He or she will miss the presence of Father-of-the-Secret-Society, and that the two came from the north. He or she will not know that the original connects shining like the sun with an unseen face.

To say this is not to privilege the original translation as final. We have come to realize that all the earlier translations must be recast. They present the stories in paragraphs, but the stories were told in lines and groups of lines. For Maidu this process has begun with the work of William Shipley (1991: p.19). It appears that in the stories of Hanc'ibyjim (Tom Young) the quotative marker indicates that a line or group of lines constitute a unit. It appears that such units go together in sets of four. So much appears, at least, from Shipley's detailed analysis (1988;cf. 1991:18) of the opening line of "The creation" as told by Hanc'ibyjim.

Sometimes a close translation suggests such relationships, and the rhythm, the point and emphasis, they give to a telling of a story. The original translation reprinted by Thompson suggests a telling in which the relations are of three and five.

In the beginning there was no sun, no moon, no stars.
All was dark,
and everywhere there was only water.
A raft came floating on the water.
it came from the north,
and in it were two persons, Turtle and Father-of-the-Secret-Society.
The stream flowed very rapidly.
Then from the sky a rope of feathers was let down,
and down it came Earth-Initiate.
When hereached the end of the rope,
he tied it to the bow of the raft,
and stepped in.

His face was covered
 and was never seen,
 but his body shone like the sun.

He sat down,
 and for a long time said nothing

Three and five relations are unexpected. Analysis of the Maidu words themselves may show that the translation is misleading. Yet unexpected relations are possible. In the fine Karok texts recorded by William Bright the salient relations are two and four. Further analysis shows the same story told by one woman with two and four relations, and by another with three and five relations. The woman who told it with three and five relations told another story with relations of two and four (Hymes, 1985:49-55).

Evidently narrators are not confined to a single type of relation. They may use different types for expressive or other reasons. This is born out by a comparison of two tellings of the same story by Clara Pearson, the source of almost all that is known of the stories of the Tillamook people of the northern Oregon coast. She told the story of the numskull, "Split His Own Head", to May Mandelbaum (Edel) in the Tillamook language with relations of three and five. She told the same story years later to Elizabeth Jacobs in English with relations of two and four.

The difference suggests a connection with gender. In the plot line of Tillamook stories a focus on men will involve a sequence of five, whereas a focus on women will involve a sequence of four. The story in question shows this. The first part focusses on male activities, and has five scenes. The second part focusses on getting a wife and has four. Now, it is known that Mrs. Pearson thought differently of the two women—May Mandelbaum, unmarried and younger, Bess Jacobs married and older. Evidently telling the story to Bess Jacobs induced a sense of a relation between two mature women, and an organization of groups of lines to match. (This finding is presented in detail in Hymes, 1991.)

There is much to learn about relationships of narrative form, and the relationships among people that induce them, from the many old collections of texts sampled by this anthology. Perhaps reading the anthology will stimulate someone to seek them out.

Dell Hymes
 University of Virginia
 Charlottesville, Virginia
 U.S.A. 22903

References

Dixon, Roland B.

- 1902 Maidu Myths. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History* 17: 33-118.
- 1912 Maidu Texts. *Publications of the American Ethnological Society* 4. Leyden: E.J. Brill.

Hymes, Dell

- 1985 Some Subtleties of Measured Verse, pp.13-57 in June Iris Hesch (Editor): *Proceedings* 1985. 15th Spring Conference, Niagara Linguistics Society. Buffalo, New York.
- 1991 Clara Pearson's "Split-His-Own-Head": A Thrice-Told Tillamook Narrative. *International Conference of Salish and Neighbouring Languages* (August 1991), Vancouver, British Columbia.

Shipley, William

- 1988 Maidu Literary Style, pp.105-13 in William Shipley (Editor): *In Honor of Mary Haas. From the Haas Festival Conference on Native American Linguistics*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.
- 1991 *The Maidu Indian Myths and Stories of Hanc'ibijim*. Berkeley: Heyday Books.

Thompson, Stith

- 1929 *Tales of the North American Indians*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. (Reprinted in paper, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1966.)

Lanoue, Guy: *Images in Stone: A Theory on Interpreting Rock Art*. Rome: Art Centre, 1989, 222 pp., preface, acknowledgements, references, notes, illustrations.

Mr. Lanoue's title describes the content of his work precisely. He presents the reader with a theory, rambling yet provocative, regarding the social and symbolic meaning behind a group of petroglyphs found on rock outcroppings in the Lake of the Woods region of western Canada. In the course of his analysis he suggests that the artistic structures and motivations he has identified can be applied to the art of all human societies. The book combines elements of theory from several prominent anthropologists, es-

pecially Claude Lévi-Strauss, with Lanoue's own detailed study and analysis of the petroglyphs.

Lanoue proceeds from a laudable appreciation for the complex humanity and sophistication of the peoples that created the petroglyphs, challenging conventional theories and assumptions about the nature of so-called "primitive" societies. He is convinced artistic processes involve impulses and responses that are universally human, regardless of the socio-political complexity of the artist's society. In fact, Lanoue considers this suggestion a given. From this premise he assumes that one may deduce significant information about the society of the artist from the artwork created, if some features of social organization are known.

The book begins with a brief introduction, presenting the basics of his theoretical position as well as details of the process used to examine and record the content of the petroglyphs. Chapter One: Problems of Interpretation, discusses the relationship between art and society. In a section titled "Validation", Lanoue argues convincingly that "social and cultural systems shape the terms of our thought [and, thus, our art] much more than environment and technology", whether the reference is to modern man and his complex societies or to those of simple hunter-gatherers. In this chapter, he also discusses the nature of symbol at length, as well as its expression of ideology. His definition of the nature and function of symbol as mediator in the paradoxes formed by the contradictions between social structure and practice is intriguing, as is his discussion of the inherent conservatism of art in general. Less satisfying are his contentions that "even the most primitive scratchings are symbols, things which stand for something else" and that art is always "a way of communicating about our interior selves rather than a means of describing the outside". These statements are presented to the reader as fact, without sufficient argument or explanation.

Still, although Lanoue's conclusions are not always convincing, the rich potential of the ideas presented is undeniable. In these initial chapters and, indeed, throughout the book, Lanoue offers the reader a plethora of interesting and mostly plausible ideas about the ways in which art operates in society. His arguments in support of these ideas, on the other hand, tend to be weak, with little or no hard evidence to back them up.

In Chapter Two, Lanoue looks at the role of animals as symbols in hunter-gatherer societies. In the first section, he examines much of the literature on rock art in various parts of North America. Once again, he challenges conventional assumptions about the creators of petroglyphs and the interpretation of their work. His alternative explanations proceed from an analysis of hunter-gatherer social organization and of the importance of territoriality in those societies. Central to his thesis are the paradoxes

presented by the social and subsistence structures necessary to the forest hunter-gatherer lifestyle. According to Lanoue, art plays an important role in structuring the necessary compromises struck within those paradoxes and necessary to survival in that environment. He presents a lengthy explication of an Ojibway myth in discussion of these issues.

Lanoue's interpretation of the symbolism in the Lake of the Woods petroglyphs-"Divided Turtles and Shapeless People": Chapter Three-is so speculative as to remain entirely in the realm of the theoretical, however. His assumptions and generalizations, while interesting and even intriguing, simply are not convincing in the absence of much evidence beyond Lanoue's own convictions about their plausibility. On the other hand, his discussion of the likelihood of dual systems of knowledge within archaic societies is well-conceived and convincing. This duality is expressed explicitly and intentionally, he suggests, in the difference between more and less naturalistic design in the art. Observed asymmetrical and symmetrical forms are discussed in essentially the same terms, although, in this case, he contends that it is social structure that is reflected, as well as ideas about change (especially transcendence) and continuity.

Interpretation of the petroglyphs continues in the fourth chapter of the book, with a discussion of the "normal" and "abnormal" and of changes in states of being as seen in the petroglyphs, with more emphasis on dualism. Again, Lanoue offers complex interpretation of the images produced, including identification of the sexuality of many of the motifs and the implications that identification presents. Extremely ambiguous imagery is interpreted with a conviction inappropriate to its form, and occasionally inconsistently. A number of equally plausible and diametrically opposed interpretations could be offered for the same designs, given the amount of hard data Lanoue offers in support of his theory. He stretches very limited evidence to the utmost in this discussion of the sexual implications of the images. In addition, he assumes from the outset that the artists are male and that their subject matter revolves entirely around masculine issues and interests. This may well be the case, but one requires more than the author's assumptions regarding this fact to be convinced of it.

In the final chapter of his study, Lanoue explores the relationships between art and social structure in territorial societies through examples only tenuously related to the makers of the Lake of the Woods petroglyphs. He continues to explore the inherent dualism noted earlier-manifested socially, geographically, and religiously-beginning with examples from the Aborigines of Australia. Next he compares the artistic structures of Northwest Coast societies with those of the Algonkian petroglyph artists. Lanoue

finds important relationships between these radically different groups, based on the importance of territory in their socio-political structure and reflected in the formline style of Northwest Coast art, as well as the pervasive "double-curve" in Algonkian design. This is seen to reflect the dualism apparent in the social structures and world views of both societies, albeit reversed, and thereby concealed, in the formal qualities of their artistic expression. Again, the arguments do not adequately support the contentions and conclusions presented. The approach is an interesting one, nonetheless, and bears further inquiry.

In his conclusion, Lanoue admits to some of the shortcomings of the book, but does not seem aware of many of them. Both the philosophical and theoretical approaches of *Images in Stone* are commendable. Conclusions and methodology may also be entirely viable. They are always intriguing and very often plausible. Unfortunately, the arguments used to present those conclusions and the lack of convincing data to support them detracts substantially from the considerable contribution this study offers to the field.

Amella Trevelyan
Art Department
Gettysburg College
Gettysburg, Pennsylvania
U.S.A. 17325

Lewis, Thomas H: *The Medicine Men: Oglala Sioux Ceremony and Healing*. University of Nebraska Press in cooperation with the American Indian Studies Research Institute, Indiana University, 1990, 219pp., illustrations. ISBN 0-8032-2890-2. Cloth, \$19.95, (U.S.).

The bibliography contained in this book is a forceful reminder of the ongoing interest in Indian religion and Oglala belief in particular. The seventeen-page listing includes a veritable Who's Who of Plains Indian ethnology. While much of the foundation work was laid by writers such as Wissler, Mooney and Dorsey, it remained for two writers not within the anthropological domain *per se* to bring Sioux religion to its widest audience. John Neihardt's *Black Elk Speaks* (1932) and Joseph Epes Brown's *The Sacred Pipe* (1953) did much to ensure an abiding interest and fascination in the subject. In the last decade in particular, there has been a flurry of work on Sioux religion, highlighted through the efforts of such people as Raymond DeMallie, Douglas Parks and Elaine Jahner, in the appearance of the edited

contributions of James R. Walker who worked as physician with the Sioux in the early years of this century.

Like Walker, Thomas Lewis' background is in the field of medicine and it is from the psychological perspective that he approaches Oglala belief. The book itself is the result of observations made in the 1960s and early 1970s on the Pine Ridge Reservation. Lewis describes his introduction and first impressions in a most illuminating first chapter and then proceeds to deal with such issues as Oglala concepts of power; the Sun Dance; Yuwipi ceremony; herbs and medicines; Heyok'a; and the state of medicine in the contemporary reservation community. All of these subjects have certainly been covered by other writers previously, so the question is inevitably begged—does this book provide further insight? The short answer is yes, due to the manner in which the author presents his work.

Firstly Lewis has the ability to paint a picture of the contemporary reservation that one instinctively feels is real. His use of first-person anecdotes to illustrate the themes covered heightens the sense of reality and sincerity. The combination of these two elements brings the sort of warmth and comfort to the reader that Indian religion brings to its practitioners. At the same time the reader is given every opportunity to make up his or her own mind on the information presented. Throughout the book Lewis takes pains to present what he has learned without passing undue judgement on its merits from a medical point of view. While this may upset some readers who feel he should evaluate the Oglala explanations of cause and effect professionally, there is much to be gained by not doing so. Associated with this is Lewis' readiness to accept things as he sees them rather than present the 'ideal'. He notes in several places the matter of fact approach to religion and ritual by the Oglala. In discussing the question of the number of times a specific ritual should be performed, for example, he observes that "practicality overrides ritual numbers" (p.47). Again he records that one medicine man at least informed him that photographs *should* be taken of the Sun Dance for the benefit of future generations (p. 104). This is not to say that the book tries in any way to diminish Oglala belief, or is it 'reservation gossip'.

When Lewis reports the views of medicine men on their peers, he is not acting in the role of a supermarket tabloid reporter, but as a professional physician recording the professional comments of colleagues. Nevertheless his use of actual names and incidents will undoubtedly assure an Indian reading public, anxious to find out who said what about whom. This is even more understandable taking into consideration what Lewis also found out about medicine men: that though 'specialists' they are still expected to

operate within the traditional holistic concept of society, subject to the same social vulnerability as the next man or woman.

The author's own views most clearly come to light in the final chapter, 'Perspectives on Oglala Medicine' where he addresses some fundamental questions that have intrigued many students. He poses and answers, for instance, the question "Why does the constant emphasis on the acquisition of power pervade every fibre of Oglala ritual and myth?". Because, he says, traditionally the concern centred upon power relative to nature and the cosmos and power to defeat enemies. Today the Oglala perceive that in their waking life situation they have no power.

The Medicine Men is a refreshing, honest look at the contemporary Oglala and their religious world. Indian religion has always been treacherous ground for outsiders to write about. While there will be those who will find fault there will be others willing to admit "he tells it like it is".

Fraser Pakes
Box 1740
Canmore, Alberta
Canada T0L 0M0

References

- Brown, Joseph Epes
1953 *The Sacred Pipe*. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Neihardt, John
1932 *Black Elk Speaks*. (Reprinted, Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988.)
- Postl, Brian D. (Editor): *Epidemiology and Control of Haemophilus Influenza Infection in Northern Populations*. Winnipeg, Manitoba: University of Manitoba, Northern Health Research Unit, 1990. Illustrations, tables, references. ISBN 1-895034-01-9.

This volume, edited by Brian D. Postl of the University of Manitoba Northern Health Research Unit includes a series of monographs presented at a symposium held in Churchill, Manitoba which focused upon Haemophilus Influenza disease. The papers included in the volume concentrate upon epidemiological studies completed in the circumpolar region, with specific research on the Indian and Inuit populations. The papers also

focus on efficacy studies of the various Haemophilus Influenza type b vaccine trials. The contributors are representative of the international concern regarding the disease. These scholars present research completed with populations in Alaska in the U.S.A.; Manitoba and Northwest Territories in Canada; Iceland; and Finland.

There is grave uncertainty from these researchers as to why the Haemophilus Influenza disease afflicts a disproportionate number of northern children. Prevention through immunization is highly desirable, although current research continues to question which vaccine provides the greatest protection to the very young population at risk. Meanwhile, northern children suffer significant sequelae and mortality, specifically meningitis.

The volume offers a valuable collection of current research for practitioners in medicine, communicable disease and public health programs. Unfortunately, the papers are not composed in a format for the lay person to understand. Northern Native people, highest at risk for the disease, would encounter difficulty in maneuvering through the research material because of the immunological and epidemiological jargon.

Laurie Crawford
103 Hordal Road
Yellowknife, Northwest Territories
Canada, X1A 3M4

Russell, Dale R.: *Eighteenth-Century Western Cree and their Neighbours*. Hull, Quebec: Canadian Museum of Civilization, 1991, x + 238 pp., preface, introduction, bibliography, notes, maps, acknowledgements, abstract. ISBN 0-660-12915-9. Paper, \$20.95.

"Masterful" is the first word which comes to mind when describing Dale Russell's work dealing with the Cree and their neighbours west of Hudson Bay. In a long overdue attempt to clarify the numerous ambiguities and misinterpretations surrounding these First Nations peoples who were so centrally involved in the early fur trade in the region. Russell, who is an archaeologist and currently a working partner with Western Heritage Services of Saskatoon, methodically demolishes an idea current in much of the literature. In short, this idea maintained that the Cree (as well as the Assiniboin) were recent migrants into the extensive territory under consideration as a consequence of the pressures generated by the European-driven fur trade. It has been widely held that the Cree were mere flotsam before a European economic tide as it swept westward.

Russell's argument to the contrary is based on a thorough examination of the primary and secondary sources using historiographic, ecological, and linguistic evidence. His admirable mastery of the relevant literature permits him to refute the seminal, but at times careless, work of David Mandelbaum done in the 1940s, which is shown to have been based upon a misinterpretation of some limited second-hand reports on the Cree offered by Alexander Mackenzie in 1801 as well as upon the unexplained discounting of important evidence derived from Anthony Henday that the Cree and Assiniboin were inhabiting the Red Deer and Edmonton areas as early as 1754-55.

Given the limited data available, Russell does a commendable job of reconstructing the identities and localities of the Cree and neighbouring groups which have been garbled in the fur trade literature. For example, Russell identifies the "Mountain Indians" as Cree of the Manitoba Escarpment region rather than Hidatsa; the "Archithinue" as a generic term for Blackfoot groups; and the "Naywatamee Poets" as Hidatsa rather than Atsina. All of these details are crucial for a proper understanding of the history of this region.

Although in general an admirably crafted work, some minor quibbles and one major disappointment might be noted. Among the former are editorial failures to catch errors-such as Frank Roe's classic work *The Indian and the Horse* being cited as "Row" (p.142)-and inconsistency in the spelling of Anthony Henday's Cree mentor Attickasish (cf. pp. 94, 147). In addition, having established that Henry Kelsey was under the guidance of Assiniboin during his famous guided tour of the interior in 1690-91 (p.74), Russell twice forgets this and cites Edward Lutit as the first Hudson's Bay Company servant to be sent inland to winter with the Assiniboin in 1776 (pp.124, 185). These editorial lapses are explained through a caveat entered by the publisher citing the intent to make recent work available as quickly as possible, thereby naturally risking editorial shortcomings.

The major disappointment in this book, however, is Russell's failure to employ archaeological data in his analysis. Indeed, in the preface he explicitly supports his deliberate omission of this data (except for a few minor references) "(t)o avoid interpreting ambiguous historic information through recourse to the limited archaeological record". Surely this is in fact an argument to make use of this data, however meager, in order to bolster the equally limited sources on the literary side. For many years there have been calls for an integration of disciplines under the rubric of ethnohistory in order to help answer such questions as whether or not archaeological cultures identified as Selkirk, Clearwater Lake, and Grass River are identifiably proto-historic Western Woods or Swampy Cree groups. If such interdisciplinary work is not to be attempted by Dale Russell, an archaeologist who

has demonstrated such a thorough command of the literary sources, then by whom? It may have been that the rush to publish his 1990 University of Saskatoon MA. thesis in this form prevented extensive reference to the archaeological literature (in spite of this book being an Archaeological Survey of Canada Paper), but it is to be hoped that Russell will apply his access to the archaeological field to expand this excellent historiographical work on the Cree.

In summary, Dale Russell's book on the Cree and their neighbours should (despite the lost opportunity) become a major benchmark in the field. It must now be an important preliminary consideration for any future work on the Cree or re-interpretation of the fur trade literature dealing with this region. His thorough research has allowed us to identify and locate named groups with much more confidence and to correct the idea that the Cree were fur trading interlopers in the West rather than long term occupants in the Hudson Bay hinterland. In short, this book is highly recommended for the attention of all those interested in the history of the region or the Cree and their neighbours.

Paul C. Thistle
Curator
The Sam Waller Museum
Box 185
The Pas, Manitoba
Canada, R9A 1K4

Sandoz, Marl: *Crazy Horse: The Strange Man of the Oglalas*. Introduction by Stephen B. Oates. New York: A.A. Knopf, 1942; reprinted, fiftieth anniversary edition, Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1992, xxi+428 pages, map, bibliography, notes. ISBN 0-8032-9211-2. Paper, \$11.95 (US).

This reprint of the biography of Crazy Horse is timely, given the controversy surrounding the events at Wounded Knee and the expansion of the American Indian Movement after 1975, for the book presents a keen portrayal of the warrior who has come to epitomize the conflict between the Sioux and the American government. Sandoz, who was born in Nebraska some nineteen years after Crazy Horse's death, is a good choice as his biographer. She was raised near the Pine Ridge Reservation, was empathetic to Sioux history and was personally acquainted with Crazy Horse's contemporaries. In *Crazy Horse*, she has produced a narrative which

describes not only the life of the great Oglala warrior but also the story behind the final years of independence of the Plains Sioux.

Sandoz's account vividly depicts the development of Crazy Horse as a private person and a public leader from his birth around 1842 near Rapid Creek in Lakota territory, to his death at Fort Robinson in 1877. During his adolescence his light hair and quiet approach to life set him apart from others and earned him the name "Curly." When he was twelve years old he witnessed the battle known as the "Gratton Fight" and from this early experience realized that the American Army could not be trusted. The event was typical of relations between the Army and the Sioux: the troops were looking for an excuse to kill "Indians" while the Natives were simply carrying on their daily chores. Shortly afterwards, Crazy Horse underwent the vision quest that determined his life's mission. Sandoz's narrative of the vision and the indelible mark it left on its recipient is a recurring theme which flows throughout her work.

Eventually known as "The Strange One" because of his personal beliefs and non-conformist attitudes, Crazy Horse was also a successful and noted warrior by the time he was in his twenties. His war experiences included many of the major conflicts between American soldiers and the Lakota. He learned early on of the horror that inevitably followed army attacks and soon realized that the Americans had to be defeated if the women and children were ever to feel safe from rape and slaughter. Inevitably, in Crazy Horse's world, there was no country that could "hold the tracks of the moccasin and the boots of the white-man side by side" (p.303). As a result, his efforts as a warrior were bent towards teaching his people the methods of the American military in the hope that they could provide protection for their families. However, the individual style of the Lakota warrior proved impossible to change. In the summer of 1857, a council of all the Lakotas faced the same problem: trying to unite the people against the threat of annihilation by the Americans, but unfortunately failing to succeed. In the final analysis, the old ways were too engrained to be changed.

After 1857, the Lakota and Crazy Horse fought a seemingly endless war of attrition that culminated in the June 1876 defeat of Custer at the Little Big Horn. After that battle, the Americans proved unyielding in their pursuit of the Sioux. Finally, in order to save his family and followers from destruction, Crazy Horse surrendered at Spotted Tail's Agency on September 4, 1877. There, one day later, he was bayoneted in the back by Lakota police working for the American Army. The message in his 1845 vision that kept him from taking scalps, using war paint or binding his hair, and which had protected him all his life, had also included a prophecy which stated that "it was only by his own people that...Crazy Horse could be hurt" (p.109). The events

surrounding his death unfortunately fulfilled the conditions of that earlier vision.

Sandoz's narrative is powerful in the way it describes the personal development of Crazy Horse and that of the Lakota themselves. In fact, the graphic descriptions of daily life and the internal operations of the Lakota world are some of the best parts of the book. In the end, the experiences of Crazy Horse become, in microcosm, the experiences of the Sioux as they try to survive the brutal attacks of the Army.

When Sandoz wrote the biography in 1942, the United States was in the grip of a war with Japan, another non-White people, and the book was not that well received. Academics also criticized it for its "embroideries" and accused her of taking liberties with the biographical process. However, Sandoz tried from the beginning to deliver a believable and moving portrait of her subject. By diligent use of documents and her personally recorded oral history of Crazy Horse's fellow warriors, men like He Dog, Short Bull, Red Feather and Black Elk, she succeeded. A constrained academic inability to comprehend the complexities of the oral record and the traditional Sioux method of recounting history should not be described as "factional embroideries" (p.xix). The ensuing intense portrayal of Sioux life was the result of Sandoz's artful mixing of the recorded word and the memories of the men who were participants in the events she describes.

The picture Sandoz weaves is of a man who was thoughtful, considerate and caring to those around him. The warrior she describes is the same individual as he became increasingly involved in a life and death struggle. In the end, Crazy Horse died because he could not bring himself to compromise his warrior principles and at the same time provide for his followers' safety in a world controlled by his enemies.

For anyone who would learn about the Sioux and their world, this is a timely reprint of a major work. Despite the scattered bits of ethnocentricity (for example the use of the word "hostile" to describe non-agency Sioux), the book is a welcome addition to knowledge about the Sioux. It tells a very personal story which is intertwined with the larger history of the Sioux and their desire for independence. It also provides a connection between the last days of the Plains Sioux, their traditional ways, the life of Crazy Horse and the renewed conflict which symbolizes their modern struggle with the American government.

Fred J. Shore
Department of Native Studies
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, Manitoba
Canada, R3T 2N2

Smith, Donald B.: *From the Land of Shadows: The Making of Grey Owl*. Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1990, 329 pp., photos. ISBN 0-88833-309-9, Cloth, \$24.95.

In the movie *Gandhi* (Columbia Pictures 1983), the Reverend Charlie Andrews accompanies the lawyer Gandhi from South Africa to India in 1915 and becomes caught up in the struggle for independence. When Gandhi is imprisoned, his friend goes to visit him in his cell, and asks, "Well, what do you want me to do?" Gandhi smiles and tells him, "I think, Charlie, that you can help us most by taking that assignment you've been offered in Fiji." His explanation is simple: "I have to be sure, they have to be sure, that what we do can be done by Indians alone." Gandhi- one of Cree lawyer and current Assembly of First Nations National Chief Ovide Mercredi's heroes-and his fellow patriots possessed the skills and resources to confront their colonial masters.

Such was not the case in Canada at that time. After World War One, Canadian "Indians" were struggling to organize and assert themselves politically on the provincial and national levels. Indians who questioned their subservience to the federal Indian Act, however, were considered dangerous subversives by government officials in the 1920s and 1930s. When F.O. Loft, the leader of the League of Indians of Canada, tried to raise money to go to England in 1931 and legally challenge provincial game laws which violated the Indians' treaty promises, he was dismissed by Indian Affairs officials as one who "made a living exploiting Indians" (Tittley, 1986:108).

Two hundred miles north of Toronto, the Temagami Ojibwa-who had never signed the Robinson Treaty of 1850-were struggling to acquire an Indian reserve and trying to survive the onslaught of non-Native society in the face of taxation and the invasion of their hunting and fishing grounds (Hodgins & Benidickson, 1989).

None of the leaders of these Indian groups who fought for the rights of their people became household words in Canada or the world. It was in the 1930s, however, that an Englishman named Archie Belaney reached his peak of popularity. He married and briefly lived with an Ojibwa woman, Angele Egwuna of Bear Island (with whom he had two daughters, Agnes and Flora). Although he never divorced Angele, Archie later lived with two other Native women, Marie Girard (the mother of his son John Jero) and Anahareo or Gertrude 'Pony' Bernard (mother of his daughter Dawn), and married two non-Native women, Ivy Holmes (who divorced him) and Yvonne Perrier. Angele, Marie and Ivy knew him only as Archie Belaney; Anahareo and Yvonne knew him as Grey Owl, an internationally renowned "Indian" writer and spokesman who promoted conservation of Canada's wildlife and forests.

Donald Smith's biography provides a detailed picture of Grey Owl's worlds, from his birth in 1888 to his death in 1938. The result of twenty years of painstaking research, including numerous interviews, dutifully referenced and illustrated with sixty photographs, it chronicles the transformation of a young man with an unhappy childhood in southeast England into the famous Grey Owl who proclaimed: "I feel as an Indian, all my ways are Indian, my heart is Indian. They, more than the whites, are to me, my people" (p.166).

It is easy for us to dismiss Grey Owl as a phoney, for such a masquerade-dying his hair, using a sunlamp and even borrowing eagle feathers from the National Museum; the ultimate Wannabe-would be unthinkable in the 1990s. Smith's book will be useful, however, in promoting discussion of the role of non-Native advisors and consultants today. Fred Lennarson and various lawyers provided essential support to the Lubicon Cree, for example, but Bernard Ominayak was clearly the leader (Goddard, 1991). The identity conflict which Archie Belaney took to an extreme, creating a fantasy world, will be familiar to many non-Native people working in Indian communities today. While some are strangely untouched by Native people (and some are, sadly, repelled), others struggle to be themselves as their lives are transformed. Unlike Grey Owl, those of us who are not Native should reflect often on Gandhi's friend, on changing circumstances, on what our role should be, and when we should exit and let go.

It will also provoke discussion on the uneasy alliance between environmentalists and Indians, the tensions between animal rights and Indian rights (Grey Owl opposed inhumane trapping and blood sports), and the effects of wilderness parks. For despite Grey Owl's support for Indian issues and causes (pp.81, 150, 163, 168, 178, 205, 208), he was a man who had renounced trapping to raise pet beavers: "I speak of Nature, not men; they are incidental, used to illustrate a point only" (p.115). In the 1930s the park system benefitted forests and animals, not Indians. They were forbidden to hunt and trap in Prince Albert National Park (p.150). Non-Natives crowded his Ojibwa friends in the Temagami Forest Preserve. Further north and west, the Chapleau Game Preserve encircled the Brunswick House Crees and prevented them from either hunting or trapping. Provincial game wardens patrolled Algonquin Park (p. 115), and Indians were forcibly relocated so that Ontario could create Quetico Provincial Park, problems which the current Ontario government are still attempting to address (to the chagrin of the Ontario Federation of Anglers and Hunters).

That Grey Owl was a great writer is attested by the comments of his contemporaries and the popularity of his books even today; I, for one, now want to read them all.

Was he one of the greatest Canadians (p.169)? Was he another Thoreau (p. 295)? The late Frank Beaucage, a Nipissing Ojibwa (whose father worked

on Lake Temagami, witnessed Belaney's marriage to Angele, and later observed his wild behavior in Biscotasing), didn't think so (personal communication summer 1978). Lizzie McKenzie Page of Temagami, who met Belaney when she was nine or ten, doesn't think much of him either: Angele was her grandfather's niece (personal communication 18 April 1992).

While initially skeptical of Smith's book, following a presentation at the Royal Ontario Museum that an Indian colleague characterized as "hero worship," I was won over by his meticulous research and by the compelling story. (At last, I couldn't put the book down and finished it at 3:30 a.m.) I was interested to learn that the (Cree) name Mukawach or Mekawatch from Moose Factory became McWatch (p.73) when they and the Swansons and McCaulays moved to Chapleau. But I was left still wondering how much Archie Belaney earned from his tours and writings, the size of his estate (p.294), and his effect on the lives of the wives and children he selfishly abandoned and sacrificed for his obsession with writing, filming and speaking about Indians.

Although we learn about the Espanieis and other individual Indians, it is still the story of Grey Owl's worlds, not the Indian worlds he claimed to speak for. James Axtell has described how Indians captured and adopted by Whites usually ran away (a familiar theme still today), because they failed to take them "into their hearts and homes," while Whites adopted by Indians did not (1981:168). Without the Teamagami and Bisco and other Indians, there could have been no Grey Owl. It is a perspective we still need on this man.

Donald Smith has given us a great book with a comprehensive bibliography for those who wish to delve deeper into the story of Grey Owl's worlds. We live in an age when Indian leaders can travel to England or Geneva and lobby for their concerns most effectively. As Smith has shown, the year after Grey Owl's death twelve Indian delegates invited to the Loram-Mcliwraith conference in Toronto resolved to hold their own meetings in future, to be attended by "*bona fide* Indian leaders actually living among the Indian people" and "free of political, anthropological, missionary, administrative or other domination" (1990:52). Don Smith says that Grey Owl would have agreed; I'm not so sure.

John S. Long
RO. Box 436
Timmins, Ontario
Canada, P4N 7E3

References

Axtell, James

- 1981 *The European and the Indian: Essays in the Ethnohistory of Colonial North America*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Goddard, John

- 1991 *Last Stand of the Lubicon Cree*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre.

Hodgins, Bruce W. & Jamie Benidickson

- 1989 *The Temagami Experience: Recreation, Resources, and Aboriginal Rights in the Northern Ontario Wilderness*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Titley, E. Brian

- 1986 *A Narrow Vision: Duncan Campbell Scott and the Administration of Indian Affairs in Canada*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press.

Smith, Donald B.

- 1990 Now We Talk - You Listen. *Rotunda* 23(2):48-52.

Taylor, Drew Hayden: *The Bootlegger Blues*. Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Fifth House Publishers, 1991, 94 pp. ISBN 0-920079-79-2. Paper, \$11.40.

Drew Hayden Taylor's *The Bootlegger Blues* is an example of the great debt that Canadian theatre owes to Native Earth Performing Arts and its annual Native Playwright Festival. It has brought about such an explosion of work that it is no longer possible to discuss Native drama as a homogeneous entity. Taylor's play may have more in common with Nell Simon and television situation comedies than the issue driven social action drama often associated with Native playwrights. But just as it is no longer acceptable to criticize mainstream Canadian plays because they are not overtly Canadian enough, so too, *The Bootlegger Blues* should remain safe from the slings and arrows of those who want a political agenda behind every curtain. This is not Tomson Highway. This is dinner theatre comedy, the kind of theatre that goes down best as a slightly over-sweet dessert served quickly after a large dinner. "Its sole purpose is to make us laugh and it succeeds.

As the title suggests, the plot revolves around the disposition of alcohol. In this case it is 143 cases of beer left over from a failed fundraising drive that coincided with a powwow. Martha, the matriarch of the reserve, has got to find a way to get her money back. What else is there to do? She has to

sell it. This causes some concern to her special constable-in-training son, Andrew, nicknamed Blue. But he has his hands full with a new flame, Angle, who has just moved to the reserve. Meanwhile his sister, Marianne, is going through relationship stress adjusting to the "Yuppification" of her boyfriend, David. Maybe, she thinks, she'd be happier running off with a nomadic dancer named Noble. These three plots fall over each other during the twenty-four hours of a powwow weekend loosely tied together by the beer.

Comedy is most successful when it is based upon reality. This prevents the use of formulas and cliché or stereotype characters. The premise of *The Bootlegger Blues* stretches this concept to an extreme. We simply have to accept the rather hazy fact that the beer in question cannot be returned because the Liquor Board tags have been removed. Even the bootlegger to be, Martha, is skeptical:

I don't believe that woman had the patience to pick off 143 stickers cause they didn't look right (p.45).

However, it is after all a powwow weekend so perhaps things should not be taken too seriously. Like most people after too much partying, just about everyone in this play suffers from some form of hangover. And it is in this atmosphere of conspicuous indulgence that the overriding theme of keeping a sense of adolescent fun and irresponsibility in your life flourishes. Life on the reserve is richer for its sense of surprise as unexpected events lead to unexpected responses.

It should be no surprise that this is a comedy of character and situations. Herein lies both the strength of Taylor's writing and his major weakness. He has vividly created some of the characters. Martha is the quintessential matron, homespun, hard working and practical. From the moment the play opens when we find her alone in the kitchen, to the innocence with which she goes about her bootlegging, the atmosphere of the play tangibly warms when she is involved.. Indeed all of the supporting characters seem richer and more alive in their conversations with Mom. Taylor makes special mention in the acknowledgements of his mother and I suspect his success with the character of Martha reflects a strong living image (p,5). She is a paradox, the most human of all character traits.

The portrayal of the female love interest, Angie, is far less likeable. Perhaps the playwright sensed that she was involved in the weakest of the three storylines and that things needed a boost, but why create a foul mouthed tramp whose only interest seems to be casual sex as a partner for Martha's son? She describes her ideal man as:

Somebody six foot four, biceps that could crack walnuts, money enough to buy me all the horses in the world, and every time he comes over to spend the night, he has to bring a

shoehorn, if you know what I mean? That's the big requirement!
(p.21)

She and Blue spend the play making sure they are not related so they can hop into bed with a clear conscience. Their antics seem strangely out of place with the style of the play as if Taylor was trying to inject a little spice.

The same mixed success is found with Martha's daughter, Marianne and the love triangle created with her common-law husband David and the hunky dancer Noble, as in 'noble savage.' David is reduced to a cliché yuppie for whom image is everything. He and Marianne have nothing in common and the audience will not care if she runs off with the dancer. He is a gold mine of a character. He lacks the problems brought on by a moral conscience. He is truly a rebel without a pause. Taylor uses him very effectively to lambaste David as an 'apple' Indian with some of the wittiest dialogue in the play. When a drunken Noble stumbles upon a jogging David he comments:

Nice outfit. Where'd you get it? Goofs-Are-Us? Christ, I'd be running too if I wore an outfit like that on my reserve (p.41).

This is a rich character; in the hands of a skilled actor he has the potential to steal the entire show. If all the roles could be imbued with this much comic edge combined with the richness of the warm, likeable reality of Martha, the play would rise above the level of 'sit-corn' for which it seems to be striving.

This is a good play that frustrates the reader-and I suspect the viewer- because it could and should be better. The writing is comfortable and unpretentious. We know from the first moment that we are going to be entertained. Taylor has invited us into his home and offered us a glimpse of reserve life through a uniquely comic eye. If all the characters were written with the care and richness of Martha we would be more likely to want to kick off our shoes and stay awhile.

This kind of play is not easy to write. Comedy is a most difficult genre to perfect. It requires practical experience and that can only come with production; seeing your work in front of an audience. If Drew Hayden Taylor keeps writing I have no doubt that he will get those productions.

James Forsythe
Drama Department
Brandon University
Brandon, Manitoba
Canada, R7A 6A9

INFORMATION FOR AUTHORS AND REVIEWERS

The Canadian Journal of Native Studies is an international refereed periodical in the discipline of Native Studies published twice annually in Brandon, Manitoba, Canada. CJNS publishes articles and reviews concerning Aboriginal people and Aboriginal affairs in Canada, the USA, and other countries of the world. All submissions to this journal, except critical reviews, are independently and anonymously reviewed by peers prior to acceptance for publication.

Articles and reviews may be submitted in either English or French. Three copies of manuscripts (at least one should be an original copy) should be submitted, together with an abstract not exceeding 100 words. Authors should study recent issues of CJNS for style guidelines. We also recommend the use of **The Canadian Style: A Guide to Writing and Editing** (1985: Toronto: Dundurn Press Limited). Authors are invited to query the editors in advance, although unsolicited manuscripts are welcome. The following guidelines are offered:

1. All submitted materials must be typed and double-spaced.
2. Ensure that printed material is of letter quality.
3. Use standard font/type (i.e. Helvetica, Courier, Times, Prestige).
4. Avoid alternating the size of the font throughout the material.

RENSEIGNEMENTS POUR LES AUTEURS ET LES CRITIQUES LITTÉRAIRES

La Revue **Canadienne des Etudes Autochtones** est une revue internationale axée sur des études autochtones, et publiée deux fois par an à Brandon, au Manitoba, au Canada. La RCEA publie des articles et des comptes rendus portant sur les autochtones et les affaires autochtones au Canada, aux États-Unis, et dans d'autres pays du monde. À l'exception des comptes rendus, tous les articles sont examinés, sans nom d'auteur, par les membres du Comité de Rédaction, individuellement, afin de déterminer la publication éventuelle des articles.

Les articles et les comptes rendus doivent être en anglais ou en français. Trois copies des manuscrits (dont l'une, au moins, est l'originale) devraient être soumises, et aussi un résumé ne dépassant pas 100 mots. Les auteurs devraient étudier les numéros récents de la RCEA pour se former une idée du style à adopter. Nous recommandons aussi l'emploi de **Guide du rédacteur de l'administration fédérale** (1983: Ottawa: Centre d'édition du gouvernement du Canada). Les auteurs sont invités à prendre contact à l'avance avec les membres de la rédaction, mais les manuscrits non sollicités seront reçus. Prière de faire attention aux indications ci-dessous:

1. Les manuscrits soumis pour publication devraient être dactylographiés à double interligne.
2. S'assurer que les imprimés sont de première qualité.
3. Se servir d'une font régulière (c-à-d. Helvetica, Courier, Times, Prestige).
4. Éviter d'alterner la grosseur de la fonte dans le manuscrit.

